PD-AAT-130

CLASSIFICATION

PROJECT EVALUATION SUMMARY (PES) – PART I

Report Symbol U-447

1. PROJECT TITLE: Pre-School Education as a Catalyst for Community Development

2. PROJECT NUMBER: 527-0161

3. MISSION/AID/W OFFICE: USAID/Peru

4. EVALUATION NUMBER (Enter the number maintained by the reporting unit e.g., Country or AID/W Administrative Code, Fiscal Year, Serial No. beginning with No. 1 each FY): 03/86

END OF PROJECT IMPACT

☐ ~~PROGRAM~~ EVALUATION ☒ SPECIAL EVALUATION

5. KEY PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION DATES

A. First PRO-AG or Equivalent FY 79

B. Final Obligation Expected FY 84

C. Final Input Delivery FY 85

6. ESTIMATED PROJECT FUNDING

A. Total $ 3'491,000

B. U.S. $ 1'800,000

7. PERIOD COVERED BY EVALUATION

From (month/yr.) 1/83

To (month/yr.) 12/84

Date of Evaluation Review 1/85

8. ACTION DECISIONS APPROVED BY MISSION OR AID/W OFFICE DIRECTOR

A. List decisions and/or unresolved issues; cite those items needing further study. (NOTE: Mission decisions which anticipate AID/W or regional office action should specify type of document, e.g., airgram, SPAR, PIO, which will present detailed request.)	B. NAME OF OFFICER RESPONSIBLE FOR ACTION	C. DATE ACTION TO BE COMPLETED
Summary of Accomplishments:		

1. Project goals for coverage, training, construction and materials development have been met and even surpassed. The project is now active in more than 2000 communities in the four pilot sites, and over 60,000 children (same number of girls as of boys) are enrolled in the program. 173 new Pre-School Centers (PRONOIEs) have been constructed. 4 curriculum guides have been developed and produced for use in each of the four pilot sites. The Project's National Coordinator obtained his M.A. in education administration from the University of New Mexico. 10 initial education specialists also studied pre-school education for three months each at the University of New Mexico. Local training was provided to more than 2000 para-professionals and more than 300 coordinating teachers during the 5 year project.

2. The project provided a center for working with children and their families in many rural communities not normally attended by government and set up community development activities.

3. The design of a methodology for training and supervision prepared by the Evaluators will be applied to similar programs at the national level.

4. T.A. provided by Contractors was timely and greatly facilitated project implementation.

9. INVENTORY OF DOCUMENTS TO BE REVISED PER ABOVE DECISIONS

- ☐ Project Paper
- ☐ Financial Plan
- ☐ Logical Framework
- ☐ Project Agreement
- ☐ Implementation Plan e.g., CPI Network
- ☐ PIO/T
- ☐ PIO/C
- ☐ PIO/P
- ☐ Other (Specify) _____
- ☐ Other (Specify) _____

10. ALTERNATIVE DECISIONS ON FUTURE OF PROJECT

A. ☐ Continue Project Without Change

B. ☐ Change Project Design and/or ☐ Change Implementation Plan

C. ☐ Discontinue Project

11. PROJECT OFFICER AND HOST COUNTRY OR OTHER RANKING PARTICIPANTS AS APPROPRIATE (Names and Titles)

Project Officer: Dr. Orlando Rojas
Education Advisor

Mr. Esau Hidalgo, MOE Counterpart, National Coordinator of the Project

12. Mission/AID/W Office Director Approval

Signature

Typed Name John A. Sanbrailo
Director

Date

AID 1330-12 (5-76)

Clearances: HNE:NJParker PROG:WRhoads CD:DHimelfarb

DD:CAH

Cost Effectiveness and Objectives Attained:

Here are the conclusions of the Project Evaluation Team regarding cost effectiveness and objectives attained:

" 1. An initial education service has been established. Project goals set for coverage, training, construction, and materials development have been met or surpassed. An initial education service has been established in the four pilot sites. That service that reaches poor families in rural communities that are often difficult to reach and where complementary services are often lacking. Attention must now be given to maintaining and strengthening the service.

2. Quality is low. Establishing the service is a major accomplishment, but up-grading is urgently needed in training and supervision, curriculum, administration. Many PRONOEI still lack minimally adequate facilities and sufficient educational materials. Attendance is low and turnover among para-professionals is higher than expected. Educational specialists frequently lack training in initial education.

3. The Project has had significant effects on early childhood development. In light of the short time the project has been in operation in most sites, and of the existing structural and bureaucratic barriers to improvement, it is encouraging to find positive and significant effects of the program on participating children. In Puno, in both Aymara and Quechua areas, PRONOEI children performed significantly better than non-PRONOEI children on test items designed to measure social, intellectual, and motor abilities. In San Martin, significant results were found only on the social subscale. In Cuzco, PRONOEI children scored lower than non-PRONOEI children on the social scale, but nevertheless the PRONOEI children showed greater gains over the course of the year. Children in formal pre-school programs (CEI) generally performed better than PRONOEI children in San Martin, but in Cuzco differences were found only on the social measure. The lack of greater differences in Cuzco in favor of control and CEI children is noteworthy because both CEI and control communities chosen for comparison were wealthier and better educated than PRONOEI communities. Most of the children tested performed well on motor abilities and were weak in intellectural skills.

4. No significant effects were found on primary school repetition rates. The inability of a pre-school experience to affect retention or drop-out rates during the first two years of primary school reflects major problems of primary school quality, organization and management. Primary school repetition rates exceeded 50 percent in the first grade and 35 percent in the second grade.

5. Effects on nutritional status are moderate, indirect, and differ by project site. Differences in nutritional status favoring PRONOEI children were found in Puno and Cuzco, but not Apurimac or San Martin. When a weight-for-height measure is used and World Health Organization norms are applied, approximately 15 percent of the children in the communities studied were moderately or mildly malnourished. Little severe malnourishment was found. These figures hide "stunting" in almost 50 percent of the children. Also, the weight-for-age measure reflects a very low intake of calories and using that standard malnutrition reaches as high as 80% in Apurimac and 70% in Cuzco. Diets are poor, making children vulnerable to disease. Still,

improvements in nutritional status occurred in the study communities between 1983 and 1984, and girls in PRONOEI communities are closer to boys in their nutritional status than in control or CEI communities. These effects seem more closely related to exogenous factors than to the project per se. The project has not given much explicit attention to nutrition

6. Community involvement and awareness has increased. The project has led to creation of new forms of community participation (parents' associations, mother's clubs, nutrition clubs) which do not alone change community structure or organization, but which, in combination with other activities, diversify leadership and promote community development by mobilizing volunteer labor for the common good. The new forms become integrated with the old wich are not therefore, barriers to implementation. The project has fostered an increased concern for education in the participating communities. It does not seem to have a fundamental effect on women's participation or childrearing practices. Parents do not perceive the program as helping them as parents or community members although they do see it as helping the children. The PRONOEI para-professional is usually from the community. Hre or she seldom takes on a role as a community leader, but often helps call meetings, act as a secretary, and introduce educational or related themes into community discussions.

7. Supporting services do not converge in PRONOEI communities. PRONOEI communities usually lack supporting services such as medical posts, sanitation, or extension. In Puno where the program is the oldest and began as an "integratred" program, most progress has been made in providing services that converge. USAID assistance does not foster an integrated approach to early childhood development in part because its own programs of health, education, nutrition, agriculture, and sanitation do not converge geographically. Community gardens and small animal raising projects initiated under 527-0161 began late, were not widespread, and were constrained by the lack of adequate technical assistance and by poor administration, providing another example of lack of integration among services. A nutrition manual produced with project funds has not been used. More effective mechanisms are needed to build inter-sectorial collaboration, generraly and within USAID's own programming.

8. Project funds have been spent in accordance with plans of operation and mainly for capital investments in services and people. The expenditure of approximately US$2,000,000 in USAID funds (including some PL-480 funds) has followed closely the strategy set out in operational plans. By emphasizing capital expenditures, USAID has played a catalytic role in extending initial education within Peru, and has been a minor partner, contributing only one-sixth of total project costs. THE MOE has contributed a higher percentage of total costs (one-half) than envisioned. Community participation has covered as high as one-half of the costs in some years, but overall is about one-fourth.

9. Per unit costs are low. An average cost of approximately US$28 per enrolled child was estimated (if imputed costs of volunteer labor and community donations are not included in the calculation). That is less than one-half the cost of the formal pre-school alternative. Because attendance is well below enrollment, there is considerable "leakage" in the system. Costs vary widely by project site and individual center. Economies of scale are evident.

10. The project is"cost-effective" in some respects and not others). Judged in relation to expected outcomes, the project is cost-effective with respect to effects on the system of initial education, the development test scores of children, and community involvement, but not with respect to nutrition, primary school progress, or community projects. The Puno site domonstrates that the model can function with relatve effectiveness and at low-cost, even though there is room for a great deal of improvement in quality efficiency.

11. No one model of non-formal pre-school education was found to be obviously more cost-effective than others. Differences in unit costs among the non-formal options analyzed (the center-based PRONOEI, the home-based adaption of the Portage model, and the resource center model serving satellite programs) are not dramatic and each model is effective when evaluated in terms of its own goals. All non-formal models are less costly than the CEI alternative. Rather than view the several non-formal programs as alternatives, they should be viewed as complentary options, each with potential for being cost-effective in particular situations and with particular age groups. For ages 3 to 5, a center-based model such as the PRNOEI seems more appropriate than a home-based model which is better applied with families of younger children."

Actions taken after PACD (September 30, 1985:

Contacts with other donors interested in supporting this program in Peru have been established. UNICEF offered to continue their support. The World Bank representatives will consider the possibility of giving support under their primary education loan if the MOE requests it.