

(Mission or AID/W Office)

yes slipped ad hoc

(ES# FY 88-1)

Eval. Plan Submission Date: FY87 Q 4th

PD-AAW-86

D. ACTIVITY OR ACTIVITIES EVALUATED (List the following information for project(s) or program(s) evaluated; If not applicable, list title and date of the evaluation report)

Project #	Project/Program Title (or title & date of evaluation report)	First PROAG or equivalent (FY)	Most recent PACD (mo/yr)	Planned LOP Cost (000)	St tr (
	PL 480 Title II Program	1956	N/A	N/A	

E. ACTION DECISIONS APPROVED BY MISSION OR AID/W OFFICE DIRECTOR

Action(s) Required	Name of officer responsible for Action	Date Action to be Completed
1. CARE and the MOE will begin a longitudinal study to measure educational impact of school feeding program.	SECPLAN** CARE MOE JCastillo TPark	March 1988
2. Growth surveillance systems should be integrated in all MCH programs of the JNBS *, The Mission will encourage efforts toward such integration.	JNBS CARE TPark JCastillo	March 1988

* National Social Welfare Board

** Ministry of Planning

Best Available Copy

(Attach extra sheet if necessary)

F. DATE OF MISSION OR AID/W OFFICE REVIEW OF EVALUATION: mo 10 day 1 yr 87

G. APPROVALS OF EVALUATION SUMMARY AND ACTION DECISIONS:

Project/Program Officer	Representation of Borrower, Grantee	Evaluation Officer	Mission or AID/W Office Director
E. Szepesy Typed Name: Thomas E. Park Juan J. Castillo		Carmen Zambrana Carmen Zambrana	John A. Sanbraillo Mission Director
Date: _____	Date: <u>N/A</u>	Date: <u>11/14/87</u>	Date: <u>11/27/87</u>

1. Purpose of the PL 480 Title II Program: This program attempts to meet the nutritional deficiency problem in Honduras through selected supplemental feeding activities. More than 100,000 beneficiaries receive food under the Maternal Child Health (MCH) component of the program; and nearly 300,000 school children and 6,000 people participate under the School Feeding (SF) and Food for Work components, respectively.

2. Purpose of the Evaluation and Methodology Used: To determine if the maternal child health and school feeding programs contribute to the Mission objectives of reducing infant mortality and increasing primary school attendance, and if there is a justifiable basis for continuing the PL 480 Title II program.

Two basic questionnaires, one for the maternal and child feeding program and one for school feeding beneficiaries, were designed. In addition, one basic questionnaire for the control groups was developed. The questionnaires were pretested and eight experienced interviewers were provided by a subcontract with ADAI (Ateneo de la Agroindustria). Data were collected in four weeks during the spring of 1987.

3. Findings and Conclusions were inconclusive. Under the school feeding program math and social studies grades were positively affected by consumption of the beverage, although not science or Spanish grades. No direct relationship between drinking the beverage and school attendance or nutritional status was found. Children most in need of the snack are drinking it. Under the MCH program, PL 480 food, whether consumed at a feeding center or consumed at home and shared with the entire family, improved women's childbearing and children's growth.

4. Lessons Learned:

- Targeting strategies and complementary inputs including the training of teachers and school supervisors should be tailored to selected areas.
- Future evaluations involving SF and MCH studies should have a more realistic time frame.
- Greatest problems in program delivery occur within the community organizations where targeting is minimal and surveillance is lacking.
- Program overlap between JNBS (National Social Welfare Board) and community centers contributes to program delivery problems.
- Without growth monitoring it is very difficult to assess the programs' nutritional impact.

I. EVALUATION COSTS

1. Evaluation Team Name	Affiliation	Contract Number OR TDY Person-Days	Contract Cost OR TDY Cost (US\$)	Source of Funds
Mrs. Meredith Smith	Winrock, Inc.	522-9103-I-00-6249-00	63,504	PD&S
Dr. Edgar Nesman	Winrock, Inc.	522-9103-I-00-6249-00		PD&S

Best Available Copy

J. SUMMARY OF EVALUATION FINDINGS, CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS (Try not to exceed the 3 pages provided)
Address the following items:

- Purpose of activity(ies) evaluated
- Purpose of evaluation and Methodology used
- Findings and conclusions (relate to questions)
- Principal recommendations
- Lessons learned

Mission or Office: USAID/HONDURAS HRD/FFP Date this summary prepared: September 4, 1987
 Title and Date of Full Evaluation Report: Implementation and Impact Evaluation of PL 480 Title II

1. Purpose of the Activities Evaluated: The PL 480 Title II program has operated for almost 30 years in Honduras, bringing in about 305 millions tons of food worth approximately \$48.7 million dollars. Currently about 116,000 children and pregnant or lactating women participate in maternal child health programs, and 6,000 people in food-for-work programs. An additional 330,000 children in grades 1 through 6 receive supplementary beverages or snacks made with foods donated under PL 480. Despite the magnitude of this program, few evaluations have been made, and most of those have focused on delivery of food rather than its impact on the nutritional status of the beneficiaries.

PL 480 commodities are imported into Honduras under the auspices of Catholic Relief Services (CRS)/CARITAS and CARE. These agencies prepare annual food requests, process the paperwork, and import the food into the country.

The objective of the school feeding program is to improve school attendance, thereby helping achieve the USAID Mission's objective of increasing the proportion of children who complete the sixth grade. A ration of 1.5 lb of nonfat dry milk and 2.5 lb of CSM per month is allocated for each student.

The maternal child health program is more complicated. There are two basic types of programs: take home and on-site. The objective of both programs is to improve the nutritional status of children under the age of 6 and of pregnant or lactating women.

2. Purpose of the Evaluation and Methodology Used: Winrock International was contracted by USAID/Honduras during the spring of 1987 to evaluate the impact of PL 480 Title II. The results of the evaluation were to be used by USAID to further Mission objectives and by voluntary agencies and Government of Honduras agencies to improve the targeting and effectiveness of the program.

USAID/Honduras developed the following objectives for the evaluation:

- a. to assess the program's efficiency;
- b. to assess the impact of the school feeding program;
- c. to assess the impact of the maternal child health subprogram;
- d. to assess the adequacy of the nutritional composition of rations for overcoming nutritional deficiencies;
- e. to assess the impact of the food-for-work activities on the socio-economic development of the family and community; and
- f. to assess the cost effectiveness of the Title II program, including a calculation of the per capita cost of the food served or the cost per ration distributed.

Methodology Used: The work plan was specific about the survey design and sample selection. The evaluation was to include a field survey of beneficiaries from all three maternal child health programs and the school feeding program with a control group for each. A stratified random sample was to be drawn so that the data could be stratified magnitude of malnutrition, rural/urban residence, sex, length of participation in the program, and degree of efficiency of program management. Anthropometric measurements were to be made of all participants and members of the control groups. Control communities were to be selected in the vicinity of program communities.

At the beginning of the study it was assumed that CARE's system for delivering the commodities from the port to regional warehouses or distribution points was well-controlled and that the commodities were reaching the intended program sites. Therefore, the evaluation concentrated on the end user of the commodities. The questions to be answered were: Are the beneficiaries the group targeted by the respective agencies? Do the intended beneficiaries actually receive the commodities? If so, what impact do the commodities have on the nutritional status of the beneficiaries?

Methodological problems that affected the survey design and sample selection were as follows: no baseline data; lack of clearly defined objectives for each program; lack of clearly defined indicators of program success; lack of a control group in the selected communities for the school feeding program; numerous maternal child health programs in the communities visited; lack of CARITAS program data at the national level; the large number of breakdowns and variables requested, and an unrealistic time frame.

Additional problems encountered in the field that affected the survey included the following: length of time required to reach isolated centers; need to return to schools or programs that were not in session on original day of visit; unanticipated program changes or suspensions; lack of data in the schools for transfer students; and lack of data on days of actual school sessions.

Because of these problems, the original survey design was modified. CRS/CARITAS programs, which were evaluated in May 1985, were eliminated from this evaluation. Since schools without feeding programs were scarce, the controls were children who did not drink the beverage provided by the program. The sample size was reduced by one-third (from 600 plus 300 controls to 600 including controls).

Questionnaire Design: Two basic questionnaires were designed: one for maternal child health program beneficiaries and one for school feeding program beneficiaries. The questionnaire used for the controls consisted of the demographic, socioeconomic, and anthropometric sections of the maternal child health program questionnaire. The questionnaires were tested in a rural community near Tegucigalpa. They were modified at that time and after interviewer training. Fidel Barahona López, Director of the National Nutrition Survey that was being conducted at the same time by the Ministry of Health (MOH), also reviewed the questionnaires. Eight experienced interviewers were provided through a subcontract with ADAI. Data were gathered the last week in February and the first three weeks of March 1987.

The control group was recruited by going from house to house in control communities. The communities selected had no more than one of the programs being evaluated.

Best Available Copy

3. Findings and Conclusions:

School Feeding: Children whose mothers received nutrition education from a homemaker club were much more likely to drink the beverage than those whose mothers did not participate in such clubs.

Math and social studies grades were positively affected by consumption of the beverage. Children who need the nutrition supplement the most are drinking it. The benefits of the beverage seem to be greatest to this group. No direct relationship between drinking the beverage and school attendance, overall grades, or growth was found.

Maternal Child Programs: The sample included 237 program beneficiaries and 150 controls randomly selected from the areas of estimated high and low malnutrition and from rural and urban areas. Of those surveyed, 77.8% were lactating women. The children were almost evenly divided between males (50.8%) and females (49.2%).

Almost half of the children were normal (48.9%). Only one case of third-degree malnutrition was found -- a child in one of the community programs. There were significant differences in nutritional status among participants in different programs. Public health programs had more first and second-degree malnourished and fewer normal children than did the other programs. Beneficiaries of public health programs were more likely than participants in other programs to receive nutrition information (65.1%).

The PL 480 Title II food, whether consumed at a feeding center or consumed at home and shared with the entire family, improved women's childbearing and children's growth (height).

Targeting was most effective in the MOH programs, as was nutritional surveillance. No evidence of surveillance in the JNBS or community programs was found. Significant program overlap occurs between the JNBS and community programs.

4. Principal Recommendations:

The final report listed 17 recommendations (see attachment A). Some of the recommendations will be analyzed in November 1987 with GOH counterparts and CARE for their consideration. The Mission will follow up on any decision taken by them. The most important recommendations are listed below:

a. Programs of the JNBS are functioning well, but are not focussed and should be better targeted.

b. The JNBS should reexamine and restate its objectives in a way that can be easily measured. Centers that have scales can weigh children to measure their nutritional status. Centers or "lactarios" without scales can use height for age as the indicator of long-term (chronic) nutritional status. Arm circumference could also be used; but it is best used to measure severe malnutrition. Therefore, this method may have only limited applicability for Honduras where children are more likely to be moderately malnourished.

c. The Ministry of Education should consider increasing the caloric content of the beverage served to schoolchildren. Currently, the beverage provides only 8% to 10% of their caloric requirements.

d. Supervision of the programs and communication with the donors should be strengthened. Given the minimal supervision the programs receive, it is amazing that more difficulties were not encountered. Volunteers and auxiliary personnel in charge of many programs do not seem to fully understand delivery problems or why they are or are not receiving food.

e. Nutrition education should be part of food distribution. Information could be made available by homemaker clubs, social workers, or nutrition auxiliaries at public health clinics.

f. Greater use of PL480 food in food-for-work programs should be considered. The food could be provided to trained volunteers for taking measurements or keeping records of program surveillance, preparing food in centers, distributing food at public health centers, or providing nutrition education.

g. Future evaluations must use more realistic time frames. The scope of work for this evaluation clearly defined the work to be done but did not realistically plan how to accomplish it. The work actually involved three evaluations, one for each program: (1) the schoolchild feeding program, (2) the public health food distribution program, (3) the JNBS and community on-site feeding programs.

5. Lessons Learned:

- Targeting strategies and complementary inputs, including the training of teachers and school supervisors, should be tailored to selected areas.

- Future evaluations involving SF and MCH studies should have a more realistic time frame.

- Greatest problems in program delivery occur within the community organizations where targeting is minimal and surveillance is lacking.

- Program overlap between JNBS and community centers contributes to program delivery problems.

- Without growth monitoring it is very difficult to assess the programs' nutritional impact.

Best Available Copy

K. ATTACHMENTS (List attachments submitted with this Evaluation Summary; always attach copy of full evaluation report, even if one was submitted earlier)

- Attachment A - Recommendations
- Attachment B - Full Evaluation Report
- Attachment C - Outline of Basic Project Identification Data
- Attachment D - Evaluation Scope of Work

L. COMMENTS BY MISSION, AID/W OFFICE AND BORROWER/GRANTEE

- 1) As a first response to the evaluation the Mission has already encouraged efforts of the Ministry of Coordination, Budgeting and Planning (SECPLAN), the Nutrition Institute for Central America and Panama (INCAP), CARE, and the Ministry of Education (MOE) to on the design of a longitudinal study and a survey of needs to promote both a document justification of program objectives and the findings of complementary inputs in the S program.
- 2) The results of the evaluation were not as expected due to a limited timeframe vis-a-vis an ambitious scope of work.
- 3) Action decisions approved by Mission will encourage efforts of the institutions involved in the Program, therefore approval by the grantee is not applicable.

Best Available Copy

RECOMMENDATIONS

Commodities donated under PL 480 Title II improve the nutritional status of pregnant or women and the height of children less than 6 years of age. They also have a positive effect on mathematics and social studies grades of schoolchildren. The foods are reaching the poorest and most needy public health and JNBS beneficiaries and schoolchildren. Each type of program has its own strengths and weaknesses. With greater targeting and some changes in delivery, the programs can become even more effective. Specific recommendations follow.

1. The Ministry of Public Health should strengthen programs that encourage women to limit the number of children they have while continuing to ensure that their children are healthy. Bei
2. The Ministry of Public Health should strengthen communication with nutrition auxiliary personnel in remote areas so problems can be resolved more easily. Bei
3. The Ministry of Public Health should consider adopting one of the pregnancy weight gain charts to record the number of women who achieve satisfactory weight gain during pregnancy. Weight at conception as well as weight gain during pregnancy are very strong predictors of pregnancy outcome and the child's birth weight. (The number of pounds gained during pregnancy must be evaluated in conjunction with the woman's prepregnancy weight). Women with insufficient weight gain, especially during the third trimester, could be targeted for additional food. Don
4. Ministry of Public Health personnel should clarify the ministry's objectives by stating the outcomes they want in a way that can be measured. Appropriate objectives might be: To
wit
Nov
 - a. to increase coverage of targeted pregnant women in the area served by a CESAR or CESAMO by 10% during 1987;
 - b. to increase the number of pregnant women enrolling in the clinic at the beginning of their second trimester by 20% by the end of 1988;
 - c. to increase the number of clinic visits per pregnancy by 20% by the end of 1988;
 - d. to decrease the number of children who are born small for date by 20% during 1987; and
 - e. to decrease the number of spontaneous abortions from nutritional causes by 50% at the end of 3 years.

Best Available Copy

5. Programs of the JNBS should be better targeted. Overlap between JNBS programs and those of other community organizations should be eliminated. Any change in policy to increase targeting in the "lactarios" should be carried out with the cooperation of the women's groups sponsoring the "lactarios". Growth monitoring would improve targeting. Centers that have scales can weigh children to determine their nutritional status. Centers or "lactarios" without scales can use height for age. This is a good indicator of long-term or chronic nutritional status. Arm circumference could also be used but it is a better indicator of severe malnutrition, therefore, this method may have only limited applicability for Honduras where children are more likely to be moderately malnourished. Volunteers can be easily trained to measure the height of children 2 years of age or older. Measuring younger children is more difficult because the children must be measured lying down; however, measuring boards are inexpensive and easy to make, and volunteers can be trained to use them. Given the large number of normal children found in the JNBS and community programs, it seems that greater targeting could be accomplished without denying food to those who truly need it.

To be
January

6. The JNBS should reexamine and restate its objectives in a way that can be measured easily. Depending on their goals, the following objectives might be appropriate:

To be
January

- a. to decrease the level of malnutrition by providing a nutritious food supplement to all children whose weight for age is less than 90% of the standard or whose height is less than 95% of the standard during 1987 (including all children with first-, second-, or third-degree malnutrition)
- b. to increase the amount of disposable income available in low income households by providing 70% of the daily nutritional requirements for children less than 6 years of age who weigh less than 90% of the standard or whose height is less than 95% of the standard during 1987;
- c. to decrease the number of children born small for date by providing a nutritious food supplement containing 50% of the extra nutrients required during pregnancy to all pregnant women during 1987;
- d. to decrease the number of children who die before their first birthday by providing 70% of the nutrients required daily by lactating women whose children are born small for date or weigh less than 90% of the standard;

Best Available Copy

7. Plans of the JNBS for technicians to become independent of political changes should be encouraged. The JNBS is a political organization whose professionals change with every change in the national presidency. Changes in political appointees brings changes in administration in every country, but the problem seems to be greater in Honduras than in many other countries. The current JNBS professionals are dedicated and have accomplished a great deal as evidenced by the functioning of the "lactarios".
8. The Ministry of Education should consider increasing the caloric content of the beverage served to schoolchildren. Currently the beverage provides only 8% to 10% of their caloric requirements. This may not be enough to affect growth. This study was conducted at the beginning of the school year, before the food actually arrived, so consumption data were based on memories of the previous year. The sample was limited to 178 children who had access to the beverage the previous year and whose grades were available.
9. Before plans are made to discontinue the program in a particular geographic area, a longitudinal study should be conducted as follows: A larger number of schools in each department, perhaps five, should be randomly selected. Every nth child in each school should be measured (height for age) as soon as possible. Attendance records and grades for each child should be recorded along with the reasons for any absences. A simple card could be developed to measure the amount of the beverage or snack consumed by the child each day -- the card should have enough pictures of a glass or snack for one month. Each day that the child consumes the supplement, he/she should color in the amount consumed on the glass or snack picture. The cards and attendance and grade information could be forwarded to Tegucigalpa for analysis. Height should be measured again at the end of the year. Because grades can be affected by teacher bias, a subsample should be given some type of standardized test at the beginning and end of the study, perhaps one of the nonculturally-biased tests of cognitive development used in Guatemala.
10. Community programs should be evaluated by an outside evaluator or by the donor agency to determine if continued assistance is justifiable. The diversity of the community programs makes recommendations difficult. The food is used as a financial aid to the center, as one part of an integrated program, as an incentive to participate in income-generating activities, produce food, or attend health centers. Community programs have the least amount of targeting and surveillance.
- Not feasible
This is a political decision
the GOH.
- To be discussed
after
conclusion
the longitudinal study
- To be done
by February
1988
- To be discussed
with CAR
and GOH
counterpart
agencies
November

Best Available Copy

11. Supervision of the programs and communication with donors should be strengthened. Given the minimal supervision the programs receive, it is amazing that more difficulties were not encountered. Volunteers and auxiliary personnel in charge of many programs do not seem to fully understand the program or why they are or are not receiving food. At all of the centers encountered during the survey that were not receiving food personnel indicated that they did not know why they were not receiving food or how they could start receiving it again. (It may be that the representatives of some centers did know, especially when they had been dropped for a just reason, but thought the survey team could provide more food). Remote or isolated centers are difficult to supervise. CARE should develop a short guide to program protocol and provide copies to each center.

To be di
with CAR
GOH cou
by Nover
1987

12. CARE supervisors should confirm that the food reaches the program beneficiaries. CARE follows up in the school feeding program, but it seems less concerned about what happens to the food in the maternal child health programs after it leaves the CARE warehouse. CARE supervisors rarely visit most of these programs. When they do visit, they should make very clear what agency they are representing and the purpose of their visit.

Being d

13. Nutrition education should be part of food distribution to the maternal child health programs as is to the school feeding programs. Information could be made available by homemaker clubs social workers, or nutrition auxiliaries at public health clinics. Nurses at the CESARs are too busy during clinic times to teach patients about nutrition. Given the large number of families with radios, a mass media nutrition-education campaign might be considered. This would require external funding.

Being d

14. Greater use of PL 480 food in food-for-work programs should be considered. The food could be used to pay trained volunteers for taking measurements or keeping records of program surveillance preparing food in centers, distributing food at public health centers, or providing nutrition education. Food could be provided to a family for a short period (3 to 12 months) to enable family members to learn job skills, plant new crops, plant a home garden, or use new agricultural technology. The food would let the family try something new without risking hunger.

To be d
with CAI
GOH cou
by Nover
1987

Best Available Copy

15. Use of the food in processed products should be considered. The CSM and milk can be combined with a source of calories, such as oil or sugar, to provide a baked product that is higher in calories. Perhaps some of the commodities can be as payment to the bakeries. A weaning food, similar to Incapirina, would be developed for use in the maternal child health programs. Any products should be taste tested by consumers. Some schools, Junta centers, and community centers probably already offer such products should be tested by other centers.

16. The possibility of a food production disincentive should be investigated. There should be a follow-up on the lack of household food production, especially among the rural public health beneficiaries versus the control group. Perhaps the public health beneficiaries are landless or have less access to technology. If that is the case, PL 480 food might be used to provide food to rural families until they can adopt new agriculture technologies.

17. Future evaluations must use more realistic time frames. The scope of work for this evaluation clearly defined the work to be done but did not realistically plan how to accomplish it. The work actually involved three evaluations, one for each program: 1) the school feeding program; 2) the public health food distribution program; and 3) the JNBS and community on-site feeding programs. For each of these at least 3 months were required to plan, collect data, analyze, and report. At least 1 month is required to design and test a questionnaire and train interviewers before data collection can begin.

SECPLA
conduc
feasib
study
nation
plant
produc
blende
Maisoy
and so
substi
SF sna
decisi
howeve
in the
not in
Missio

For O/
consid
when t
ES is

Will b
throug
longit
study

Best Available Copy