

PD-AAS-073
4100

UNCLASSIFIED
CLASSIFICATION

PROJECT EVALUATION SUMMARY (PES) - PART I

Report Control
Symbol U-447

1. PROJECT TITLE INTEGRATED NON-FORMAL EDUCATION			2. PROJECT NUMBER 520-0281	3. MISSION/AID/W OFFICE USAID/Guatemala
			4. EVALUATION NUMBER (Enter the number maintained by the reporting unit e.g., Country or AID/W Administrative Code, Fiscal Year, Serial No. beginning with No. 1 each FY) <u>85-03</u>	
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> REGULAR EVALUATION <input type="checkbox"/> SPECIAL EVALUATION	
5. KEY PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION DATES			6. ESTIMATED PROJECT FUNDING	
A. First PRO-AG or Equivalent FY <u>82</u>	B. Final Obligation Expected FY <u>N/A</u>	C. Final Input Delivery FY <u>87</u>	A. Total \$ <u>8,576,000</u>	
			B. U.S. \$ <u>3,860,000</u>	
			7. PERIOD COVERED BY EVALUATION	
			From (month/yr.) <u>09/82</u>	
			To (month/yr.) <u>07/85</u>	
			Date of Evaluation Review <u>Sept. 27, 1985</u>	

B. ACTION DECISIONS APPROVED BY MISSION OR AID/W OFFICE DIRECTOR

A. List decisions and/or unresolved issues; cite those items needing further study. (NOTE: Mission decisions which anticipate AID/W or regional office action should specify type of document, e.g., algram, SPAR, PIO, which will present detailed request.)

B. NAME OF OFFICER RESPONSIBLE FOR ACTION

C. DATE ACTION TO BE COMPLETED

- | | | |
|--|--|------------|
| 1. Reprogram project to emphasize management improvement and focus educational materials production on newspaper, training modules and radio. Incorporate recommended evaluation steps to improve project management, except for the decentralized management. | G. Méndez, OHR
P. Wrobel, PDSO
G. Leal, PDSO | Nov. 1985 |
| 2. Revise project paper logical framework to conform to reprogramming document. | G. Méndez, OHR
G. Leal, PDSO | Nov. 1985 |
| 3. Assess capability of current technical assistance staff to deliver technical assistance and make adjustments where necessary. | G. Méndez, OHR | Nov. 1985 |
| 4. In preparing project agreement amendment, add a condition precedent which assures the establishment of personnel positions for the Salama radio station. | P. Wrobel, PDSO
G. Leal, PDSO | Dec. 1985 |
| 5. Project committee disagrees with recommendation for expansion of coverage of both radio and educational materials. Lack of experienced personnel and limitation by GOG on establishment of new positions prohibits carrying out this recommendation. | P. Kolar, DDIR
F. Fairchild,
OHR | Sept. 1985 |
| 6. OHR personnel to review whether a special evaluation should be carried out in weak areas in CY 1986. | G. Méndez, OHR
F. Fairchild | Oct. 1986 |
| 7. Coordinate content of print, media and training. | G. Méndez, OHR | Dec. 1986 |

9. INVENTORY OF DOCUMENTS TO BE REVISED PER ABOVE DECISIONS

<input type="checkbox"/> Project Paper	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Implementation Plan e.g., CPI Network	<input type="checkbox"/> Other (Specify) _____
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Financial Plan	<input type="checkbox"/> PIO/T	_____
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Logical Framework	<input type="checkbox"/> PIO/C	<input type="checkbox"/> Other (Specify) _____
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Project Agreement	<input type="checkbox"/> PIO/P	_____

10. ALTERNATIVE DECISIONS ON FUTURE OF PROJECT

A. Continue Project Without Change

B. Change Project Design and/or Change Implementation Plan

C. Discontinue Project

11. PROJECT OFFICER AND HOST COUNTRY OR OTHER RANKING PARTICIPANTS AS APPROPRIATE (Names and Titles)

Frank Fairchild, OHR *FF* Gustavo Leal, PDSO *Leal*
 Gilberto Méndez, OHR *GM* Lawrence Odle, PDSO *LO*
 Paul Wrobel, PDSO *PW*
 Clara Carr, PRM *CC*

12. Mission/AID/W Office Director Approval

Signature *Charles E. Costello*

Typed Name Charles E. Costello

Date October 7, 1985

13. Summary:

The non-formal education project has been a cooperative effort of AID and the Secretariat of Coordination of the National Board of Non-Formal Education. It is funded by a combination of grant, loan, and counterpart funds totalling over \$8 million, over a five year period. It is intended to expand the coverage, improve the quality and develop the infrastructure of Guatemala's system of non-formal education.

The Secretariat, after a late start and very slow progress, has not demonstrated the capacity to spend the loan funds allocated to it, and to produce the results envisioned by AID at the outset. The project represented a substantial addition to a small, relatively new, Guatemalan institution. It added substantially to its operating budget, expanded its activities into new geographic and technical areas, necessitated a number of additional administrative procedures, and put heavy additional demands on a weak administrative structure. The three main areas of administrative weakness have been programming (budget), purchasing and personnel which can be attributed, at least in grand part, to the lack of adequate administrative systems and the lack of familiarity with procedures required for GOG and AID loan disbursement activities.

The evaluation conclusions suggest that in spite of difficulties, progress is being made in a number of areas, and much enthusiasm is evident on many levels of the Secretariat. Still it is clear that some significant changes are to be made, if the project is to have a chance of achieving some of the results expected in the time allocated. The evaluation report recommends that the Mission explore ways to support the continuation and improvement of at least a major part of the non-formal education project.

14. Evaluation Methodology:

Terms of reference for the mid-term evaluation were developed by a committee representing all project-related agencies. This committee decided that one of the evaluation consultants responsible for assessing administrative systems/ procedures should be a Guatemalan thoroughly familiar with local bureaucratic processes.

The evaluation was conducted over three weeks (May/June 1985) by two independent consultants who reviewed project documents, attended project implementation meetings and interviewed personnel from the executing unit, the AID Mission and all government offices involved in project implementation. The Guatemalan consultant, Miguel A. Barrios, and the U.S. consultant, Alan Hurwitz, an individual with a Ph. D. in non-formal education, jointly prepared the evaluation report. The Guatemalan

consultant concentrated on personnel, purchasing, logistic support and financial programming/fiscal management matters. The U.S. consultant concentrated on radio, graphic materials design/production and training endeavors.

15. External Factors:

A serious economic crisis in the country over the past six months has amplified the effects significantly of other problems encountered in carrying out the project. An effect of this crisis has been to create serious price instability which has contributed greatly to difficulties in purchasing supplies, equipment, and services in Guatemala. Economic pressure on the Guatemalan government has caused the availability of counterpart financing to be limited and lack of financing has also had a more general effect on the morale and activities of public institutions relying on this funding source.

16. Inputs:

The program began late and got off to a slow start. The original understanding was signed without agreement to the budget by the Guatemalan government. Modifications took six months. To go into effect the loan agreement required the Guatemalan government to meet certain conditions, primarily involving the filling of positions funded by Guatemalan counterpart funds. This took approximately fifteen months. With additional delays involving the fiscal year schedule, it was approximately two years from the original signing before the project got under way. Its activities were further delayed by a number of organizational weaknesses which have plagued the project to the present. Now, in spite of some continuing problems, it is showing some significant progress in several important areas, though many limiting factors still exist.

Weaknesses in the three main administrative areas of programming (budget), purchasing and personnel can be attributed, at least in grand part, to the lack of adequate administrative systems, and (particularly with purchasing) the lack of familiarity with procedures required for disbursement activities. In addition the instability of the Quetzal has caused serious problems in purchasing. Rapid inflation and delays in processing appropriate forms has made it very difficult to complete purchases at a given price. The result has been the organization's inability to respond to the needs of its various technical departments in a timely way.

17. Outputs:

The following table presents expected LOP outputs through June 30, 1985 and magnitude realized by that date.

TABLE ONE
PROJECT OUTPUT STATUS

<u>LOP Outputs</u>	<u>Schedule for 6/30/85</u>	<u>Realized</u>
- NFE bulletins published/distributed (40,000 copies per monthly issue)	20,000 monthly	10,000 per quarter
- Literacy primers published/ distributed (40,000 copies per monthly issue)	20,000 monthly	20,000 per quarter
- 48 issues of monthly rural newspaper published/distributed	17	9
- 500 NFE learning groups formed	245	245
- 900 community projects generated	110	50
- 5 NFE modules (self-contained instructional packages) designed/produced	5	3
- 2,240 interinstitutional agents and community promoters trained	640	300
- 3 mobile radio units operating	-	-
- Radio transmitter/studio operating	-	-
- 227 monthly hours of radio programs on-the-air	66	64

Some of the problems with reproduction and distribution have to do with more basic administrative functions, such as purchasing, planning, budgeting, and the delegation of responsibility (i.e., for editing and review). A task force of all those with the possibility of improving the situation with a clear commission to resolve the problems is recommended.

Both regional offices demonstrated a great deal of success at developing important relationships with community leaders and technical people from other institutions as part of their training activities. Geography and the lack of effective administrative systems can make these offices seem very far away from the planning and decision-making of the Secretariat. Strengthening these links, and the regional offices themselves, ought to be a principal objective in the interest of long-term goals.

There has been important progress in a number of aspects of the development of increased capacity in radio. Unfortunately, these developments have not been coordinated and integrated into the organization as a whole or reflected by increased expenditures. There has been some very creative and extensive program development in Quetzaltenango; much of which involves some very constructive work with commercial stations at good prices. The central office is producing taped shows in a number of areas for broadcast. The evaluators found a need for further training and planning both in Salama and Guatemala to prepare for the opening of the new station.

18. Purpose:

The purpose of the project is to expand and improve the Guatemalan non-formal education program. More specifically, the project assists the National Board for Non-Formal Education to coordinate non-formal education activities directed to the rural poor and increase the geographic coverage of NFE services.

The evaluators found that the work of the Secretariat has been hampered by some ambiguity in its sense of its own mission. The leadership and coordination role demands creating a sense of direction for all non-formal education activities and involves providing support to the non-formal education activities of other institutions, many of whom make up the National Board. The evaluators doubt that the Secretariat, at present, has the administrative infrastructure to provide that kind of leadership and coordination. There is a need for more coordination among many of its own activities in the central and regional offices. That kind of national role would require a sophisticated planning capacity which the Secretariat is only beginning to develop.

Progress toward the conditions expected at the end of the project has been as follows:

-- The NFE program has expanded to four of the six new departments although penetration in two of the four departments is minimal.

-- There is a continuous demand for NFE program services. For example, one of the new regional offices is supporting the work of 20 GOG institutions working in the area. Interinstitutional training activities are now underway in the other regional office. There is demand for printed materials and radio messages by at least four major GOG rural development institutions.

-- Complete NFE evaluation feedback systems have not been established but a general base-line survey was completed recently.

-- NFE instructional materials are being distributed in eleven out of 16 target departments.

-- Currently, approximately 10,000 individuals are being served directly by the NFE program. The target for direct service delivery was 30,000 people. The indirect target audience was estimated at 175,000 individuals. It will be necessary in the reprogramming efforts to revise these target audience estimations.

-- At present, there are no audience checks/controls to determine the size of the program audience. At this stage it is not possible either to ascertain whether extension agents are using NFE techniques and media in the 16 target departments. Completion and operation of the evaluation/feedback system is required.

-- One new regional office has been established, the other regional office should not be established due to lack of personnel, other counterpart inputs and poor prospects for an improvement of this situation during the life of the project.

The project purpose and end of project conditions expected are still valid; however, the degree of impact will be lower than expected. Instead of three regional offices, the project will establish only two. This reduction in the level of operations will cause reductions in the number of departments to be covered by the project and the number of direct and indirect beneficiaries. Moreover, fewer community projects and fewer community learning groups will be organized. Likewise fewer

interinstitutional technicians and community promoters will be trained. Finally, given a reduction in LOP status, a reduction in the level of loan funding will be in order.

19. Goal:

The goal of the project is "to improve the quality of life for the rural poor through improved services delivery by government and private extension agencies." The measures of goal achievement are: (1) adoption of NFE program initiatives by the rural poor; (2) increased effective demand for rural development GOG services by the rural poor. Impact evaluations, surveys, case studies, etc., necessary to assess the foregoing changes have not been carried out. Nevertheless, the assumptions as well as the measures of goal achievement appear to be appropriate.

The evaluators found some problems regarding the receipt and use of materials by clients. Some of these can be attributed to the lack of timely reproduction and distribution of materials being produced by the Secretariat. Also, while the materials have generally been considered of good quality, there has been a range of opinion regarding their relevance for rural audiences, concerning both content and style. The evaluators recommend further study in this area. The evaluators also identified the lack of an educational context for the use of materials as detracting from their potential value.

The evaluators found that the radio programs seem to be of potential interest and value to the target populations. They recommend a study, at least small-scale, of reactions to these efforts and interest in other radio programming formats.

20. Beneficiaries:

The National NFE program has two kinds of beneficiaries: (1) the rural poor (mostly Indian subsistence farm families) and (2) field technicians and community promoters from public and private institutions.

As mentioned previously, baseline data has recently been compiled. Impact on the project beneficiaries will be measured at the completion of the project.

21. Unplanned Effects:

Not pertinent at this time.

22. Lessons Learned:

The project represented a substantial addition to a small, relatively new Guatemalan institution. It added substantially to its operating budget, expended its activities into new geographic and technical areas, necessitated a number of additional administrative procedures (particularly involving the use of new funding sources), and put heavy additional demands on a weak administrative structure. Some of these weaknesses were either underestimated or overlooked at the outset by both the Secretariat and AID, and the project began without sufficient attention to developing the administrative foundation for its timely success. Although the project provided funds for most of the project's direct and technical/operational needs, these initial structural and administrative weaknesses have caused difficulties to the present day. As a result good work in several content areas has been undermined, and the progress of the project, particularly with regard to expenditures, has been greatly delayed.

23. Special Comments or Remarks:

There appears to be no one at the Secretariat, at present, who can provide consistent, accurate advice on the policies of the various administrative agencies (Ministry of Finance, Ministry of Education, etc.) with regard to expenditures on the project. This has resulted in the rejection of requests, and perhaps worse, hesitation on requests that would be approved, and a general feeling of helplessness vis-a-vis these institutions. The evaluators recommended that someone should be available on call to provide the timely financial advice which would have an immediate effect on the activities and morale of the entire operation.

To function at the level demanded, the Secretariat needs a unit responsible for managing the programming and budgeting of the entire organization. To have a budget structure which (a) responds to the needs of the organization, and (b) is clearly understood by managers at all levels, it needs to be the result of a process in which all levels of the organization participate in its formation. Such a process can also be a vehicle for some immediate, much-needed, technical assistance, particularly at middle levels of the organization.

The project should provide the opportunity for consulting assistance in all technical areas, at the central and regional areas. Once the long-term objectives are clear for each area (as a result of the planning process), each department head should be in a position to know what help is needed. In the Secretariat as a whole there is a need for more awareness and knowledge about:

1. the conceptual background of non-formal education;
2. non-formal education activities in other countries;
3. non-formal education materials and methodologies, and,
4. what is known about non-formal education administration.

1. Reprogram project to emphasize management improvement and focus educational materials production on newspaper, training modules and radio. Incorporate recommended evaluation steps to improve project management, except for the decentralized management.
2. Revise project paper logical framework to conform to re-programming document.
3. Assess capability of current technical assistance staff to deliver technical assistance and make adjustments where necessary.
4. In preparing project agreement amendment, add a condition precedent which assures the establishment of personnel positions for the Salama radio station.
5. Project committee disagree with recommendation for expansion of coverage of both radio and educational materials. Lack of experienced personnel and limitation by GOG on establishment of new positions prohibits carrying out this recommendation.
6. OHR personnel to review whether a special evaluation should be carried out in weak areas in CY 1986.
7. Coordinate content of print, media and training.