

PD-ART-862
SN=46093

CLASSIFICATION
PROJECT EVALUATION SUMMARY (PES) PART I

Report Symbol U-447

1. PROJECT TITLE Opportunities Industrialization Centers _ ORG	2. PROJECT NUMBER 669-0168	3. MISSION/AID/W OFFICE USAID/Liberia
	4. EVALUATION NUMBER (Enter the number maintained by the reporting unit e.g., Country or AID/W Administrative Code, Fiscal Year, Serial No. beginning with No. 1 each FY) # 3 FY 84	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> REGULAR EVALUATION <input type="checkbox"/> SPECIAL EVALUATION		

28

5. KEY PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION DATES			6. ESTIMATED PROJECT FUNDING		7. PERIOD COVERED BY EVALUATION	
A. First PRO-AG or Equivalent FY 77	B. Final Obligation Expected FY 83	C. Final Input Delivery FY 84	A. Total \$ 4,750	B. U.S. \$ 3,654	From (month/yr.) 12/82	To (month/yr.) 10/83
					Date of Evaluation Review 11/7/83	

B. ACTION DECISIONS APPROVED BY MISSION OR AID/W OFFICE DIRECTOR

A. List decisions and/or unresolved issues; cite those items needing further study. (NOTE: Mission decisions which anticipate AID/W or regional office action should specify type of document, e.g., airgram, SPAR, PIO, which will present detailed request.)	B. NAME OF OFFICER RESPONSIBLE FOR ACTION	C. DATE ACTION TO BE COMPLETED
1. Project management should finalize all plans for relocation of training facility from Klay to Monrovia, to include scheduling GOL inputs -- fencing, service road, etc. and the return of the Klay Center to the Ministry of Youth and Sports.	LOIC	1/84
2. Detailed plans and a fixed implementation schedule should be prepared for staff development -- especially for upgrading the Student Services Job Development Unit.	LOIC	1/84
3. Special efforts need to be taken to insure that Management Information System (MIS) guidelines are followed, particularly documentation of applications, enrollment, training completions and job placements.	LOIC	1/84
4. Library resources for both feeder and technical training programs need to be upgraded. Audio visual equipment should be used more effectively.	LOIC	4/84
5. Student stipends should be paid promptly, and (serious) differences between food supplies delivered and those paid for by the ministry should be eliminated.	Ministry of Youth & Sports	1/84
6. The Industrial Advisory Council should be reactivated, and fund raising capacity of the board should be strengthened and fund raising efforts should focus on mobilizing financial support for the Monrovia center.	Ministry of Youth & Sports	6/84
7. In view of the finding that almost all project targets have been met or exceeded, evaluation committee's recommendation for a six month to one year extension should (see pg. 2)		

9. INVENTORY OF DOCUMENTS TO BE REVISED PER ABOVE DECISIONS			10. ALTERNATIVE DECISIONS ON FUTURE OF PROJECT		
<input type="checkbox"/> Project Paper	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Implementation Plan, e.g., CPI Network	<input type="checkbox"/> Other (Specify)	A. <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Continue Project Without Change		
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Financial Plan	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> PIO/T		B. <input type="checkbox"/> Change Project Design and/or		
<input type="checkbox"/> Logical Framework	<input type="checkbox"/> PIO/C	<input type="checkbox"/> Other (Specify)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Change Implementation Plan		
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Project Agreement	<input type="checkbox"/> PIO/P		C. <input type="checkbox"/> Discontinue Project		

11. PROJECT OFFICER AND HOST COUNTRY OR OTHER RANKING PARTICIPANTS AS APPROPRIATE (Names and Titles)		12. Mission/AID/W Office Director Approval	
Dr. Edwin R. Tolle, LOIC Project Manager, USAID/Liberia Mr. Quy D. Nguyen, OICI Director of Evaluation Mr. A. Karngar Thomas, Ministry of Youth and Sports, GOL Ms. Ottalee J. McBorough, Ministry of Youth & Sports, GOL Mr. Edward Davis, Jr., Training Consultant, OICI		Signature <i>Lois Richard</i> Typed Name Lois Richard	
		Date February 21, 1984	

APPENDIX G

INSTRUCTIONS FOR COMPLETING FORM AID 1330-15 & 15A, PROJECT EVALUATION SUMMARY (PES)—PART I & II

EVALUATION PROCESS - Officials of the Host Government and AID Mission should collaborate in periodic evaluation of the progress of each project. (For AID/W projects, participation of grantees is appropriate.) Timing of such regular evaluations should be linked to the key decisional requirements of the project, as listed in the Evaluation Plan included in the Project Paper and as confirmed in the Evaluation Schedule of the Annual Budget Submission; otherwise annually. A description of the evaluation process is found in Handbook.3, Part II, Chapter 8.

PURPOSES OF SUMMARY - The Project Evaluation Summary (PES) is prepared after each review to record information which is useful both to the implementors (including the Host Government and contractors) and to concerned AID/W units. It serves four purposes:

- (1) Record of decisions reached by responsible officials, so that those who participated in the evaluation process are clear about the conclusions, and so that headquarters is aware of the next steps.
- (2) Notice that a scheduled evaluation has been completed, with a brief record of the method and participation for future reference.
- (3) Summary of progress and current status for use in answering queries.
- (4) Suggestions about lessons learned for use in planning and reviewing other projects of a similar nature. The PES and other project documentation are retained in DS/DIU/DI and are available to project planners.

CONTENTS OF SUMMARY - A PES submittal has two parts, plus relevant attachments if any.

PART I REQUIRED: Form AID 1330-15 contains identifying information about the project and evaluation (Items 1-7), action decisions about the project's future (Items 8-10), and signatures (Items 11-12). Since the PES reports decisions, it is signed by the Director of the Mission or AID/W Office responsible for the project. Space is also provided for signatures of the project officer, host country and other ranking participants in the evaluation, to the extent appropriate.

PART II, OPTION 1: For regular evaluations, use continuation sheets to respond to Items 13-23 as outlined in the attached Form AID 1330-15A.

PART II, OPTION 2: For a special evaluation, the reporting unit may opt for a somewhat varied format, with a different sequence or greater detail in some areas, however, Items 13-23 should all be addressed.

ATTACHMENTS: As appropriate, reports of host governments, contractors, and others, utilized in the preparation of the evaluation summary, should be labeled A, B, C, etc., attached to the PES submittal (Missions are to submit 7 copies and AID/W Offices 7 copies) and listed under Item 23. Where it is necessary to transmit these source documents separately from the PES, Block 23 of the PES should note how this material was transmitted, when, number of copies and to whom.

SUBMITTAL PROCEDURE: Missions will submit the PES Facesheet, continuation sheets, and attachments under cover of an airgram which will be received by the Cable Room. AID/W Offices will submit the PES Facesheet, continuation sheets, and attachments to MO/PAV, Room B-930, NS under cover of a memorandum which cites any distribution instructions beyond the standard distribution. All AID/W Offices and most Missions will use the blank cut PES Facesheet and plain bond for continuation sheets, which can be reproduced on copiers. Those Missions preferring to use hecto, may order the form in hecto sets from AID/W, Distribution Branch. There will be a standard distribution made in AID/W of all field-originated PES's. Copies will be sent to the corresponding bureau's DP, DR, the country desk and Evaluation Office. Other copies will be sent to PPC, SER, PDC and DS (including DI and ARC). For AID/W-generated PES's, copies will be distributed to all bureaus.

- be thoroughly justified on a basis other than unexpended funds. LOIC, MYS 6/84
8. The Vocational Training Program should be strengthened by: establishing a functional means for management to supervise both Klay training and Monrovia construction; providing additional texts and resources materials at Klay; adding P.C.V.'s to the staff and; guaranteeing that LOIC, MYS, 6/84
9. A system of inhouse evaluation should be developed for administration and instruction functions. LOIC 6/84
10. The long range financial plan should be upgraded and a funding strategy formulated including viable contingency plans. This plan should be done jointly by the Board, TCT staff and LOIC staff. The board should focus fund raising efforts on support for the Monrovia Center. LOIC 6/84
13. Summary: The LOIC program, since its inception in 1977, has focused on the establishment of an operational skills training center in Liberia. Considerable progress has been made -- there are fully operational courses offered in carpentry, masonry, electricity, air conditioning and refrigeration, plumbing and auto mechanics. There have been 499 trainees graduated and over 80% of those are now in full time jobs. During the time covered by the evaluation, October 1982-October 1983, there were 201 applications, 177 enrollments, 153 completions and 72 placements. There have been 2 separate, fairly distinct phases in the program to date. The first, 1977-1982, was concerned with program development, course structuring, management/instructional skill development and the establishment of contacts with local business and industry. The second phase, 1982-1984, is being devoted to institutionalization of the program -- a major segment of this undertaking centers around the construction of a permanent training facility in Monrovia. At the time of the evaluation the building was over 40% completed, with May, 1984, set as the target date for its becoming completely operational. The evaluation committee found the program to be largely meeting or exceeding its objectives, with only the Student Services Unit being in serious need of improvement. It was unanimously agreed that the program should be continued. As there appears likely to be from \$300,000 to \$400,000 in unexpended funds at PACD, it was recommended that consideration of a TA extension of from 6-12 months be explored by USAID/GOL and OICI. The need for an extension should be thoroughly justified as extension for the sake of drawdown of unexpended funds is not an acceptable rationale for continuing a project whose major output and institution-building targets have been met. A major issue remaining is the financial viability of the project in view of the reduced ability of the GOL to provide on-going funding. Without an economic upturn it is unlikely that this problem can be completely resolved.

14. Evaluation Methodology: This was a regularly scheduled evaluation. The six-person evaluation team consisted of two OICI employees, the USAID/Liberia project manager and two officials from the Ministry of Youth and Sports. The evaluation began by reviewing relevant USAID project documents, followed by an examination of LOIC files and internal reports -- to include its Management Information System [MIS] files. All professional and management staff members were interviewed, the evaluation committee dividing into 2 groups to conduct the interviews. Visits were made to the building where the Feeder Program takes place and the Klay Campus, where the skills instruction classes are held. At both locations administrators, professional staff and students were interviewed and classes observed. As a last function, interviews with on-the-job graduates were made.

Costs: OICI Evaluation Officers (2) \$4,500

Evaluation Committee:

Mr. Quy D. Nguyen, OICI Director of Evaluation, Team Leader/Coordinator
Dr. Edwin R. Tolle, LOIC Project Manager, USAID/Liberia
Mr. A. Karngar Thomas, Vocational Counselor, Ministry of Youth and Sports, GOL
Mr. Edward Davis, Jr., Training Consultant, OICI
Ms. Ottalee J. McBorough, Training/Research Officer, Ministry of Youth and Sports, GOL
Mr. George P. Dixon, USAID Assistant Program Officer. (Acted for Dr. Tolle when the latter was unable to participate in on-going evaluation activities.)

15. External Factors: The major factors which have negatively affected the project are:

1. The political turmoil surrounding the 1979 Rice Riots and the 1980 military coup -- their political, social and economic results.

2. A continued deterioration of the Liberian economy since the late 1970s; and the subsequent stagnation in both public and private sectors.

3. The project's weakest segment, as noted in three evaluations, 1979, 1980 and 1983, was the Student Services Unit. The Student Services Manager is the wife of the Deputy Minister of Youth and Sports who is the project's liaison to that ministry. The Project Director's attempts to make personnel changes and/or operational improvement have not been as effective as they might under different circumstances.

16. Inputs - Funding: The project was first funded as part of an African vocational training initiative that included headquarters operations (Philadelphia, Pennsylvania) and countries' projects in Ghana, Zambia, Togo, Sierra Leone, Lesotho, The Gambia and Liberia. A total of \$1,216,503 was reserved for LOIC.

In FY 1981 an increase of \$176,000; primarily to pay contractor overhead costs. In 1982 an additional \$2,216,000 was added to institutionalize the program and construct a permanent training facility in Monrovia.

<u>Original</u>		<u>Required</u>	<u>Revised</u>
Technical Assistance	1,216,503	LT 210 PM ST 31 PM	\$3,653,503
Participants	19,057		27,500
Commodities	34,466		139,892
Other Costs	267,819		387,650
Building			655,500

17. Outputs:

<u>Targets</u>	<u>Status</u>	<u>Changes</u>
A. Fully operational training programs in carpentry, masonry, electrical/air conditioning and refrigeration, plumbing and auto mechanics	Completed Klay	To be transferred to Monrovia
B. Fully trained staff	Completed	To be transferred to Monrovia
C. Fully equipped shops	Completed in Klay	To be transferred to Monrovia
D. Enrollment of 348 students in first phase	Enrolled 469	
E. Enrollment of 320 in second phase	Enrolled 336	
F. Train 290 students in first phase	Trained 243	
G. Train 274 students in second phase	Trained 256	
H. Place 235 students in first phase	Placed 156	

<u>Goals</u>	<u>Status</u>	<u>Revised</u>
I. Place 220 students in second phase	Placed 209	
J. A trained functioning board of directors.	Completed	
K. Construction of a training facility in Monrovia.	40% complete	

Management Experience: Project management, with the exception of its handling of improvement needs in Student Services (discussed in #15), has been strong and consistent. Original training sites, with feeder training in Monrovia and skills training 34 miles away in Klay, placed serious pressure on senior management. The more recent activities surrounding the planning and construction of the permanent training site in Monrovia have added to management responsibilities, as has the problem of delayed GOL funding support. The project director and senior staff are fully aware of the tasks to be accomplished in the remaining months of the project (PACD, September 30, 1984).

18. Purpose:

A. To institutionalize a skills training program in Liberia for the training of the underemployed and unemployed in appropriate labor-market skills.

B. Progress toward each EOPS Condition:

1. A permanent facility to house all LOIC program components constructed. The building is over 40% completed. Opening date is now set as May 1984.

2. Expand and upgrade the Board of Directors and the Industrial Advisory Council. The board is functioning extremely well. Most members have participated in at least three OICI training seminars. The council was disbanded at the time of the military coup. This evaluation has strongly recommended its reactivation. Board needs to improve its fund raising.

3. Local staff development. All skills-training personnel are operating effectively, as are the management and TA teams. Weaknesses in operational capabilities and counseling have been noted in the Student Services Unit and specific recommendations have been made for their improvement.

4. Introduction of new training areas. Two new courses will be offered once the program is housed in the new facility -- bookkeeping and driver training. All programs will be open to female students. There will be a limited amount of course redesign, i.e. electricity and air conditioning/refrigeration

training will be combined into one course, emphasizing small appliance repair skills and generator rewinding.

C. When can achievements be expected: The revised PACD September 30, 1984, should see substantive achievement of all project objectives.

D. Causes of shortfalls; causal linkage between outputs and external factors:

As mentioned previously, there have been essentially no significant shortfalls in the vocational training program. One exception, discussed in #15, is the development of an effective operational capability by the Student Services Unit. The evaluation committee felt that while the placement of graduates since implementation was less than should be expected, significant increases in placement may be difficult to realize as long as the national economy continues to decline.

A second exception relates to the difficulty of raising funds for recurrent expenses. It is likely that without an economic upturn this problem will go unresolved and create a recurrent funding problem. Contingency plans are necessary to deal with this likelihood.

19. Goal/Subgoal:

A. Goal/Subgoal to which project contributes: To improve and increase the skill and efficiency of the indigenous Liberian labor force.

B. To what extent can progress toward goal/subgoal be attributed to achievement: The project has directed itself toward developing an operational vocational training facility and a program that will provide a means to reach the goal. Currently, trainees are enrolled in courses that have proven to be effective, and that retain the trainees' interest until graduation. With the completion of the new training facility, and transfer of all project elements into it, all can be realized.

- to other projects NA
- to other causal factors NA

20. Special comments and remarks: The LOIC project has developed, to a fairly high degree, three closely related elements that are often lacking in LDC vocational education programs. The first is the ability to recruit students who truly want to become skilled technicians, and are not just using the program as a bridge to further academic training. The second is a workable meld of theory training, actual hands-on practical experience and early on-the-job follow-up. The third is a successful attempt to stress personal satisfaction in skilled performance. There have, of course, been set-backs and occasional failures. On the whole, however, the LOIC project can be expected to establish an effective means for upgrading the level of vocational/technical skills found in the Liberian work force if the question of on-going financial viability can be effectively addressed through better fund raising and use of contingency planning.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Prepared by: Edwin R. Tolle, HRD
Date : December 6, 1983
Project : Liberia Opportunities Industrialization Centers
Country : Liberia
Cost : \$3,654,000

I. What Constraint did this project attempt to relieve?

The LOIC program is aimed at the resolution of at least two major problems -- (1) an almost disabling lack of skilled vocational manpower in both the private and public sectors; and (2) an equally serious lack of institutions that can, and will, train qualified artisans. The project's goal is to increase the skill and efficiency of the indigenous Liberian labor force. With a public educational system that reaches only 50% of the school-aged population, and a literacy rate of no more than 25%, the labor market is glutted with a mass of unskilled, untrained and largely unemployable men and women in their late teens and early twenties. The LOIC program is targeted at this group. To those who show promise and interest, plus an ability to learn while working with one's hands, LOIC offers a well-designed program that will take them to at least an entry level of technical skill in one of several different trades.

II. What technology did the project promote to relieve this constraint?

The project's primary focus is on the institutionalization of a training center that will increase the efficiency/skills of the Liberian work force. It is approaching this task on five different levels: (1) establishment and training of an active Board of Directors and an Industrial Advisory Council; (2) developing a highly skilled local staff,* (3) introducing a broad, need-centered curriculum in the areas of carpentry, masonry, electricity, air conditioning and refrigeration, plumbing, auto mechanics, bookkeeping and driver training (for both male and female trainees) and (4) establishment of a mechanism for review of both the courses and the relevance to local labor market conditions, to make each graduate as employable as possible.

* Emphasis should be equally on instructional competence and effectiveness in all student service areas.

III: What technology did the project attempt to replace?

Although the technically correct answer here would be "a largely traditional, on the job apprentice system", in fact the project is going into areas where there is no existing "technology". Almost all other vocational/technical schools are unable, for a variety of reasons, i.e. lack of direction, lack of equipment and supplies, lack of competent instructors, etc., to offer opportunities for students to have prolonged contact with actual work situations with relevant materials. Many, if not most of them, are used by trainees not to learn a skilled trade but to get academic credentials that might enable them to get out of the labor market and into white-collar employment.

IV. Why did the project planners believe that intended beneficiaries would adopt the proposed technology?

The OICI approach to technical/vocational education was developed among the culturally disadvantaged of Philadelphia, Pennsylvania, before becoming an international movement. This project, implemented in 1977, had Liberia as one of a group of African countries that also included Ghana, Zambia, Togo, Sierra Leone, Lesotho and The Gambia. It offered an already developed approach that included not only manual skill training, but the creation of proper cognitive understanding skills and correct value concepts.

V. What characteristics did the intended beneficiaries exhibit that had relevance to their adopting the proposed technology?

The primary beneficiaries, as seen by the project planners, were unemployed/underemployed school leavers who possessed the ability to pass both literacy and aptitude tests; or military personnel requiring skills development in auto mechanics and/or the building trades. The Liberian work force from which these people were to come, or, later, to enter, showed a desperate need for skilled artisans.

VI. What adoption rate has this project achieved in transferring the proposed technology?

During the first 6 years of the project's life it has trained 499 students. There have been 1,577 applications and 801 trainees enrolled. Approximately 80% of the trainees have stayed for the full course and graduated. Of these, over 80% are now part of Liberia's work force.

VII. Has the project set forces into motion that will induce further exploration of the constraints and improvements to the technical package proposed to overcome it?

most assuredly. Most significant in this regard was the establishment of a strong, well-trained board of directors. This group, drawn from both the private and public sectors, assures that there will be continued attention given to the constraints that prompted the adoption of the OICI approach, and to the effectiveness of the program. The board members, in their own business or professional lives, have frequent contact with graduates of the program. Additionally, staff members conduct regularly scheduled reviews of both instructional and labor-market conditions. The evaluation found them to be weak, however, in fund raising. This is partially due to the serious economic decline and absence of a climate conducive to investment. Contingency plans are needed to address this constraint since fund raising will continue to be a problem.

- VIII. Do private input suppliers have an incentive to examine the constraints addressed by the project and to come up with solutions?

Again, most assuredly. Each graduate placed with LOIC assistance, and others if they request it, are followed for the first 3 months of employment by periodic visits from trained project counselors. Part of the action is to discuss the trainee's progress with the employers. This allows for contacts between the training institution and those who are directly involved with the products of the training. The employers are, in this way, able to affect the content, length, sequence, etc., of the training program, as well as its areas of concern.

- IX. What delivery system did the project employ to transfer technology to intended beneficiaries?

The development of an effective hands-on training program and a specially designed and equipped building are major forces of the project. Current plans call for the building to be completed and the full program operational in May, 1984 -- 4 months before the current PACD.

- X. What training techniques did the project use to develop the delivery system?

The project provided advance technical training for Ministry of Youth and Sports personnel assigned to management and staff positions. It allowed them to develop skills not only in their particular disciplines, but also the ability to do curriculum review and development, and to survey and interpret data from the job market.

- XI. What effect did the transferred technology have upon those impacted by it?

In spite of the fact that the Liberian economy has been in a steady decline for most of the project's life, over 80% of its graduates have obtained steady employment. (It might be noted that several have been hired as instructors in other vocational programs.) Reactions from the employers are largely positive and, as part of this evaluation, a number of graduates who had been working for up to 3 years were contacted. Their reactions were overwhelmingly complementary.