PD-AAT-124

INTERIM EVALUATION

OF

DEVELOPMENT SUPPORT TRAINING PROJECT
USAID/PAKISTAN

Conducted by the

National Association of Schools of Public Affairs & Administration
Under Contract No. DAN-0000-I-00-5051-00
Through USAID S&T/RD

November 21, 1985

00421D

Evaluation Team

Richard A. Fehnel, Team Chairperson
Harold Freeman
Alice Murray
Louis Picard

391 04 74

TABLE OF CONTENTS PAGES

PART I: EXECUTIVE SUMMARY.....1

- o Background.....2
- o Overview.....2-3
- o Findings and Conclusions.....3-4
- o Recommendations.....4-5
- o Lessons Learned.....5-6

PART II: THE REPORT.....7

- o Introduction.....8-9
- o Participant Training.....9-16
- o English Language Training.....16-21
- o Institutional Development and Management Training.....22-34
- o Special Targets: Private Sector.....35-37
- o Special Targets: Training at the Provincial Level.....38-39
- o Special Targets: Training for Women.....39-40

PAPT III: REPORT SUMMARY (Originally the Executive Summary).....41

- o Overview.....42
- o Participant Training.....42-43
- o Strengthening of Training Institutions.....43-44
- o Management Training.....44-46
- o English as a Second Language.....46
- o DSTP Role re National Human Resource Development Policy..46-47
- o Special Targets : Private Sector.....47
- o Special Targets : Provincial Governments.....47-48
- o Special Targets : Women.....48
- o Project Planning Administration and Coordination.....48-49

PART IV:
- Appendix 1: Bibliography.....51-54
- Appendix 2: Lists of Persons Interviewed.....55-58
- Appendix 3: Survey Instruments.....59-64
- Appendix 4: Survey Data Tables.....65-122
- Appendix 5: ESL Charts 1 and 2.....123-125

PART I

E X E C U T I V E S U M M A R Y

- Background
- Overview
- Findings and Conclusions
- Recommendations
- Lessons Learned

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY
OF
DEVELOPMENT SUPPORT TRAINING PROJECT EVALUATION

I. BACKGROUND

A. Mission: USAID/Pakistan: Interim Evaluation of the Development Support Training Project (391-0474 and Participant Training placement and services "add on" for other Mission projects). Nov. 17, 1985.

B. Purpose of the Development Support Training Project: "to upgrade the managerial and technical expertise of Pakistanis in the private sector and the federal and provincial government who are involved in the planning and implementation of Pakistan's priority social and economic development programs through long and short term training programs." (Source: AID Assistance to Pakistan: FY 1982)

C. Purpose of the Evaluation. This is an interim evaluation, occuring at a point in time when long term project activities could be viewed within a context of opportunities for significant funding increases and the perspective of recent project experience.

D. Methodology Used: The methodology included:

1. Review of project documents and other related materials (see bibliography, Appendix 1);

2. Survey of current (US) and returned participants and their supervisors (see Appendix 3 for copies of the survey instruments, and Appendix 4 for a tabular report of survey data)

3. Interviews with (see Appendix 2 for a complete list of interviewees):

a. Current and past GOP officials involved with the project.
b. AID personnel, inclusing project officers in some of the "add on" project
c. Contractor and subcontractor personnel in Pakistan, Washington D.C., and home offices.
d. A sample of returned and current (in US) training participants and their supervisors.
e. In-country ESL experts.

II. OVERVIEW

1. The Development Support Training Project has had a successful start, credit for which is due to dedicated people in the Government of Pakistan

(especially the Economic Affairs Division and the Training Wing of the Establishment Division); in AID (most notably HRT); in the Washington and Islamabad offices of the contractor, the Academy for Educational Development (AED); and in the offices of the sub-contractors (Arthur D. Little, Inc., the Experiment in International Living, and the Institute of Public Administration of Pennsylvania State University). Despite the difficulties that always occur at the start of a complex endeavor such as this, this project can point to a number of successes. In several areas, project outputs are ahead of schedule, and in all areas there is significant activity underway.

In each section of the body of the report the successes, constraints and recommendations are discussed. In the summary section there is a more detailed summary of findings, conclusions and recommendations than what is provided here. It was originally developed as the Executive Summary, but because of its length was moved. The evaluation team strongly recommends that it be studied by all concerned.

III. FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS

A. Successes:

1. Three training organizations (NIPA/Karachi, PIM and the Training Wing of the Pakistan Audit Department have been assisted in the development of strategic plans which will have a major impact upon their respective ability to upgrade their management training capability.

2. Fifteen of the thirty-four management training courses, seminars and workshops scheduled for development and delivery with project assistance have been completed, with positive results overall.

3. Over 400 individuals have been involved with the Participant Training program. Most of these have been through the DSTP "add on" activities serving other Mission projects.

4. The role of DSTP to serve other Mission projects is regarded as a successful, efficient way to use participant training resources.

5. ESL activities have been initiated that will enable many more Pakistanis to utilize participant training opportunities.

B. Constraints:

1. The level of effort needed to carry out the project is not sufficient to meet project goals and evolving opportunities. As participant training activities increase, all the involved offices (including GOP, AID/HRT, and AED/EIL) may need more staff. The components of institutional development, management training, and ESL are currently understaffed and as project opportunities and expectations grow, this problem will become more acute.

2. In the area of participant training, there are serious policy differences regarding jurisdictional responsibility and procedural bottlenecks within the GOP that will make it impossible for participant training goals to be reached.

3. The GOP's ability to make more effective use of DSTP (and other donor agency assistance) is limited by the lack of a comprehensive human resources development planning process that links training needs and opportunities to the career growth of individuals, and to organization growth and strengthening. This is especially true at the provincial level of government.

4. The private sector goals of the project, and of the Mission generally, lack a clear focus. This constraint limits the development of project activities in all components, especially participant training and institutional strengthening and development.

5. There is widespread concern among GOP officials about short-term participant training.

IV. RECOMMENDATIONS

---

1. Funding for the Development Support Training Project should be increased to the maximum extent possible. There are no serious limitations to the absorptive capacity of the GOP and the private sector in the areas of institutions strengthening, management training and ESL. The project has reached a phase in these areas where new windows of opportunity are emerging that could provide AID with a unique chance to change management practices in the sectors that it sees as strategic (i.e. agriculture, energy and the private sector).

2. The project termination date should be extended as long as possible, given the institutional strengthening priorities and activities of the project, as well as the commitment to long-term participant training.

3. All components of the project need increased resources and levels of effort.

4. The project extension agreement should have a covenant requiring GOP action to streamline the process of participant training nomination and selection.

5. The GOP should undertake activities to develop a human resources development plan, and should include provincial government needs in these activities.

6. AID should offer to provide technical assistance and financial resources to the GOP in order to streamline participant training nomination and selection processes, and for undertaking a human resources development plan.

7. Participant training activities should give a higher priority to long-term training.

8. All parties need to assure that short-term activities (particularly study tours) are closely monitored.

9. AID should review English language requirements for short-term training, with a view towards lowering required TOEFL scores or using another indicator.

10. The Mission needs to provide leadership in giving a focus to private sector goals so that this project can organize its private sector activities more effectively.

11. Institution strengthening and management training activities should focus on the training units within GOP and the private sector that have closest connection to AID's priority areas of agriculture, energy and the private sector. Institution strengthening should follow a strategic plan developed by the local training unit. Management training activities of these units should aim at creating a "critical mass" of trained supervisors and managers in operating units, in order to reinforce effective management practices, and to create and maintain a new managerial culture.

12. Project planning and coordination should include the technical divisions of AID to a greater extent. There is interest among some project officers and technical staff in seeing closer coordination between participant training and in-country management training in the organizations they work with, and they feel that Mission goals would be better served and resources better utilized through more coordinated efforts.

13. Opportunities to impact training related to women are beginning to develop, and more responsiveness to these at this time is recommended.

In summary, this is an exciting time to be involved with human resources development in Pakistan. AID has an unusual opportunity and the resources to create a lasting impact upon management practices in key sectors in this country if it chooses to do so.

VI. LESSONS LEARNED

A. Background: Background: Current Agency policy is to increase participant training substantially. One of the ways of doing this is to make greater use of short term training and study tours.

B. Situation: Many GOP official who were willing to express an opinion of this policy questioned the validity of USAID's emphasis on short term training in the United States. They feel that much of this is irrelevant

and/or unadaptable to conditions in Pakistan. They would prefer that most short term training be developed and conducted in-country. Besides being more applicable to local needs, this approach would serve to strengthen local institutions, one of AID'S four cornerstones and a goal of this project. GOP officials warned that this approach of emphasizing short-term training is producing cynicism and, in the long run, is counter productive in that it seemingly emphasizes a short run, superficial attitude toward Pakistan. Given the high volume of short term participant training in this Mission the evaluation team regards this as a very serious problem, and recommends that careful analysis precede the initial distribution of types of training (in terms of long-term and short-term), and that careful scrutiny be given the planning and follow-up of short-term training, particularly study tours.

PART II

R E P O R T

- Introduction
- Participant Training
- English Language Training
- Institutional Development and Management Training
- Special Targets: Private Sector
- Special Targets: Training at the Provincial Level
- Special Targets: Training for Women

I. INTRODUCTION

The Development Support Training Project began in 1983 and had as its primary goal the upgrading of the management and technical expertise of Pakistanis in the Federal and Provincial Governments as well as in the private sector who are involved in the implementation of Pakistan's priority social and economic development programs. This goal was to be achieved through a combination of long and short-term training programs and through support to a number of Pakistani training institutions.

The purpose of this evaluation is to examine the impact of the DST project and consider ways in which the DSTP might evolve in the next phase of project activity. This is an intermediate evaluation and it occurs at a point in time in which long-term project activities can be viewed in the context of opportunities for significant funding increases and with the perspective of project experiences over the last two years.

The methodology used in the evaluation included a review of all project documents and other related materials, a written survey of returned and current training participants and their supervisors and oral interviews with selected individuals who have been involved in different phases of the project. Those interviewed included current and past GOP officials involved with the project, AID personnel including project officers in some of the technical "add on projects" which have sent participants to the U.S. and with contractor and sub-contractor personnel in Pakistan, in Washington and in the home office of the sub-contractors. A sampling of participants involved in overseas training were also orally interviewed.

There are four major components of the Development Support Training Project. These include (1) Participant Training in which participants are sent for long and short-term training in the U.S. and in Third Countries, (2) English as a Second Language training which is designed to increase participants' capacity in English to allow them to go overseas, (3) the strengthening of local management training institutions and increasing their capacity to undertake management training and (4) emphasizing management training in special target areas including private sector management training, management training for women and training and institutional development in the provinces of Baluchistan and the North West Frontier Province.

There are two overall findings that the evaluation team has come to in the course of their research. First, the DST project is seen by Mission project officers and technical staff as an efficient way to handle the logistical aspects of participant training without giving up substantive control over these resources. Secondly, the management training needs of Pakistan require considerably greater financial resources over the next phase of the project in all targeted areas.

As a result, the evaluation team makes two overall recommendations. First, as funding levels increase in the next phase of the project, so should the relative importance of DSTP funds allocated to institutional strengthening, in-country training and English as a second language. All of these components are underfunded. Secondly, the project termination date should be extended until FY 90 or longer in order to permit commitment to and support of strategic plans for institutional strenghtening.

The body of this report examines in detail each of the major components of DSTP: participant training, ESL training, management training and institutional development and special target areas. After examining the strengths as well as the constraints that have developed in each project component, the report makes specific recommendations designed to strengthen the component in the next phase of DST activity.

II. PARTICIPANT TRAINING

A. Background:

Although a substantial number of participants has received training under AID auspices to date, (e.g. under the Government Administration Staff Improvement Project 128 participants were trained between 1969 and 1980), it has been recognized that these numbers are not large enough to meet Pakistan's needs at the national and provincial levels to plan and implement development projects.

It was also felt that there should be one mechanism within USAID to provide placement and support services for participants sent to the U.S. and third countries under all (DSTP and Other) AID-financed projects.

Finally, needs existed to institutionalize a system whereby training was undertaken in response to identified needs, and the nomination/selection process would be streamlined.

B. Project Goals:

Accordingly, this project is designed to upgrade the technical and managerial skills of Pakistanis in both the public and private sector. Progress is to be measured by development of provincial training plans related to training requirements in management, administration and planning, adequate placement and support services provided to participants and, ultimately, effective utilization of training (individuals returning to appropriate positions and putting their acquired skills to use).

140 participants were to be selected for U.S. training, of which 30 would be long term (one year or longer), and in addition 88 selected for third country training. These figures do not reflect the participant training goals added through other AID projects served in DSTP.

C. Successes:

The participant training component of the DSTP Project has been successful to date both in terms of the rate of achieving life-of-project target numbers of persons to be trained (project outputs) and with regard to indications of the effective utilization of training by those who have already completed their programs (project purpose). Table 58 in Appendix 4 indicates that 18/71 survey respondents have been able to utilize their training substantially, and 44 said they were using their training moderately.

Although the project paper called for 88 persons to be trained in third countries and 140 in the United States (110 short term; 30 long term) over 80 persons have already received third country training and more than 340 have been trained in the United States. A major factor in this increase in numbers was the decision in 1983 to implement the recommendation in the project paper to utilize the processing and support services provided by the DSTP project contractor (AED) for participants going overseas for training from all Mission projects. Also, while not substantially effecting the overall numbers, a decision was made to provide similar services to certain categories of participants already selected and financed by the Ministry of Education. Nevertheless, even within the boundaries of the original program the numbers trained to date already exceed the life of project target. As of June 30, 1985 33 long-term participants and 157 short-term participants have been sent to the United States for training as specified in the original project design.

It is too early in the project to make judgments about its overall impact but through questionnaires sent to (1) participants currently in the United States, (2) returned participants and (3) a few supervisors of returned participants, as well as interviews with GCP officials 1/, the team has developed a sense that the training to date has been effective. Specifically, a majority of the participants felt that their training was "on target" both as to length of time and level of complexity (Tables 56 and 57). Supporting these findings were the comments of eight supervisors of returned participants who felt that (1) the returnees were making "considerable" to "great" efforts to apply the knowledge and skills gained in their training program and, like the participants, (2) marked the actual utilization of training at the top end of the questionnaire rating scale (moderate to substantial use).

D. Constraints and Recommendations Regarding Certain Procedures:

While the overall effectiveness of the project is thus far rated highly, the team noted a number of constraints that are hindering its

1/ Note: See "Word of Caution" paragraph at the end of this section for a qualifier to this statement.

efficient implementation. These could become more severe as the project progresses, if steps are not taken now to resolve them. The easiest way to outline these problems is by a brief review of the implementation process from the initial announcement of training opportunities to the follow-up of returned participants.

Nominations and Selection

The most serious cause for concern relates to the delays that take place during the nomination process. Thirty nine percent of those surveyed stated that the time they had to prepare for departure was too short (27 percent only had 1-7 days and 12 percent had 8-14 days between the time of notification and their departure date). Most felt that streamlining procedures and improving communications among concerned agencies would make a difference.

The first step in the nomination process is the annual compilation by USAID, (in consultation with EAD and GOP units with which USAID is already working), of Participant Training Estimates broken down by project, U.S./third country and short and long term. In determining these annual estimates it would be helpful if they could fit within the framework of a country training plan (federal and provincial) which would be based on an assessment of training requirements. The Establishment Division stated it would like to go one step further by first developing an overall training policy covering both the federal and provincial governments which would provide the guidelines for a plan.

EAD then circulates the Estimates under cover of a letter to the provincial P&D departments and the federal ministries (including the Ministries of Commerce and Industry for the private sector) and invites them to submit nominations for the training listed. The recipients of this announcement, in turn, notify the offices in their jurisdiction. The EAD letter asks only for senior officials and those who have never been overseas. This seems too restrictive and consideration should be given to explicitly permitting more flexibility so that those who can benefit the most have the opportunity to apply. It would be useful in helping departments determine the suitability of their candidates, (thus avoiding later confusion or delay), to include in this letter more specific information about the level and type of training available; qualifications needed by nominees, a complete checklist of data needed for a nomination to be considered at each step; and deadlines. To the extent feasible, alternates should be designated at this stage of the process (with complete files) so that if the principal drops out, the selection process could continue without having to start over.

To insure a quicker turnaround response from the P&Ds and federal ministries, there is a need for a monitoring system to alert EAD if (and where) nominations are being delayed in the line of transmission. EAD might forestall some of the delay by sending informal copies of its formal

announcement letter to the P&D departments directly to the various provincial departments and by initiating a structured follow-up system.

When EAD receives the nominations it undertakes to examine the conditions of training, the suitability of the candidate and the completeness of the file. Once a file is screened it must go up to the Joint Secretary (or Secretary, if nominees are Grade 20 or above) for approval. The file is then sent to the Establishment Division where, essentially, the screening process is duplicated and then the file is returned to EAD. EAD has indicated it would be willing to examine the current screening procedures and explore alternative to speed up the process.

Once the GOP has completed its screening, the names of approved nominees are sent to USAID. Each nominee's file is examined by the pertinent technical division in USAID to determine if the person proposed fits the program being offered. If not, the file is returned to EAD. Once approved by the technical division, HRT develops the PIO/P processing document and forwards it to AED. At the same time HRT writes to the proposed participant advising him or her of the nomination. If the file does not have a TOEFL score included, the nominee is advised that this test must be passed with a score of 550, and is told where and when the test is offered. If the score is included but is lower than 550, the nominee is advised that USAID will be arranging for his or her enrollment in an Intensive English Language class and inviting attendance, with travel and per diem covered by USAID if the class is located away from home. This letter also indicates if the GRE or GMAT is required. Finally, the letter advises that USAID's contractor, the Academy for Educational Development (AED), will be getting in touch to help complete processing and that in the meantime, any questions should be directed to AED.

Once AED receives the PIO/P from USAID, it contacts the nominee and asks for pertinent documents, e.g. transcripts, that are not normally included in the file and, in order to insure a relevant placement, sends a Participant Nomination Form to elicit specific information concerning the training goal, field of study and intended use of training skills upon return home. The original intent was that this form would be filled out during the nomination process, but the GOP has not always passed these on. Unfortunately, if approval by the GOP of the nominees does not come in until a program is almost ready to start, there may not be enough time for the form to be sent out and returned. Of course, the more information AED in Washington receives about participants the more likely that it can arrange the most appropriate program.

Once essential documents are received from the nominee, AED cables its Washington office to make the placement. While placements in general have been appropriate, a few instances were found where long term placements were made in University programs not sufficiently relevant to the Pakistani situtation; e.g. an agricultural degree program at a northern state university where soil conditions, rainfall, and crops are very

different from Pakistan's; a public administration degree program oriented to the U.S. social and economic environment, when courses in the same field at a nearby university were geared to international and third world problems. While these participants said their present placements were valuable and useful, the adaptation of material to the Pakistani situation would be somewhat easier with the help of more specifically relevant programs. When AED/Washington placement is completed the participant is notified and travel arrangements are made.

Orientation

Most of the participants surveyed stated they had no orientation concerning their program, living conditions, or cultural and educational differences prior to leaving Pakistan, and those that had received orientation rated it "poor" to "very poor". In retrospect, many felt it would have been very useful (see Tables 17-40). Also, AED/Washington indicated that because of the usual short lead time, many participants could not be given an orientation in the U.S. either. Most of those surveyed, however, did receive an orientation in Washington and rated it highly (see Table 42). It is suggested that AED/Washington closely coordinate with its Pakistan office and the U.S. educational institutions where participants are placed to determine the nature and extent of their orientations and to fill in any gaps that exist. AED/Pakistan, for its part, should make every effort to develop and conduct a comprehensive pre-departure orientation for both Islamabad and the provinces.

Follow-Up and Support of Participants in U.S.

The majority of the participants surveyed rated the support services from AED and the training institutions high in all respects (Tables 41-45). Besides AED's monthly letter and supplemental phone calls to participants at the beginning of the program, it also requests the participants' advisors to contact an AED counselor if any personal or academic problems should arise. At the end of each semester AED receives course grades and the list of courses participants plan to take the next term. It should be determined whether this information is promptly conveyed to HRT, AID's other technical divisions and AED.

The new expanded computer program to be installed at the AED/Washington office should improve record keeping and increase the opportunity for cross-referencing data. It is suggested that AED/Pakistan provide AED/Washington with information on follow-up and the participants' use of the knowledge and skills once they returns to Pakistan so that there will be total information on each participant available in the computer. This will give a more complete picture of the value and impact of the DSTP training experience.

There was a strong feeling by participants surveyed and GOP officials interviewed that allowances provided in the U.S. are inadequate. AID/Washington is aware of this problem, (which extends beyond Pakistan), and is studying alternatives to the present method of determining allowances.

Returned Participant Follow Up

In Pakistan, AED recently developed and sent out a follow-up questionnaire for returned participants but not many have been returned so far. These are steps in the right direction. However, to ensure the effectiveness of the training program there is a need for systematic feedback to determine (1) if course offerings need to be revised or augmented to make them more appropriate for Pakistan and (2) if problems returned participants are facing are such that intervention by USAID and its GOP counterparts could make a difference. As a minimum it is recommended that USAID take responsibility for maintaining contact with returned participants (with or without AED assistance) by correspondence every six months. An attempt to bring together participants in each of the four provinces once a year would be highly desirable.

An additional consideration might be to utilize returned participants to assist in briefing others before they leave. In response to a question about this on the survey, all but four said that they would be willing to do this, and said this is a good idea. This is a potentially valuable resouce in areas such as Karachi and Baluchistan, where participants find it difficult to come to Islamabad for a pre-departure orientation.

E. Other Aspects of Training

Third Country Training

The procedures for third country training are essentially the same as for U.S. training, including the GOP screening and approval process, AED processing in Pakistan and placement by the AED/Washington office. Of course, the institutions in the third countries are relied on to provide participant support. Institutions such as the Asian Institute of Technology in Thailand and the Asian Institute of Management and IRRI in the Philippines are all first rate and Pakistanis should be encouraged to attend.

Assistance to Ministry of Education (MOE) and Ministry of Science and Technology (MOST).

Although not designed in the formulation of this project, AED is now assisting the MOE with the processing, placement and support of fifteen Pakistanis studying in the U.S. under MOE financing. Another group will be nominated this year. The MOST has now requested similar USAID/AED

assistance for up to 100 participants in scientific fields in CY 86 and as many as 200 a year thereafter for a five year period. USAID is in the process of determining the unit add-on costs for these services to determine what increases in total project costs will be involved. As far as staffing requirements to absorb the extra workload is concerned, AED has already added a second support person to their staff in anticipation of an increased role and could increase their level of effort both in the field and Washington, if necessary. It is recommended that whatever upper limit of assistance to MOE and MOST is finally determined, it should be implemented on a time phased basis so all sides can adequately program for the added management burden.

Development Economics:

The Planning Division has requested a substantial number of participant training opportunities. Improvement of planning capability is a main goal in this project, and it is strongly recommended that training related to planning be given highest priority at the provincial level, rather than in the secretariat. This view was strongly supported by all interviewed (except those in the Planning division) and is supported in previous studies on planning needs).

Other Mission Projects

Based on conversations with other divisions in USAID and with HRT, there is a need for closer coordination between the technical divisions and HRT. While they stated that HRT was always helpful and responsive to their specific problems, some indicated confusion regarding roles and responsibilities related to the nomination and processing of participants under their projects. For example, if EAD is not pressing the provincial P&Ds for approval of nominations, should they go to their counterparts in the technical ministries for help or should HRT deal with EAD? On the other side, HRT states that even after nominations are cleared by EAD and the other divisions are notified, HRT is sometimes held up waiting for clearances by the USAID technical divisions. There also should be closer coordination among the project managers, HRT and AED regarding English language training needs, pre-departure orientation and departure timing. As mentioned above, project managers are concerned about support to long-term participants in term of sticking to approved study plans. In the areas of agriculture and energy, project officers feel it would be highly desirable to add management training to long-term study plans, and would like assistance from AED in assuring that this happens.

F. Recommendation

Although recommendations for the participant training section of this report have been incorporated into the preceding sections, the most serious problem is repeated here. Something needs to be done about the

delays in the nominating/approval process! At the time of the next amendment to the grant agreement it is recommended that a covenant be added requiring that the GOP take steps to rationalize and streamline the process. Either before then or at that time USAID should offer to finance up to six months of short-term technical assistance to help the GOP to identify and analyze the bottlenecks and to develop systems and procedures to improve on them. At a minimum, it is recommended that the O&M study on the procedures for nominating civil servants for foreign training be reviewed by all parties. (See bibliography for full citation under Dr. Tariq Siddiqui).

G. A Word of Caution

Key GOP officials, while fully supporting long-term training, have questioned the validity of USAID's emphasis on short term training in the U.S. They feel that much of this is irrelevant and/or unadaptable to conditions in Pakistan and would prefer that most short term training be developed and conducted in Pakistan. Besides being more applicable to local needs, this would serve to strengthen local institutions -- one of AID's four cornerstones and a goal of this project. This leads to two suggestions:

1. If funding limitations should require choices between long and short-term training, first priority should go to long-term training.

2. All short-term training should be carefully reviewed to insure appropriateness and relevance to both the trainees' background and conditions in Pakistan.

III. ENGLISH LANGUAGE TRAINING

A. Background:

English is a vital key to the success of the Development Support Training Project. The project paper states that most in-country courses and all overseas training will be conducted in English. Therefore intensive ESL programs were planned for those who require English language skills improvement training. Nominees going to the United States for more than 3 months training, moreover, must be prepared to pass the TOEFL (Test of English as a Foreign Language).

The project paper also states that ESL training will be done through existing in-country English language instruction centers. It was anticipated that this objective would probably require strengthening ESL institutions through technical assistance in curriculum design, English language instruction methodology, and limited commodity support.

English has been taught and spoken in Pakistan as the language of a reigning colonial power. Following a period in which English was de-emphasized, the Pakistanis are turning again to a renewed use of the language as a necessary vehicle for scientific and technical learning and international communication. However, though English is widely used, proficiency in the language is diminishing. Besides this, the teaching of English in the country has not kept pace with modern ESL philosophy and methods.

Though the Pakistanis are again eager to learn the language, English still carries political overtones from the past. While the country tries to mold its own cultural, religious, and linguistic identity, it must find a way to fit in this necessary foreign language.

It is against this background that the ESL component in the DST Project is considered.

B. Project Goals:

Under the feneral purpose of the project, the goal of the language program is to increase the English language proficiency of DSTP candidates. In the project paper this goal would be achieved by (1) strengthening Pakistani ESL centers in 3 locations in preparation for the IEAP (Intensive English for Academic Purposes) courses; (2) curriculum design for the intensive ESL courses; (3) in-country training of Pakistani ESL instructors to teach the IEAP program; (4) out-of-country advanced ESL training in Singapore or the U.S. for some Pakistani instructors. The combination of strengthened Pakistani ESL centers providing English at every level, and intensive courses for upgrading to an acceptable TOEFL score would yield both long and short term results. Institutionalizing improved contemporary ESL training would guarantee a higher general level of English proficiency for all, including potential DSTP candidates; immediate short term results would be attained in quickly bringing present DSTP candidates up to the level necessary for study in English abroad.

As part of the institutional upgrading, 90 Pakistani ESL instructors would be trained and prepared to teach and three IEAP programs would be operationalized.

This plan would be carried out assuming that the Government of Pakistan continued to encourage the learning and the spread of English.

From the beginning the main areas of activity for the ESL specialist were (1) to establish a network of professional ESL contacts in Pakistan in order to become familiar with where and how the language is taught, and to avoid duplication of programs; (2) to assist in the institutional development of the Pakistan-American Cultural Centers (PACCs) since this private non-profit ESL organization, the only major English language teaching operation in Pakistan, was seen as a likely vehicle for providing the ESL courses needed for the DST program; (3) to administer the TOEFL to prospective DSTP nominees to determine the extent of the need for English

language training and to identify high priority candidates for intensive English courses; and (4) design and plan for courses in intensive English for Academic Purposes at three centers: Quetta in Baluchistan, Peshawar in the NWFP and a central location such as Islamabad.

C. Current Status:

In general, the ESL program has been successful. The program suffered somewhat from a lack of clarity regarding the relative weight to be given to each of the main areas of activity. In the beginning considerable effort was expended to upgrade staff and materials at the PACCs so that they could improve their course offerings and teach the IEAP programs. As it became clear that they would not be ready to provide the programs for a long time, primary energy was shifted to designing and running independent IEAP programs. At the present time the relative priority of goals is: (1) TOEFL testing and AID-run IEAP programs; (2) institution building and (3) networking.

A good working relationship has developed with other professional ESL groups in Pakistan. These include USIS, the British Council, the U.S. Education Foundation, the Asia Foundation, the PACCs at Quetta, Peshawar, and Karachi, the ESL departments at the University Grants Commission and at the Open University. Members of these groups have collaborated in providing ESL training programs for Pakistani instructors.

TOEFL tests have been given to about 800 people to date, all of them prospective candidates for the DSTP and other AID funded projects.

A series of 4 day workshops was given at Quetta, Peshawar and Karachi in collaboration with the PACCs and other ESL professionals to upgrade the skills of national English language teachers. Besides this, teacher training, supervision and support were given to 12 native English speaking women to prepare them to teach in the IEAP programs.

Nine IEAP classes were held at three sites to prepare 141 prospective candidates for TOEFL and for academic study in the United States. In general, the classes have improved with experience - in organization, materials and design. Results are fairly good: about 35% of the students achieved 530 in the TOEFL upon completing their courses: 50% achieved a 10+ point increase in their TOEFL scores and 51% maintained a 2.5+ point increase per week; 34% maintained a 5+ point increase per week (see ESL Chart No. 1, Appendix 5). Beginning scores were generally no lower than 450.

The success of the ESL program to date is a tribute to the energy and initiative of all involved.

Present plans include providing TOEFL tests and IEAP courses as requested. The new ESL specialist has redesigned the focus for the courses in order to improve the teaching and learning of grammar, reading, writing and listening skills. She has adjusted the number of hours in the

classroom to optimize language learning and has introduced an attendance policy and student evaluation form. A new approach to teacher training was initiated this fall, encouraging a more participative creative role for the teachers in program planning, teaching and evaluation. This should result in a feeling of "ownership" of the program on the part of the teachers, greater team effort and a more informed professional approach to teaching ESL.

Since requests for IEAP courses are increasing, a Center may be established in Islamabad for the programs. This AID funded Center may merge in the future with a projected GOP - USIS Institute for Language Training which will serve as an ESL research and teacher training Center for Pakistan.

With so much energy going into IEAP courses, it appears that activities related to institution building and networking will be curtailed.

Problems have surfaced during the past 18 months. Providing IEAP courses on request has usually meant a short lead time. Often there was not time to train teachers sufficiently, obtain books and prepare a comfortable classroom setting. Besides this, there were various problems with the length of the courses, the time of day and time of year for courses, suitability of some materials and unavailability of comfortable classrooms. Generally, adjustments were made with the help of the ESL specialist and the solution of these problems contributed to the on-going evolution of quality IEAP programs.

The use of American women as teachers in the IEAP programs did not appear to be a problem from the cross cultural point of view. Both students and teachers adjusted well to each other despite differing cultural values and customs. The advantages of having Americans teach are that they provide the American accent and speech patterns for imitation as well as instant informal explanations of American culture. However, while some of the women had previous training or experience in ESL, the majority were non-professionals in teaching a second language. Therefore, very basic training in ESL and close supervision were required in order to maintain a quality program.

Teacher training generally took the form of briefings on the materials to be used and help with lesson planning and presentation. The materials used were chosen on the basis of being "teacher proof". Unfortunately, the close supervision needed in this kind of situation was not always available and there was a certain amount of frustration among the teachers due to lack of proficiency and ease in using ESL materials and methods.

Finally, employing women who are wives of Americans temporarily posted to Pakistan provides for little teacher continuity.

A critical aspect of the IEAP program is the motivation of the students to learn. Unfortunately students were often demotivated by not knowing definitely whether they would go to the U.S. to study, and by the continuing demands of their jobs which often took them away from classes.

All of these negative aspects of the program were constraints to greater progress in learning English.

C. Analysis:

In sheer volume of activities, this program is impressive. Networking has resulted in a valuable pooling of talent and resources for ESL teacher training as well as in joint discussions on improving the process of English Language training in Pakistan. Institution building activities have included (1) donating books and equipment to the PACCs in Quetta, Peshawar and Karachi; (2) working jointly with the PACCs to design long term courses in English for Academic Purposes (these courses were to be added to their regular course offerings); (3) teacher training seminars which were well received by the PACCs. Even though the PACCs were not used to deliver the IEAP programs, the time and effort spent with them was worthwhile in that it helped to further professionalize their programs.

The IEAP programs, despite the problems mentioned above, have laid the groundwork for quality intensive ESL courses which can be counted on to produce desired results.

However, the shift in the relative importance of goals from using local institutions for IEAP courses to mounting independent courses has brought about the unexpected result that these two goals are in contradiction to each other. As IEAP courses are set up as 6 to 8 week crash programs, using non-professional American teachers, much more time will have to be given to designing the courses, training and supervising the teachers and managing the program. Less time or inclination is left for building up Pakistani ESL centers which now appear to be superfluous to the IEAP effort. Though the short term goal of "getting nominees into the pipeline" is accomplished, the long term goal of improving local institutions is diminished. If this path is followed, the ESL component in the DST program will leave no legacy of strengthened and improved Pakistani institutions.

Moreover, using all American administration and staff for the ESL program runs the risk of isolating it from its Pakistani environment. Though there is value in using an all American staff, there is a political risk in appearing chauvinist or elitist. The implication that Pakistanis are not "qualified" to teach in or run our English language programs is a negative message which might breed resentment.

Lack of integration with the participant training program has already caused problems and could cause more. Hasty beginnings, as programs are mounted on request, and lack of motivation because students do not know their status in the DSTP nomination process could be avoided through closer collaboration with the participant training component of DSTP.

D. Recommendations:

In general, the recommendations of this evaluation are to continue to provide and improve the IEAP program, but ensure that it does not become isolated from the participant training program or from an effort to upgrade and institutionalize ESL training in Pakistan. Specifically:

(1) Include among DSTP nominees qualified Pakistani for training in ESL certificate or advanced degree programs. Since many ESL instructors in Pakistan are women, including them in DSTP would enhance their professional capabilities and professional status in Pakistan.

(2) Continue AID financial support of and professional contribution to ESL teacher training for Pakistanis. This support may also take the form of teaching internships offered to one or two qualified Pakistanis in each IEAP program.

(3) In collaboration with the Pakistani Government and USIS, support the projected Islamabad Language Training Institute. This Institute is expected to provide research facilities and training for Pakistan ESL trainers, as well as a site for the DSTP/IEAP programs. However, care should be taken to ensure that increased activities at an Islamabad Center do not exclude prospective participants in Baluchistan and the NWFP from receiving necessary English Language Training.

(4) Integrate qualified Pakistani into the administration and teaching staff of the IEAP programs, so that nationals make up about 20% of the whole operation. This is to ensure some feeling of Pakistani identification with, support for, and contribution to the IEAP program.

All of the above recommendations provide for an institutionalization of the DSTP/ESL training project, while assuring that the main effort will be on needed short-term IEAP programs.

(5) The ESL specialist should work more collaboratively with the participant training coordinator to schedule TOEFL tests and classes at regular advertized times during the year. These schedules should coordinate with deadlines in the participant training nomination process.

(6) The ESL specialist should work with the participant training coordinator and AED Washington to use the ESL courses for orientation. The orientation information given in the ESL programs should coordinate with and supplement the pre-departure orientation in Pakistan and the U.S. orientation program.

Recommendations 5 and 6 call for greater coordinated team effort among various actors in the DST project.

Finally, (7) Consider using more ESP (English for special purposes or technical English) material in the IEAP programs to further motivate students to study English and to prepare more directly for their coming overseas academic program.

IV. INSTITUTIONAL DEVELOPMENT AND MANAGEMENT TRAINING

A. Background

Since Partition, the growth of Pakistan's civil service has outpaced its ability to develop the institutions to train its managers. In the 1950's, a network of management training institutes was created, assisted in part through AID. These included the Pakistan Administrative Staff College, the National Institutes of Public Administration, the Institute of Business Administration, and the Pakistan Academy for Rural Development.

In the period from 1969 to 1980, AID's Government Administrative Staff Improvement (GASI) Project provided assistance for the training of a total of 128 officers, while the numbers of federal senior civil servants grew from 2,400 to slightly over 6700 1/. During this period the scope of government changed dramatically, as activities previously left to the private sector were nationalized, putting more managerial responsibility on senior civil servants, and more demand on the training institutes.

During this period, resources for the training institutes did not keep pace with demand and the quality of staff suffered as many were recruited to more rewarding employment in and out of Pakistan. The development of curricula based on an understanding of Pakistan's rapidly changing governmental environment did not occur, and as a result, management training, which was reaching a smaller percentage of the managerial cadres of government, became outdated.

By 1982 the Government of Pakistan recognized that government departments could not adequately identify, design and implement development projects, and that the improvement of management training programs and the institutes responsible for them was a critical factor in managing developmental activities more effectively. There was particular concern about the quality of course offerings and the under staffing of many of the government's training programs 1/. This was the environment in which the Development Support Training Project was initiated.

B. Project Goals

The purpose of the Development Support Training Project is to upgrade the managerial and technical expertise of Pakistanis in the public and private sectors who are involved in the planning, development and implementation

---

1/. Dr. Mohammed Jameelur Rehman Khan. Federal Government Civil Servants Censuses Over the Years: An Analytic Study. Public Administration Research Centre, O&M Division, Government of Pakistan, 1982. P. 47

of Pakistan's priority social and economic development programs. Organizational and institutional development activities focused at Pakistan's national training institutions are considered critical to this overall goal.

Three major institutional development objectives are specified to achieve this overall goal. First, relevant courses and workshops offered in GOP institutions are to be modified in order to address identified public and private Pakistani training needs. Second, a cadre of trained instructors at Pakistan's training institutions will be developed, which is capable of designing and conducting courses and workshops for the GOP and for private sector enterprises. Third, capacity will be increased for selected Pakistani training institutions to provide training in management, planning and administration. As a consequence of achieving these goals, these selected institutions will have better trained staff and improved curricula.

The specific outputs of institutional development and management training expressed in the Logical Framework of the Project Design Summary were:

1. "Training in management and technical subjects has been provided to 1,850 Pakistanis during the life of the project.

2. Approximately 34 short courses and workshops of several days to three weeks have been designed, developed, tested, and integrated into host institution curricula.

3. 50-75 Pakistani trainers have been trained to design and conduct courses that address current management training needs.

4. At least one training institution in each province will be strengthened" 1/.

These goals and activities were based on certain assumptions. These included:

1. The GOP will continue to attach high priority to quality improvement of training institutions and will provide sufficient budget and personnel for training institutions and programs;

2. Some positive policy measures will be taken both in public and private sectors for the recruitment and retention of professional staff;

1/. USAID. DSTP Project Paper, P. 16

3. GOP and private sector employees would be identified and released for participation in training activites, and upon completion of training would be returned to positions where their training could be utilized.

Current Status of Institutional Development and Management Training Activities:

The current status of activities in these project components is summarized below:

1. Institutional strengthening:

a. Three institutions have developed comprehensive strategic plans which include staff development, curriculum development, instructional methodology improvement, and facility and resource projections;

b. Two intensive training-of-trainers workshops have been conducted, with approximately 16 trainers from various training institutions participating in both;

c. A proposal has been initiated for the development of an action research program for the Administrative Staff College;

d. Planning is underway to consider the creation of a management training materials clearing house, and a workshop to increase trainer competence in the development and use of indigenuous training materials.

2. Management Training:

a. 15 of the 34 courses targeted for develpment and/or upgrading will have been held as of December 1985;

b. Approximately 300 persons have participated in these 15 courses;

c. Trainers at local institutions have begun the process of acquiring the competency to take over most of these courses after working with short term training consultants for several more cycles;

d. An inventory of trainer needs was carried out and based on this assessment, two management training workshops were held to improve training techniques.

1/. USAID, DSTP Project Paper Appendix 1.

C. Successes of Management Training Activities:

Analysis of the success of the management training activities carried out to date has to be limited to short term indicators. These are primarily the evalutions made by the trainees and the trainers at the conclusion of training activities.

Of the fifteen courses which will have concluded by the end of November, 1985, all but two or three were evaluated by all parties to have been very well conducted. Considering the many constraints and uncertainties at the start of any project, this is a commendable effort.

In six of these courses there has been a close working relationship between the short term trainers and the faculty from the sponsoring training institution in the development of the courses so that the local staff will be able to conduct the courses in the future without reliance upon external resources. The pattern of the relationship has varied depending on particular circumstances, but the general plan has been that the short term consultant and the local trainer collaborate in the general design of the course, then jointly carry out an assessment of the specific training needs of those who plan to attend. Based on this assessment, the final course plan and materials are developed. The degree of participation that the local trainer has been able to contribute to the actual conduct of the course has depended on the individual's level of preparation in the subject matter. When preparation has been needed, the project has been able to provide special intensive training.

The in-country pre-course planning and needs assessment process has been an excellent way to assure that course content matches trainee needs, and to introduce the short term trainer to local management realities and practices.

In six cases, the courses developed are modules of one to three weeks within " long courses" regularly offered by the training institute. However several of these are being considered as "stand alone" courses for other client groups. In the remaining cases, the courses were designed as stand alone courses, except for the two course sequence in training-of-trainers.

In the five courses aimed more at the private sector than the public sector, one of the courses (offered twice) has been a course for Chief Executive Officers. It has attracted top people and is the type of course that can lead to in-house training and consulting efforts that are likely to have an impact on the managerial climate and practices of an organization. The course has been conducted by senior management consultants from Arthur D. Little, Inc., one of the sub-contractors on the project.

D. Constraints in Management Training Activites:

The major constraint faced by the contractor in carrying out the management training mandate in this project is the insufficiency of the resources. There are opportunities to develop management training courses in sectors that have a high priority to AID, but the existing level of effort is not adequate to respond to these.

A second major constraint has been the inability of the GOP to identify and prioritize management training needs in the public sector. One of the assumptions on which the project was started was that this task would be done by the GOP, and would form the basis on which the development of management training courses would proceed within the training institutions. This plan would also serve the important role of providing a mechanism by which the training institutes could coordinate their training plans. This would reduce the overlap in training content that exists.

Additionally, the activities of this project have faced contextual constraints that limit the effectiveness of training no matter how well it is executed. Foremost among these is the pattern of drawing trainees in a given course from a wide range of organizations. This limits the training impact because of the difficulty of achieving a "critical mass" of persons trained in a specific management practice in a given organization. While the assumption holds that employees are released for training, the necessary assumption that they be supported in their effort to apply what they may have learned in training does not generally hold. As a consequence, much management training, including that developed and conducted through this project, has little probability of having any lasting impact on the managerial practices in any Pakistani organization.

Another constraint against effective management training, and which is a consequence of the trainee mix noted above, is that the content of training is general in nature. A persistent criticism of management courses in the public and private sectors in Pakistan has been their general nature and their lack of skill development. This pattern will continue as long as course composition is determined in the current manner. It should be noted that the courses developed in the project have exhibited more content oriented toward developing practical managerial skills than is usually the case in the courses offered at the training institutions.

Another constraint is the scarcity of resources in the training institutions. Modern training tools, including current, indigenous materials, generally do not exist. The assumption that resources are available does not hold to the degree necessary.

A constraint experienced by and commented on by several of the short term consultants is the cultural expectation of lecture based learning. Courses that are based on an experiential learning design tend to meet resistance from some trainees, and also from local instructors. Effective management training requires a skillful blending of the two methodologies, linking knowledge, skills and attitudes into managerial competence.

A point made strongly by several AID project officers in technical divisions is that while there is general recognition of the need for management training in the areas in which they work (agriculture and energy) this project offers an opportunity to do more integration of technical and management training. For example, it was suggested that those being sent abroad for technical training ought to be required to take basic management courses to acquire the knowledge base on which subsequent in-country and project specific management training can be carried out through this project. The basic constraint here is that project personnel have lacked the time to develop this opportunity. There also appears to be another factor. In the short time that this project has operated, the interaction between AED and AID has been focused mainly on the administrative matters of participant training. This is understandable, given the volume of work this task demands. But there is a growing opportunity for more interaction between the management training component of the project and the other AID projects. In effect, what is being suggested by these other project personnel is that the contractor's participant training planner and management training specialist sit down with them and plan how to attack management problems in their areas through DSTP.

Finally, a factor which tends to work against the effectiveness of training is the failure of those who believe in training to recongnize its limitations, and therefore expect too much of it. It is an effective way to change ability; but it is only one way to change attitudes and motivation. If the limitations of managerial practicesrequire structural reorganization, or policy changes, or different resource allocation, or procedural changes, no amount of training will solve these problems.

E. Recommendations:

1. Considerably more resources need to be provided than are currently available in this component. At the start of this project, this was the area of highest priority. Many feel that it still is; however, the resource base needed to carry out enough management training activities to begin to have an impact on management practices in key GOP developmental programs are not reflected in the level of effort for short and long term consultants and the support they need. It is recommended that a substantial increase in funding for this component be made, with primary emphasis placed on the development and delivery of in-country management training in those areas that GOP and USAID agree have the highest priority for national development.

Specifically, funding for the long term management training position should be extended, and another senior position in this area should be added. It is suggested that this position be filled with a Pakistani, perhaps one who is currently living abroad.

The level of effort for short term consulting should be substantially increased, to allow for a greater effort of in-country management training. An effort should continue to be made to use the same consultants on several occasions (when approrpriate) as to generate more continuity and monitoring of progress within the local institutions.

There should be substantial increases in the level of funding for commodities, according to demonstration of need established in the comprehensive strategic plans developed by training institutes.

2. In addition to increasing funds in this component, it is recommended that the project termination date be extended. The institutional capacity to develop and deliver the kind, quality and amount of management training needed in the key development sectors does not exist, and its creation is a lengthy process.

3. In a speech on Nov. 1, 1985 the Secretary of Agriculture of the GOP stated that the main problem facing agriculture in Pakistan was management, not technology. Allen Hankins of the AID Mission has similar views. He feels that there are adequately prepared technicians in agriculture, but not technicians who can think and act like managers. Similar things could be said about the energy sector, as well as strategic areas of the social development sectors and the private sector generally.

In order to get better impact from USAID resources being managed by the Mission, it is recommended that closer coordination occur between the activities of DSTP and other AID projects in the area of management training. Given the institutional resources of two of the DSTP sub-contractors (ADL and Penn State University), there is the capability of responding to management training needs in energy and agriculture. The Management Education Institute of ADL, for example, is launching a utilities management training program, parts of which may be adaptable for in-country training in Pakistan.

Several ideas for developing closer coordination between DSTP and other AID projects are suggested here:

a. The Consortium Council, which will meet in Islamabad in the near future, should use that opportunity to explore with other AID projects whether and how the DST Project can serve more than their PT needs.

b. The Mission should consider creating an ad-hoc task force on management training in key sectors. The purpose of the task force would be to review current management problems being experienced or observed by project personnel, and to explore ways to address these problems through the resources of DSTP.

c. On a smaller scale, direct contact between the management training specialist and one other AID project, such as MART, for example, might be initiated to explore coordination and integration possibilities.

4. It is recommended that management training activities and resources be focused within organizations in key development sectors; that these efforts be closely integrated with efforts to develop and strengthen institutions of training within those sectors as "centers of excellence of management training"; and that the training plans and training content be built around the need to create sound management practices thoughout all levels of operation in the organizatons in these sectors.

5. It is recommended that efforts to develop indigenous training materials be continued and closely coordinated with curriculum development efforts in the training institutes.

6. It is recommended that the strategic plans developed by PIM, NIPA/Karachi and the Pakistan Audit Department be supported.

7. It is recommended that greater effort be made to utilize short term consultants with greater familiarity with conditions in Pakistan.

8. It is recommended that course development and modification continue to place a high priority on the integration of knowledge, skills and values specific to the needs of managers in Pakistan.

9. To bring a sharper focus to an understanding of who should be trained and what the content of management training should be, it is recommended that results of a human resorces development plan proposed elsewhere in this report be the foundation of such decision making.

F. Successes of Insitutions Building Activities:

The Development Support training project has been institution building activities with three training institutes. These are: NIPA/Karachi, PIM, and the Training Wing of the Pakistan Audit Department. After initial difficulties in trying to move all of the general training institutions, the strategy was changed to focus resources on only those insitituions whose director and faculty demonstrated a commitment to institution strengthening activities.

The test of commitment has been the development of a strategic plan for the training institute, which covers a 3-5 year time frame; requires an intensive analysis of purpose, resources, clients and "competitors"; analyzes the structural and institutional barriers that have historically inhibited the development of the institution to its full potential; and results in a plan that will lead the institution out of its present state of affairs and into a new cycle of development and growth.

The strategic plans of PIM and NIPA/Karachi will provide the first serious test of the assumption that the GOP is prepared to take the necessary steps to allow these institutes to recruit and retain highly qualified staff.

DSTP's support for the development of a strategic plan by the Training Wing of the Pakistan Audit Department signals another important shift in the project's insitutional development policy. The original design saw support going to the general training institutions. PAD's Training Wing is a specialized training institute, serving primarily the civil servants in the Audit Department, or those in the Accounts and audit service group (cadre) who carry out the accounting and auditing functions in all GOP organizations. The most important aspect of this strategic plan is that the strengthening of the Training Wing is a key step in a total reform of the entire Audit Department and the functions it serves in the GOP. This DSTP activity is key to a profound attempt to change management practices that will not only affect the Audit Department, but every other office of the federal government in Pakistan. It is the conclusion of the evaluation team, that this approach has higher chance of changing management practices in Pakistan than most other approaches presently tried.

DSTP is exploring institution building activities with several organizations in the private sector. These are discussed in Section V: Special Targets: Private Sector.

G. Constraints

A major constraint in the DST program has been a lack of clarity and definition of program goals by both the GOP and USAID regarding institutional development of training organizations. The problem was critical during the first year of the project and contractor reports expressed considerable concern over it. The shift in policy to strategic support for training institutions willing to make a major commitment seems to have offset this constraint, at least in the short run.

The lack of clarity on the part of the GOP stems in part from its lack of a human resources development plan, based on a clear understanding of which managers need training in which areas.

The lack of clarity in USAID's part may be the result of preoccupation with the rapid expansion of the participant training activities and the need to devote considerable time to this because of the problems that rapid expansion revealed.

A second constraint on the DSTP activities relates to the resources the training institutions have to work with. There are severe staffing problems at several of Pakistan's training institutions, including both of the NIPAs and PIM. The failure to fill these positions makes it difficult for USAID to support staff training in these institutions. The absence of a suitable faculty who can and want to be trained remains a serious constraint to the long term impact of the DSTP activities.

The human resource development of Pakistan's training institutions remains a critical problem. The reward system for teaching in training institutions is not good and there are very few incentives for career and skills development. Many of those placed at the training institutions perceive their position as somewhat of a "punishment".

There is some concern among GOP and training institution officials that the contractor is not open to ideas except those that come from AID. In addition there is some concern that AID policy with regard to support for training institutions has been too rigid. The Directors of a number of training institutes have indicated that they feel cut off from the decision making process and that their ideas about the needs of their institutions are not taken into consideration by the contractor unless it fits into the framework that AID and its contractor have already defined. Regardless of the validity of this perception, the fact that it exists suggests that there is a communication problem between the institutions and the project administrators which needs to be addressed in the next phase of the project.

There is some evidence that the relationship between participant training as a component of DSTP and institution-building activity is not entirely clear. On a day to day basis, the volume of participant training suggests that there is very little distinction made between those trainees who are targeted for institutional development activities and those who are not. As the volume of participant training under DSTP grows dramatically over the next few years the absence of a separate tracking mechanism and of a clear focus upon the relationship between participant training and institution building would become increasingly threatening to the success of the project.

There is some suggestion amoung some working in the project that institution building activity is on a "tighter" budget and shorter leash than the other components of the DSTP project and that there are budget constraints in this component of the project which do not exist in other project activities. Regardless of the validity of such views, such a perception of project management is bound to have a significant negative impact upon project implementation.

Recommendations:

The overall recommendation of this evaluation is that AID continue to support institution building activities under DSTP and that insofar as is possible such activities should be greatly extended and expanded during the next phase of the project. The needs of Pakistan's training institutions are severe and yet they remain critical components of GOP development efforts. There should be increased levels of support for staff training, for program development activities, for supplies acquisition and for institutional planning and development activities.

At the same time, some of the uncertainties in terms of goal definition will have to be adressed as the project moves into its next phase. In particular, USAID should request clarification from the GOP on government priorities in terms of training institutions and on the role of Establishment (as opposed to the Directors) in the planning and staffing policies of training institutions. The purpose and goals of the training institutions need to continue to be clarified. In order to plan for and fulfill their training mission, training institutions need reasonable discretionary authority.

AID and its contractor should continue to assist the government of Pakistan in expanding its institutional capacity for training for private sector activities. In particular, AID should provide support for the Graduate School of Business Administration of the Lahore University of Graduate Sciences. Particular focus should be on those aspects of training which support indigenous entrepreneurial activity and new sources of capital accumulation. One such effort might focus upon those Pakistanis who are returning from overseas who might be interested in private sector activities. AID and its contractor have already been very active in the area and efforts should be made for increased activity in this direction.

AID should provide increased assistance to the GOP for support in order to increase provincial training capacity and provincial efforts to train officials at the divisional, district and local level. A first step in this direction would be to provide support for the Project Training Institute of the Planning and Development Board of the Government of the Punjab. Other institutes which might be supported include the Local Government Training Institute at Lalamusa and the National Rural Development Center in Islamabad. In the next phase of the DSTP it is important for DST project managers to pay much more attention to middle level field based managers at the provincial level and the institutions which have been established to train them. Those officials are critical to the development and implementation activities of GOP.

DSTP should continue its successful pattern of taking advantage of "windows of opportunity" to support organizational and institutional development in non-institutional training units in the public, parastatal and the private sectors. Support for the training unit of the Pakistan Audit Department (PAD) is the first involvement under the DSTP in an organization other than one of the traditional semi-autonomous training institutions. This involvement should serve as a model for other operational training units in the federal goverment, the public corporations and the private sector, especially in those areas having a high priority to national development efforts of AID in Pakistan, such as WAPDA.

At the same time AID and its contractor should maintain contact with training institutes such as the Pakistan Academy of Rural Development (PARD). Given significant preliminary discussions it is likely that PARD could become involved in the next phase of DSTP activity. Officials at PARD have indicated that they would welcome increased contact and involvement with all aspects of the DST project.

Strategic plans from several of Pakistan's training organizations, including PIM, NIPA-Karachi and the Training Unit of the Pakistan Audit Department will become operational in the next few months. An important next step in support for institutional development of these training institutions should be significant levels of support for those components of the strategic plan for which GOP officials seek external assistance. Assuming suitable candidates, priorities for participant training should be given to those training institutions which have completed the strategic planning exercise.

GOP, with the assistance of AID and its contractor, needs to address the question of staffing of training institutions. One model of staffing suggests that some of the training institution staff positions might be shifted from direct hire to a deputation pattern whereby particularly well qualified officials from line ministries are assigned to the training institutions for two or three years. Such a pattern of career development could be modeled upon the pattern of promotion and career development which exists in the Pakistan military.

Care must be taken, however, if such a model were adopted, that the deputation should be considered a promotion and that such position not be considered "dumping grounds" for unwanted personnel. A first step in this direction might be, on an experimental basis, to convert one or two positions to this mode. Those filling such positions should be provided with Training of Trainer instruction prior to assignment in the training institution. Such individuals upon completion of their two or three year assignment, could, on the basis of a high quality of performance within the training institute, be sent for advanced training for the next stage of their career.

GOP, with the assistance of AID and its contractor, should address the issue of research and consultancy activities within the training institutions. Potential for development of institutions, such as PIM, lie in linking consultancy activities to financial remuneration for faculty. Under this model, institutional staff would be allowed a certain number of consultancy days per year, and would be allowed to keep a percentage of the revenue garnered. Such a pattern would have two advantages: First, it would insure that the instructional staff of the training institution would stay current in management issues and secondly the revenues generated would provide financial support for the training institution itself.

Under the DSTP, some attention must be given to the question of curriculum development. One possible approach is the development of and support for a specialized agency, possibly commercially based, to develop and market training materials for training institutions. The more mundane questions of supplies of books, library materials, audio-visual aids and other kinds of limited acquisition support should not be neglected assuming such action can be justified within the context of the strategic planning process. Often these items, though the costs are relatively small, are not available to training institutions through their operating budgets. AID should clarify its policy with regard to purchases and communicate this policy to GOP and training institution staff members who are responsible for acquisitions activity.

One issue which needs to be raised and addressed as the project is extended and expanded is the relationship between AID and the contractor. There is currently a very close supervision of contractor activity. While this supervision is appropriate, it is important to bear in mind that the kind of developmental approach which is being attempted in terms of institutional development is different from many of the more routine, on going contractor activities in the participant training and course delivery areas. Consistent with overall AID policy, the contractor should be given some discretion in institutional development activities. Both AID and the contractor should do everything possible to ensure that communication blockage points between those responsible for institutional development activities and AID officials do not develop and that the institutional development activities continue to be an integrating factor in DSTP activities. As the institutional development component of the DST project expands, it is critical that a direct line of communications exists between the Human Resources Training office of AID and the Management Specialist responsible for the contractor's institutional development activities. The contractor/AID relationship is often a "conservative" one and unless AID officials encourage diversity of thinking the dependency relationship between the two may preclude the kind of creativity which is critical to development activities.

A concluding remark about the whole question of organizational and institutional development is in order. One of the things which has to be kept in mind is that the DST Project has been going for a very short period of time. Institution building activities cannot be addressed in two years or even four or five. A ten year period of activity is considered by many as a minimum commitment to institution-building activities.

V. SPECIAL TARGETS: PRIVATE SECTOR

A. Background:

The private sector has been included as a target area in DSTP since the inception of the project. Reference to the need for management training is in the contract, narrative summary of the Project Paper, as well as the project purposes and outputs of the Logical Framework. The Pakistan Institute of Management (PIM) was targeted as one of the training institutes to receive institutional strengthening. PIM's clients include private sector organizations, as well as many of the public corporations.

B. Current Status

Activities are underway on several fronts to improve managerial practices in the private sector. These are:

1. Assistance to PIM in the development of a market survey and a multi-year strategic plan.

2. Upgrading of existing courses and addition of new courses at PIM (4 Courses).

3. Development of a Training of Trainers workshop specifically for trainers in private sector organizations.

4. Support of Management Development Center of the Habib Company in reviewing US corporate models for the development of management training centers which serve an in-house market as well as external markets.

5. Support to the Pakistan Society for the Advancement of Training (PSAT) in the development and delivery of a management training materials workshop, aired primarily at trainers in the private sector.

C. Successs:

1. The activities initiated with Habib Group, Jaffer Brothers, the National Bank of Pakistan, and the Pakistan Society for the Advancement of Training are significant because they include some of the most influential companies in Pakistan. From AID's point of view, this means that activities undertaken should have a higher probability of success (since these firms have more resources to commit to undertakings and have a history of being leaders in innovation) and are likely to have a greater multiplier effect since they will attract the following of other firms who do not want to lose contact with the front runners.

2. Unlike the public sector, where management training priorities have not been identified in recent years, there have been recent efforts of this nature in the private sector. Through the DSTP, ADL assisted the Pakistan Institute of Management (PIM) to conduct a marketing survey which identified management training needs among a range of private firms. In addition, PIM published a survey in 1982 of the management training needs in the private sector and public enterprises.

3. There is a climate of cooperation and interest in professional development in management training circles in the private sector. DSTP has begun to develop the contacts with key people in this movement, and is in a position to provide support to their ideas.

4. There is no single dominant point of central control vis a vis private sector initiatives. On the one hand, this makes coordination and direction more elusive. On the other hand, it means there are no immediate bottlenecks to flexible, innovative action.

5. DSTP is planning to provide support to the new Lahore University of Management Sciences, Graduate School of Business Administration (LBS). The backers of this school include some of the top business leaders in the nation. They will provide faculty and students of the new school with an unusual degree of access to consulting and research opportunities that will be critical to LBS. They also provide AID with an opportunity to broaden areas of mutual interest in private sector management development.

6. As indicated elsewhere in this report, PIM has recently adopted a strategic plan, developed with the assistance of DSTP. Technical assistance throughout this task was provided by ADL. The Secretary of Production has commited substantial resources to PIM, as has AID through DSTP, to implement the strategic plan. This represents a significant success for the project.

D. Constraints:

1. Within AID's frame of reference, the private sector initiative lacks a focus. This is apparent from the CDSS to the DSTP. No specific project thrusts or goals have emerged around which key counterparts can be identified and activities developed.

2. The Pakistan Society for the Advancement of Training (PSAT), while acting as a linking pin to many of the training initiatives in the private sector, including those that involve DSTP, is a small voluntary organization. This leaves it very vulnerable to changes that may happen.

3. The Lahore Graduate School of Business Administration faces all the challenges of a new organization. While it is new and exciting, it is not unique, except in the amount of the tuition it plans to charge.

But its services are not unique, and that may be a constraint to its success. On the one hand, its plan seems ambitious. On the other hand, the plans may not be ambitious enough. Perhaps if the short range operational goal was to create Pakistan's first doctoral level program in management, the program might better serve AID's goal of more visible support to management development.

The Graduate School's plan to develop a bilateral assistance relationship with a high prestige university in the United States will not be easy to arrange. There are many competitors for few institutions of the caliber LBS has in mind, and Pakistan is at a competitive disadvantage in this regard.

E. Recommendations

1. The Mission needs to take the initiative in developing a private sector strategy and focus, which this and other projects need. Consideration might be given to creating an Advisory Council, including the key ministers or secretaries, as well as private individuals representating major corporations. Not only might this Council help to clarify focus, it might be an effective means to keep project initiatives from becoming captives of bureaucratic procedures.

2. The private sector target of DSTP needs a considerably higher level of effort, as do all components and targets of this project.

3. Opportunities for strengthening institutions with a management training mission exist, and should be supported to the maximum extent possible. These include PIM, the Pakistan Society for the Advancement of Training, the National Management Development Centre, the Executive Development Centre of Jaffer Brothers, and the Lahore University of Management Sciences (both the executive development programs and the graduate degree programs). In addition, consideration should also be given to reviewing the needs of the Institutes of Business Administration at the Universities.

4. Participant training opportunities for the private sector have been limited, primarily because of the lack of focus mentioned earlier. In the short run, participant training opportunities could be expanded considerably by:

a. developing more programs for women, as HRT has creatively started;

b. using short-term PT for internships for graduate students in business administration programs such as LBS and IBAs;

c. acting aggressively at this stage of the project to limit the role of EAD and other PT bottlenecks regarding clearances. Support from the Advisory Council mentioned above might be sought for this purpose.

VI. SPECIAL TARGETS: TRAINING AT THE PROVINCIAL LEVEL

A. Background:

In the project paper, it was stated that much of the in-country management training in Pakistan would focus on provincial and local level project management and that special attention should be paid to training in Pakistan's less developed provinces of NWFP and Baluchistan. It was intended that training institutions located in these provinces would be utilized wherever possible. Where feasible it was proposed that instructors from Pakistani institutions located in different parts of the country might be asked to conduct courses based at targeted provinces. The Pakistan Academy for Rural Development (PARD) was identified as a likely location for training in the NWFP while in Baluchistan the University of Baluchistan and the Railway Academy were posited as possible sites. Newly created NIPAs at Quetta and Peshawar were to be targeted for institutional development activities. The project was also designed to support management training for small industries at the Provincial level.

B. Current Status:

During the first phase of DSTP, little support was provided for provincial level training either in the disadvantaged provinces or in the more developed provinces of the Punjab and Sind. There were three reasons for this. First, the development of the two NIPAs at Peshawar and Quetta had not developed to a stage where either management training or institutional development activities could occur. More generally, management training for provincial level officials is constrained by a lack of GOP resources to develop training institutions at this level. Secondly, some resistance to project activities developed in existing institutions in the less developed provinces, and in particular the Pakistan Academy of Rural Development. Finally, the project has been constrained by a lack of qualified nominees from the provinces.

C. Recommendations:

Provincial level management training should be a major priority area in the next phase of DSTP. While there should be concern for provincial level training in all of Pakistan's provinces, particular attention should be paid to the provinces of NWFP and Baluchistan.

During the next phase of the project the following activities should be undertaken in order to provide support for management training at the provincial level. First, the project managers should continue to have contact with the Pakistan Academy of Rural Development. It remains the

insititution in Pakistan which focuses on training for middle and field level managers. Given sufficient preliminary discussions it should be possible for PARD to become involved in DST activities. Officials at PARD have indicated that they would welcome increased contact and involvement with all aspects of the DST project.

Secondly, AID should provide increased institutional and programatic support for management training efforts at the provincial level. Focus of attention should be upon middle level and field based managers at the provincial, divisional, district and local level. One step in this direction would be support for the Project Training Institute of the Planning and Development Board of the Punjab. This institute, which provides project, planning, management and implementation training, is critically short of resources and staff and is very interested in receiving support under DSTP. Other institutes which might be supported include the Local Government Training Institute at Lalamusa and the National Rural Development Center in Islamabad.

Thirdly, because much is as yet unkown in terms of provincial level training needs, AID should support efforts in each of the four provinces to identify provincial training needs. This training needs analysis, carried out by a management specialist from the U.S. and one or more Pakistani specialist, would focus upon skills needed, and projections of provincial training requirement levels over a five year period. Consideration should be given to the stationing of a human resources specialist from the United States in Islamabad for six months in order to carry out this activity.

Finally, in the event that the NIPAs in Peshawar and Quetta become operational, every consideration should be given to supporting the new institutions in the development of strategic action plans and in terms of programatic and staff support.

VII. SPECIAL TARGETS: TRAINING FOR WOMEN

A. Current Status:

Twenty-six women have gone to the U.S. under the DST program, one for a degree program, the rest for short courses or conferences in general management, personnel management, and women in development. Besides this, AID, in collaboration with the Center for Development and Population Activities, has helped fund a seminar on Women in Management. AID has also sponsored three women to attend the U.N. International Conference for Women in Nairobi, Kenya.

An extensive effort is underway to inform women's organizations of the opportunities for management training or scholarships under the DST program. Personal contacts have been made with the Women's Division, Shirkat Gat (Women's resource center in Lahore), the Business and Professional Women's Associations in Lahore, Quetta, and Karachi, and associations of women journalists, lawyers, small business women, advertisers, and travel agents.

B. Analysis:

The recent initiative to offer participant training scholarships to women in the private sector has met with an excellent response. It should be noted that a number of women from the civil service also responded to the offer, indicating that they had not known about the participant training nomination process available to them through government channels.

Because of the groundwork already laid, there are several opportunities to develop in-country management training projects for women in collaboration with Pakistani Women's Organizations. Besides this, the Women's Division has shown some interest in using DSTP resources for its training institutes for field workers, and for other staff training needs.

Though extension of the DST program to women began slowly, a great deal of spadework has been done in the last 18 months. Significant expansion in the near future is likely. We strongly encourage AID to move ahead vigorously on the opportunities now developing.

C. Recommendations:

1. Substantially increase funding for scholarships to women in the private sector;

2. Collaborate with Pakistani women's organizations to design and produce management training courses for business and professional women. This will necessitate using management consultants to help design and give the seminars. These programs should be oriented toward women in management in Pakistan.

3. Continue contact with the Women's Division and work with them to design and produce in-house training programs for its staff as well as basic management training seminars for field supervisors in rural women's development programs;

4. Consider devising a way to directly inform women in the civil service about the DSTP Participant Training Program so that if they wish they can take the initiative in promoting their own nominations.

PART III

R E P O R T S U M M A R Y

(Originally the Executive Summary)

- Overview
- Participant Training
- Strengthening of Training Institutions
- Management Training
- English as a Second Language
- DSTP Role re National Human Resource Development Policy
- Special Targets : Private Sector
- Special Targets : Provincial Governments
- Special Targets : Women
- Project Planning Administration and Coordination

I. OVERVIEW

A. Findings and Conclusions:

1. The Development Support Training Project has had a successful start, credit for which is due to dedicated people in the Government of Pakistan (especially the Economic Affairs Division and the Training Wing of the Establishment Division); in AID (most notably HRT); in the Washington and Islamabad offices of the contractor, the Academy for Educational Development (AED); and in the offices of the sub-contractors (Arthur D. Little, Inc., the Experiment in International Living, and the Institute of Public Administration of Pennsylvania State University).

2. Despite usual start-up difficulties, project outputs are generally on target, and some significant short-term successes have occured.

3. There are problem areas that could jeopardize the overall success of the project. These are discussed below in project components.

4. DSTP is seen by Mission project officers and technical staff as an efficient way to handle logistical aspects of participant training, without giving up substantive control over these resources.

5. The management training needs of Pakistan require considerably greater resources over a long period of time in the targeted areas.

B. Recommendations:

1. As funding levels increase, so should the relative proportion of DSTP funds allocated to institutional stengthening, in-country training, and ESL activities. These project components are underfunded.

2. The project termination date should be extended to FY 90 or longer to permit commitment to and support of strategic plans for institutional strengthening.

II. PARTICIPANT TRAINING

A. Findings and Conclusions:

1. Present GOP selection processes are cumbersome and redundant, resulting in delays that carry past training activity starting dates. As a consequence, 27% of all trainees currently in the US had one week or less between their notification of selection and departure. The situation is getting worse, as indicated by the data in Table 12 of Appendix 4.

2. There is widespread concern among GOP officials about the impact of participant training which is less than three months duration and which is not a formal training program closely addressing the trainee's current job needs. This seems to be more of a problem in the management area than in technical areas. Similar concern was expressed in over thirty percent of the survey responses.

3. It is too early in the project to determine the impact of long-term training.

4. At present there is no effective mechanism for systematically monitoring training impact.

5. Some GOP officials feel that English language requirements for short-term training are too high.

B. Recommendations:

1. USAID seek, through convenanted agreement to the extension of the project, GOP action to streamline the participant training nomination and selection process so as to achieve timely results.

2. All short term training activities need much more careful planning and scrutiny to assure that they will provide worthwhile training outcomes for the trainee's work unit.

3. AID needs to establish who is responsible for monitoring training impact, and establish a process for insuring that this function is carried out in a manner that assists HRT, GOP, and the contractor in assuring that DSTP resources are being effectively utilized.

4. AID should review its English language requirement for short-term training to determine if changes could be made without impairing training effectiveness.

III. STRENGTHENING OF TRAINING INSTITUTIONS

A. Findings and Conclusions:

1. Strenghtening of training institutes does not have the same priority it had at the inception of the project.

2. Two general training institutes (NIPA/Karachi and Pakistan Institute of Management) and one specialized training institute (Training Wing, Pakistan Audit Department) have developed comprehensive 3-5 year

strategic plans for strengthening their respective staff, curricula, and training activities. In the case of the general training institutes, these plans also cover research and consulting activities. The process of developing these plans has generated an unusual amount of discussion about and support for the proposals by staff, boards, and funding authorities.

3. The strategic plans offer a uniquely comprehensive rationale for addressing chronic staffing shortages, lack of meaningful consulting and research activities, curricular gaps, and the scarcity of instructional and research support services.

4. Other training organizations within line departments, autonomous bodies, and the private sector have begun to show serious interest in the "strategic plan" approach evolving in DSTP. This offers DSTP opportunities to have a more immediate impact on management practices in those sectors having high priority to AID than reliance upon the generalized training institutions.

5. The current level of effort of the contractor's management training and institutional strengthening consultants (long and short term) does not allow response to these opportunities.

B. Recommendations:

1. A review of project priorities, with particular regard to institutional development and its relationship to other project components, should be carried out. A propitious opportunity for doing so will be the forthcoming meeting of the Consortium Council.

2. Training organizations that request substantial assistance should develop a 3-5 year strategic plan demonstrating how those resources will be used for institution strengthening purposes, and the breadth of internal and external support the plan has. Technical assistance should be provided for the development of the strategic plan after prerequisite criteria have been met. AID should develop such criteri.

3. The strategic plan approach should be directed towards those training organizations whose management training clients are organizations with activities central to the sectors which AID has given highest priority (e.g. agriculture, energy, private sector), as well as other critical targets (planning and development divisions of federal and provincial governments, the cabinet secretariat, and women).

IV. MANAGEMENT TRAINING

A. Findings and Conclusions:

1. Management training is generally regarded as an activity to change

the individual without adequate regard for a plan to change the organizational culture within which the individual works. The strategy of training a "critical mass" of managers within the same organization is not generally being pursued by the training institutes. As a consequence, much management training, including that developed and conducted through this project will have a low probability of having lasting impact on management practices, which is a fundamental purpose of this project.

2. The lack of resources from both the GOP and DSTP is a major constraint to carrying out the management training mandate of the project at a level more likely to have an impact on management practices. Increased support from the GOP may be forthcoming to PIM and NIPA/Karachi in support of their strategic plans, and this will impact their management training capability.

3. The training institutes feel that the GOP needs to provide more direction in terms of specifying training priorities.

4. Fifteen of the thirty four targeted courses in management training programs have been conducted by short term consultants. Local staff of the sponsoring training institutions are supposed to develop the competence to assume full responsibility for these courses. The rate at which that is happening is behind schedule. Reasons for this vary, but utilization of consultants with more first hand familiarity with Pakistani management practices would help this process, as would greater cooperation from local staff.

5. Each of these courses was preceded by an in-country needs assessment conducted by the short term consultants, usually with assistance from a staff member from the local training institution. This process was very succe sful in assuring that the competencies developed in these courses were appropriate to the needs of the trainees.

B. Recommendations:

1. More resources need to be provided by the GOP and DSTP for all catagories of expenditures if the quality and quantity of management training is to be significantly increased.

2. It is recommended that management training activities and resources be focused within training units in key development sectors such as agriculture, energy and the private sector.

3. It is recommended that AID and GOP seek ways to cooperate in developing management training priorities. (See Section VI below for a specific recommendation regarding this).

4. Short term consultants should have expertise in applications of their specialty in Pakistan or similar settings, and should be more carefully selected to insure that their level of expertise is appropriate for the assignment.

5. The practice of conducting an in-country pre-training needs assessment of the trainees of all DSTP supported management training courses by the trainers should be continued.

V. ENGLISH AS A SECOND LANGUAGE

A. Findings and Conclusions:

1. There is a critical need to increase ESL programming if projected PT targets are to be met.

2. There is a need for closer coordination between ESL activities and other DSTP activities related to the planning and scheduling of PT.

B. Recommendations:

1. The HRT initiative to start an ESL center should proceed as quickly as possible.

2. The contractor needs to work more closely with all AID projects involved in DSTP.

VI. DSTP ROLE RE NATIONAL HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT POLICY

A. Findings and Conclusions:

1. There is no such planning or policy formulation, but the Establishment Division has expressed an interest in having DSTP provide technical assistance in initiating such an effort. This would greatly assist training institutions in developing plans that address training needs in a timely, coordinated fashion. The contractor has consistently reported that the lack of management development priorities which such a plan would cover has been the biggest factor in limiting its ability to promote coordination among the training institutions.

2. The availability of such polices and plans would greatly assist AID and GOP to plan more effective utilization of all DSTP resources.

3. There is finite universe of federal senior civil officers who are eligible for and interested in training abroad. That universe may be smaller than generally expected, and careful career planning and training selection is needed.

B. Recommendations:

1. DSTP should act immediately to support Establishment Division in initiating human resources development plans and policies. The scope of such activities should be focused so as to insure a timely, workable model, and should include provincial governments.

VII. SPECIAL TARGETS: PRIVATE SECTOR

A. Findings and Conclusions:

1.Project activities (detailed in the body of the report) have recently been initiated that relate to this target.

2. The Mission seems to lack a clear focus on private sector goals, which constrains this project from developing a more agressive plan for increasing activities in this key sector.

3. Management training priorities in the private sector have been recently identified through a PIM study.

B. Recommendations:

1. Project activities begun in this area ought to be increased substantially.

2. The Mission needs to give private sector goals a clearer focus so that this project can develop its activities in this sector more effectively.

3. Participant training opportunities in the private sector should be increased significantly, particularly for women. Consideration might also be give to using DSTP participant training resources to establish internship programs in the Lahore Graduate School of Business Administration and the IBAs.

VIII. SPECIAL TARGETS: PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENTS

A. Findings and Conclusions:

1. DSTP support for provincial governments is constrained by a lack of data about human resource needs.

2. Management training for provincial government officials is constrained by a lack of GOP resources to develop viable institutional training bases in Baluchistan and NWFP.

B. Recommendations:

1. Provincial level institution strengthening, management training and participant training should be a major priority area in the next phase of DSTP.

2. DSTP should assist provincial governments in initiating human resource development plans so that activities in 1 above can be assured of having a greater impact.

3. Intensive English language training programs need to be more accessible for provincial nominees from Baluchistan and NWFP, and consideration should be given to designing and/or selecting PT programs more suited to their needs and qualification than the training made available for most of the federal officials.

IX. SPECIAL TARGETS: WOMEN

A. Findings and Conclusions:

1. Training targets for women are constrained by cultural barriers. Nevertheless, HRT has initiated a private sector participant training activity that demonstrates a high potential for expansion, particularly for in-country training. Certain NGOs have also indicated interest in management training workshops for women, and the Women's Division has expressed a need for in-house training for its staff and field supervisors.

B. Recommendations:

1. There should be a substantial increase in assistance for training activities for women. Such assistance might be more effective if integrated with activities of other donor agencies, GOP's goals for women's development, and Pakistani NGO women's organization.

X. PROJECT PLANNING, ADMINISTRATION AND COORDINATION

A. Findings and Conclusions:

1. Generally, the project has been well managed to date. Planning within each of the component activities has been effective in

initiating a course of action that has been consistent with contract specifications. The administration of those activities has been effective in producing desired results. This has been accomplished by a process of developing six-month work plans which HRT reviews and approves before the contractor initiates action.

2. The level of coordination among project components has been relatively low. Given the need to initiate activities in each of the components, and their relative sequential independence at the start up phase of things, this has not produced any significant problems. However, the project is now entering a phase when more coordination is needed. For example, the placement activities of the PT pipeline is going to be effected by the ESL pipeline. The scheduling of ESL activities is dependent, in part, on the other AID projects served through DSTP knowing what their placement options are at the earliest possible date.

B. Recommendations:

1. The contractor needs to begin a process of planning and coordinating the activities of the project in a more integrative manner.

2. Within AID there could be closer coordination of project components, as discussed in the management training section of the body of the report. The intent of such an effort would be to achieve a greater level of impact in solving Pakistan's management problems with the same level of effort.

3. As the volume of participant training increases, coordination among GOP, AID and AED may need to improve. It is recommended that consideration be given to creating a PT coordination mechanism at the level of section officers to identify and solve problems that do not involve policy questions.

PART IV

A P P E N D I C E S

- Appendix 1: Bibliography
- Appendix 2: Lists of Persons Interviewed
- Appendix 3: Survey Instruments
- Appendix 4: Survey Data Tables
- Appendix 5: ESL Charts 1 and 2

APPENDIX 1

B I B L I O G R A P H Y

A. Articles, Books and Papers

B. Government Documents and Publications

C. Project Documents and Papers

ARTICLES, BOOKS AND PAPERS

Bhaya, Hiten. Methods and Techniques of Training Public Enterprise Managers.
Cambpell, William. British Council "The Teaching of English in Pakistan - What needs to be Done?"

Grissmana, Carla "Some Impressions of the Teaching of English in Pakistan".

Hafiz, Abdul and Qayuum, Abdul, "Evaluation of an English Training course in Pakistan", 1985.

Harris, David P. Interpretive Manual for the Tests of English as a Second Language. ALIGU - 1980

Khan, I.H., Ali Shahiruddin and Mozina Stane. Management Training and Development in Public Enterprises. International Center for Public Enterprises in Developing Countries. 1982.

Khan, Irshad H. and Alvi, Shahiruddin. Management Training in Pakistan: PIM Survey. Pakistan Institute of Management 1982.

Lynton, Rolf and Pareek, Udai. Training for Development Kumarian Press, 1978.

Mickelwait, Donald. Sweet, Charles. and Morss, Elliott. New Directions in Development: A Study of U.S.A.I.D. Westview Press: Boulder Colorado 1979.

Miller, T. Project Synopsis - for National Institute of Language Training

"English Teaching Seminar H.M. Patel Institute and University of Boroda" Memorandum from Miller, T. to Maginley, J. USIS India.

Mushtaq and Tahir, The English Language Center - University of Baluchistan

Overholt, et al eds. Gender Roles in Development Projects Kumarian Press, 1984
Pakistan American Cultural Center - Silver Jubille Report - 1984.

Reeves, Richard. Passage to Peshawar

Saeed, A.G. "What We Don't Teach You At Business Schools: Confessions of a Business Teacher". Unpublished paper. Oct. 1985

Stanley, Lloyd Guide to Evaluation of Training. International Center for Public Enterprises in Developing Countries. 1984.

Stanley, Lloyd. Guide to Training Needs Assessment. International Center for Public Enterprises in Developing Countries, 1984.

GOVERNMENT DOCUMENTS AND PUBLICATIONS

"AID's Participant Training Program Can Be Made More Effective". Audit Report No. 85 - Dec. 7, 1984. Office of the Inspector General, USAID.

"Evaluation of the USAID/Lisbon Participant Training Program and a Suggestion for a Standardized AID Participant Training Methodology". USAID/Lisbon. September 1982.

Country Development Strategy Statement. FY 1986: Pakistan, USAID, January 1984.

Federal Government Civil Servants Census Report: January 1983. Public Administration Research Center (Statistical Cell) O&M Division, Cabinet Secretariat, Government of Pakistan.

Gable, Richard W. LaPorte, Robert, and Achakazi, Abdul H. Khan "Report of the Management Constraints Team". USAID Mission, Pakistan, March 15, 1982.

Handbook 10, USAID, Washington D.C.

"Participant Training Program can be made more effective". AID Audit Report # 75-08

"Participant Training: Policy Determination". PD-8, USAID, July 13, 1983.

Project Authorization Paper and Annexes ("Project Paper")

Project Implementation Report, USAID

Project Paper: Pakistan Management of Agricultural Resources and Technology (391-0489). USAID, August 1984.

Report of the Pakistan Commission on the status of women.

Report: Study group on the Teaching of Language 1982 (Presidents' Commission) Rules of Business. Government of Pakistan Cabinet Division, Cabinet Secretariat. April 1981.

Siddiqui, Tariq Dr., Summary of the Standing Organization Committee: Review of the Procedures for Nomination of Civil Servants for Foreign Training, O&MDivision, Cabinet Secretariat, Government of Pakistan. Oct. 13, 1983.

USAID Mission Evaluation Paper - 1983.

PROJECT DOCUMENTS AND PAPERS

ADL. A Marketing Survey for PIM Training Services, 1985.

ADL. Renewal and Growth of PIM, 1986-91: Strategy and Guidelines. 1985

Academy for Educational Development the following documents:

a. Development Support Training Proposal.
b. First, Second and Third Six Month Reports of the DSTP.
c. All extant Reports on the Courses conducted under this Project.
d. All extant Consultant Report submitted by consultants to AED at the conclusion of their activity.
e. DSTP Contract and Contract Amendments.

Emel, L. Project Memorada - Trip Reports.

Hopkins, David. ESL Specialist Final Report - English as a Second Language.

Revised IEAP Curriculum - Fall 1985.

Selected memoranda and correspondence provided by Jon Gant, Chief HRT, USAID.

Technical & Management Proposal/ AED & AED contact

APPENDIX 2

Persons Interviewed Regarding English Language Training

Abdul Hafeez	Director of Training PARC
ANGELO, Mervyn	Director PACC, Quetta
BAUMGARTEN, Robert	Director, Asia Foundation, University of Baluchistan, Quetta
BARHGTE, Bonnie	Manager, Participant Training EIL/AED Washington, D.C.
CAMPBELL, William	Regional Director British Council, Lahore
CLARK, Ray	Professor, EIL Brattleboro, ST.
DINES, Frank	Country Represntative Asia Foundation Islamabad
DIXON, John	Director, USIS, Peshawar
EMEL, Laurie	ESL Specialist, AED, Islamabad
FARRAH, Iffat	Senior Researc Officer and Subject Specialist National Academy of Heigher Education University Grant Commission, Islamabad
FLEMING, Maurice	Liaison AID/TIPAN, Peshawar
FRITZ, Jim	COP/AED, Islamabad
Gant, Jon	HRT-AID, Islamabad
GANT, Susan	Instructor, IEAP - NARC, Islamabad
LOHOFF, Bruce	U.S. Education Foundation, Islamabad
MILLER, Tom	ESL Specialist, USIS, Islamabad
NIAZI, G. A. K.	Deputy Educational Advisor, Ministry of Education, Islamabad

PETERS, HUMPHREY	Director, PACC, Peshawar
PIECKNEY, Joan	Instructor, IEAP - NIPA, Islamabad
RANA, Dr.	PARC, Islamabad
REDLINGER, Hendy	Project Coordinator, EIL Biattleboro, St
SHAH, Azeem	Director of Development and Special Programme PACC, Karachi
TRAISTER, Robert	AID Liaison Quetta
WALLS, Diana	Instructor/Coordinator, IEAP-NARC, Islamabad
WAANENON, Martin	Training Specialist, TIPAN, Peshawar
ZAHEER, Zanid	HRT, AID, Islamabad

Persons Interviewed
Regarding Participant Training

AHMED, Mushtaq	Director(?) Participant Training AED, Islamabad
AHMED, Nuzhat	Admin Services Coort, AED Washington D.C
ALFRIDI, Mohammad Ali	(Returned P.T.) Section Officer, Ministry of Production, Islamabad
ANSARI, Akhtar Hussain	(Returned P.T.) Deputy Chief Engineer, Karachi Elec. Supply Corp., Karachi
BARHGTE, Bonnie	Manager, Participant Training, EIL/AED
BOKHARI, K. H.	Joint Secretary for Itern. Cooperation Ministry of Education, Islamabad
BOGYTON, Peter FRITZ, Jim	AED, Washington D.C.
GUERRETTE, Lymne	Senior Program Specialist, AED Washington D.C
JOHNSON, Robert	Program Specilaist, Short Team Participant AED, Washington D.C
KETCHAM, Mark	Program Assistant AED, Washington D.C
MAJEED, Shahid	(Returned P.T.) Instructor, NIPA, Lahore
RASHED, Rukhsana	(Returned P.T.) Reasearch Officer, NIPA - Lahore
REDLINGER, Wendy	Project Coordinator, EIL - Brattleboro ST.
SHAIKH, Sikandar Ali	Section Officer, Wildlife and Forest Department, Karachi (returned P.T.
TRAISTER, Robert	Liaision - AID, Quetta
TRELEVEN, Laurie	Program Specilaist, AED - Washington D.C

Telephone Interviewes with 3 Participants in U.P.

AHMED, Sohail

ANSARI, Arif

HAQ, Zahid

Women:

AHMED, Nuzhat	Administrative Services Coordinator AED Washington, D.C.
ALI, Mazood	Acting Director, Women Division, Islamabad
ARMOR, Monica	CEDA, Islamabad
RASHEED, Rukhsana	Reasearch Officer, NIPA, Lahore
SUFI, Asma	Program Specialist, AID-HRT, Islamabad

APPENDIX 3:

USAID/Development Support Training Project
Participant Training Program (PTP)
Questionnaire for Participants who have completed training)

PERSONAL CHARACTERISTICS

1. Name:.....

2. Age:.....3. Sex:.....

4. Who is your current employer in Pakistan?.....

5. a. If you are employed by the government, is your service a centrally recruited civil service? Yes..... No.....
   b. Which service is it?.....
   c. Which cadre or group (e.g. DMG) do you belong to ?.....
   d. Which is your grade? (e.g. 16,17).....

6. What is the title of your present position (in Pakistan)?.....

7. What was your title at the time of your selection for the USAID Participant Training Program (PTP)? (if same, write "same").....

8. What was your highest level of education before you participated in this training program? (e.g. MS, BA).....

9. In what field was the academic degree you reported above?.....

10. What other formal training experiences did you have before the USAID PTP? In Pakistan:.....
    Abroad:.....

TRAINING SELECTION

11. How much time did you have between the time you learned that you had been selected for the PTP and your departure date?.....

12. In your opinion, did you have enough time to arrange all aspects of your personal and professional life? Yes..... No.....

13. If that was not enough time, what do you think was the reason there was not more time?.....

14. Do you have any comments or suggestions for improving any aspect of the selection process?.....
    .....

TRAINING PURPOSE

15. In your opinion, who determined the purpose of your training? (place a check mark by the appropriate answer)
.....Establishment Division
.....Economic Affairs Division
.....USAID
.....the Director of the organization where you work
.....a project committee made up of the above
.....your supervisor where you work
Your advisor in your training program
.....Academy of Educational Development/Islamabad
.....Academy of Educational Development/Washington
.....I don't know

16. Was the purpose of your training adequately explained to you before you left Pakistan? (Circle the description closest to your opinion)

Very inadequate	somewhat inadequate	neutral	fairly adequate	very adequate

17. How much did you participate in determining the purpose of your training? (Circle the phrase closest to your opinion)

No part.	little part.	moderate part.	substantial participation	extensive part.

18. What was the nature of your training program? (Check appropriate choice)
a. Long term, non-degree program
b. Long term, degree program (what degree?.....)
c Short term, formal training (name of training agency) and training program/course.....)
d. short term, visitation program
e. other (describe briefly.....

19. Do you have any comments or suggestions regarding the process of determining the purpose of a specific training activity?.....
.....
.....

PRE-DEPARTURE ORIENTATION

20. Did you receive an orientation to your USAID/PT program prior to leaving Pakistan? Yes..... No.....

21. If you did not attend an orientation, why not?.....
If you did not receive an orientation, skip Question # 22.

22. Overall, how would you rate the orientation you received before leaving? (Circle the number best describing your opinion: rate only the orientation you actually received)

	Very Poor	Poor	Average	Above Average	Excellent
AED/Islamabad	1	2	3	4	5
AID/Islamabad	1	2	3	4	5
AID/Karachi	1	2	3	4	5
Other (Identify)	1	2	3	4	5

23. Indicate (with a check mark) what information was provided during your pre-departure orientation, whether the information was oral, written or both:
(check only those which you received)

	Received	Oral	Written	Both
a. your travel itinerary.....	.....	....	.....	.....
b. training Expectations.....	.....	....	.....	.....
c. contact person at destination.....	.....	....	.....	.....
d. financial entitlement.....	.....	....	.....	.....
e. likely costs.....	.....	....	.....	.....
f. medical/insurance coverage.....	.....	....	.....	.....
g. culture aspects of US.....	.....	....	.....	.....
h. specific info re food.....	.....	....	.....	.....
i. specific info re housing.....	.....	....	.....	.....
j. specific info re climate.....	.....	....	.....	.....
k. other (specify.....	.....	....	.....	.....

24. Indicate by circling the number closest to your opinion how useful the information you received actually was:

	Not Useful		Somewhat Useful		Very Useful
a. your travel intinerary	1	2	3	4	5
b. training expectations	1	2	3	4	5
c. contact person at destination	1	2	3	4	5
d. financial entitlement	1	2	3	4	5
e. Likely costs	1	2	3	4	5
f. medical/insurance coverage	1	2	3	4	5
h. specific info re food	1	2	3	4	5
i. Specific info re housing	1	2	3	4	5
j. Specific info re climate	1	2	3	4	5

25. Comment or suggestions regarding the pre-departure orientation:.....
.....

ENGLISH LANGUAGE TRAINING

26. Did you receive English language training in conjunction with the USAID PT Program? Yes...No... If not, why not?.....
If you answered "No" above, go to # 29.

27. If yes, identify which institute or organization provided the training:
    a. English language training organization;.....
    b. Dates when you started and completed: start.....end.....

28. Indicate how effective this training was in each of the following areas by circling the number closest to your opinion. If no instruction was attempted in an area, indicate this with a check in the NA column.

	NA	Not Eff.		Somewhat Eff.		Very Eff.
a. conversational skill.....	.....	1	2	3	4	5
b. teaching vocabulary.....	.....	1	2	3	4	5
c. reading skill.....	.....	1	2	3	4	5
d. writing skills.....	.....	1	2	3	4	5
e. comprehension of spoken English.....	.....	1	2	3	4	5

29. Comments and suggestions regarding the English language training:.....
    .....
    .....

SUPPORT SERVICES

30. Did you receive an orientation from AED (Academy for Education Development) when you arrived in the USA? Yes.... No.... If not, why not?.....
    If not, skip the next question

31. Rate the Support Services you received form AED/PPTP (in Washington) upon arrival in the USA:

	Not Eff.		Somewhat Eff.		Very Eff.
a. orientation to training activities.....	1	2	3	4	5
b. program related travel arrangements.....	1	2	3	4	5
c. receipt of allowances/payments.....	1	2	3	4	5
d. other (Specify).....	1	2	3	4	5
e. general assistance.....	1	2	3	4	5

32. Comments or suggestions concerning the AED support Services:
    .....

33. Rate the services you received from the training institution:
    (if you do not receive a service, check the NA column)

	NA	Not Eff.		Somewhat Eff		Very Eff
a. assistance in focusing training.....		1	2	3	4	5
b. access to trainers/faculty.....		1	2	3	4	5
c. access to admin. staff (eg. advisor).....		1	2	3	4	5
d. assistance in finding housing, food.....		1	2	3	4	5

34. How would you rate the effectiveness of your government or employer while you were in training:

a. in maintaining contact with you.....	1	2	3	4	5
b. in keeping you informed about affairs relating your training to your job.	1	2	3	4	5

TRAINING IMPACT

35. How would you rate the effectiveness of your training in each of the following areas: (each NA if appropriate)

	NA	Not Eff.		Somewhat Eff.	Very Eff.
a. improve your knowledge of professional... matters in your field	1	2	3	4	5
b. improve job related skills.....	1	2	3	4	5
c. establish professional contacts.....	1	2	3	4	5
d. better understanding of USA organizations similar to yours.....	1	2	3	4	5
e. better understanding of USA culture.....	1	2	3	4	5

36. Overall, how would you rate the appropriateness of your training, with respect to (circle the description that fits)

a. training level.....

(Much too low)	(Somewhat low)	(on Target)	(Somewhat high)	(Much too long)

b. training length...

(Much too short)	(Little short)	(On Target)	(Little long)	(Much too long)

37. To what extent have you been able to use aspects of your training in your job: (circle description that fits best)

(not at all) (limited amount) (moderately) (substantially)

38. Please give specific examples of uses you have to made of your training:
.....
.....

39. What are the main factors that have prevented you from using more of your training?.....
.....
.....

40. Which professional associations do you belong to?.....
.....

41. Since your return from training have you joined any professional associations? Yes..... which one(s).....No.....

42. Would you be willing to volunteer some time occasionally to discuss your training experiences with new Participant Trainees before they leave for training? Yes..... No.....

43. Would you be willing to volunteer some time occasionally to help organize a Participant Training Alumni Associations?
Yes..... No.....

44. If such an Association were formed, what kind of activities would you like to see it
offer?.....
.....

45. Do you have any comments or suggestions on any aspects your training that have not been mentioned?.....
.....
.....

46. If the goal of Participant Training is to improve the quality of management practices in Pakistan, which of the following training models do you think would be THE most effective? (Check only ONE):

..... a. in-house training courses with management personnel of a specific organization,
..... b. in-country training with trainees from various organizations in the same training courses,
..... c. participant training of the kind you participated in,
..... d. on-the-job training in conjunction with comprehensive organizational change efforts

Why did you select the one you did?.....
.....
.....

47. In summary, what would you identify as the TWO greatest BENEFITS of your training program?
a. .....
b. .....

48. What would you identify as the TWO biggest Problems with the training program?
a. .....
b. .....

THANK YOU FOR YOUR COOPERATION IN COMPLETING AND PROMPTLY RETURNING THIS QUESTIONNAIRE: YOUR RESPONSE WILL HELP IMPROVE PARTICIPANT TRAINING.

Dr. Richard Fehnel
DSTP Evaluation Team
Human Resources Training Division
USAID
PO Box 1028
Islamabad, PAKISTAN

APPENDIX 4
SURVEY DATA TABLES

Table 1: Personnel Characteristics

Age of Participant Surveyed

Age Groups	Training Completed			Participant Still in USA Training			TOTAL
	Long Term	Short (Formal)	Short (Study Tours)	Other	Long term	Short term	
25-29	-	1	1	-	4	-	6
30-34	-	8	-	1	8	1	18
35-39	-	17	2	3	15	-	37
40-44	1	8	-	-	4	-	13
45-49	1	10	2	1	3	-	17
50-54	-	12	3	-	-	2	17
55 and over	-	2	-	-	-	3	5
TOTAL	2	58	8	5	34	6	113

No Response : 3

Table 2: Personnel Characteristics

Age of Participant: Summary Data

Age Groups	Long Term	Short Term	Total	%
25-29	4	2	6	(6)
30-34	8	10	18	(15)
35-39	15	22	37	(26)
40-44	5	8	13	(10)
45-49	4	13	17	(14.5)
50-54	-	17	17	(14.5)
55 and over	-	5	5	(5)
TOTAL	36	77	113	(100)

No Response : 3

Table 3: Personnel Characteristics

Gender of Participants Surveyed

	Training Completed			Other	Participant Still in USA Training		TOTAL
	Long Term	Short (Formal)	Short (Study Tours)		Long term	Short term	
M	2	56	7	2	33	6	106
F	-	6	1	2	1	-	10
Total	2	62	8	4	34	6	116

Table 4: Personnel Characteristics

Gender of Participants: Summary

	Long Term	Short Term	Total	%
M	35	71	106	91
F	1	9	10	9
Total	36	80	116	100

Table 5: Personnel Characteristics

Service Categories of Participants Surveyed

	Training Completed				Participant Still in Training in USA			
Service Categories	Long Term	Short Formal	Short Study Tour	Other	Long Term	Short Term	Total	
Federal Civil Service	-	20	2	-	19	5	46	40
Public Corporation	-	22	-	-	2	-	24	21
Provincial Service		15	3	2	11	-	32	27
Private Sector	-	6	2	2	2	1	13	12
Total	1	63	4	4	34	6	115	100

Table 6: Personnel Characteristics

Service Categories : Summary

Service	Long Term	Short Term	Total	%
Federal	19	27	46	(40)
Public Corp	2	22	24	(21)
Provincial	12	20	32	(27)
Private Sector	2	11	13	(12)
TOTAL	35	80	115	(100)

	Training Completed				Participant Still in Training in USA		
Service Categories	Long Term	Short Formal	Short Study Tour	Other	Long Term	Short Term	Total
below 16	-	1	-	-	-	-	1
16	-	-	-	-	1	-	1
17	-	8	1	1	7	-	17
18	-	18	1	-	15	-	34
19	-	15	3	1	7	3	29
20	-	9	2	-	2	-	13
21	-	2	-	-	-	-	2
TOTAL	-	53	7	2	32	3	97

Table 8: Personnel Characteristics

Service Grades : Summary

(Government Employees Only)

Service	Long Term	Short Term	Total	
Below 16	-	1	1	(1)
16	1	-	1	(1)
17	7	10	17	(18)
18	15	19	34	(38)
19	7	22	29	(28)
20	2	11	13	(11)
21	-	2	2	(2)
TOTAL	32	62	97	(100)

Table 9: Personnel Characteristics

Educational Level of Participants Surveyed

	Training Completed				Participant Still in Training in USA		
Educational Level	Long Term	Short Formal	Short Study Tour	Other	Long Term	Short Term	Total
Secondary	-	2	-	-	-	-	2
Bach	1	22	-	1	8	4	36
Master	1	35	3	3	26	2	70
Doctor	-	4	1	-	-	-	5
TOTAL	2	63	4	4	34	6	113

Table 10: Personnel Characteristics

Educational Level of Participants Surveyed : Summary

Educational Level	Long Term	Short Term	Total	(%)
Secondary	-	2	2	(2)
Bach	9	27	36	(33)
Master	27	43	70	(62)
Doctor	-	5	5	(3)
TOTAL	36	77	113	(100)

Table 11: Training Selection

Length of Time Between Notification and Departure

	Training Completed				Participant Still in Training in USA		
Days	Long Term	Short Formal	Short Study Tour	Other	Long Term	Short Term	Total
1-7	1	13	1	1	9	2	27
8-14	1	5	-	-	5	1	12
15-30	1	8	5	1	7	3	25
31-90	-	20	-	1	9	-	30
91-180	-	3	-	1	2	-	6
181-360	-	1	-	-	1	-	2
Over 360	1	-	-	-	1	-	2
TOTAL	4	50	6	4	34	6	104

Table 12: Training Selection

Length of Time Between Notification and Departure : Summary

Days	Long Term	Short Term	Total	(%)
1-7	10 (37)%	17 (63)%	27	(26)
8-14	6 (50)	6 (50)	12	(12)
15-30	8 (33)	17 (67)	25	(23)
31-90	9 (30)	21 (70)	30	(29)
91-180	2 (33)	4 (67)	6	(6)
181-360	1 (50)	1 (50)	2	(2)
Over 360	2 (100)	0 (0)	2	(2)
TOTAL	38	66	104	(100)

Table 13: Training Purpose

Extent to Which Purpose of Training was Explained Before Departure

	Training Completed				Participant Still in Training in USA		
	Long Term	Short Formal	Short Study Tour	Other	Long Term	Short Term	Total
Very Inadequate	1	10	2	1	7	3	24
Somewhat	1	11	-	2	6	1	21
Neutral	-	7	2	-	5	-	14
Fairly Adequate	-	26	2	1	8	-	37
Very	-	8-	2	-	7	2	19
TOTAL	2	62	8	4	33	6	115

Table 14: Training Purpose

Extent to which Purpose of Training Explained : Summary

	Long Term	Short Term	Total	(%)
Very Inadequate	8	16	24	(22)
Somewhat	7	14	21	(19)
Neutral	5	9	14	(12)
Fairly Adequate	8	29	37	(29)
Very	7	12	19	(18)
TOTAL	35	80	115	(100)

Table 15: Training Purpose

Level of Trainee's Participation in Determining Purpose of Training

	Training Completed				Participant Still in Training in USA		
	Long Term	Short Formal	Short Study Tour	Other	Long Term	Short Term	Total
No Part	1	14	3	-	11	1	30
Little Part	-	2	2	1	4	1	10
Mod. Part	1	15	-	1	4	2	23
Subs. Part	-	21	1	1	8	1	32
Extens. Part	-	10	2	1	6	1	20
TOTAL	2	62	8	4	33	6	115

Table 16: Training Purpose

Level of Trainee's Participation : Summary

	Long Term	Short Term	Total	(%)
No Part	12	18	30	(27)
Little Part	4	6	12	(9)
Mod. Part	5	18	23	(19)
Subs. Part	8	24	32	(27)
Extens Part	6	14	20	(18)
Total	35	80	115	(100)

Table 17: Pre-Departure Orientation

Participants Rating of the Orientation in Pakistan at AED

	Training Completed				Participants Still in USA Training		Total
Rating	Long term	Short term	Short study	Other	Long-term	Short-term	
Very poor	-	-	-	-	6	2	8
Poor	-	3	-	1	1	-	5
Average	-	5	1	-	7	-	13
Above average	-	6	-	-	3	-	9
Excellent	-	2	-	-	3	1	6
Total	0	16	1	1	20	3	41

Table 18: Pre-departure Orientation

Summary: Rating of AED Orientation in Pakistan

Pating	Long Term	Short Term	Total	
Very Poor	6	2	8	20
Poor	1	4	5	12
Average	7	6	13	32
Above average	3	6	9	22
Excellent	3	3	6	14
Total	20	21	41	

Table 19: Pre-Departure Orientation

Participants Rating of the Orientation in Pakistan at AID
(Islamabad and Karachi)

	Training Completed				Participants Still in USA Training		Total	%
Rating	Long term	Short term	Short study	Other	Long-term	Short-term		
Very Poor	-	-	-	-	8	1	9	33
Poor	-	-	-	-	4	-	4	15
Average	-	1	1	-	3	1	6	22
Above average	1	3	-	-	1	-	5	19
Excellent	-	2	-	-	1	-	3	11
Total	1	6	1	0	17	2	27	100

Table 20: Pre-departure Orientation

Summary: Rating of AID Orientation in Pakistan

Rating	Long Term	Short Term	Total	
Very Poor	8	1	9	33
Poor	4	-	4	15
Average	3	3	6	22
Above average	2	3	5	19
Excellent	1	2	3	11
Total	18	9	27	100

Table 21: Pre-departure Orientation

Orientation Information on Itinerary

	Training Complete		Still in Training		
	Long Term	Short Term	Long Term	Short Term	Total
Didn't Receive	-	-	-	2	2
Written Only	-	16	8	-	24
Oral Only	-	14	10	1	25
Both Oral & Written	2	26	14	2	44
TOTAL	2	56	32	5	95

Table 22: Pre-departure Orientation

Usefulness of Information on Itinerary

		Training Complete		Still in Training			
		LT	ST	LT	ST	Total	(%)
Not useful	1.	-	8	1	3	12	(12)
	2.	-	-	2	-	2	(2)
Somewhat useful	3.	-	15	10	1	26	(29)
	4.	-	18	7	-	25	(24)
Very useful	5.	2	23	11	1	37	(34)
TOTAL		2	64	31	5	102	(100)

Table 23: Pre-departure Orientation

Orientation Information on TR Expectation

	Training Complete		Still in Training		
	Long Term	Short Term	Long Term	Short Term	Total
Didn't Receive	-	-	23	4	27 (44)
Written Only	1	8	2	1	12 (19)
Oral Only	-	5	2	-	7 (11)
Both Oral & Written	-	11	5	-	16 (26)
TOTAL	1	24	32	5	62 (100)

Table 24: Pre-departure Orientation

Usefulness of Info. re Training Expectation

		Training Complete		Still in Training		
		LT	ST	LT	ST	Total (%)
Not useful	1.	-	26	21	5	52 (56)
	2.	-	4	2	-	6 (6)
Somewhat useful	3.	-	14	1	-	15 (15)
	4.	1	10	4	-	15 (13)
Very useful	5.	-	10	3	-	13 (10)
TOTAL		1	64	31	5	101 (100)

Table 25: Pre-departure Orientation

Orientation Information re Contact Person

	Training Complete		Still in Training			
	Long Term	Short Term	Long Term	Short Term	Total	
Didn't Receive	-	-	5	-	5	(6)
Written Only	-	23	12	3	38	(44)
Oral Only	1	6	3	-	10	(12)
Both Oral & Written	1	18	12	2	33	(38)
TOTAL	2	47	32	5	86	(100)

Table 26: Pre-departure Orientation

Usefulness of Info. re Contact Person

		Training Complete		Still in Training		Total	(%)
		LT	ST	LT	ST		
Not useful	1.	-	17	6	-	23	(22)
	2.	-	3	-	-	3	(3)
Somewhat useful	3.	1	12	3	1	17	(16)
	4.	1	13	8	1	23	(22)
Very useful	5.	-	21	14	3	38	(37)
TOTAL		2	66	31	5	104	(100)

Table 27: Pre-departure Orientation

Orientation ..formation Financial Entitlement

	Training Complete		Still in Training			
	Long Term	Short Term	Long Term	Short Term	Total	%
Didn't Receive	-	-	14	-	14	(17)
Written Only	-	23	4	2	29	(35)
Oral Only	8	-	4	1	13	(16)
Both Oral & Written	1	14	10	2	27	(33)
TOTAL	9	37	32	5	83	(100)

Table 28: Pre-departure Orientation

Usefulness of Info. re Financial Entitlement

		Training Complete		Still in Training			
		LT	ST	LT	ST	Total	(%)
Not useful	1.	-	21	16	2	39	(41)
	2.	-	5	2	-	7	(7)
Somewhat useful	3.	-	14	6	1	21	(22)
	4.	-	13	2	1	16	(14)
Very useful	5.	1	13	5	1	20	(15)
TOTAL		1	66	31	5	95	(100)

Table 29: Pre-departure Orientation

Orientation Information re Likely Costs

	Training Complete		Still in Training			
	Long Term	Short Term	Long Term	Short Term	Total	
Didn't Receive	-	-	21	4	25	(38)
Written Only	1	11	3	-	15	(23)
Oral Only	-	8	1	1	10	(15)
Both Oral & Written	-	9	7	-	16	(24)
TOTAL	1	28	32	5	66	(100)

Table 30: Pre-departure Orientation

Usefulness of Info. re Likely Costs

		Training Complete		Still in Training			
		LT	ST	LT	ST	Total	(%)
Not useful	1.	-	31	21	5	57	(56
	2.	-	1	2	-	3	(3)
Somewhat useful	3.	-	9	2	-	11	(11)
	4.	1	13	2	-	16	(16)
Very useful	5.	-	11	4	-	15	(15)
TOTAL		1	65	31	5	102	(100)

Table 31: Pre-departure Orientation

Orientation Information re Insurance

	Training Complete		Still in Training			
	Long Term	Short Term	Long Term	Short Term	Total	%
Didn't Receive	-	-	18	2	20	(30
Written Only	-	15	6	1	23	(34
Oral Only	-	2	3	1	6	(9
Both Oral & Written	-	13	4	1	18	(27
TOTAL	1	30	31	5	67	(100)

Table 32: Pre-departure Orientation

Usefulness of Info. re Insurance

		Training Complete		Still in Training			
		LT	ST	LT	ST	Total	(%)
Not useful	1.	-	20	19	3	42	(44)
	2.	-	2	2	-	4	(4)
Somewhat useful	3.	-	12	1	-	13	(14)
	4.	1	11	1	-	13	(14)
Very useful	5.	-	19	4	1	24	(25)
TOTAL		1	64	27	4	96	(100)

Table 33: Pre-departure Orientation

Orientation Information re Cultural Aspects

	Training Complete		Still in Training			
	Long Term	Short Term	Long Term	Short Term	Total	%
Didn't Receive	-	-	12	1	13	(17)
Written Only	1	27	14	3	45	(59)
Oral Only	-	3	1	1	5	(7)
Both Oral & Written	-	9	4	-	13	(17)
TOTAL	1	39	31	5	76	(100)

Table 34: Pre-departure Orientation

Usefulness of Info. re Cultural Aspects

		Training Complete		Still in Training			
		LT	ST	LT	ST	Total	(%)
Not useful	1.	-	23	14	4	41	(41)
	2.	-	1	2	-	3	(3)
Somewhat useful	3.	-	16	6	-	22	(22)
	4.	1	9	6	-	16	(16)
Very useful	5.	-	15	1	3	19	(19)
TOTAL		1	64	29	7	101	(100)

Table 35: Pre-departure Orientation

Orientation Information re Food Info

	Training Complete		Still in Training			
	Long Term	Short Term	Long Term	Short Term	Total	
Didn't Peceive	-	-	24	3	27	(45)
Written Only	1	11	5	2	19	(32)
Oral Only	-	6	-	-	6	(10)
Both Oral & Written	-	5	3	-	8	(13)
TOTAL	1	22	32	5	60	(100)

Table 36: Pre-departure Orientation

Usefulness of Info. re Food Info

		Training Complete		Still in Training			
		LT	ST	LT	ST	Total	(%)
Not useful	1.	-	31	25	4	60	(60)
	2.	-	4	1	-	5	(5)
Somewhat useful	3.	-	13	1	-	14	(14)
	4.	1	6	2	-	9	(9)
Very useful	5.	-	9	2	1	12	(12)
TOTAL		1	63	31	5	100	(100)

Table 37: Pre-departure Orientation

Orientation Information re Housing info

	Training Complete		Still in Training			
	Long Term	Short Term	Long Term	Short Term	Total	%
Didn't Receive	-	-	26	4	30	(43)
Written Only	1	19	5	1	26	(38)
Oral Only	-	5	-	-	5	(7)
Both Oral & Written	-	6	2	-	8	(12)
TOTAL	1	30	33	5	69	(100)

Table 38: Pre-departure Orientation

Usefulness of Info. re Houseing

		Training Complete		Still in Training			
		L	S	L	S	Total	(%)
Not useful	1.	-	29	26	5	60	(62)
	2.	-	3	-	-	3	(3)
Somewhat useful	3.	-	9	-	-	9	(9)
	4.	1	5	3	-	9	(9)
Very useful	5.	-	14	2	-	16	(16)
TOTAL		1	60	31	5	97	(100)

Table 39: Pre-departure Orientation

Orientation Information re Climate

	Training Complete		Still in Training			
	Long Term	Short Term	Long Term	Short Term	Total	
Didn't Receive	-	-	19	2	21	(30)
Written Only	1	21	8	3	33	(46)
Oral Only	-	6	3	-	9	(13)
Both Oral & Written	-	6	2	-	8	(11)
TOTAL	1	33	32	5	71	(100)

Table 40: Pre-departure Orientation

Usefulness of Info. re Climate

		Training Complete LT	Training Complete ST	Still in Training LT	Still in Training ST	Total	(%)
Not useful	1.	-	26	18	4	48	(49)
	2.	-	-	1	-	1	(1)
Somewhat useful	3.	-	13	4	-	17	(17)
	4.	1	10	4	-	15	(15)
Very useful	5.	-	12	4	1	17	(17)
TOTAL		1	61	31	5	98	(100)

Table 41: Support Services

Usefulness of AED/W Support Services : Orientation

		Training Completed		Still in Training			
		Long Term	Short Term	Long Term	Short Term	Total	(%)
Not Useful	1.	-	3	4	1	8	(10)
	2.	-	1-	-	-	1	(1)
Somewhat Useful	3.	-	13	4	2	19	(25)
	4.	1	13	6	-	20	(26)
Very Useful	5.	-	17	10	2	29	(38)
Total		1	47	24	5	77	(100)

Table 42: Support Services

Usefulness of AED/W Support
Services : Travel Arrangements

		Training Completed		Still in Training			
		Long Term	Short Term	Long Term	Short Term	Total	(%)
Not Useful	1.	-	6	-	1	7	(9)
	2.	-	-	-	-	-	
Somewhat Useful	3.	-	4	4	1	9	(12)
	4.	-	13	3	-	16	(21)
Very Useful	5.	1	25	14	3	43	(57)
Total		1	48	21	5	75	(100)

Table 43: Support Services

Usefulness of AED/W Support Services : Allowances

		Training Completed		Still in Training			
		Long Term	Short Term	Long Term	Short Term	Total	(%)
Not Useful	1.	-	5	1	-	6	(8)
	2.	-	2	2	-	4	(5)
Somewhat Useful	3.	-	4	3	-	7	(9)
	4.	-	11	5	1	17	(21)
Very Useful	5.	1	27	14	4	46	(58)
Total		1	49	25	5	80	(100)

Table 44: Support Services

Usefulness of AED/W Support Services : General

		Training Completed		Still in Training			
		Long Term	Short Term	Long Term	Short Term	Total	(%)
Not Useful	1.	-	5	2	-	7	(10)
	2.	-	1	-	-	1	(1)
Somewhat Useful	3.	-	5	3	2	10	(14)
	4.	1	6	4	1	12	(16)
Very Useful	5.	-	26	15	2	43	(59)
Total		1	43	24	5	73	(100)

Table 45: Support Services

Usefulness of Training Institution Support Services : Asst. in Focusing Training

	Training Completed		Still in Training			
	Long Term	Short Term	Long Term	Short Term	Total	(%)
Not available	-	2	5	-	7	(7)
Not Useful 1.	-	2	1	1	4	(4)
2.	-	-	-	-	-	
Somewhat Useful 3.	-	11	6	2	19	(18)
4.	-	24	10	-	34	(30)
Very Useful 5.	1	29	12	3	45	(41)
Total	1	68	34	6	109	(100)

Table 46: Support Services

Usefulness of Training Institution Support Services : Access to Trainers/Faculty

		Training Completed		Still in Training			
		Long Term	Short Term	Long Term	Short Term	Total	(%)
Not available		-	2	3	-	5	(5)
Not Useful	1.	-	-	-	-	-	
	2.	-	1	1	-	12	(2)
Somewhat Useful	3.	-	7	5	-	34	(11)
	4.	1	25	8	-	58	(30)
Very Useful	5.	1	34	17	6	53	(52)
Total		2	69	34	6	111	(100)

Table 47: Support Services

Usefulness of Training Institution Support Services : Access to Admin Staff

		Training Completed		Still in Training			
		Long Term	Short Term	Long Term	Short Term	Total	(%)
Not available		-	1	-	-	1	(1)
Not Useful	1.	-	-	-	-	-	
	2.	-	-	1	-	1	(2)
Somewhat Useful	3.	-	10	8	-	18	(16)
	4.	1	24	4	1	30	(28)
Very Useful	5.	1	32	21	5	59	(52)
Total		2	67	34	6	109	(99)

Table 48: Support Services

Usefulness of Training Institution Support Services : Assistance in Finding Housing & Food

	Training Completed		Still in Training			
	Long Term	Short Term	Long Term	Short Term	Total	(%)
Not available	-	3	2	1	5	(5)
Not Useful 1.	-	2	8	2	12	(12)
2.	-	2	3	-	5	(4)
Somewhat Useful 3.	-	6	7	1	14	(13)
4.	1	20	6	1	28	(25)
Very Useful 5.	1	33	8	2	44	(41)
Total	2	66	34	6	108	(100)

Table 49 : Support Services

Effectiveness of Government Employees Support
In Keeping Contact W/Trainees

		Training Completed				Still in Training				Total
		LT	ST (F)	ST (V)	Other	LT	ST (F)	ST (V)	Other	
Not Available		-	-	-	-	4	-	5	-	9
Maintain Contact	1.	1	23	-	3	16	-	-	-	43
	2.	1	3	-	1	6	-	-	-	11
	3.	-	7	-	-	4	-	1	-	12
	4.	-	7	1	-	2	-	-	-	10
	5.		11	2	-	2	-		-	15
Total		2	51	3	4	34	-	6	-	100

Table 50 : Support Services

Effectiveness of Government/Employers Support
In Keeping Trainee Informed Re Job Related Matters

		Training Completed				Still in Training				Total
		LT	ST (F)	ST (V)	Other	LT	ST (F)	ST (V)	Other	
Not Available		-	-	-	-	4	-	5	-	9
	1.	1	21	1	3	17	-	-	-	43
	2.	1	3	-	-	6	-	-	-	10
	3.	-	7	-	1	2	-	1	-	12
	4.	-	11	-	-	2	-	-	-	13
	5.		9	1	-	2	-		-	12
Total		2	51	3	4	33	-	6	-	99

Table 51 : Training Impact

Effectiveness of Training for Improving Knowledge of Professional Matters Knowledge

		Training Completed				Still in Training				Total
		LT	ST (F)	ST (V)	Other	LT	ST (F)	ST (V)	Other	
Not Applicable		-	1	-	-	-	-	-		1
Not Effect. ive	1	-	-	1	-	1	-	-	-	2
	2.	-	1	-	-	1	-	-	-	2
	3.	-	13	2	1	3	-	2?	-	21
	4.	-	34	3	3	11	-	-	-	51
	5.	1	14	1	-	18		4?	-	38
Total		1	63	7	4	34	-	6	-	115

Table 52 : Training Impact

Effectiveness of Training for Improving Knowledge of Professional Matters Skills

		Training Completed				Still in Training				Total
		LT	ST (F)	ST (V)	Other	LT	ST (F)	ST (V)	Other	
Not Applicable		-	1	-	-	-	-	-		1
Not Effect. ive	1	-	-	1	-	2	-	12	-	4
	2.	-	2	-	-	1	-	-	-	4
Somewhat Effective	3.	-	13	2	1	5	-	1	-	22
	4.	1	27	4	2	9	-	-	-	43
	5.	-	16	1	1	17	-	4	-	39
Total		1	59	9	4	34	-	6	-	112

Table 53 : Training Impact

Effectiveness of Training for Improving Knowledge of Professional Matters
Contacts

		Training Completed				Still in Training				Total
		LT	ST (F)	ST (V)	Other	LT	ST (F)	ST (V)	Other	
Not Applicable		-	1	-	-	2	-	-		3
Not Effect.	1	-	6	-	1	5	-	1	-	13
	2.	-	6	-	-	3	-	1	-	10
Somewhat Effective	3.	1	9	4	1	13	-	-	-	28
	4.	-	21	3	2	5	-	-	-	31
	5.	-	19	-	-	6	-	4	-	29
Total		1	62	9	4	34	-	6	-	114

Table 54 : Training Impact

Effectiveness of Training for Improving Knowledge of Professional Matters
Organizations

		Training Completed				Still in Training				Total
		LT	ST (F)	ST (V)	Other	LT (F)	ST (V)	ST	Other	
Not Applicable		-	4	1	-	2	-	-		7
Not Effect.	1	-	-	-	1	4	-	1	-	6
	2.	-	8	-	1	3	-	-	-	12
Somewhat Effective	3.	-	9	-	-	8	-	-	-	17
	4.	1	21	2	1	10	-	-	-	35
	5.	-	21	2	1	7	-	5	-	36
Total		1	63	5	4	34	-	6	-	113

Table 55 : Training Impact

Effectiveness of Training for Improving Knowledge of Professional Matters Culture

		Training Completed					Still in Training			Total
		LT	ST (F)	ST (V)	Other	LT	ST (F)	ST (V)	Other	
Not Applicable		-	2	-	-	1	-	-	-	3
Not Effect.	1	-	2	-	1	3	-	-	-	6
	2.	-	5	-	-	3	-	-	-	8
Somewhat Effective	3.	-	14	-	-	4	-	1	-	19
	4.	1	22	5	1	12	-	-	-	41
	5.	-	15	1	2	11	-	4	-	33
Total		1	60	6	4	34	-	5	-	110

Table 56 : Training Impact

Appropriateness of Training : Level

		Training Completed				Still in Training				Total
		LT	ST (F)	ST (V)	Other	LT	ST (F)	ST (V)	Other	
Much Too Low	1	-	2	-	-	2	-	-	-	4
Somewhat Low	2.	-	10	1	1	2	-	1	-	15
On Target	3.	1	39	6	2	24	-	4	-	96
Somewhat Higher	4.	1	9	1	1	-	-	-	-	12
Too High	5.	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Total		2	60	8	4	28	-	5	-	107

Table 57 : Training Impact

Appropriateness of Training : Length

		Training Completed				Still in Training				Total
		LT	ST (F)	ST (V)	Other	LT	ST (F)	ST (V)	Other	
Much Too Short	1	-	6	1	1	-	-	-	-	8
Little Short	2.	2	24	2	2	4	-	4	-	37
On Target	3.	-	26	5	2	24	-	2	-	59
Little Long	4.	-	4	-	-	3	-	-	-	7
Too Long	5.	-	-	-	-	1	-	-	-	1
Total		2	60	8	4	32	-	6	-	112

Table 58 : Training Impact

Extent to Which Able to Use Aspects of Thing on the Job Training

	Training Completed				Still in Training				Total
	LT	ST (F)	ST (V)	Other	LT	ST (F)	ST (V)	Other	
Not At all	-	1	-	-	1	-	-	-	2
Limited	-	6	1	1	2	-	1	-	11
Moderate	2	34	5	3	8	-	2	-	54
Substantial	- 16	2	-	-	-	-	-	-	18
Total	18	43	6	4	11	-	3	-	85

APPENDIX 5
ESL CHARTS

ESL Chart # 1

IEAP PROGRAMS

TOTAL STUDENTS: 141

Achieved 10+ point raise in TOEFL score = 10 — 50 of Total

77% of Usable (pre-and post Scores available) 90

Scored over 530 in post-TOEFL- 50 — 35% of Total

45% of Usable (post-scores available) 110

Achieved 2.5 + point join per week (of total in class)

Quetta I	15 points	5/13	38%
Quetta II	20 "	12/26	38%
Peshawar I	20 "	10/13	76%
TIPAN I			
Peshawar II	20 "	6/8	75%
TIPAN II			
NARC I	29 "	23/22	72%
NARC II	20 "	1/12	8%
NARC III	15 "	4/11	51%
Total		59/115	51%

Clark formula (5+ point increase per week) (of total in class)

Quetta I	30 points	4/13	31%
Quetta II	40 "	6/26	23%
Peshawar I	40 "	7/13	54%
TIPAN I			
Peshawar II	40 "	5/8	56%
TIPAN II			
NARC I	55 "	14/32	44%
NARC II	40 "	1/12	8%
NARC III	30 "	2/11	18%
Total:		39/115	34%

Achieved 530 or over by course (of total in class)

Quetta I	1/3	7%
Quetta II	3/26	12%
Peshawar I	8/13	61%
TIPAN I	8/18	44%
Peshawar II	6/8	75%
TIPAN II		
NARC I	17/32	53%
NARC II	5/12	42%
NARC III	2/11	18%
Total:	49/133	36%

Chart 2:		Schedule	Hours	Design	Teachers	Training	Facility	Results
QUETTA I	13	5/19/84- 6/26/84.	120 4 hrs/d. 5 dys/w. 6 wks.	List., Read Writ. Skills equal time	1 Exp.	1 week mater. and less. plans	bad. PACC P & d not carry thru on reloc.	unclear: TOEFL not avail. used TOELIC/ALIGU
QUETTA II	26	3/17/85- 5/09/85	200 5 hrs/d 5 dys/w. 8 wks.	List., Read structure	2 Exp.	4 days, Islam. Narc prog., obs. & exper.	Labour Hall in Satellite Town. satis. except at end.	50%+ were better; troub. w. context and gen.lev./ed.
PESHAWAR I	13	10/28/84- 12/24/84	200 4 hrs/d. 5 dys/w. 8 wks.	List., Read Structure equal	1 exp.	cons. time on materials	Lounge at hostel of PARD	all impr. 6 to 87 pts.
TIPAN I U.of III.	18	1/15/85- 5/9/85	225 hrs. 3 hrs/d. 5 dys/w. 15 wks.	List Read. Structure equal	1 exp. same as Pesh. I		NWFP Ag.Univ/ Peshawar	test. inad. 12 passed TOEFL. Used TOELIC+TOELF
PESHAWAR II	8	3/17/85- 5/9/85	160 hrs. 4 hrs/d. 5 dys/w. 8 wks.	List., Rd., Struc. equal	1 exp.	sev. days on content of course.	recording studio at office of st. PARD failed to get a site	sig. impr.for more than half. 9-116
TIPAN II	8	5/12/85- 6/06/85	96 hrs. 4 hrs/d. 6 dys/w. 4 wks.	List., Rd., Structure, Test Prep.	2 exp.		Ag. Univ./ Peshawar	no pre- or post testing This was to prepare for TEEFL
NARC I 99	32 +2hrs/10	2/06/85- 4/18/85	350 hrs. 6 hrs/d. 5 dys/w 11 wks. Sats.	Struc., Rd., List.	6; 1 exp	none; extra help in class prep.	NARC Training Center	50+ pts. aver.
NARC II	12	4/15/85- 6/06/85	240 hrs. 6 hrs/d. 5 dys/w. 8 wks.	Structure; Rd. List.	2 exp?	4 day; 2 hrs per day	same as above	no pre- or post test. TOEFL 5 wks. later. Incon
NARC IIB	11	4/15/85- 5/23/85	180 hrs. 6 hrs/d. 5 dys/w	Write., Rd. Discussion	3 exp.		same as above.	5 sign. increases