

memorandum

DATE: August 13, 1987
 REPLY TO: *Jean Meadowcroft*
 ATTN OF: Jean Meadowcroft, PHS
 SUBJECT: RETT (367-0146) PES

PD-AAU-904
 ED 5297

TO: See Distribution

This memo shows the current status of each of Action Decisions, listed in Part I, E. The PES represents the project status as of the evaluation; i.e., up till April 1987. Since then considerable changes have been made in response to the evaluation and are noted here. Please attached this to the front of the PES so it will show the current project status.

- 1.a. Probably will be directed to all untrained teachers, per 1.d. review now underway
- 1.b. Underway
- 1.c. Accepted
- 1.d. Reassessment underway per Sector Assessment and year 2000 goals
- 1.e. Same
- 1.f. Underway
- 1.g. Meetings CERID-RED begun
- 1.h. Underway.
- 2.a. To be reviewed by MOEC policy committee
- 2.b. Done contract to 12/3/87
- 2.c. Done Purchase Order
- 2.d. Will depend on revised plans per 1.a,d,e
- 2.e. Now approved to 6/88.

- 3.a. This will be a long-term decision
- 3.b. Underway. Most now named
- 3.c. Dohe
- 3.d. District supervisors, trained for English tuition
- 3.e. Accepted.
- 4.a. New Project Director appointed in April, 1987. He is taking a serious interest in understanding the project and meeting its needs.

The one major recommendation not included in the Action Decisions is F.1, p. 5, adding a two year technical advisor position. This decision should depend on the current reassessment of project plans for 1988-89 (points 1.a,d,e) and on availability of funds.

DISTRIBUTION

PDIS:DClark, TR'Tuladhar
PRM:JClary
DD:WSRhodes
A/D:GLewis

A.I.D. EVALUATION SUMMARY PART I

A. REPORTING AID UNIT (Mission or AID/W Office)	B. WAS EVALUATION SCHEDULED IN CURRENT FY ANNUAL EVALUATION PLAN?	C. EVALUATION TIME
(ES: USAID/Nepal, FY87-2)	(x) Yes () Slipped () ad hoc	(x) Interim (2/87) () Final () ex post () Other

D. ACTIVITY OR ACTIVITIES EVALUATION (List the following information for project(s) or program(s) evaluated: if not applicable, list title and data of the evaluation report)

Project	Project/Program Title (or title & data of evaluation report)	First FROG or equivalent (FY)	Most recent PACD (mo/yr)	Planned LOP Cost (\$000)	Amount Oblig. to date (\$000)
367-0146	Radio Education Teacher Training II - Mid-Term Evaluation Report, April 1987	84	9/89	2120	2120

E. ACTION DECISIONS APPROVED BY MISSION OR AID/W OFFICE DIRECTOR-ACTION REQUIRED	NAME OF OFFICER RESPONSIBLE FOR ACTION	DATE ACTION TO BE COMPLETED
1. <u>Reassessment of Project Goals and workplan</u> a. RED should direct programming at larger audience, such as all untrained teachers, primary students, or all SLC takers b. RED should concentrate all of its resources in 1987 towards the production of a revised English tuition course. c. Preparation of the Math Tuition Program should be delayed until 1988 (See continuation)	Jean Meadowcroft	2/88
	Jean Meadowcroft	6-12/87
	Jean Meadowcroft	2/88

F. DATE OF MISSION OR AID/W OFFICE REVIEW OF EVALUATION
 Month .May day 8.. year 87.

G. APPROVALS OF EVALUATION SUMMARY AND ACTION DECISIONS:

Signature Typed Name Date	Project/Program Officer <i>Jen Meadowcroft</i> J. Meadowcroft	Representative of Borrower/Grantee See Attached Letter Cha.No.204	Evaluation Officer - <i>George Lewis</i> George Lewis	A/Mission or Office Director <i>W. Stacy Rhodes</i> W. Stacy Rhodes (Acting For) 8/17/87
---------------------------------	---	--	---	---

E. ACTION DECISIONS APPROVED BY MISSION OR AID/W OFFICE DIRECTOR-ACTION REQUIRED	NAME OF OFFICER RESPONSIBLE FOR ACTION	DATE ACTION TO BE COMPLETED
d. RED/MOEC should reassess their radio education goals, and plans for future math programs	Jean Meadowcroft	2/88
e. The proposed science and Nepali SLC tuition course should be postponed pending a RED/MOEC decision on the usefulness of continuing with the development of SLC tuition course	Jean Meadowcroft	2/88
f. The revised RED formative evaluation plan for three teacher observation groups to meet regularly at RED and for regular field observations by RED personnel should be fully implemented during the development of the revised Pilot English series	Jean Meadowcroft	8/87
g. Activities in the Integrated Research Plan should be prioritized and budgets and timeliness prepared jointly by RED and CERID	Jean Meadowcroft	10/87
h. The revised Pilot English Tuition series should be the subject of intensive RED/CERID monitoring and evaluation	Jean Meadowcroft	8-12/87
i. Incentives for participants and supervisors should be improved	Jean Meadowcroft	2/88
2. <u>Technical Assistance</u>		
a. An instructional radio writer/producer should be recruited as soon as possible to work with RED staff on the revision of the English tuition course	Jean Meadowcroft	7/87
b. An ESL teacher should be recruited locally to coach actors	Jean Meadowcroft	8/87
c. Instructional radio mathematics and science specialist should be recruited when MOEC plans for revision are completed	Jean Meadowcroft	2/88
d. The technical assistance to RED supplied by the current IEES advisor and AID Research Advisor should continued through 1988	Jean Meadowcroft	6/88
3. <u>Institutionalization</u>		
a. RED should be institutionalized by merger either with the Training Sub-Division or with Audio Visual Division of CTSDC	Jean Meadowcroft	12/88

E. ACTION DECISIONS APPROVED BY MISSION OR AID/W OFFICE DIRECTOR-ACTION REQUIRED	NAME OF OFFICER RESPONSIBLE FOR ACTION	DATE ACTION TO BE COMPLETED
b. Ensure that the best available people are selected for the 20 permanent position	Jean Meadowcroft	6/87-2/88
c. RED should request the continuation of 27 temporary positions for fiscal year 1987-88 in order to be able to carry out its responsibilities	Jean Meadowcroft	7/87
d. RED should pursue the development of a distance education support system through cooperation with the District Education Offices (DEOs)	Jean Meadowcroft	7/87
e. No overseas additional training should be carried out until the English tuition program is thoroughly revised. On-the-job training efforts should continue	Jean Meadowcroft	12/87
4. <u>Future Action by USAID/Nepal</u>		
a. Following the appointment of qualified staff and leadership and the clarification or RED's administrative placement. USAID should carry out an assessment of MOEC's radio education capacity, the most promising program areas and target audiences needing attending, the effective coverage of Radio Nepal's transmitters, and the need and feasibility of further AID support for radio education following the end of RETT II	Jean Meadowcroft	12/88

H. EVALUATION ABSTRACT

Since 1978, USAID/Nepal has supported the development of an educational radio capability within the Ministry of Education and Culture (MOEC) of His Majesty's Government of Nepal by means of two successive Radio Education Teacher Training (RETT) Projects. These projects focused on the development of a Radio Education Division (RED) within the MOEC that would deliver in-service training programs to primary school teachers who lacked a high school diploma--the School Leaving Certificate (SLC).

RETT II began in 1984 with the goal of developing radio courses in English, mathematics, science, and Nepali, the four subjects causing most SLC failures. Passing the SLC was seen as a strong motivating force for under-SLC teachers because the SLC is required for permanent appointment as a teacher. Teachers with the SLC are also entitled to a higher salary. RETT II has the additional goals of improving the research capability of RED and CERID (Research Center for Education Innovation and Development) and the capacity of Radio Nepal to broadcast two programs simultaneously.

During the first three years of RETT II, there has been a continuing development of RED's ability to create and deliver educational radio programs. The RED office building has been expanded and additional recording equipment has been installed. Radio Nepal has received equipment and training. The Government of Nepal provided 45 temporary staff positions for RED including a second class officer position for the Chief of RED, the highest level yet sanctioned for that unit. AID technical advisors have

(See Continuation)

I. EVALUATION COST

1. Evaluation Team

Name	Affiliation	Contract No. OR TDY Person Days	Contract Cost OR TDY Cost (US\$)	Source of Funds
Dr. Willard D. Shaw Team Leader Academy for Educational Development, WASH, DC		PDC-1406-I-00- 4052-00, Work Order No. 34	40,244	Project 367-0146 PD&S
Mr. David C. Edgerton Academy for Educational Development, WASH, DC				
Dr. Mana P. Wagley Tribhuvan University Kathmandu, Nepal				

2. Mission Professional
Staff Person days (estimate) 12

3. Borrower/Grantee
Professional Staff
Person-Days (estimate) 30

Continued from Section II

assisted RED in the development of its management, evaluation, and program production components. A scriptwriting/production/ evaluation process has been put into place, staff members have been trained, and 117 twenty-minute English language lessons have been pilot-tested with 171 teachers in five districts. A revised version of this series will be broadcast to over 400 teachers in 10 districts during 1987.

Although USAID/Nepal has provided support to RED for the last eight years, the division has been slow to develop due to leadership and staff changes and a lack of institutionalization. RED has had at least eight directors (many of them "acting") and has changed its administrative location four times. Of the twenty RETT I staff members sent overseas for training, only six are still working at RED. RETT II, therefore, had to start the staff development process all over again. Delays in fulfillment of certain project covenants in the grant agreement hindered the flow of funds from both governments and further restricted progress. Despite these difficulties, RETT II has succeeded in developing and testing its English language tuition program; however, the project is behind schedule and has little chance of reaching the ambitious targets set out in the project plan.

The actions of the next few months will be crucial in determine if RED will continue to develop as a professional radio education unit capable of serving the needs of the MOEC. A number of vitually important issues have to be successfully resolved soon if RED is to enter into a period of sustained and positive growth. Among those issues are:

- o the staffing and leadership of RED
- o the nature of its target audiences and programming
- o its permanent place within the MOEC administrative framework
- o its ability to produce high quality, effective educational radio program
- o its development of a distance education support system that enhances the learning of its program participants
- o its success in developing a constituency within the MOEC that will support its budget and staffing requests
- o its future relationship with AID

Important lessons:

1. Project design should be appropriate to institutional administrative capabilities
2. Technical objectives should be based on feasibility studies of the technical demands of project objectives and technical capabilities of the institutions.

Date this summary prepared: August, 1987

J. SUMMARY OF EVALUATION FINDINGS, CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

o Name of Mission or Office: USAID/Nepal/PDIS

o Purpose of Activity Evaluated

The overall purpose of the RETT projects is to increase the access of children in Nepal to relevant effective education through the use of distance education systems, instructional radio in particular. RETT II has aimed at providing primary teachers with radio-based, in-service training in English and other core academic areas.

o Purpose of the Evaluation and Methodology Used

This is a mid-point evaluation of the RETT II project. The report also offers recommendations regarding the institutionalization of systems and resources developed.

Methodology. The evaluation team reviewed all available RETT documentation, interviewed the staff and technical advisors of the Radio Education Division, and talked with many other associates and friends of the projects in the Ministry of Education, the Research Centre for Education Innovation and Development (CERID), and elsewhere in government and education. The team also gathered information through questionnaires distributed to 126 teachers in four of the five districts that have participated to date in RETT II pilot activities and met with 24 of these teachers in Nuwakot District.

The team presented its preliminary findings to Radio Education Division staff and other key people associated with the project at an intensive one-day workshop, February 23, 1987. The comments and suggestions of the workshop participants figured importantly in subsequent deliberations.

o Findings, Conclusions and Recommendations

I. TECHNICAL STATE OF THE PROJECT

A. THE SCRIPTWRITING/PRODUCTION/EVALUATION(SPE) CYCLE

Findings and Conclusions

- o In its pilot year the RETT II SPE system scripted, produced and broadcast 117 twenty-minute radio lessons
- o There is little practical linkage between the script development and production phases of the cycle.
- o The Instructional Materials Production Specialist served as the technical manager of the SPE cycle, it is appropriate that a technical advisor should set up the system, see that the work gets underway, and show the host country staff how the system works. But no host country staff member is positioned to assume these responsibilities.

(See Continuation)

- o The RETT II studio product to date is not acceptable, because it employed untrained actors and producers.
- o RETT II formative evaluation for Pilot English consisted of two elements: an observation group of learner participants gathered at RED, and field observations by CERID of learners listening to lessons at home.

Recommendations

1. RED should focus achieving marked improvement in program quality.
2. Qualified candidates for the three key technical positions of Script Editor, Production Supervisor, and Studio Producer should be identified at the earliest possible date.
3. Efforts should be made to develop internal RED formative evaluation capability during the coming year and parallel efforts throughout the Division should be made to devise practical systems to incorporate the entire SPE staff into the formative feedback system.

B. RESEARCH AND EVALUATION

Findings and Conclusions

- o Two external entities, CERID and IEES, contribute to RETT II research and evaluation activities. IEES provides technical advice in research and evaluation and often serves as liaison between CERID and RED. It appears that communication between CERID and RED is not always complete. The issue of communication arises in the first place from the fact that project research and evaluation capability has not been developed internally, but is attached to the project from outside.
- o The CERID formative evaluation component is not sufficiently responsive to the needs of the project; likewise, the SPE system has not been responsive to formative evaluation information. Formative evaluation feedback from the field reached RED too late to be of much use in program development.
- o The IEES-developed Integrated Evaluation Plan is overambitious. The Integrated Evaluation Plan does not provide cost estimates by activity or prioritization of activities.
- o One CERID staffer recently returned from the U.S. project-funded graduate work. IEES and AID (through the Research/Education Systems Designer) are providing ongoing technical assistance to CERID.
- o RED's internal research capability has not developed very far to date. The revised staffing plan, scheduled for implementation on July 15, reduces the RED research staff from two people to one.

Recommendations

1. Following a review of financial and human resources, the evaluation committee needs to prioritize the activities outlined in the Integrated Evaluation Plan, prepare a cost estimate, and establish a time line for carrying out high priority items.
2. The present multiple arrangements, involving IEES and CERID from outside the project, should probably continue for as long as they are needed to ensure adequate evaluation activities. Coordination meetings involving the IEES advisors, CERID and the RED staff should take place regularly at two-month intervals.
3. The contract of the Nepali IEES advisor should be extended to advise and assist the new RED research officer.
4. The contract of the Researcher/Education Systems Designer should be extended to ensure the quality of the evaluation component. Ways must be found for him to shift more of his attention to research and evaluation. He also needs to place increasing amounts of responsibility for research and evaluation in the hands of his Nepali colleagues.
5. Greater emphasis must be placed on developing internal RED capability to carry out both formative and summative evaluation. This work can begin when the permanent Research Officer position is filled.
6. Formative evaluation plans should be implemented using three groups of teacher informants to evaluate lessons and regular field visits to learner households in the Kathmandu Valley Area. Observation experience is the cornerstone of staff professional development, for the scriptwriters in particular.

C. STUDIO ACTORS

Findings and Conclusions

- o Studio actors during the first RETT II operational year were of poorly paid young amateurs. The performance of the actors in Pilot English I was so bad that it effectively neutralized the efforts of the other RED components.
- o The faults of the actors have to do with the most basic tools of the actor's craft: coming in tightly on cues; presenting lively, believable readings; building and sustaining characterization; using to good effect the mechanics of voice pitch and register.
- o The talent's English articulation is likewise inadequate. Both instructions and practice material are often unintelligible.

Recommendations

1. RED should spend the money necessary to hire professional actors or very talented amateurs. For Pilot English II, the Team recommends the use of a cast of only three people, who can perform well in English.

D. ENGLISH

Findings and Conclusions

- o Pilot English ("Radio Tuition") was completed during January 1987. The series consists of 117 twenty-minute radio lessons broadcast three times weekly for 39 weeks.
- o The Pilot English material conforms in design to the Interactive Radio Instruction (IRI) system, with particular reference to applications developed for the Radio Language Arts Project (RLAP)/Kenya. The IRI model features an intense candence of pauses for active learner response to radio-delivered cues; a cueing system that depends on questions and answers, with many possible variations; immediate correction and reinforcement of responses; highly systematic design; and a segmented program format. Pilot English shows all these features and is in design terms a successful replication of basic IRI systems. However, the technical quality of the radio lessons is inadequate.
- o The instructional master plan, or "Scheme of Work," for Pilot English I consists of 19 instructional "frames" based on the curriculum. It is aimed at providing a comprehensive review of English language skills based on an achievement test administered to teachers in the pilot districts. The result is a broad spread of material to be taught. Reading skills are aimed at the Grade 7-10 textbooks, but oral practice dips down as low as grade five. The multi-grade level of the target material often made it difficult to write cohesive scripts and sometimes resulted in confusion for the learners.
- o The Pilot English scripts do not adequately take the nature of the learner into account. This is evident in the general scripted tone of voice and in the choice and use of characters, settings, dramatic situations, themes, and music.

Recommendations

1. The Evaluation concurs with the internal RED decision to completely redo the Pilot English series. Pilot broadcasts of the revised English series should begin in June 1987.
2. The revised English course should feature a simplified setting and a continuing cast of three characters. The staff should consider the needs not only of the original learner audience of teachers but also of the general listening public.

3. During 1987 RED should pilot-test an attractive study guide to accompany the revised English series. A contract should be provided during the latter half of 1987 to assist in the development of a study guide to accompany the revised English series.
4. The technical advisor position should be filled by an instructional radio writer/producer who is familiar with the interactive radio system and who has experience in the broadcast presentation of ESL material.
5. The revised English broadcasts should be lengthened to 26:30 to allow three minutes for commercial sponsorship. The lessons should be broadcast on the 8:15 to 8:45 p.m. timeslot.

E. MATHEMATICS

Findings and Conclusions

- o Given the importance of maintaining uniformly high standards of program quality, delaying the development of a mathematics course for a year appears absolutely necessary. Trying to generate a math and English course at the same time over the coming year would result, at best, in the generation of two mediocre series. Klaus Galda (RETT II Consultant Report, 1985) argues cogently that, if 'under-SLC teachers' needs in mathematics are to be addressed, the project should develop an intensive two-year upper level course consisting of about two hundred 30 minute programs.
- o There are two other possibilities for a useful mathematics series. One is a mathematics series for teachers focusing on the content of grades 1-5 and on the methodologies needs to teach that content. Another possibility is the development of a radio mathematics series for children, for classroom use in grade 1-3. Such a course could be adapted from existing materials of proven excellence, which have been used successfully in Thailand, Nicaragua, and the Dominican Republic.

Recommendations

1. The design phase of the RETT II mathematics component should be delayed until early 1988.
2. At least three months of technical assistance should be provided early in 1988 for staff training and for the development of the instructional design for the mathematics course.
3. Among other options, and on the basis of a careful needs assessment, RED should consider using its principal resources between 1988 and 1990 for the development of a three year pilot primary level mathematics series on the Thailand/Nicaragua Radio Mathematics model.

F. THE IMPORTANCE OF UNIFORMLY HIGH PROGRAM QUALITY

Findings and Conclusions

- o If institutionalization is to succeed, production quality must be raised to uniformly high standards beginning with the revised English course and sustained therefore. This need is the principal technical findings of the Evaluation Team.

Recommendations

1. An additional long-term (two-year) technical advisor must be made available to the project beginning as soon as possible. The advisor should be an accomplished instructional radio writer-producer with experience in interactive radio instruction.

G. NOTES ON TECHNICAL MATTERS

Findings and Conclusions

- o Radio Nepal broadcast the first Pilot English lessons on the 90-meter shortwave band only. After many complaints from RETT learner-participants about the quality of reception, the broadcasts were moved to the 60-meter band, but learners still complained about poor reception. Participants at Nuwakot complain of a hum that makes the transmissions very difficult to understand.
- o Pilot English was broadcast three times weekly from 6:40 to 7:00 p.m. on Sundays, Tuesdays, and Thursdays. Most Pilot English learner-participants say they would have preferred broadcasts after 7:00 p.m. so that they could finish their other work first. A majority thought the 20 minute Pilot English radio lessons were too short.
- o The RETT projects have provided Radio Nepal with a 100-kilowatt shortwave transmitter, a studio-to-transmitter link, and other equipment. Under RETT I, three Radio Nepal engineers were sent to the U.S. for Master's programs in engineering and one was sent for a three-month program. Two of those engineers are still working for Radio Nepal. One of them is the Chief Engineer.
- o Radio Nepal also receive a \$50,000 grant to form a training unit within the institution. That unit is now being managed by a USAID/N Personal Services Contractor. The unit has conducted "A" level training for studio technicians. "B" level training for radio engineers is scheduled to begin in March. With the joint cooperation of AIBD and Radio Nepal, this unit has also conducted training programs for Radio Nepal technicians on studio and transmitter operation. Two of Radio Nepal's senior engineers will visit the U.S. in April and May for advanced training at sites in Baltimore, Atlanta, and Washington, D.C.

Recommendations

1. RED should probably assume that learners in the Eastern, Mid Western, and Far Western Development Regions cannot receive dependable radio education services as long as those areas are not covered by medium wave.
2. The Team recommends that the revised English series be carried between 8:15 and 8:45 p.m., the only appropriate time slot now available after 7 p.m..
3. During the coming pilot year, the project could experiment with increasing broadcasts to four per week. The team recommendation for program length is 26 minutes 30 seconds.

II. STAFFING

Findings and Conclusions

- o Forty-five temporary positions are authorized for RED by MOEC and have to be renewed each year. Forty-one of these 45 positions are presently filled.
- o Of the 20 people sent for overseas training under RETT I, only 6 are working on RETT II. The USAID training plan for staff members has been in abeyance pending approval of the permanent positions. In-country training workshops for scriptwriters and evaluation personnel have been held.
- o Four people have been sent overseas for Master's degree training. Two have already returned. The other two will return in 1988. One of the returnees is a CERID employee who is already back at work. the other returnee will rejoin RED. It is expected that the other two people will also work with RED after their return, but their present appointments are with CTSDC.
- o MOEC has received permission to create 20 new permanent positions for RED. Their original request had been for 46 posts. At present it is not known if the GON will agree to the continuation of any of the temporary posts.
- o MOEC has ordered that RED be merged with the Training Sub-Division which has 5 permanent positions including a Class II position that could be used for the director slot. The 20 new RED positions do not include a position for director. This merger will move RED out of the sphere of CTSDC and into the Educational Administration Division. There is no current information on how this merger will be accomplished nor on who will head the merged groups.
- o Due to the uncertainty about the future and the troubled history of the project, staff morale is extremely low.

- o At present the RED Chief has little knowledge and perhaps no interest in radio education. It does not appear that he would be an effective leader of the merged divisions. As a new and innovative program, radio education needs dynamic and creative leadership. It needs a person with experience in education and administration, and interest in radio education, and a willingness to learn about approaches to radio and distance education.

Recommendation

1. The RED Chief should move quickly to exert as much control as possible over the process of filling the 20 permanent positions
2. For fiscal year 1987-88 the RED Chief should ensure that RED has the manpower it needs to fulfill its responsibility by requesting continuation of 26 of the present temporary positions, and requesting sufficient budget to hire consultants or other temporary personnel to fill the manpower gap.
3. Given the short lifespan of the project following the July 1987 appointment of the permanent staff and the amount of work to be accomplished, training efforts should be directed at on-the-job types of activities that will not significantly interrupt the completion of project work. No foreign training is recommended until 1988.
4. MOEC should resolve project leadership.

III INCENTIVES FOR LEARNERS

Findings and Conclusions

- o Unlike the RETT I teachers, the RETT II teachers will not automatically receive an increase in salary following their successful completion of the RETT II course. Their only salary increase will come if the program helps them to pass the SLC.
- o Most of the teachers in the RETT II program are in temporary positions. They need to pass the SLC in order to become permanent. This is the main attraction for them to join any course that prepares them for the SLC. But the program can not help them very much to pass the SLC because many have to do the SLC in seven to nine subjects, and the English language tuition course is not enough to help them with the large learning task they face in all of those subjects.
- o RETT II teachers are allowed to purchase a radio from RED for Rs.500. The market price of that radio is Rs.1100. The subsidized radio is a strong incentive for joining the program--not necessarily for completing the course.
- o The participants appear to have strong self-motivation to learn. Seventy-six percent of the 126 English Tuition candidates surveyed

wanted to have broadcasts more than three times a week; 23% were willing to have them seven days a week. Ninety-five percent wanted the programs to last at least 30 minutes. On average the participants said that they could spend 37 minutes a day four days a week in self study outside of radio time.

Recommendations

1. The availability of a subsidized radio should be linked in some way to completion of the course and taking the post-test, and not just to enrollment in the course. Perhaps those who fail to take the post-test should be required to pay the full market cost of the radio.
2. RED should issue certificates to those who successfully complete the broadcast and pass the post-test. No monetary reward would accompany the certificate. Prizes could be awarded to people who score highest on the post-test.
3. If the English tuition course is to be geared to the SLC, then the present programs should be rewritten and focused on the content of grades 9-10. Broadcasts should follow the sequence of the books and a study guide should be prepared to help teachers follow the radio course and to give explanations and exercises that are not in the regular books. The broadcasts and study guide should be geared towards the format of the SLC to help participants prepare for that examination.
4. Broadcasts should include assignments for the learners so that they are motivated to study more, and answers to those assignments so that the learners receive feedback on their progress and problems.

IV. INSTITUTIONALIZATION AT THE REGIONAL AND DISTRICT LEVEL

Findings and Conclusions

- o. The District Education Officers of the first five project districts have been included in the planning of present RETT II activities and have attended a program at RED where they made their own recommendations for improvement of the program. Four of their recommendations have already been acted upon:
 1. use of a selection process for enrolling RETT participants
 2. placing of a radio cassette player and copies of all broadcasts at each DEO
 3. provision of TADA (Travel Allowance - Daily Allowance) from RED for supervisors to make visits to RETT participants in their area.
 4. provision of radios for RETT supervisors.

Four suggestions are included in plans for the second pilot phase:

1. organization of contact sessions for "clusters" of teachers twice during the radio course time as well as one individual visit by a supervisor to each learner
 2. one supervisor given the responsibility for supervising the RETT participants in their district
 3. supervisors reporting to RED on a regular basis
 4. training for the DEOs and supervisors
- o During the first Pilot Phase, the supervisors did not visit the teachers due to the lack of funds for traveling. Their supervision allowance of 33% of salary was cut by the government; however, RED did train one supervisor from each of the five project districts in the basics of the RETT approach and the need for supervision. For the second phase of the Pilot English Program, RED plans to implement a supervision schedule in all of the 10 districts. RED has recently sent Rs. 2,500 to each of the first 5 districts to be used for supervisor travel to visit RETT participants.

Recommendations

1. RED should continue to implement the steps it has already taken and strongly pursue the goal of constructing a distance education support and supervision system for RED program participants.
2. Money for field supervision should be allocated for the fiscal year 1987-88. RED should outline the requirements for its use by the DEOs, a time schedule for field visits, and a reporting system to document whom the supervisor has seen and what he has done and learned.
3. The supervisors need to be trained by RED staff on their role as RED facilitators and supervisors, the level of support they can expect from RED, and the details of the RED program. The DEOs should be informed of the responsibilities of the RED supervisors, their instructions and work plans.
4. RED should explore ways in which to maintain and improve the performance of the supervisors through such means as an honorarium, additional training, special certificates of recognition, prizes, special broadcast programs, etc.

V. INSTITUTIONALIZATION OF THE RADIO EDUCATION DIVISION

Findings and Conclusions

- o Under the RETT I and II programs, new office facilities have been constructed and equipped for RED, including a new recording studio. Following the completion of current renovations, the physical plant will be more than sufficient to meet RED's present needs.

- o Only 6 of the 20 people who received overseas training during RETT I are working on RETT II. Of the 45 temporary staff positions sanctioned by the MOEC, 41 have been filled. Most of the current professional staff have been working with the foreign technical advisors for two years.
- o The GON has recently agreed that 20 permanent positions be created for RED. This represents a major step in the process of the institutionalization of RED from a "project" to a full-fledged government unit. (RED and USAID/N had requested that 46 permanent posts be created, but the GON is under heavy pressure to decrease the size of its bureaucracy rather than increase it. The creation of these posts in the face of this pressure must be seen as a positive step.) The 20 permanent positions for RED will possibly be filled by July 1987.
- o The MOEC has recently made the decision to move RED from its present position under CTSDC (Curriculum, Textbooks and Supervision Development Center) to the Educational Administration Division and to merge it under the Training Sub-Division which currently has five permanent positions. The transfer of RED to the Training Sub-Division would mean that RED would be limited to teacher training activities only. The responsibility for in-school broadcasts and other types of educational radio programs would remain with the Audio-Visual Division of CTSDC which has far less capability than RED.

Recommendations

1. MOEC should fill the permanent position with quality personnel and continue the 26 temporary positions. The staffing and leadership issue must be successfully resolved.
2. MOEC should review how the Radio Education Division should evolve into independent Distance Education Center servicing all of the radio education needs of the MOEC. Creating a DEC could be done by the current merger with the Training Sub-Division. This unit should be merged with the Audio-Visual Division of CTSDC to create an independent Distance Education Center.

o Lessons Learned

- o Lesson 1. RETT II project design referred to RED leadership problems, then proceeded to establish the not-yet appointed project chief as project manager - not only to develop and administer RETT, but to coordinate several institution's work. MOEC had no person with qualifications to lead a radio instruction project. Project administration should be designed in accord with host ministry capabilities; a weak project administration cannot carry out a complex project.

- o Lesson 2 - RETT II contracting was designed to include at least 3 separate USAID TA contracts and for USAID to arrange nearly all training, construction and commodities. This not only made project complex, and but increased the administrative work of USAID. Unless the host ministry has a proven record of competent project administration, USAID should arrange one TA contract with a Chief of Party and have that contractor arrange for training and commodities.

- o Lesson 3 - The project design asserts the need to raise teacher's level of education from below 8 grade up to SLC equivalent (more than just 10th grade pass) in four subject areas; that is, to instruct 3 grade levels in each subject in each one year period. No study of the technical feasibility of such instructional programming was done. Also, the design referred to high turnover (loss) of RETT I staff but only provided 3 work years of long term TA. The low levels of trained staff and technical assistance are in contradiction with the ambitious technical objectives of the project. Technical design of a project must take into account the feasibility of technical objectives, and relate those to technical capabilities of the host institution, and technical inputs to be provided.

J M

HIS MAJESTY'S GOVERNMENT
MINISTRY OF EDUCATION AND CULTURE
(TRAINING DIVISION)

Ref. No. (TD)043/44 Cha. No. 204

Date: March 19, 1987

Mr. Virgil D. Miedema
Project Development Officer
USAID/Nepal

Received with thanks the draft report on the mid-term evaluation of Radio Education Teacher Training Project. In this regard, we were unable to discuss with the team in detail about the evaluation, and because it is only briefly discussed during the review session, it may be possible that proper attention could not have been paid to many other issues. Although we have not been able to send our comments within the time allowed for any corrections and/or changes on the draft report received, I would like to draw your attention to the following points.

It seems that most of the problems pointed out in the report are important ones and measures suggested therein are appreciable. But, more time is needed to study and provide comments and suggestions on the report. Additionally, it is also important to include comments and suggestions from the Project Policy Committee. Therefore, I would like to inform you that a meeting of the Committee will be held as soon as possible and major points contained in the report will be discussed.

However, your immediate attention is drawn to the following points.

Comments received from some sectors indicate that English tuition program produced and broadcast last year was not good and effective. It is but natural that some program don't get 100% success in the beginning.

In response to questions concerning the program for the teachers, only 16% of teachers have answered that they want to appear in the SLC, while 80 teachers answered that they want to improve their teaching method. These varied responses clearly indicates that there is a need to rethink about the program.

The evaluators have contacted and obtained comments and suggestions from many organizations and individuals on the effectiveness of the program. But, the types of comments and suggestions received from these organizations and individuals were not included in the report. The report could have been more effective if it contained in sufficient detail description of comments and suggestions received.

In the beginning the program was conducted for only about 200 teachers from five districts. Based on a year's experience and some comments received on the program conducted for relatively few teachers from only few districts, is it fair to conclude that the decision taken to change (revise) the program is appropriate?

Secondly, on the one hand, it is suggested to postpone Math program until 1988, and postpone Science and Nepali tuition courses for an indefinite period. But, on the other hand, the project's objective and program is to conduct every year English, Math, Science and Nepali broadcasts. In the annual program of the project, the goal set for this year is to broadcast Math lessons. According to the objective and the program of the project, it is understood that participating teachers and people in other sectors were assured of continuity of program broadcasts and subsequently teachers were enrolled last year in English tuition course.

But, the sudden decision to broadcast only English program this year and conduct Math program in the next year will mislead teachers enrolled in English tuition course last year. It also raised the possibility that teachers expecting to participate in the second group including people in general will have no faith and lose confidence on the program and objective of the project. Additionally, it will also affect the annual program targetted by the project.

Because of these reasons, I realize it is highly essential to conduct, as far as possible, Math program in this current fiscal year. If it is not possible to conduct Math program, then it is essential to conduct one additional program, either Science or Nepali. The Grant Agreement has a provision for technical assistance to plan and formulate the program, and you are requested to advise in time if it is not possible to immediately arrange and provide the services of one technical assistant.

Finally, I would like to inform you that the meeting of the Project Policy Formulation Committee will be called shortly and necessary suggestions on the draft evaluation report will be sent to you after it is discussed in the meeting.

Sincerely,

Gopi Nath Sharma
Joint Secretary

cc; The Secretary
Ministry of Education and Culture
Kaiser Mahal, Kathmandu

The Director
USAID
c/o American Embassy
Kathmandu, Nepal