

CLASSIFICATION

PROJECT EVALUATION SUMMARY (PES) - PART I

Report Symbol U-447

1. PROJECT TITLE Caribbean Regional Development Training Project: CARICOM Component			2. PROJECT NUMBER 538-0014	3. MISSION/AID/W OFFICE RDO/Caribbean
			4. EVALUATION NUMBER (Enter the number maintained by the reporting unit e.g., Country or AID/W Administrative Code, Fiscal Year, Serial No. beginning with No. 1 each FY) <u>538-84-06</u> TERMINAL <input type="checkbox"/> REGULAR EVALUATION <input type="checkbox"/> SPECIAL EVALUATION	
5. KEY PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION DATES		6. ESTIMATED PROJECT FUNDING		7. PERIOD COVERED BY EVALUATION
A. First PRO-AG or Equivalent FY <u>79</u>	B. Final Obligation Expected FY <u>84</u>	C. Final Input Delivery FY <u>84</u>	A. Total \$ <u>2,834,000</u> B. U.S. \$ <u>2,450,000</u>	From (month/yr.) <u>July 1979</u> To (month/yr.) <u>May 1984</u> Date of Evaluation Review <u>May 24, 1984</u>

8. ACTION DECISIONS APPROVED BY MISSION OR AID/W OFFICE DIRECTOR

A. List decisions and/or unresolved issues; cite those items needing further study. (NOTE: Mission decisions which anticipate AID/W or regional office action should specify type of document, e.g., sirgram, SPAR, PIO, which will present detailed request.)	B. NAME OF OFFICER RESPONSIBLE FOR ACTION	C. DATE ACTION TO BE COMPLETED
<p>1. This project successfully ended on May 31, 1984. At the time of the PES there were no unresolved issues or items needing further study.</p> <p>2. One participant, whose period of training went beyond the PACD, is being funded by the Regional Development Training Project II (RDT II) in keeping with an earlier decision.</p>	IIE and RDO/C	

9. INVENTORY OF DOCUMENTS TO BE REVISED PER ABOVE DECISIONS

<input type="checkbox"/> Project Paper	<input type="checkbox"/> Implementation Plan e.g., CPI Network	<input type="checkbox"/> Other (Specify) _____
<input type="checkbox"/> Financial Plan	<input type="checkbox"/> PIO/T	_____
<input type="checkbox"/> Logical Framework	<input type="checkbox"/> PIO/C	<input type="checkbox"/> Other (Specify) _____
<input type="checkbox"/> Project Agreement	<input type="checkbox"/> PIO/P	_____

Not applicable

10. ALTERNATIVE DECISIONS ON FUTURE OF PROJECT

A. Continue Project Without Change

B. Change Project Design and/or Change Implementation Plan

C. Discontinue Project

Not applicable

11. PROJECT OFFICER AND HOST COUNTRY OR OTHER RANKING PARTICIPANTS AS APPROPRIATE (Names and Titles)

A. J. Ortega: HRDO, RDO/C SAGriffith: SEPM, RDO/C
P. Pitt-Leacock: A/TO, RDO/C R. Rainford: Sec. Gen, CARICOM

Clearances:
HRDO: AJOrtega [Signature] SEPM: SAGriffith [Signature] CPO: EWarfield [Signature]
EVAL/SPS: DClarke [Signature] CONT: RWarin [Signature]

A/PRM: BJensen [Signature] Ag: D/DIR: CCoulter [Signature]

12. Mission/AID/W Office Director Approval

Signature: [Signature]
Typed Name: William B. Wheeler, RDO/C
Date: 10/31/85 Director

14. EVALUATION METHODOLOGY

The external terminal evaluation of the CARICOM component of the Caribbean Regional Development Training Project was conducted by a team comprised of Dr. William Boyer, Charles P. Messick, Professor of Public Administration, University of Delaware and Mr. Robert Morris, Lecturer in Economics, Barbados Institute of Management and Productivity. Dr. Boyer was contracted by RDO/C under a Personal Services Contract. Mr. Morris was contracted by CARICOM. The principal objective of the evaluation was to review the life-of-project activities aimed at upgrading the managerial and technical skills of civil servants and small business persons in the CARICOM states with particular emphasis on the LDCs and Barbados.

Between May 1 and May 24, 1984 the evaluators under contract conducted the evaluation and outlined their findings in an evaluation report. The evaluation of the project was conducted at a cost of approximately US\$18,000.

The evaluation methodology consisted of the following:

1. Briefing of the consultants by the Human Resources Development Officer of RDO/C.
2. Examinations of the Project files, documents, correspondence, and reports at RDO/C.
3. Continuing contact throughout the evaluation with either the Training Officer or Assistant Training Officer of RDO/C.
4. Visit to the CARICOM Secretariat in Georgetown, Guyana for collection and study of relevant documents, and discussions with the Secretary-General, the Directors of Functional Cooperation, the Chief of Education and Culture, the Training Officer and the Accountant.
5. Visits to St. Vincent, St. Lucia, Antigua and Montserrat to interview government training officers, government officers and project participants.
6. Continuing contact with the Training Officer of the CARICOM Secretariat.
7. Visits to the headquarters of SYSTEMS and CAIC in Barbados to discuss the involvement of their staff in the project evaluation and management training on behalf of the project.

The first draft of the evaluation report was reviewed at a meeting between the evaluators and staff of RDO/C. The Training Officer of CARICOM was also present at this meeting. Following the meeting the final evaluation report was prepared.

15. EXTERNAL FACTORS

Training enjoyed the commitment of top political leadership and assumed prominence in national plans already developed or being developed within the particular countries.

13. Summary

The Caribbean Regional Development Training Project (538-0014) has two components - one implemented by the Caribbean Community Secretariat (CARICOM) and the other implemented by the Organization of Eastern Caribbean States (OECS). The goal of the project is to improve the productivity of public and private sector enterprises in the Eastern Caribbean. The project is intended (a) to upgrade the managerial and technical skills of civil servants and small businessmen in the CARICOM states with particular emphasis on the LDC's and Barbados and (b) to develop institutional capabilities to design and provide management, administration, supervisory and clerical skills training and to identify, develop, coordinate and implement participant training activities in specialized technical and managerial areas.

The CARICOM component of this project was funded by an AID Grant of \$2.45 million. This component aimed to provide Individual Training Grants (ITGs) and Special Focus Seminars in response to the need for specialized technical and managerial training in CARICOM member countries in general and in the LDC's in particular.

Three types of special focus seminars were funded under the CARICOM component of the project viz. Regional Public Sector, Regional Private Sector and Island-Specific seminars. The project anticipated 12 Regional Public Sector Seminars to be conducted for 240 participants. Actually, 13 of these seminars were conducted for 293 participants. The project anticipated eight Regional Private Sector seminars for a total of 160 participants. Actually, there were 11 seminars attended by 204 persons. The project anticipated 48 Island Specific seminars for a total of 960 persons. Actually, there were 52 seminars for a total of 931 persons. It is quite clear, therefore, that the Project satisfactorily achieved the numerical outcomes anticipated for the Special-Focus seminars and in many instances exceeded them.

The achievement in the area of ITGs was equally satisfactory. It was anticipated that 240 participants would be sent for training over the life of the project. Actually 254 completed training.

The external evaluators identified "two major problems with regard to the implementation of the Project which remained contentious throughout the Project period". They were in the area of (a) CARICOM's management of the individual training grants discretionary funds and (b) the project evaluation conducted during the life of the project. The evaluators implied that CARICOM used the discretionary awards principally to develop that institution's human resource capability to the neglect of the needs of other institutions in the Caribbean. With respect to project evaluation, the external evaluators felt that formative evaluations undertaken by SYSTEMS under contract did not address certain critical issues such as whether the training courses as executed by CARICOM met the objectives as conceived, whether the materials used and the topics selected were appropriate to the level of the participants on the program and whether the learning experienced was transferrable to the job situation and in fact was being transferred.

The socio-economic conditions of the territories included in the project were relatively stable with the exception of Guyana. There were no major changes in the project setting. Host government priorities remained in training of the public and private sectors to enhance development.

16. INPUTS

All of the seminars were hosted in the Caribbean and the Resource personnel were also drawn from the Caribbean. Two of the Island Specific seminars relied on outside resources. One seminar was conducted by a Puerto Rican firm and another by a Mainland U.S. firm.

Six regional institutions provided training for the regional private sector program and thirteen for island specific programs.

Under contract CAIC undertook some training activities for the project and in the process helped to overcome the administrative and logistical problems which plagued and delayed the implementation of the private sector component of the program in the early years of the project.

CARICOM's management of the project improved during the project period and was successful, overall, in achieving or exceeding project targets, as amended, and in fulfilling the project objectives. CARICOM strengthened its relationship with member states, particularly those in the Eastern Caribbean, and was successful in (a) assisting member states to utilize project opportunities and resources, (b) working with many regional and national institutions in the placement of participants, and in conducting seminars as envisaged by the project and (c) strengthening relationships with (and within) the private sectors (particularly through CAIC), and with other regional non-government organizations and national private sector organizations. Part of its success is reflected in the fact that the Chambers of Commerce in the Region now accept that they have an important role to play in the training of personnel within their respective countries.

Two major problems were identified with regard to the implementation of the project. These problems were related to: (a) CARICOM's management of the ITGs discretionary fund and (b) The project evaluation during the life of the project. These are discussed elsewhere in this PES (see Summary).

This was a pilot project and a learning experience. There were some communication difficulties between RDO/C and the CARICOM Secretariat especially during the first two years of the project. The two institutions differed in their interpretation of what was intended by statements in the project paper (e.g. CARICOM interpreted training in "printing" as contributing to development, whereas RDO/C did not).

17. OUTPUTS

Regional Public Sector

As amended, the project called for 12 Regional Public Sector Seminars to be conducted for 240 participants; 13 Regional Public Sector Seminars were conducted for 293 participants. 172 were from senior management, 92 from Middle Management and 30 from Junior Management. Top and Middle Management personnel accounted for 89% of the total, with top management personnel accounting for 58%.

Areas of training varied. Seminar topics on Management and Development Administration, and on Women in Development proved to be most popular. 85 persons took part in the former category whilst 32 participated in the latter. The seminar on feeding systems for Animals held in Trinidad attracted the highest number of participants.

Regional Private Sector

The Project called for about two annual Regional Special Focus seminars to assist established businesses and participants were expected to pay their travel expenses and fees to cover 15 to 25 percent of costs. 12 Regional special focus seminars were originally targeted but an August 9, 1982 amendment reduced the total to 8. This reduced target was exceeded by 3. Eleven seminars were conducted by the end of the project. Nine were Regional and 2 were subregional.

Topics on Investment and Export Promotion as well as various aspects of Customs Administration and Classification Systems proved to be the most popular. Some 34 persons attended workshops on the first topic, whilst 52 persons participated in the latter category. The largest number of seminars was held for trainers and 33 persons attended. The average attendance of these seminars was 13.

Island Specific Seminars

The Project Paper called for about two Island Specific Seminars to be conducted annually in each LDC. 52 such seminars were conducted in eight different territories. By the end of the project each LDC experienced six seminars, though none was held during the first year. A total of 52 Island Specific seminars were conducted under the project.

Customer relations, Marketing and various aspects of management were topics most frequently chosen by the 10 countries that participated under the project.

Individual Training Grants

The Logical Framework's initial target of 300 participants selected and sent for training under the ITG program was reduced by amendment to 240. Of a total of 314 ITGs approved, 254 actually completed training, while 60 had withdrawn after selection but before training. One person was continuing training beyond the end of the Project. Forty-one participants were selected for long term training; 33 of these were trained in the Caribbean. Most of the short term training was conducted in United States institutions. Altogether, 132 persons were trained in the United States, compared with 122 persons in the Caribbean. Montserrat, the smallest nation in the region, sent the most persons for training i.e. 32. Dominica sent the next highest number i.e. 28.

The areas well represented in the ITG program were agriculture, health, finance and education. Antigua, St. Christopher-Nevis and St. Vincent each sent five persons for training in Agriculture, while 10 out of the 24 participants for training in natural resources came from Belize. Dominica concentrated its training efforts on finance; 10 of 28 ITG participants for such training came from Dominica. Montserrat sent 6 persons for training in Customs and another 5 across the areas of agriculture, trade, lands and housing.

A total of 1,458 participants were trained in 77 seminars and 255 ITGs completed training for a grand total of 1,713 individuals trained under the project without "braindrain" loss.

All quantifiable project targets, as amended, were achieved or exceeded.

Those countries whose training units have become self-reliant, as a result of this Project, are capable of administering the ITG program. The eventual transfer of these programs from CARICOM to the LDCs would then be another indicator of their increased self-reliance and enhanced national capability.

18. PURPOSE

The purpose of the CARICOM component of the Regional Development Training Project as gleaned from the Project was first to upgrade the managerial and technical skills of civil servants and small businessmen in the CARICOM states, with particular emphasis on the LDC's and Barbados and second, to develop a capacity in the CARICOM Secretariat to identify, develop, coordinate and implement participant training activities in specialized technical and managerial areas, with emphasis on meeting the training needs of the LDC's and Barbados.

Special Focus seminars as intended by the project paper were designed to support training groups rather than individuals. Special Focus seminars were problem focussed and technically oriented and geared to meet the needs of the experienced practitioner-participant. It was anticipated that about half of the funds utilized for Special Focus seminars will provide training to the private sector.

Two types of private sector Special Focus seminars were anticipated by the Project Paper.

- (a) Special training island-specific seminars in the LDCs aimed at small businesses, and focused on such subjects as bookkeeping, personnel relations, principles of business organization, procurement, quality control, pricing, inventory, investment and credit. About two such seminars were to be conducted annually in each LDC and participants were to pay a small fee to attend.
- (b) Seminars to assist established businesses and particularly those interested in expanding production and employment. These seminars were to be conducted on a regional or sub-regional basis, and were to emphasize topics relating to export development and labor intensive investment. About two annual regional seminars of this type were anticipated and participants were to pay their travel expenses and fees expected to cover 15 to 25 percent of costs.

In addition to private Special Focus seminars, about half of the funding of all Special Focus seminars were targeted at the public sector. These Public Sector Special Focus seminars were also to be regional or subregional. Seminars dealing with Management and Public Administration were to draw participants from top and middle levels of the public service. Special Focus seminars dealing with technical subjects were to focus primarily on agriculture, health, education, environmental and natural resource management, women in development and economic analysis and planning.

Individual Training Grants were to be available primarily to enable government officials to receive specialized short-term training principally within the region. Most ITGs were to be used for training public sector and regional officials, but private sector individuals were also to receive grants to support government and regional objectives such as export promotion, market development, capital formation and development of financial institutions and labor organizations.

The shortfall in this Project in achieving its purpose was as follows:

- (a) Even though the project was designed to emphasize the LDCs and Barbados, the latter country did not participate in the Project to the same level as did other MDCs -- Guyana and Jamaica. Barbados received approval of all ITGs requested, but still did not use them all.
- (b) The project paper's anticipation that private sector individual might also receive ITGs was not realized. None received ITGs.

Apart from this, the project clearly achieved its purpose. This view is supported by the many outputs which not only satisfied the anticipated project outcomes but in many cases exceeded them.

19. GOAL/SUBGOAL

The goal of the project was to improve the productivity of public sector institutions and the number and efficiency of private sector enterprises. In the public sector, increased efficiency would be reflected in an enhanced capability to plan and implement development programs and to administer basic social and economic services. In the private sector, achievement of the project goal would be reflected in increased employment, investment and output.

The Project contributed to the enhancement of the Public Sector through the Individual Training Grants (ITGs) through which individuals received training in existing training programs and Special Focus seminars, it is hoped that such training would lead to a more competent and efficient Public Sector.

Through the ITGs government officials received specialized short-term training. Emphasis was on short-term, in-service training programs with provision of modest levels of diploma and degree training at the University of West Indies or the University of Guyana for preparing officials to work in priority development areas. Where training was not available in Caribbean institutions and where there was clearly a demonstrated need, U.S. academic training was provided, in most cases on a long-term basis for one or two-year Masters level programs.

Most ITGs were used for training public sector and regional officials.

Special Focus seminars were intended to support training groups rather than individuals. These seminars were problem focussed and technically oriented. They were distinguished from ITG in that the courses were developed in response to the special needs of participants.

The project has been successful in achieving its overall goals of improving the productivity of the Public and Private sector enterprises of the Eastern Caribbean. While more time would be required before a proper assessment of the extent to which all project goals have been achieved, there is every indication that in the medium term these will be met as a direct consequence of the achievements of this project.

20. BENEFICIARIES

In Antigua, the Agricultural Sector had direct benefits as a result of training. Both in Pineapple and Tomato Production, new planting techniques have been devised and adapted to the needs of Antigua. Farmers have recorded significant increases in both of these crops. New farmers are also being encouraged to enter agriculture. Demonstration of these success projects is a powerful catalyst to involve new farmers in agriculture and ultimately to improve agricultural output in Antigua, where it is particularly low.

In St. Lucia, the fisheries program, particularly as it relates to aquaculture, has improved tremendously. The training which their Marine Biologist acquired, has enabled the Ministry to identify the types of fresh water fish which would be both suitable and palatable for St. Lucia and St. Lucians. Some small scale pond construction is underway for pilot projects.

St. Lucia also derived direct benefits from its participation in the comprehensive seminar for Tax Administrators. Their Revenue Department has been reorganized and they have placed an emphasis on selective audits rather than the comprehensive type. The result is that more revenue is being collected as a result of this training exposure. They have used their training in public relations, and have been successful in transforming "Tax evaders to willing compliants."

In St. Vincent, the Business seminar programs were very effective. Not only have participants been able to employ new procedures, but one employer was so receptive and impressed by the program done by an employee that that employee was promoted to run a new store.

In Montserrat, the training programs were ably supported throughout the Public and Private business hierarchy. Once businessmen were made aware of training programs they quickly recognized their benefits and sought to have more training. The importance and usage of time has been discovered and businessmen have become more efficient.

CARICOM's Training Unit has been developed and strengthened as a result of this project. CARICOM now funds this training unit from its own resources. It has the capacity for initiating and conducting training programs.

National Training Units were established, as planned, under the project. In St. Vincent, St. Lucia and Montserrat, the training units have progressed beyond a post office function. They have developed the capacity and the capability to plan, organize and implement training programs. In each of these three islands, their resource personnel have also been involved directly in the training process for local participants.

As a result of this project CAIC was strengthened as a regional institution. Their training unit's capability was enhanced as it responded to the training needs of National Chambers of Commerce in formulating and implementing appropriate programs. CAIC has also been able to develop a better working relationship with CARICOM.

21. UNPLANNED EFFECTS

Because private sector participants were unable to meet the designated financial contribution to their training, such training was totally funded by USAID. This resulted in more private sector participation in the programme. To meet these additional training costs without exceeding the allotted amounts, the number of seminars was reduced from 12 to 8.

The PACD of the project was extended from September 30, 1983 to May 31, 1984. This was done so as to facilitate the completion of scheduled training activities with unutilized project funds and thus enable to project to satisfy its objectives more adequately.

22. LESSONS LEARNED

According to the external evaluators, this project was very successful despite a few problems. From the recommendations of the external evaluations, several lessons may be gleaned. They are as follows:

- (a) Projects of this nature would be better implemented over a longer period of time. The external evaluators suggested eight to 16 years.
- (b) Future participant training for the small Caribbean states would be more beneficial to participants if conducted on a regional basis rather than on a national basis since the regional seminars permit interaction among persons with varying experiences.
- (c) Provision should be made for an internal evaluator to conduct both formative and summative evaluations of the activities undertaken by the project and so help to improve project implementation as well as provide longitudinal data on project impact.
- (d) To avoid communication difficulties, more attention should be given in the Project Design to the clarification and particularization of objectives, roles, authority and responsibility.
- (e) Attempts should be made to improve certain aspects of the placement process for participants (under individual training grants) by ensuring (i) adequate lead time for their departure, (ii) adequate information from AID/Washington concerning their training courses, (iii) adequate housing at destinations (iv) timely processing and disbursement of maintenance allowances (v) more comprehensive briefing concerning student visas.
- (f) Courses conducted in the United States for participants should be carefully selected for relevance or appropriateness to the needs of participants and their countries.
- (g) A mechanism should be developed to assure more individual training grants for persons in the private sector.

One final comment may be in order in this section. In collecting evaluation data from the territories, the external evaluators were accompanied by the CARICOM Training Officer. This officer was present at all interviews conducted. Such presence was likely to temper the responses of participants who were involved in the training programme implemented by the CARICOM Secretariat and in which the training officer playing a key role. Future evaluations should seek to avoid such a presence and the consequent constraints which it imposes on the collection of objective evaluation data.

23. SPECIAL COMMENTS OR REMARKS

The external evaluators found that there was good promotion of this project by USAID personnel and by CARICOM personnel to the target market, especially the Less Developed Caribbean States. They found that at the highest political level, there was a knowledge of, and continuing support for this project.

The evaluators also found strong support for regional as opposed to bilateral efforts in a project of this nature. They felt that (i) implementation through CARICOM made the project politically "palatable" to the member states, (ii) CARICOM itself was strengthened both politically and in its technical capacities, (iii) with CARICOM serving as the recognized regional "umbrella" institution, other regional institutions were strengthened; and (iv) had AID attempted the Project on a bilateral basis, AID would have required a far larger staff and greater expense to monitor the many governments, regional organizations, and individual trainees involved.

ATTACHMENTS

1. Report on Evaluation of CARICOM/USAID Regional Development Training Project 538-0014. Submitted by Dr. William Boyer and Mr. Robert Morris. 49 pp plus Appendices.

111

XD - AAP - 956 - A
1501 1985

CARIBBEAN CONFEDERATION OF CREDIT UNIONS
REGIONAL DEVELOPMENT PROJECT

Second Evaluation Report

J. Peter Marion
World Council of
Credit Unions
Ruth Anne Mitchell
Cooperative Development
Foundation
January-February 1984

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>PAGE</u>
I. INTRODUCTION	1
A. Project Background	1
B. Evaluation Objectives	3
C. Methodology	4
II. ENVIRONMENTAL CONDITIONS	6
III. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	9
A. CCCU Organizational Development	9
B. CCCU Services Development	10
C. CCCU Regional Credit Union Financial System	17
D. CCCU Country Development Programs	19
E. Technical Assistance	23
F. Finance	24
G. Institutional Relationships	26
H. Action Plan	28
I. Other Recommendations	29
IV. 18-MONTH EVALUATION STATUS REPORT	34
V. PROJECT ASSESSMENT	36
A. Current Status	36
1. CCCU Organizational Development	36
2. CCCU Services Development	40
3. Country Development Program	45
4. Technical Assistance	48
5. Finance	49
B. Implementation Activities and Objectives	54
C. Indicators	59
D. Project Impact	62
E. Institutional Relationships	92

LIST OF TABLES AND APPENDICES

<u>TABLES</u>	<u>PAGE</u>
1. Comparative Percentage Annual Growth Rates of Credit Unions and Territorial Economies for the Project Period	8
2. Consolidated Project Fiscal Report at December 1983	51a-51b
3. Project Indicators Status at December 1983	59a
4. Distribution of Loans Granted By Purpose - Sample Data from 1983 Evaluation Survey and Percent Distribution	63
5. Growth in Savings - Members - Average per Member Savings	65
6. Growth Comparison	67
7. Project Period Loans Outstanding Growth	69
8. Comparative Attainment of Self-Sufficiency Targets	76
9. Comparative Membership Growth - Project Period 1979-1982	79
10. Comparative Savings Growth Rates	81
11. Women's Participation in Credit Union Leagues	85
12. Women's Participation at Credit Union Level	86

APPENDICES

1. Country Survey Reports
2. CCCU Evaluation Recommendations Status Report
3. Development Institutions, USAID and CDF Projects List
4. Implementation Objectives and Activities Status

I. INTRODUCTION

A. PROJECT BACKGROUND

The Caribbean Confederation of Credit Unions Regional Development Project was originally researched and designed during a four month period from March to June 1979. The design team was made up of representatives of the World Council of Credit Unions (WCCCU), the Co-operative Development Foundation of Canada (CDF), and the Caribbean Confederation of Credit Unions (CCCU). The design was modified subsequently in order to assist in greater measure the reconstruction programs of the Dominica credit union movement after Hurricane David. The project became operational in June 1980.

A noteworthy aspect of the project is its joint financing by U.S. and Canadian government development agencies through domestically based private sector organizations, CDF of Canada and the Credit Union National Association of the United States (CUNA), under co-ordination of the World Council of Credit Unions.

Operationally the project consists of three major components: CCCU regional and headquarters development, country development project and grants (CDG's), and technical assistance. The CCCU regional component includes essential management functions necessary for project and confederation administration and provision of training and field support services to member credit unions and leagues. Country develop-

1-

ment projects are designed to assist member organizations in developing essential training, financial and other services for their members. Grants to support these projects are awarded after the member league or credit union meets certain minimum criteria and are scheduled over a three to five year period on a decreasing basis; the recipient is expected to make up the difference in locally generated revenues. Technical assistance is provided currently by an American and Canadian staff of two. A financial advisor supports management systems development at CCCU headquarters and specialized assistance to member organizations. A training advisor supports CCCU's training and country development programs. A third technical advisor was based in Dominica for a two year period and assisted the League in developing its central finance systems.

During the first two years of the project, the CCCU concentrated on establishing its headquarters in Barbados; formulating and implementing in-house management systems and the delivery of services to members; assisting affiliates to meet the basic requirements for initiation and continuation of the Country Development Programs; providing technical assistance to affiliates in developing their own management and service systems; training league credit union development officers (CUDOs), managers and field representatives; assisting the Dominica league in establishing its central finance facility; in-country basic training to league Boards of Directors.

During the following 18 months, the CCCU had increased its focus on the promotion and development of primary level credit unions. The CCCU continued its development efforts with the member leagues; yet an increasing proportion of its programs and activities were devoted to credit union level development. In addition, particular emphasis was placed on enhancing the financial viability of both member leagues and their credit unions.

B. EVALUATION OBJECTIVES

This evaluation is being conducted after completion of three and a half years of the project's first phase and an 18-month process-oriented assessment. Therefore, this study will be largely concerned with evaluating the purpose and goal level impacts achieved and identifying key needs and factors to be considered in designing a second phase development activity.

The specific objectives were:

1. Assessment of project performance and management, including comparison of actual results against those projected in the current grant agreements.
2. Assessment of those external economic, political and legislative conditions which have hindered or supported project implementation.
3. Report on current status of the project.

4. Project impact analysis of the degree to which the project has strengthened the institutional capabilities of the regional credit union system to provide financial and other services to the member population.
5. Develop conclusions on those components of the project which have been more or less effective in meeting the development needs of the CCCU, the leagues, credit unions and membership and provide recommendations to improve project implementation.

C. METHODOLOGY

The evaluation was designed jointly by WOCCU, CDF and CCCU based in part on consultation with USAID and CIDA. The evaluation team consisted of J. Peter Marion, WOCCU Project Monitor; Ruth Anne H. Mitchell, CDF Project Monitor; Melvin Edwards, Acting Managing Director, Director of Training Development, CCCU; Everard Dean, Treasurer, CCCU; Richard Lowe, WOCCU Training Advisor; Kenton Eggleston, WOCCU Financial Advisor; Roderick MacMullin, CIDA Consultant; Darwin Clarke, AID Evaluation Specialist; Peter Medford, AID Project Officer; Thomas Rampursad, CUNA Mutual Representative; Hugh Maxfield, Manager Designate, CCCU (Observer). Secretarial support was provided by Bonita Marshall, CCCU; Lasanta Hayes-McCarthy, CCCU; and L. Susan Wright, CDF. Research of CCCU member countries' economic indicators was performed by Gloria Stemper, WOCCU. In addition to the team evaluation, CIDA consultant, Roderick MacMullin, made an

independent evaluation of the project and commented upon specific items referred to him in his Terms of Reference.

The evaluation process was divided into four parts: January 22-24, review of evaluation design, current project status, and documentation review at CCCU headquarters (Barbados); January 24-February 1st, country development program review; February 2-6, conclusions at CCCU headquarters (Barbados). In each country visited, an attempt was made to balance visits to rural and urban, large and small, effective and ineffective, credit unions. The credit union league and co-operative department were visited in each country. The league meetings included sessions with both staff and board members. All credit unions were visited in St. Kitts/Nevis, St. Vincent and Antigua; representative units were surveyed in Barbados, Dominica, Grenada and St. Lucia. The only major exception to a representative sample was Guyana, where of six credit unions visited, five were in Georgetown. While not representative of the movement as a whole, it does follow the pattern of League assistance to credit unions.

Summaries of the country surveys are included in Appendix 1. While the quantitative material represents the most accurate data the teams were able to collect, it must be viewed as limited, and not representing a true cross-section of the credit union movement. For the most part, large urban credit unions were more successful in gathering data than credit unions that were small, rural, or entirely volunteer staffed.

II. ENVIRONMENTAL CONDITIONS

On balance, the political, economic and legislative environment for the development of credit unions in the region has not been unfavorable. Historically credit unions were conceived in times of adversity and flourished in times of economic recession.

The political environment in the region has ranged from being very stable to quite volatile. However, it has not hindered the development of credit unions; actually, most governments in the region have rendered a great deal of assistance to the movement and in some cases enthusiastically supported a strong credit union movement. In some cases departments of co-operatives could be accused of helping create and maintain a "dependency syndrome" among credit unions by doing too much for them in certain areas, such as auditing. It is common to find co-operative department auditors bringing books up-to-date in order to complete an annual audit, and it is common to find credit union officers taking such help for granted.

The economic environment has been traditionally providing a lower standard of living than that enjoyed by most North Americans. Unemployment is high throughout the region, wages are low, housing is scarce and sub-standard and new housing is not affordable for many wage earners. Governments, likewise, have difficulty in providing a more desirable level of social services. Despite these disadvantages, greater numbers of citizens are joining credit unions, are

building savings accounts and are making use of credit available for provident and productive purposes at reasonable rates of interest.

The legislative environment has been generally favorable. Antigua did not have a law under which credit unions could be incorporated until 1982. Credit unions existed in the country but had no legal basis; now all have been registered. All countries in the region have adequate legislation to permit the development of credit unions.

Credit unions have generally performed slightly better than the territorial economies in savings, credit and membership growth during the project period, as shown in Table No. 1. Credit unions in six territories outperformed the growth of total private sector savings; in four territories the opposite was true. Credit unions did better in the area of credit, where seven movements outgrew their economies, as compared to three territories where total domestic private sector credit growth exceeded that of credit unions. The record is matched in comparing the growth of national income per capita with savings per member, where six territories exceeded the credit union movement and vice versa. The area where credit unions seem to have grown markedly faster than the region is seen in comparing membership growth rates against total population growth. Membership outgrew total population in eleven territories; only two territories outgrew their credit union movements.

TABLE NO. 1

**COMPARATIVE PERCENTAGE ANNUAL GROWTH RATES OF
CREDIT UNIONS AND TERRITORIAL ECONOMIES FOR THE PROJECT PERIOD**

	Savings		Credit		Savings and Income		Member Growth	
	Credit Unions	Total Private	Credit Unions	Total Private	Credit Union Savings per Member	National Income per Capita	Membership Growth	Population
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	(8)
Trinidad	45*	21	38*	21	40*	29	4*	1.4
Jamaica	26	34	26	30	11*	-2	14*	0.2
Guyana	22	25	26*	24	25*	12	-2*	-2.8
Suriname	17*	10	3	14	12	13	4*	-6.3
Barbados	19*	15	16*	13	9	21	9*	-0.4
Dominica	22*	15	23*	22	11	35	10*	-3.2
Belize	3	13	4	15	2	2	1	6.6
Grenada	21	3	20*	8	22*	16	-1	1.8
St. Lucia	10	15	23*	14	-2	12	12*	0
Bahamas	74*	18	71*	12	NA	14	24*	-3.5
Antigua	35	NA	59	NA	19*	14	29*	1.3
St. Vincent	24	NA	59	NA	12	13	11*	1.9
St. Kitts/Nevis	53	NA	46	NA	23*	16	25*	-1.0
Montserrat	6	NA	6	NA	-6	14	20	NA
Cayman Islands	51	NA	54	NA	NA	NA	11	NA
	6*	4	7*	3	6*	6	11*	2

NOTES

(1),(3),(5),(7) - CCCU growth statistics for the 1979-1982 period except Antigua (1981-83) and Montserrat (1981-82).

(2),(4) - International Monetary Fund, International Financial Statistics for the 1979-1982 period, line #25 for savings, line #22 for credit.

(6),(8) - World Bank Atlas, for the period 1979-1981.

* Shows cases where credit union rate exceeds territorial economy's rate.

III. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

A. CCCU ORGANIZATIONAL DEVELOPMENT

Conclusions

CCCU has achieved most of the institutional development objectives specified in the project design, the first evaluation and the institutional analysis. The confederation has successfully overcome the organizational problems identified during the first evaluation and has accelerated completion of the project implementation objectives and activities. Although there has been staff turn-over the institutionalization of CCCU's basic financial, administrative and operating systems has enabled the confederation to maintain a high level of services to members. Return to a full staff and continued board of directors and executive committee involvement can be expected to complete CCCU's transformation into a financial and development services organization.

One organizational development area requiring specific attention is CCCU's public image. People at the government and league levels are aware of the CCCU and its assistance but there was a lack of clear regional image of its role, functions and services particularly at the credit union level. CCCU news is often provided to the Barbados media but this is not always picked up for regional distribution.

Recommendations

1. Member leagues should increase promotion of CCCU through their local communications media.
2. CCCU should issue its press releases through the regional news agency CANA so that regional credit union news stories are made available to territorial newspapers, radio and television stations.

B. CCCU SERVICES DEVELOPMENT

1. INSTITUTIONAL ANALYSIS AND PLANNING

Conclusions

CCCU products and techniques, particularly the institutional analyses, were often perceived as over-sophisticated relative to the abilities and needs of the users. These products were frequently very highly rated, although it was felt that they should be simplified, reduced in scope and their terminology and presentation adjusted to the requirements of each user. In some cases it was felt that additional follow-up to the original institutional analysis was needed to reflect changing situations. One concern was that achievement of the overall project planning and institutional analysis objectives needs to be made relevant to the conditions of each participating territory.

Recommendations

- 1.1. CCCU management should review its products and techniques to assure that they are understandable by target groups.
- 1.2. The Confederation should develop alternative institutional analysis survey forms and questions relevant to the type and scale of leagues and credit unions in the region.

2. TRAINING

Conclusions

In general, training services provided by the CCCU were highly rated both by credit union personnel and by league staff and leadership. The evaluation team concluded however that the CCCU needs to address the issues of participant selection, curriculum design and course length in its training policy and programs.

Participant selection was identified as a problem area in two ways; problems were created in the regional program by mixing league managers and field workers in the same course; in other programs the mixing of volunteers and staff may have been inappropriate. In between league management and leadership personnel and those entrusted to implement league operations. In the latter case topics, which may be appropriate to staff may exceed the

capabilities or the available time of volunteer credit union participants.

In curriculum design it was felt that the CCCU should set the duration and content of its courses in accordance with the absorptive capacity of the participants. In some cases it was felt that the curriculum was overloaded and that both the training day and the training week were too long.

Both credit union and league personnel expressed a clear need for increased on-site follow-up to CCCU's formal training programs especially in the financial management areas. The leagues are generally unable to provide in-depth on-site assistance to their member credit unions and CCCU currently has insufficient staff to train league personnel in these areas.

The train the trainers concept and program as implemented by CCCU has been reasonably successful despite the low retention rate of its first generation of trainees. In many cases these trainees have continued within the movement at the league or credit union leadership level although they are not necessarily employees of league or credit unions. These individuals represent a valuable human resource which is being utilized by the Caribbean credit union movement.

Recommendations

- 2.1. The CCCU should set the duration and content of its courses in accordance with the absorptive capacity of the participants.
- 2.2. Leagues, monitored by CCCU, should become responsible for in-country training of credit union personnel.
- 2.3. The training of trainers concept and strategy should be retained and encouraged.
- 2.4. If CCCU initiates training, then follow-up assistance is a CCCU responsibility. On-the-job training of credit union staff should be increased, primarily through concentration by CCCU on training League CUDOs and other field staff.

3. TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE

Conclusions

The country level surveys consistently reported the need for increased one-on-one technical assistance and less emphasis on formal training programs. There is need for in-country technical advisors to work with credit unions and to train the Credit Union Development Officers (CUDOs). At the same time there was some concern whether the CUDOs and other league field workers are doing all that is possible to train credit union staff in

accounting, preparing financial statements and credit management. There is a need to assure strict implementation of this high priority field work by the CUDOs. CCCU will need to examine the budget and cost implications of increased in-country technical assistance as well as linkages with organizations capable of providing such support.

Recommendations

- 3.1. CCCU should put greater emphasis on in-country and on-the-job training as opposed to regional and sub-regional classroom training.
- 3.2. CCCU and league boards should assure that the maximum possible technical assistance to credit unions is provided by league managers, CUDOs and field workers.
- 3.3. Where community-wide capital city credit unions exist, special developmental attention should be provided to them by league CUDOs, field workers and manager.

4. MARKETING

Conclusions

The team found that many CCCU publications were not generally recognized by credit union people although they were often known

by league personnel. The CCCU is dependent on its leagues to market its publications and other products to credit unions. In many cases the leagues are not yet capable of effectively implementing this marketing function and the team concluded that there is a need for the CCCU to market directly to credit unions. The CCCU newsletter is sporadic and CCCU lacks the word and list processing technology to produce and distribute it on a cost-effective basis.

The Confederation has no regional public relations or marketing strategy either for its own products or those of its member leagues and credit unions. Nevertheless the CCCU has been highly effective in increasing public awareness of credit unionism and the personal benefits of participation in the credit union system in a general sense. This is borne out by dramatic growth rates in several territories especially Antigua, Barbados, St. Kitts/Nevis, Montserrat and even Dominica (already a highly saturated marketplace). In several countries the importance of a CCCU newsletter with updates on country projects, new events, credit union development, etc., was cited as an important need.

Recommendations

- 4.1. Marketing of credit union services should be done by the leagues. Regional image building for the movement as a whole should be done on an on-going basis by the CCCU.

- 4.2. CCCU should implement and maintain distribution of its newsletter on a regular basis, mailing it directly to credit unions, leagues, government cooperative departments, the media and other interested parties.
- 4.3. CCCU staff should investigate and identify funding sources for appropriate technology to implement word processing, mailing lists, accounting and statistical data and make appropriate recommendations to the Board.
- 4.4. CCCU should identify its publications available for sale or distribution to its clientele and market these products actively at both league and credit union levels.

5. INSURANCE

Conclusions

Fidelity bonding is generally not available in the territories although it was cited as a need by credit union and league personnel in several cases. This nonavailability is due to non-registration of the CUMIS Insurance Company in nearly all territories and the high costs of administering bonding programs in such small markets. The CUMIS bond with its breadth of coverage is generally regarded as the ideal type of bond for most credit unions around the world. Nevertheless there are other types of fidelity bonds available which are marketed by existing companies

in the region. CCCU, CUNA Mutual Society, CUMIS and the leagues are currently examining various alternatives for offering the appropriate bonding coverage required by the credit union movement.

Recommendations

5.1. The CCCU should identify available sources of bonding insurance and arrange for services to be provided to league and credit unions. If feasible, the CCCU should seek appropriate registration in each territory in order to provide bonding coverage directly through the credit union system.

C. REGIONAL CENTRAL FINANCE SYSTEM

Conclusions

The evaluation team identified a widespread demand for additional capital to complement credit union funds, particularly for housing finance. Only Jamaica and Dominica, however, have national central finance systems capable of mobilizing and intermediating these funds. The evaluation team concluded that external grant and loan funding will still be necessary to develop the Caribbean credit union regional finance system but there is need to develop criteria linking external funds to internal capitalization at both the territorial and regional levels. It appeared to the team that some territories might not be making as strong an effort as possible to generate their own

funds and had slipped into a dependency relationship with external funding sources. In most cases, however, credit union and league leadership and staff indicated the desirability of generating their own local resources complemented with external loan funds which would produce income instead of relying on operating grants.

The evaluation team concluded that many credit unions and leagues do not meet investment standards in their operating systems and policies. Nevertheless the team was generally impressed by the degree of honesty and control exhibited by most leagues and credit unions despite the lack of bonding or highly trained credit union managers. A sound institutional and human base is being established which will support a regional central finance system.

Several grant-loan agreements between CCCU and member leagues appeared to lack clear definition of the specific terms and conditions for use and repayment of the loan portion of the funds involved. This lack of clarity in the loan terms clouded what were otherwise successful country development activities.

Recommendations

1. Member credit unions and leagues should concentrate on bringing their financial management practices up to the standards necessary for successful operation of a regional central finance system and attraction of external capital.

2. CCCU and Leagues should embark on a program to identify local institutions that can provide funds for specific investment projects.
3. Boards and staff should examine alternative sources and methods of capitalization to avoid creating or continuing dependency on grant funding to the exclusion of domestic resource mobilization.
4. CCCU should develop and implement a matching concept in providing grants or loans to member organizations.
5. The CCCU board of directors should develop a clearly stated policy on grant and loan funding to be disseminated to all member organizations.
6. CCCU management should review, clarify and document existing grant and loan agreements with members to assure commitment to and full understanding of the specific terms and conditions of each agreement.

D. COUNTRY DEVELOPMENT PROJECTS

Conclusions

The country development program has continued the successful development process begun at the CCCU. The leagues have now largely achieved operational capabilities; all have offices, capable if not

fully trained staff, active boards of directors and they offer basic training, promotional and in some cases financial services. The CDP program focus has now therefore shifted to developing credit union management capabilities. The evaluation team concluded that credit union development is being hindered by over-reliance on volunteers to act as managers even when credit unions have sufficient funds to employ staff. Though these staff are apparently well qualified they are usually limited to clerical roles while management is nominally performed by the volunteers. Typically, basic bookkeeping is being performed but financial management is minimal and the credit unions frequently depend on government co-operative officers or league field workers to prepare financial statements and perform other controls.

The major management problem at the league level has been difficulty in attracting and retaining league staff due in part to the newness of the league service functions and insecurity associated with an externally funded program. Another factor has been the lack of management and personnel systems in the leagues. In some cases, leagues have been hindered by poor working relationships with the larger more successful credit unions in their territory. These credit unions are frequently older than the league, they have professional staff, are financially self-sufficient and may perceive little need for the league and its relatively basic services. This situation is changing as the CCCU upgrades both the capabilities of league staff and the portfolio of services which they can offer. A similar problem occurs in terms of the league representational systems where

there is inadequate representation of the larger credit unions with their more skilled staff and leadership.

The country development program has now largely overcome a problem which was identified during the first evaluation. This involved the league perception that CCCU was imposing arbitrary requirements for participation in the country development program. This problem has nearly disappeared as leagues were increasingly able to meet the CCCU's participation requirements which the team concluded were entirely reasonable. Nevertheless there is a continuing need for the CCCU to use considerable sensitivity in assuring league compliance with its CDP participation criteria in order to avoid any possible perception of interference in its members' autonomy.

In some cases league field workers are unable to perform their on-site technical assistance and training functions due to lack of transportation.

Credit union auditing at the current time is largely a responsibility of the government cooperative departments in each territory. The audits provided by the departments are low in costs but frequently involve delays which retard the distribution of dividends and rebates. In some cases, credit unions may elect their auditors but in most they are restricted to the government department. Government auditors are frequently delayed by the need to reconstruct the books or prepare financial statements which are not currently being prepared by credit union staff.

Recommendations

1. CCCU should develop and implement a strategy to assist member credit unions to convert from elected management to appointed or employed full- or part-time managers, who are not Board members.
2. CCCU should develop a systematic job definition, recruitment selection and employment process to be recommended to its member leagues for their internal use.
3. CCCU should encourage leagues to develop closer working relationships with large credit unions, in order to gain increased access to their skills, and to help them in accessing specialized external technical support.
4. CCCU should examine alternative constitutional structures at the league level to increase the participation of skilled credit union representatives and develop appropriate recommendations for its members.
5. CCCU should review CUDO and field workers' transportation needs within the context of its country development program funding.
6. CCCU should examine the question of credit union audits, their costs, certification standards and procedures and develop appropriate recommendations for the leagues.

7. Leagues should develop closer relationships with their Registrars to achieve designation of a list of pre-approved, alternative auditors which may be selected by the credit unions themselves.

E. TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE

Conclusions

WOCCU technical assistance has been critically important to the CCCU during its first three years and especially during 1983 while the confederation was understaffed. The technical advisors have been involved in preparing draft system designs, policy and training documents which have been adapted by CCCU Caribbean staff to local requirements and integrated into the confederation's operating framework. As noted previously, most of the headquarters systems have been completed. The technical assistance effort is now focussed on coordinating and mobilizing technical and financial resources to assist the member leagues and credit unions.

The technical assistance program has been increasingly involved in mobilizing much broader assistance involving technical resources both within the region as well as extra-regionally. The Caribbean exchange program has utilized the technical skills of the region's most developed movements, Jamaica and Trinidad and Tobago, to assist the developing leagues and credit unions. The Coady International Institute has provided periodic accounting and financial systems

development assistance and CUSO volunteers have been employed for country level programs. There is an evolving relationship with the Peace Corps in one territory.

The evaluation team concluded that there is a need to Caribbeanize the technical assistance effort beginning with the transfer of skills and knowledge from the current advisory staff to the new training officers to be selected by the confederation.

Recommendations

1. CCCU should review its technical needs and develop a strategy for mobilizing and utilizing technical assistance personnel during Phase II.
2. CCCU should develop and implement a strategy for greater in-country technical assistance to its member organizations.

F. FINANCE

Conclusions

While progress is being made, the leagues have not been as successful as originally expected in reaching their financial self-sufficiency targets. This is due to a number of reasons including implementation delays in the country development projects, over-reliance on grant funding in setting expense targets, relatively low dues increases and

overly high spending in non-priority areas. There is need for increased commitment to both the concept and practice of financial self-sufficiency in the leagues' financial planning process. The CCCU elected leadership needs to continue its involvement in assuring member compliance with established CDP funding policy and priorities. Monitoring of the CDP grant portfolio is needed to review each leagues' achievement of its financial self-sufficiency plan as well as specific budget items.

The Caribbean movement has not yet developed financial structure guidelines relating to investment in fixed assets, levels and types of indebtedness, etc. Given the current relatively high interest in making fixed asset investments and the Cooperative Development Foundation's ability to assist that undertaking, guidance is needed to avoid potential liquidity problems to credit unions and leagues in the region.

Recommendations

1. CCCU in its Phase II presentation should address, define and project realistic self-sufficiency objectives for each member organization. These objectives should be based on committed plans developed by each member organization with specific funding limits and completion dates.

2. CCCU management and board of directors should review the financial policies and practices of CDP participants and encourage appropriate remedial action in all cases where current operations are ineffective or inefficient in using development resources.
3. The approved CDP implementation policy should be consistently applied and monitored regularly.
4. CCCU Board should present to the AGM for its approval, a quantitative guideline for investment in fixed assets.
5. CCCU should assist its member institutions in developing a strategy for investment in and the financing of fixed assets.

G. INSTITUTIONAL RELATIONS

Conclusions

Joint funding of the CCCU and its member leagues by CIDA and USAID through CDF and WOCCU has been effective and advantageous to all parties. In terms of development approach, joint funding has combined the flexibility of CDF and CIDA with the systematic procedures of WOCCU and USAID. It has doubled the resources available to the movement while increasing flexibility in allocating expenditures and allowing implementation of a common financial plan and budget. Joint funding has also eased the burdens of reporting by replacing

multiple reports with a single basic progress and fiscal report which integrates all major components.

The evaluation team concluded that CCCU relationships with the leagues and credit unions are generally positive. Most leagues are now up-to-date in their progress and financial planning and reporting. Reporting of fairly routine financial and membership statistics is still a problem. This reflects the lack of financial statement preparation at the credit union level more than the leagues' inability to collect and consolidate such data.

Relations with governments reflect the changing roles of the credit union movement as it grows, increases its capabilities, and serves a broad range of the financial needs of its members. The CCCU and leagues need to improve the credit union movement's image with the public, government and the financial sector. In some cases, CCCU and the leagues need to develop a strong, more defensive strategy to counter a lack of government support. In others a positive approach is needed to extend fiscal incentives already achieved in Jamaica, Trinidad and Tobago and Barbados to other territories within the region.

Recommendations

1. The joint funding approach should be continued in Phase II of the regional development program.

2. CCCU should assist its member credit unions and leagues to develop linkages with domestic development institutions in each territory. CCCU should broaden its links with regional institutions such as CARICOM, CDB and OECS.
3. CCCU should assist its member institutions to develop a strategy to foster improved governmental relations, and to identify a specific agenda for governmental support, including fiscal incentives for savings, participation in training opportunities, and improved legislation.
4. CCCU should develop better linkages with CUNA Mutual to gather and report on credit union movement statistics.

H. ACTION PLAN

Conclusions

The evaluation team concluded that CCCU is successfully achieving most of the regional credit union movement's development objectives, as specified in both the original and revised project designs. Appropriate action is needed to assure continuity of funding between the project's first and second phases.

Recommendations

1. Based on its findings, the evaluation team recommends that CCCU prepare and submit a proposal for funding of the Phase II project to begin by January 1, 1985 which incorporates the team's recommendations.

I. OTHER RECOMMENDATIONS

The CIDA evaluator noted additional recommendations to those discussed and agreed upon by the team as a whole. These recommendations are included here as a reference for future evaluation follow-up.

1. Standard Guidelines and Manuals

- 1.1. That CCCU continue to develop and update manuals for leagues and credit unions and exert greater effort to have these accepted and used as standards for all in the region.
- 1.2. That CCCU continue to develop and market educational literature such as "The Credit Union and You" for mass distribution to credit union members and the general public so as to provide greater awareness of the benefits of credit unions among members and non-members alike.

2. Audit Monitoring

- 2.1. That CCCU, in consultation with leagues and co-op department auditors, design a strategy with appropriate programs to assure that all credit unions have their books and accounts brought up-to-date punctually, and that greater efforts be made to encourage, and eventually insist upon the Treasurer being responsible for having all records up-to-date within a reasonable time after the close of each month.
- 2.2. That the leagues be urged to emphasize the training of treasurers and accounting clerks and that this be specifically indicated in the CUDOs and field workers' job description.
- 2.3. That CCCU, in consultation with the leagues and co-op department auditors encourage government inspection of credit unions in addition to the making of an annual audit.

3. Regional Central Finance

- 3.1. CCCU and the league boards of directors should examine their respective legislation to anticipate any changes that may be desirable to enable credit unions, the leagues and CCCU to receive funds from internal and external sources as loans or deposits and to make loans or investments to their members.

4. Personnel

- 4.1. That CCCU review its personnel policy relative to hours of work and particularly the hours of overtime secretarial staff is expected to work.
- 4.2. That the board of CCCU place a limit on the number of hours of overtime that may be worked in any one week with the aim in mind of hiring additional help if it is found that essential work cannot be done in the prescribed time including a reasonable maximum number of overtime hours per week.
- 4.3. That staff be compensated for overtime work by extra pay or at their option, some other form of compensation such as time off, extended vacation, etc., with the further understanding that such alternatives to actual cash payment for overtime not be allowed to accumulate beyond the overtime worked in each half of the fiscal year.
- 4.4. That the CCCU board of directors give consideration to a package of employee benefits including a pension plan and hospital and medical insurance.

5. Women in the Movement

- 5.1. In view of the fact that as much as 60 percent of credit union membership is made up of women, efforts should be made to encourage more women to serve as directors and committee members of local credit unions.
- 5.2. That local credit unions be encouraged to make use of more of their well informed and active women members to act as delegates to represent their local credit unions at meetings of the league, not only to present women's point of view, but so that more women will have the opportunity to sit on the board of directors and committees of the national leagues.
- 5.3. That national leagues be encouraged to select or elect a greater number of women to represent their respective national leagues at the Annual General Meeting of CCCU so that more women, actively participating in credit unions, may have the opportunity to act on the board of CCCU, thus assuring the movement of women's participation at all levels.
- 5.4. That boards of directors at each level of the movement recognize the contribution being made by women in clerical positions and where possible provide the necessary training so that an increasing number of women be selected as managers or for other executive positions in the movement.

6. Phase II - Joint Funding

- 6.1. That CCCU and its affiliated national leagues and credit unions approach CIDA and USAID for joint funding if and when a proposal is put forward for a Phase II of the Caribbean Credit Union Project; and that such funding continue to support technical assistance and country development programs for as long as such are needed.
- 6.2. That low interest bearing loan funds be made available to the leagues and/or credit unions to help meet their members' demands, especially for housing loans.
- 6.3. That CIDA give favorable consideration to a request to participate in Phase II of the Caribbean Credit Union Project.
- 6.4. That CIDA continue to be involved in the joint funding and implementation of Phase II of the project.
- 6.5. In the event that USAID decides not to participate in Phase II, it is recommended that CIDA consider favorably a request to fund the project itself, knowing that in so doing it would be enhancing an already excellent reputation in the region for the quality and generosity of its assistance.

IV. 18-MONTH EVALUATION STATUS REPORT

In essence, all major recommendations of the first evaluation have been implemented. A detailed report on the status of each recommendation made in the first evaluation is found in Appendix 2. A summary of the implementation status for each of the major categories of recommendations follows.

Institutional Analyses and Planning:

- 14 institutional analyses completed
- final draft of 5-year plan (Phase II) to be completed June 1984.

Country Development Grants:

- budget revisions completed
- planning ongoing
- CDP implementation manual completed.

CCCU Headquarters Operations:

- all recommendations implemented.

Training:

- all recommendations implemented.

Technical Assistance:

- all recommendations implemented.

Project Finance:

- all recommendations implemented.

Information System:

- information system partially implemented in 1983.

Resource Mobilization:

- self-sufficiency strategy being developed to be completed June 1984 as part of Phase II
- foreign exchange management program designed, 50% implemented.

V. PROJECT ASSESSMENT

A. Current Status

1. CCCU Organizational Development

a) Legal Status

On October 1st, 1982, the CCCU was registered as a non-profit organization under the Companies Act of Barbados.

b) Annual General Meeting

The annual general meeting is the primary decision-making body of the confederation. It reviews the operations of the previous year, approves the budget for the ensuing year and elects the Board of Directors.

The 11th Annual General Meeting held in Nassau, Bahamas, August 20, 1982 made the following major decisions:

1. approval of special dues to cover the shortfall in budgeted income;
2. approval of the establishment of a CCCU Development Foundation;
3. development and pursuit of a resource mobilization strategy to meet additional CCCU requirements.

The 12th Annual General Meeting was held in Barbados, August 1983. The following major issues were addressed:

1. legislation favourable to the provision of appropriate insurance services to members of credit unions and other co-operatives;
2. currency unification of the Caricom area;
3. income tax relief on savings in credit unions and other co-operatives;
4. maximum use of available training facilities and opportunities;
5. inauguration of the development foundation as the future resource mobilization arm of the CCCU.

c) Board of Directors

The current Board is comprised as follows:

President: O.J. Thorbourne (Jamaica)
Vice-President: Ned Pitts (Belize)
Treasurer: Everard Dean (Trinidad & Tobago)
Secretary: Calvin Nicholls (St. Vincent)
Director: Richard Didier (Dominica)
Director: Melbourne Wells (Bahamas)
Director: Alwyn Linger (Suriname)

The Executive Committee comprises the President, Treasurer and Secretary. Regular meetings were held over the past two years:

- 1982: four Board, two Executive
- 1983: six Board, six Executive.

d) Staff

Seven staff positions exist at headquarters performing the following chief functions:

Managing Director: responsible for the detailed planning, organizing, coordination, implementation, evaluation and direction of all systems, programs and activities of the confederation.

Director, Training and Development: institutional development and implementation, country development support, CCCU and country monitoring, representation and liaison.

Accountant: administration of the full accounting cycle, financial statement preparation, financial research, accounting system maintenance and refinement (position currently vacant).

Secretary to the Managing Director: Board and Annual General Meeting support, office management, systems maintenance, typing and filing.

Secretary, Training and Development: typing, filing, library development, training program support, country development monitoring, communications.

Receptionist: communications, typing, filing, petty cash maintenance.

Office cleaner: clean and neat appearance of building and furniture.

Upon the resignation of Mr. Don Lyn, Mr. Melvin Edwards, Director of Training and Development, was appointed Acting Managing Director from March 1st, 1983. The new managing director, Mr. Hugh Maxfield, is expected to assume duties on February 27th, 1984.

Except for two brief vacancies, all other positions remained filled during 1983. Regular staff meetings were held throughout the year.

A staff development program is in effect. At present, the accountant and receptionist positions are vacant and replacement personnel have not yet been identified.

e) Policies and Systems

Most of the concerns for improved management policies and systems raised by the 18-month evaluation have been addressed. The CCCU institutional analysis of February 1983 noted this. Adequately documented policies and operating procedures detailing the organization's personnel administration, accounting, planning, country development, training, travel and reporting systems have been installed.

The revision of the regional project design during 1982 resulted in large part from greater initiative and involvement by the CCCU Board in improving operations. A more concerted effort is being made by the Board and staff to develop a more self-reliant organization, in accordance with the CCCU's Mission Statement.

2. CCCU Services Development

a) Manuals and Guidelines Development

This service program has been implemented with the production of the following manuals:

- Board/management relations (league and credit union);
- country development (revised);
- model credit union loan policy;
- credit union accounting system (draft);

- CCCU convention and Annual General Meeting criteria and guidelines (applicable to league and credit union general meetings).

Standard forms and technical papers for league and credit union operations have been developed for adoption in the following areas: accounting, financial reports, planning, program reporting, institutional analysis and statistical gathering. 5,000 reprints of the information booklet "Credit Unions and You" have been made for distribution throughout the regional system; other previously produced material was supplied by affiliates. League and credit union leaders continued to improve their familiarization with manuals, bulletins and standard forms through the various CCCU-run courses.

In keeping with current demands and the revised project outputs, the manuals development and application program will receive greater emphasis in 1984.

b) Technical Assistance

All 15 territories received greater technical assistance through an increased number of staff visits over the previous reporting period. Technical visits during 1982 and 1983 concentrated on league and credit union bookkeeping, action planning, budgeting, financial reporting, institutional

analysis and operational surveys, project preparation, strengthening board-management relations, conference co-ordination and long-range planning.

Thirteen territorial institutional analyses have been completed plus analysis of the CCCU itself and an operations survey of the large and strategic Roseau, Dominica credit union. Comprehensive reports and recommendations of all analyses have been compiled and formally presented.

The confederation achieved several successes in attracting additional extra-regional expertise to supplement its own technical resources and WOCCU support. Organizations providing assistance include:

Community Credit Counselling Centre, Canada; Coady International Institute, Canada; and Canadian University Services Overseas (CUSO).

A Caribbean exchange program has been developed by CCCU, largely with support from Jamaica, Trinidad and Tobago and Dominica movements. Personnel from the Belize, Bahamas, Barbados and Guyana leagues have benefitted from short exposures to the Jamaican system; personnel from eastern Caribbean territories have participated in short-term work-study visits to major community credit unions in Trinidad and Tobago and Dominica. The Jamaica League has also provided

periodic technical support to the St. Lucia, St. Vincent and Barbados leagues through the CCCU.

c) Public Relations, Liaison and Representation

As a result of its successful development program and reinforced as a legal entity, CCCU has established credibility as the regional apex institution representing and catalysing the growth of credit unions. Continued active participation in the activities of the World Council of Credit Unions has bolstered the international image and access of the Caribbean movement. With over 500,000 members at the end of 1983, CCCU has now qualified to exercise the regular vote on the membership council.

Government support for the movement and the project continued to improve across the region. Governments have seconded personnel to some leagues and have hosted CCCU and affiliates' courses and conferences. Several proposals from the movement have led governments to review their legislation and policies relating to such matters as income tax, duty concessions, insurance, currency, domestic savings and schools' co-operatives. The Jamaica, Belize and Barbados leagues are actively pursuing mortgage lending schemes with their governments under USAID financing.

Increased dialogue, joint planning and shared activities between affiliates and government cooperative departments have also resulted in a more favourable image for credit unions in the community development process.

A listing of the various other development institutions with which CCCU has developed favourable ties is included in Appendix 3.

The North/South Co-operatives Study Conference (St. Lucia, October 1983) requested the confederation to serve as regional representative and coordinator for cooperative development in the region. Plans are moving ahead for a 1984 regional cooperative legislation and policy conference, involving government registrars and co-op officers, as well as volunteer and professional cooperators. The University of the West Indies and Coady are collaborating with CCCU in this exercise.

d) Project Development

Responding to the needs and demands of its affiliates, CCCU headquarters has developed a project design, marketing, supervision, and evaluation service. A variety of construction, training, administrative and technical support projects have been prepared and are being managed with direct benefits for credit union members. To date, an additional US\$600,000

has been mobilized for the movement; this compares with US\$300,000 at February 1982. During 1983, the project management service generated US\$6,300 in additional income for CCCU.

e) Credit Union Supplies Service

A stationery supplies service was introduced in 1983 as further support to credit union promotion regionally and also as an income-generating activity. Stock was purchased from CUNA Supply (Madison). Sales for 1983 generated net income of US\$470; the new service will be provided to affiliates on an ongoing basis.

3. Country Development Projects

a) CCCU Strategy

A full review of the country development program was undertaken in November 1982, resulting in a new "partners" approach being tested and put into effect. This new approach included:

- a classification of affiliates according to viability;
- greater emphasis on the development of capital city and mass organization-based credit unions;

- increased training and technical assistance, especially at the credit union level;
- expanded financial support in accordance with absorptive capacity;
- better reporting formats;
- refined country information systems;
- long-range institutional development planning.

An unallocated "country development fund" was included in the revised budget to support additional development projects. The new strategy also included a shift from budget deficit funding to line item support. At present, 7 of the 13 recipient countries are now on the line item basis (Suriname, Guyana, Trinidad and Tobago, Grenada, St. Vincent, St. Lucia and Nevis).

b) CDP Monitoring and Reporting

The country development monitoring system was reorganized and documented in accordance with the new strategy. The CDP disbursements now bear closer relationships to program performance, and more accurate country information is being generated, though not yet as timely as desirable.

c) CDP Performance

All affiliates have active Boards and full-time operations. Only 3 territories were unable to complete their 1981 audits in 1982. During 1983, 14 affiliates' audits and 15 annual general meetings were completed; of these annual general meetings, only 2 were held after July. A similar standardisation of audit and annual general meeting schedules is being developed at the credit union level. Financial reporting has improved considerably since 1982. Ten affiliates have developed mission statements to guide their institutional development process. Seven have developed long-range plans, focussing on the achievement of technical and financial self-sufficiency.

d) Disbursements

By July 1983, all member countries had met the prerequisites for grant funding under the program. At December 1981, US\$83,924 had been disbursed to 6 territories; by December 1983 a total of US\$254,263 had been disbursed to 13 territories. The non-recipient territory, Cayman Islands, is not considered as in need of funding for its operations.

4. Technical Assistance

Two WOCCU specialists have worked full-time on CCCU's staff since the first evaluation, the previous training advisor and a new financial advisor, recruited with CDF's assistance.

Their activities have been focused on the following areas:

Training Advisor: training strategy design; manuals development; institutional analysis and development planning; affiliate training and technical support; technical resource library; project preparation; program evaluation; advice to Board and management.

Financial Advisor: financial analysis and planning; cash flow monitoring; technical assistance for affiliates; financial management training; advice to Board and management; manuals development; accounting system design; technical research on dues, foreign exchange management and other topics.

The work of the advisors and their effective collaboration with CCCU staff are significant factors behind the achievement record of CCCU during 1982-1983. CCCU and WOCCU have agreed to adjust the work schedule of the two specialists to assure program continuity between the first and second phases of the project. They are expected to participate in training the new field

officers to be employed by CCCU, preparation of the 5-year development plan and phase II strategy, and continuing support to CCCU training operations and technical manuals development. The WOCCU advisors are currently scheduled to complete their service with the end of phase I in December 1984.

5. Project Finance

a) Financial Management:

The CCCU has achieved a major turnaround in its financial management. Virtually all financial management systems have been designed, documented and implemented, including the CCCU accounting manual. Essential financial management policies have been approved and are being regularly monitored by the Board of Directors. Transaction documents have been redesigned to accommodate true double-entry accounting and regular monthly financial statements, including supplementary schedules, are now prepared. Recordkeeping has advanced to the point that a routine semi-annual audit is being maintained without delay in producing audited statements.

Operating budgets are being developed by staff and approved by leadership which are based on the project budget and are strictly adhered to. On a quarterly basis the CCCU prepares a fiscal report for internal management and submission to

WOCCU and CDF. This fiscal report details for each line item the budget amount, the actual level of expenditure, and variance amount and percentage in Barbadian, Canadian and U.S. currencies. This report also includes the advance balance and cash position of CCCU. WOCCU similarly prepares a quarterly consolidated fiscal report which integrates all project components into a single budget report which is distributed to each participating organization. This report details actual expenditure for each quarter, as well as project-to-date position, balance of funds remaining and percentage spent. Budget position data is summarized by cost centre and by funding source.

The CCCU is now developing its asset management capabilities. It has a portfolio of four loans outstanding to Dominica, Grenada, St. Vincent and St. Lucia. The confederation does not yet have a comprehensive credit policy nor administrative procedures. This is not, however, a management problem given the small size of the portfolio and the specialized grant-loan agreements under which these loans were made. There have been some problems of an institutional nature due to non-specification of grant and loan terms in each of these cases.

Development of a central finance system for the Caribbean region is the next major evolutionary step of the CCCU system. Central finance is now successfully being operated in Jamaica and Dominica and system development is under way

in Grenada, St. Lucia and St. Vincent. An initial concept paper on regional finance has been prepared and visits undertaken to the Latin American Credit Union Confederation in Panama to review their international central finance operations.

The CCCU development foundation trust was initiated in August of 1983 as a vehicle for resource mobilization to assist its member leagues and credit unions. The initial capitalization totalled US\$1,300. Specific policy guidelines, grant criteria and program objectives are still in the developmental stage. Together with the proposed central finance service, the foundation is seen as a major focus of CCCU resource development activities during the next decade.

b. Project Budget

As of year-end 1983, the project was 6% under budget (US\$137,277); about 73% of this was for country development projects. This information is shown in Table 2 containing the December 1983 Consolidated Fiscal Report. Examination of Section IV, Expenditure Summary, of that report shows that on a project-to-date basis, the regional program was 1% under budget with 68% of funds spent; the country development projects were 21% under budget, with 57% of funds spent; technical assistance was 4% under budget and 79% spent; and indirect costs were exactly on budget with 84% of funds

	1974	1975	1976	1977	1978	1979	1980	1981	1982	1983	1984	1985	1986	1987
PROJECT - REGISTRATION														
Regional Programs														
Administration														
Personnel	15,231	15,231	15,231											
Travel	5,972	5,972	5,972											
Supplies	0	0	0											
Printing	1,479	1,479	1,479											
Other Direct Costs	2,035	2,035	2,035											
Total	18,444	18,444	18,444											
Funding														
WORLD BANK	7,547	7,547	7,547											
IDA Mutual Ins Soc	149	149	149											
WORLD USAID	1,005	1,005	1,005											
CFP/CIDA	2,112	2,112	2,112											
Other	0	0	0											
Total	7,444	7,444	7,444											
B. Country Devel. Programs														
Expenditure														
Belgium	0	0	0											
Bolivia	4,435	4,435	4,435											
Burkina Faso	0	0	0											
Burundi	4,600	4,600	4,600											
Cameroon	0	0	0											
Canada	0	0	0											
Chad	1,365	1,365	1,365											
Cote d'Ivoire	0	0	0											
Guatemala	0	0	0											
Haiti	1,712	1,712	1,712											
India	0	0	0											
Indonesia	0	0	0											
Kenya	0	0	0											
Madagascar	0	0	0											
Mali	0	0	0											
Mexico	0	0	0											
Mozambique	0	0	0											
Nicaragua	0	0	0											
Niger	0	0	0											
Nigeria	0	0	0											
Other	0	0	0											
Total	11,644	11,644	11,644											
Funding														
WORLD BANK	4,512	4,512	4,512											
CFP/CIDA	7,132	7,132	7,132											
Total	11,644	11,644	11,644											
C. Technical Assistance														
Expenditure														
Salaries	15,434	15,434	15,434											
Benefits	2,451	2,451	2,451											
Allowances	5,758	5,758	5,758											
Travel	195	195	195											
Other Direct Costs	0	0	0											
Total	23,838	23,838	23,838											
Funding														
WORLD BANK	23,838	23,838	23,838											
WORLD USAID	0	0	0											
CFP	0	0	0											
Total	23,838	23,838	23,838											
D. Overhead, Admin														
Expenditure														
WORLD BANK	9,755	9,755	9,755											
CFP	0	0	0											
Total	9,755	9,755	9,755											
Funding														
WORLD BANK	9,755	9,755	9,755											
CFP	0	0	0											
Total	9,755	9,755	9,755											
GRAND TOTALS														
EXPENDITURE	11,997	11,997	11,997											
FUNDING	11,997	11,997	11,997											

TABLE 2

Account Group	F.Y.A.				Budget Status		Budget to Date	Actual to Date	Variance		Fiscal Year	Actual Total	Balance of Funds	% Spent		
	Grants	Grants	Grants	Grants	Total	Variance			Percent	Percent						
BUDGET B EXPENDITURE																
Technical Assistance																
Expenditure																
Salaries	0	0	0	0	0	0	60702	60779	-77	1	60702	60679	-23	101		
Benefits	0	437	0	0	437	0	13927	13886	-41	-2	13927	13886	-41	98		
Allowances	0	0	0	0	0	0	14460	14351	-109	-13	14460	14351	-109	97		
Travel	706	115	0	0	1911	0	40035	31124	-8911	-22	40035	31124	8911	78		
Other Direct Cost	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0		
Overhead	0	0	0	0	0	0	38020	38301	-281	1	38020	38301	-281	101		
Total	706	1592	0	0	2298	0	168745	158141	-10604	-6	168745	158141	10604	94		
Funding																
WCCU/USAID	B/A	706	1592	0	0	2298	0	2298	0	0	168745	158141	10604	94		
League Support																
Expenditure																
Country Dev. Proj	B/B	3109	3110	311	3110	12439	13918	-1479	-11	94231	93535	696	8190	92		
Funding																
WCCU/USAID	B/B	3109	3110	311	3110	12439	13918	-1479	-11	94231	93535	696	8190	92		
BUDGET B TOTALS		3815	4702	311	3110	14737	13918	819	6	262976	251676	11300	18794	93		
EXPENDITURE		3815	4702	311	3110	14737	13918	819	6	262976	251676	11300	18794	93		
FUNDING		3815	4702	311	3110	14737	13918	819	6	262976	251676	11300	18794	93		
201 FUNDING SUMMARY																
WCCU/USAID																
Budget A	51128	59714	92068	65766	278566	319727	-37141	-12	904818	943679	-38861	-7	1214845	843679	371166	59
Budget B	3815	4702	311	3110	14737	13918	819	6	262976	251676	11300	-4	270470	251676	18794	73
Sub-total	54953	64416	95479	68876	293303	333645	-36322	-11	1167794	1195355	-28561	-6	1485315	1095355	389960	74
CCF CDA	31140	4747	65825	35154	196076	250213	-54137	-22	669031	597895	-71136	-11	935014	597895	337119	64
CCF	0	0	12666	0	12666	12666	0	0	59476	59476	0	0	66722	59476	7246	89
CCU	35477	1215	721	0	36722	39000	-2278	-8	154564	110650	-43914	-28	260781	110650	150131	42
CCF Mutual	149	4810	1500	6448	26413	25000	1413	6	89918	86212	-3706	-4	120000	86212	33788	72
Other	93	2736	3566	6736	13153	0	13153	0	1848	55766	53918	2918	1848	55766	-53918	3018
TOTAL FUNDING	121812	127225	211852	116814	577703	656524	-78821	-12	2142631	2005354	-137277	-6	2870680	2005354	865326	70
202 EXPENDITURE SUMMARY																
Project Components:																
Regional Program/HD																
Country Dev Projects																
Budget A	12532	11054	71492	15660	110748	190104	-79356	-42	384042	292915	-91127	-26	559233	283915	275318	51
Budget B	3109	3110	311	3110	12439	13918	-1479	-11	94231	93535	-696	-1	101725	93535	8190	92
Sub-total	15641	14174	74602	18770	123187	204022	-80835	-40	478273	377450	-100823	-21	660958	377450	283508	57
Technical Assistance																
Budget A	25866	32580	35556	32898	124900	128754	-3854	-3	412823	397737	-15086	-4	538883	397737	141146	74
Budget B	706	1592	0	0	2298	0	2298	0	168745	158141	-10604	-6	168745	158141	10604	94
Sub-total	24572	34172	35556	32898	127198	128754	-1556	-1	581568	555878	-25690	-4	707628	555878	151750	79
Overhead/Adm (A/D)	9755	12415	40987	12692	75849	76058	-209	0	263229	262033	-1196	0	312813	262033	50780	84
TOTAL EXPENDITURE	121812	127225	211852	116814	577703	656524	-78821	-12	2142631	2005354	-137277	-6	2870680	2005354	865326	70

Best Available Document

spent; 70% of total project funding has been spent. At that time, the project was approximately 72% complete (43 of a scheduled 60 month total). The status of each budget component is outlined below.

A/A Regional Program

This budget component contains the income and expenditure managed directly by the CCCU for its own operations and to provide services to its member organizations. As of the first evaluation, the regional program budget was approximately 24% over budget at December 1981. This situation has been dramatically turned around as review of 1982 and 1983 figures shows. At year-end 1982, expenditure was 5% under the budgeted total, and at year-end 1983, it was 1% under budget on a project-to-date basis. Earned income in 1983 totalled US\$49,225 or 19.6% of total operating expenses. Project-to-date earned income of CCCU has totalled 20.5% of project expenditure. This income has consisted primarily of dues, indirect cost recoveries from sub-projects, training fees and sales to leagues, credit unions and others. On a budget-to-date basis, CCCU has performed better than budget in terms of both its own generated income and in cost control. Earned income exceeded budget figures by 6.4% or US\$10,004; expenses were under targets by 1% or US\$9,468.

This budget component is expected to increase during the remainder of Phase I due to the recently approved training officers project which will enable CCCU to add two field workers to its training department staff. This increase in the regional program budget will be slightly offset by a transfer of funds to cover CCCU's requested extension of the training advisor's term of service in Barbados.

A/B Country Development Projects

The country development program was under budget by 74% at the end of 1981. However, as the participating leagues have become capable of effectively utilizing these funds, disbursements have been increased. At the end of 1982, the component was 15% under budget and at year-end 1983, 42%; on a budget-to-date basis about 51% of total funds have been spent. Scheduled disbursements over the remainder of Phase I are expected to be on budget. As of year-end 1983, five country development grants were over 75% disbursed, four were between 50% and 75%, and three were between 25% and 50%. Sixteen percent of the development fund was disbursed. Two CDP's did not have budgets.

A/C Technical Assistance

Technical assistance has been close to budgeted figures since the staff was increased in 1982. This component was 25.5% under budget at year-end 1981 reducing to 9% under in 1982, 3% under in 1983 and 4% under on a project-to-date basis.

This component will increase about 13% in response to the CCCU request to extend the training advisor as noted previously.

A/D Administrative Recovery

This component is almost exactly on budget with a variance of less than 1/2 of 1%. This component will also increase in response to the extension of the training advisor and incorporation of the training officer project in the regional program.

B/A Dominica Technical Assistance

This component has been largely completed and stands at 6% under budget at year-end 1983.

B/B Dominica League Support (CDP)

The Dominica country development project grant remains in progress and was 1% under budget at year-end 1983; 92% of the funds for this component have been disbursed.

B. IMPLEMENTATION ACTIVITIES AND OBJECTIVES

The completion status of the intermediate project objectives and activities contained in the program description of the grant agreements is summarized below. The specific status of individual output indicators is shown in Appendix 4. The completion percentage shown

below for each intermediate objective is the average of the completion percentages of the individual output indicator and tasks corresponding to that objective.

CCCU Organization Development:

1. Management Systems

Complete documentation of headquarters management systems for:

- a) finance - 89% complete;
- b) operations - 61% complete;
- c) office administration - 74% complete;
- d) personnel - 90% complete;
- e) Country Development Program management, monitoring and administration - 97% complete.

2. Planning

- a) institutional analysis of member organizations - 93% complete;
- b) 5-year regional development and self-sufficiency plan (1985-1990) - 50% complete.

3. CDP Management

Implement and review CDP's through monitoring system and on-site visits - 85% in place; 201 visits have been made to countries; 8 reports are received regularly, 2 are no more than 2 months late, and 4 are long overdue.

4. Management Information Systems

Design a management information system to gather data on project implementation and performance from credit unions and leagues - 25% complete.

CCCU Service Development:

1. Training

- a) subregional courses - 100% of courses conducted as scheduled;
- b) on the job training - on-going;
- c) system for identifying and co-ordinating resource personnel - 58% complete;
- d) regional training courses - 66% complete;
- e) training activity and participant evaluation - 51% complete.

2. Institutional Analysis and Planning

- a) IA process completed and submitted to Board of Directors - 93% complete;
- b) assist each member country to design and document long-range development plans - 54% complete;
- c) assist credit union leagues in preparation of annual work plan, train staff and volunteers in planning process - 47% complete;
- d) document planning manual - 50% complete.

3. Standard Guidelines and Models

- a) league and credit union operating manuals - 26% complete;
- b) marketing of manuals - 20% of material produced and marketed;
- c) technical papers - 90% complete.

4. Insurance

- a) co-ordinate development of comprehensive insurance program - process initiated;
- b) review alternative insurance services available - 50% complete;

5. Standard Forms

Review and revise standard league and credit union forms - 89% complete.

6. Resource Mobilization

a) design and document resource mobilization strategy - 75% complete;

b) project development for member countries - 85% complete.

7. Audit Monitoring

Design and document audit monitoring program - 100% at league level; credit union audit level inadequate.

8. Central Finance

a) design and document central finance facility base - 35% complete;

b) develop national credit union central finance facilities - 34% complete; Dominica and Jamaica have central finance facility in place. Grenada is preparing facility. Central finance not feasible in three other territories.

Dominica Organization Development

1. Management Systems:

- a) financial management - 89% complete;
- b) operations management systems - 86% complete;
- c) personnel systems - 80% complete;
- d) office administration - 80% complete.

2. Identify needs of credit unions post-Hurricane David

- a) identification - 100% complete;
- b) feasibility studies - 100% complete.

3. Prepare medium and long-term development plans including resource mobilization strategies - 77% complete.

4. Develop financial work plans for project implementation integrated with league planning - 93% complete.

5. Design agricultural lending program - 73% complete

C. DEVELOPMENT INDICATORS

Data for the development indicators are shown in Table 3. These data are derived from CCCU operating reports presented in the regular quarterly progress reports as well as special reports prepared for

Table No. 3

PROJECT INDICATORS STATUS AT DECEMBER, 1983

<u>INDICATORS</u>	<u>1980</u>	<u>1981</u>	<u>1982</u>	<u>1983</u>	<u>TOTAL TO 12/83</u>	<u>PHASE I TARGET</u>	<u>PERCENT TARGET</u>	<u>PROJECTION TO 7/85</u>
<u>Membership</u>								
Total Members.....	397,300	433,870	471,240	513,660 ⁽³⁾	513,660 ⁽³⁾	572,500	90%	585,570
Members Rec'd Training (2).....		195	760	2,400	3,355	22,000	15%	
<u>Credit Unions</u>								
Savings (1).....U.S.\$	139,445	218,880	278,295	320,100 ⁽³⁾	320,100 ⁽³⁾	391,000	82%	400,125
Loans Outstanding (1).....U.S.\$	139,800	217,100	267,250	307,400 ⁽³⁾	307,400 ⁽³⁾	366,000	84%	385,000
Assets (1).....U.S.\$	157,380	243,865	308,380	354,640 ⁽³⁾	354,640 ⁽³⁾	398,000	89%	440,000
Reserves (1).....U.S.\$	10,195	9,405	9,995	10,590 ⁽³⁾	10,590 ⁽³⁾	13,000	81%	12,000
Gross Income (1).....U.S.\$	--	--	--	--	--	24,000	--	--
Managers/Staff Trained.....	--	29	86	120	235	1,050	22%	
Directors/Committee Members Trained..	--	450	1,000	1,505	2,505	4,650	54%	
<u>Leagues</u>								
With Full-time Management.....	4	11	13	15	15	12	125%	
Credit Union Affiliation Rate.(%)....	--	--	--	--	--	95	--	
Country Projects Completed.....	0	0	0	1	1	6	17%	
Country Projects in Progress.....	2	9	12	13	13	7	186%	
Managers/Fieldworkers/Staff Trained..	--	26	73	87	207	16	1294%	
Treasurers/Directors/Committee Members Trained.....	--	54	96	105	255	320	80%	
<u>CCCU</u>								
Staff Trained.....	0	3	2	1	6	11	55%	
Directors Trained.....	0	3	7	7	17	15	113%	
League Affiliation Rate.....	--	--	--	100%	100%	100%	100%	
Ratio Dues Income to Total Expenses..	--	14.1%	13.4%	14.4%	14.4%	20%	72%	

NOTE: (1) Monetary data in thousands of U.S. dollars
(2) Data represent CCCU member institutions.
(3) Estimates

Training data are for participants in CCCU, League or Credit Union Courses.

the evaluation. The Phase I target indicator values are shown as presented in the November 1982 project revisions document approved by the funding agencies in early 1983.

Review of the indicators shows that CCCU is making accelerated achievement of its objectives in most areas. The project at the time of the evaluation was approximately 70% complete and it will be noted that most indicators exceed this value in the "percent target" column. Numbers alone do not tell the whole story, but they do reflect the quantity of achievement of CCCU's development objectives. The quality of the project's achievement is more accurately reflected in the improved operating capabilities and services of the leagues as well as the growth and development of the credit unions themselves.

1. Membership

Membership growth has exceeded figures with the target already 90% complete based on year-end 1983 estimates. On the other hand, the training of members is considerably under the project figure at only 15% of the expected 22,000 members educated in their basic rights and responsibilities as credit union members. This number is low because there is still relatively little education of members by credit unions. This was confirmed in the country surveys and is probably the result of a lack of paid managers in many credit unions. Basic member education, particularly for new members and for members making their first loan, is typically the responsibility of the manager in credit unions in

the developing world. Without paid managers, credit unions must rely on inadequately functioning volunteer education committees and little member education is done.

2. Credit Unions

As with membership, most of the financial variables are considerably in excess of the expected Phase I totals. This appears to reflect a basic change in the growth trends which the project is achieving, in many if not all, territories. Income estimates are not generally available but an increasing number of credit unions are now being audited, generating dividends and interest refunds and appear to be improving their gross earnings. In the training area, the managers/staff trained indicator stands at only 22% of the projected value. This is due largely to a lack of data since statistics on the training by leagues of their affiliated credit unions' staff and leaders are not yet systematically collected and passed on to CCCU. The evaluation showed that weekend and sometimes longer seminars and courses are frequently given by many leagues. It is quite possible that the actual number of credit union staff trained by the league exceeds the target figure.

3. Leagues

Most league indicators exceed the project completion percentage with the major exception being country projects completed, which stands at only 17%. As noted previously however, nine of these projects are already over 50% complete. The high degree of completion of league staff trained reflects CCCU's concentration on train-the-trainers. It also reflects a technical disparity between the number of people trained and the number of course participants; it is clear that virtually all active league employees in CDP countries have received CCCU training.

4. CCCU

The staff training indicator understates the degree of training of current staff of CCCU due to inclusion in the target value of trained but departed employees. All CCCU staff have received considerable on-the-job training from leagues, particularly Jamaica, and the WOCCU advisors. This training has been complemented by the Coady advisor and other support from WOCCU and CUNA Mutual.

D. PROJECT IMPACT

This section reports on the project impact as measured by the evaluation team in the country surveys and analysis of CCCU statistical reports. Just as the first evaluation concentrated on the level of

TABLE 4

DISTRIBUTION OF LOANS GRANTED BY PURPOSE
SAMPLE DATA FROM 1983 EVALUATION SURVEY
 (Expressed in US\$)

<u>Purposes</u>	<u>Dominica*</u>	<u>St Lucia</u>	<u>St Chris- Nevis</u>	<u>Barbados</u>	<u>St Vincent*</u>	<u>Grenada</u>	<u>Antigua</u>	<u>Total</u>	<u>Percent of Sample</u>
Housing	1,252,168	3,126	48,108	885,857	94,327	12,370	19,370	2,315,326	45
Health, Educatn, Prov.	37,089	333	3,219	68,393	34,806	1,081	9,443	154,364	3
Household	159,574	1,209	16,263	85,650	60,160	3,859	10,741	337,756	7
Vehicles	313,195	741	31,757	285,530	71,240	6,111	16,426	725,000	14
Debt Cons, Refinance	738,674	0	36,376	95,359	33,019	43,780	10,481	957,689	19
Agriculture	48,408	0	18,353	0	31,456	593	2,963	101,773	2
Business, Production	215,697	0	34,141	9,409	7,840	296	1,019	268,401	5
Other	110,026	0	4,224	25,169	65,727	2,593	33,624	241,363	5
TOTAL	2,874,831	5,409	192,441	1,455,366	398,575	70,683	104,067	5,101,372	100

PERCENTAGE DISTRIBUTION

<u>Purposes</u>	<u>Dominica*</u>	<u>St Lucia</u>	<u>St Chris- Nevis</u>	<u>Barbados</u>	<u>St Vincent*</u>	<u>Grenada</u>	<u>Antigua</u>	<u>Average Percent Share</u>
Housing	44	58	25	61	24	18	19	35
Health, Educatn, Prov.	1	6	2	5	9	2	9	5
Household	6	22	8	6	15	5	10	10
Vehicles	11	14	17	20	18	9	16	15
Debt Cons, Refinance	26	0	19	7	8	62	10	19
Agriculture	2	0	10	0	8	1	3	3
Business, Production	8	0	18	1	2	0	1	4
Other	4	0	2	2	16	4	32	9
TOTAL	100	100	100	100	100	100	100	100

NOTE: Data are for 1983 except Dominica and St Vincent which are for 1982.

development at the CCCU headquarters the second evaluation focuses on development at the leagues and credit unions where the project is now producing a widespread and consistent improvement and expansion of credit union services to members. Project impact was evaluated by the team in relation to each of the purpose or goal level objectives stated in the USAID and CIDA grant agreements. The team's findings for each objective are summarized below.

1. CIDA: The general objective of this project is to improve living standards of low-income people in the Caribbean region by developing a strong credit union movement in 15 Caribbean countries.

Finding: The project is clearly strengthening the movement's capability to help members improve their standard of living. Credit unions help people improve their standard of living primarily through the granting of loans for provident and productive purposes. Provident loans are those for health, education, and other basic family needs; these are estimated to have increased during the project period by 102%, rising from US\$55.7 million in 1978 to US\$112.4 million at year-end 1982. These estimates are based on the evaluation's survey of credit purpose data at the credit union level. The percentage distribution of loans granted for each purpose is shown in Table 4. The amount of credit for each purpose is estimated by multiplying the percent share times total loans outstanding. This dramatic increase demonstrates the deep involvement of credit unions in the community-level economic system. Clearly the

TABLE NO.5

GROWTH IN SAVINGS - MEMBERS - AVERAGE PER MEMBER SAVINGS

	1979			1982		
	NO. OF MEMBERS	TOTAL SAVINGS	AV. PER MEMBER	NO. OF MEMBER	TOTAL SAVINGS	AV. PER MEMBER
Antigua (1)	563	\$ 75,000	\$133	726	\$ 137,328	\$ 189
Barbados	5,601	1,765,980	315	7,269	2,956,861	407
Dominica	23,130	2,741,444	119	31,160	5,009,499	161
Grenada	5,510	937,652	170	5,356	1,675,541	313
Montserrat (2)	460	55,996	122	550	59,198	108
St. Kitts-Nevis	447	39,094	87	868	139,741	161
St. Lucia	4,000	958,646	240	5,600	1,260,908	225
St. Vincent	2,786	350,931	126	3,854	676,926	176
Belize	11,463	1,591,210	139	11,915	1,754,424	147
Cayman Islands	589	335,061	569	816	1,161,933	1,423
Guyana	30,935	4,054,977	131	29,124	7,409,299	254
Suriname	6,580	1,959,922	298	7,500	3,101,143	413
Bahamas	2,000	450,000	225	3,800	2,371,800	624
Trinidad	99,187	42,500,000	428	110,600	129,099,486	1,167
Jamaica	171,100	60,819,926	355	252,109	121,590,357	482
TOTALS	364,351	\$118,635,879	\$325	471,247	\$278,404,444	\$ 590

NOTES

(1) Antigua: figures for 1981 to 1983

(2) Monserrat: figures for 1981 to 1982

population feels that credit unions are important to meeting their standard of living needs; member growth was 9% per year during the 1979-1982 period, resulting in a membership increase of nearly 107,000.

2. USAID: The purpose of this grant is to provide support for a program to support the increased mobilization of local savings and the channelling of these funds back into productive and provident investments by Caribbean credit union members and their families.

Finding: The CCCU, it's leagues and credit unions have actively supported the mobilization of savings by the system. The annual percentage growth rate of savings increased from 26% to 33% during the project period, as compared to the pre-project period and there were substantial increases in the annual growth of total savings in all but two territories. This is shown in Table 5. Average savings per member nearly doubled during the project period, rising from US\$325 to US\$590 for an 82% gain. The average account grew by 22% per year in 1979-1982, three times the pre-project 1974-1978 rate of 7% per year. Overall, the system mobilized an additional US\$160 million in savings during 1979-1982, an increase of 135%, as shown in Table 6.

Lending also increased with the annual growth rate rising from 29% per year in the pre-project period to 31% per year in the project period. Total lending of the system increased from \$99.4

TABLE NO. 6

GROWTH COMPARISON

	<u>Total Loans*</u>	<u>Total Members</u>	<u>Total Savings*</u>	<u>Average Savings Per Member</u>
<u>PROJECT PERIOD</u> <u>1979-1982 (3 years)</u>				
Annual percent growth rate	31%	9%	33%	22%
Numerical increase	\$147,229	\$106,896	\$159,768	\$265
Percentage increase	123%	29%	135%	82%
<u>PRE-PROJECT PERIOD</u> <u>1974-1978 (4 years)</u>				
Annual percent growth rate	29%	15%	26%	7%
Numerical increase	\$ 63,118	\$149,354	\$ 59,361	\$ 83
Percentage increase	174%	83%	153%	39%

* Amounts in thousands of U.S. dollars.

million in 1978 to \$267.5 million in 1982. Lending to members for production purposes per both the pre-project design sample and the evaluation survey maintained the same basic percentage of total lending, about 15%. This includes loans for agriculture, business and other production, and half of vehicle loans. The vehicle estimate is based on interviews with credit union officials during the evaluation since a more detailed breakdown of vehicle loans was not available.

Maintenance of this level of productive lending is noteworthy given the fairly deep recession in which most of the territories found themselves during the project period. In such times the percentage of production loans would normally be expected to decrease. In fact, the actual amount of production oriented lending by credit unions, increased from about \$18.0 million in 1978, to \$40.1 million in 1982 - an increase of 123%. The project has supported increases in productive credit through three major developments at the credit union level: improvements in management capabilities of credit unions; implementation of fairly standard, comprehensive written loan policies throughout the region; and access to external funds through CCCU's regional resource mobilization program supported by CDF. See Table 7 on lending activity.

3. CIDA: To develop the institutional capabilities of the Caribbean credit union system at the local, national, and regional levels, so that by 1985, more than 500 local credit unions, 15 national

TABLE NO. 7

PROJECT PERIOD LOANS OUTSTANDING GROWTH
(U.S. Dollars)

	1979 LOANS OUTSTANDING	1982 LOANS OUTSTANDING	PERCENT ANNUAL GROWTH
Antigua (1)	\$ 77,384	\$ 145,926	24%
Barbados	1,809,320	2,826,679	16
Dominica	2,303,559	4,307,363	23
Grenada	1,018,868	1,746,454	20
Montserrat (3)	47,424	50,073	6
St. Kitts/Nevis	33,622	105,128	46
St. Lucia	610,902	1,132,832	23
St. Vincent	172,084	685,446	59
Belize	1,580,317	1,754,423	4
Cayman	341,490	1,258,812	54
Guyana	3,177,975	6,339,969	26
Suriname	1,783,087	1,952,572	3
Bahamas	400,000	2,010,000	71
Jamaica	59,947,782	120,250,513	26
Trinidad/Tobago	46,666,667	122,711,537	38
TOTALS	\$119,970,481	\$267,277,727	31%

<u>Estimated Productive Credit</u>	<u>1979</u>		<u>1982</u>	
	<u>Percent</u>	<u>Amount (3)</u>	<u>Percent</u>	<u>Amount (3)</u>
Business & Other Production	7	\$ 8.4	4	\$10.7
Agriculture	1	1.2	3	8.0
Vehicles	<u>7</u>	<u>8.4</u>	<u>8</u>	<u>21.4</u>
	15	\$18.0	15	\$40.1

NOTES

- (1) Antigua: figures for 1981 to 1983
(2) Montserrat: figures for 1981 to 1982
(3) Amount in millions

credit union institutions and the CCCU will be functioning effectively to serve the needs of credit union members.

Regional

At the regional level, CCCU has evolved from a largely promotional and representational organization into a development and financial services provider. Since the first evaluation, the CCCU has developed internal capabilities and external services. In addition to training, technical assistance is now being provided in-country by CCCU staff, the WOCCU advisors, a Coady advisor, and two CUSO volunteers in addition to Caribbean credit unionists under the regional exchange program. In the area of resource mobilization, CCCU has implemented its development foundation and has assisted member leagues and credit unions to mobilize substantial funds for sub-projects. The manuals component of CCCU's service portfolio has produced the model loan policy which has been utilized by most of the affiliated movements in developing their own standard policies, the country development program implementation manual and the Credit Union promotional booklet. As noted previously, these services were largely unavailable only two years ago, and were completely nonexistent at the start of the project.

National

The improved capabilities at the national level are demonstrated by the high level of league participation in the country development program. All member leagues now have offices and full-time credit union development and managerial personnel; accounts are largely up-to-date and audits are being performed on a timely basis; annual general meetings are now being held to bring together movement leaders in each territory to address their development needs. Central finance has begun in Dominica, Grenada will shortly initiate its service and St. Vincent and St. Lucia are in earlier stages of development.

Local

More credit unions throughout the region now have offices and employed staff though many do not yet have employed managers. Committees are substantially more active. Annual general meetings are being held, audits conducted and dividends and rebates paid for the first time in some cases. New capital city credit unions with a territorial focus have been organized in Antigua and Barbados. Loan policies are now largely in place and there is an increasing focus on productive lending. Credit unions are developing new savings instruments including current accounts and fixed deposits. The development at the credit union level is borne out by the dramatic increases in the credit union movement's total savings, loans,

assets, and membership throughout the region. In only limited cases have there been declines, and these appear largely due to external conditions in particular territories.

4. USAID: To assist the Caribbean Confederation of Credit Unions (CCCU) to assist member credit union leagues to design and implement successful development programs for member credit unions.

Finding: The CCCU is assisting its member credit union leagues to develop credit union capabilities largely through its country development projects (CDPs) and regional train-the-trainer program. The CDPs partially finance league operations, including technical and managerial staff, training and fieldwork programs. The train-the-trainers program focuses on enabling league credit union development officers (CUDOs) and field workers to train individual credit union staff in improved operations. This involves on-site technical assistance by league staff and other, including CUSO volunteers, and the preparation and distribution of manuals and written guidelines. Leagues are giving seminars for credit union leaders on a variety of managerial topics. The CCCU and leagues are also assisting credit unions to build joint offices.

5. USAID: To assist member credit union leagues to develop their affiliates' management capabilities to provide services to credit union members.

Finding: Development of managerial capabilities at the credit union level is primarily addressed through CCCU's train-the-trainers program. Models have been developed and are being employed in the areas of loan policy, standardized accounting, and planning. The number of credit union development officers and other league staff available to assist credit unions in developing management, has increased from three in the pre-project period to over 15 at the end of 1983. The major area in which improved credit union management is leading to new services is in savings mobilization, where most surveyed credit unions are now beginning to offer new types of savings instruments. Insurance services are being maintained. Some credit unions have initiated bill payment services and foreign exchange transactions.

6. CIDA: To train over 27,700 credit union leaders, staff and members in credit union operations.

Finding: CCCU and its member leagues are providing extensive training services throughout the region as noted in Section B, Project Indicators. At the CCCU and national level the number to be trained as staff, directors and committee members is not large and therefore a substantial percentage of the targeted groups have received training. For example, the training of CCCU directors has been complete, but because of the democratic nature of the organization training will continue to update current directors as well as to train those coming on the board for the

first time. Similarly with directors and committee members at the League level. The training of such groups at the local level is more difficult because of the much larger group scattered over fifteen territories. The number of those trained reached 2505 at December 1983 which is 54 percent of the total target, which can be judged a significant number to reach for training in the three year period from 1981 to 1983 inclusive.

At the credit union level the training of members is both difficult to do and likewise difficult to measure. What is referred to as training for members is more of the nature of membership education rather than training per se. Some of this is unstructured such as the education imparted to a borrowing member by a credit union manager, loan officer or credit committee, but usually no statistics are kept of such activities. The distribution of literature such as "The Credit Union and You" is educational for those who read it, but it is difficult to measure unless one measures it in the terms of the total distribution of the leaflet. Likewise certain types of advertising or news releases may be considered educational but these items are not usually included in assessing the degree of member training or education. However the evaluation team was satisfied that, even though the numbers recorded as having received training is low (3,355 or 15% of target) it is significant and actually considerably higher than the figures would indicate. The much increased public awareness of credit unions would suggest that a great deal of information on credit unions is being disseminated.

7. CIDA: To ensure, by 1985, that the CCCU and 11 affiliated national leagues will have achieved complete technical self-sufficiency in their essential management functions, and that at least six affiliated leagues will have achieved financial self-sufficiency.

Technical Self-Sufficiency:

Finding: Technical self-sufficiency is defined here as the ability of the CCCU and the leagues to meet their basic management and service needs. CCCU is already largely self-sufficient technically. It has a well trained and dedicated staff and a good board and could carry on its current operations technically without difficulty.

The evaluation team, after reviewing the country surveys and visiting with seven of the participating territories concludes that not more than five will be technically self-sufficient by end of project in '85. Essential management systems are in place in all leagues and a satisfactory job is being done, but most will be unable to maintain a reasonable standard of operations without external technical assistance. The five that will be self-sufficient are Dominica, Cayman Islands, Nevis/St. Kitts, Montserrat and Jamaica. Of these Montserrat, Antigua, and Nevis/St. Kitts may very well develop an alternative type of league fulfilling a representational purpose only. In these three territories there are very few credit unions and larger

TABLE NO. 8

COMPARATIVE ATTAINMENT OF SELF-SUFFICIENCY TARGETS

	Technical Self-Sufficiency		Financial Self-Sufficiency				1983 Percent Earned Income to Total Costs
	Planned	Actual	Complete (100%)		Partial (50%)		
			Planned	Actual	Planned	Actual	
Trinidad	x				x	x	100%
Jamaica	x	x	x	x			100%
Guyana	x						53%
Suriname	x		x				68%
Barbados	x						22%
Dominica	x	x	x	x			58%
Belize	x		x				39%
Grenada	x		x				41%
St. Lucia	x				x		23%
Bahamas	x						20%
Antigua	x				x	x	15%
St. Vincent	x		x				77%
St. Kitts/Nevis	x	x	x	x			100%
Montserrat	x	x			x	x	6%
Cayman Islands	<u>x</u>	<u>x</u>	<u> </u>	<u> </u>	<u> </u>	<u>x</u>	100%
TOTAL	15	5	7	3	4	4	

NOTE

- (1) This table shows those countries planned to achieve financial and/or technical self-sufficiency with an "x" in the "Planned" column. Those countries judged able to actually achieve the target by 1985 have an "x" in the corresponding "Actual" column.
- (2) Shows actual earned income as a percent of total operative costs.

island-wide credit unions are being developed which could adequately service the entire territory, thus making it unnecessary to try to develop a traditional league. Table 8 shows which CCCU affiliates are currently expected to be technically self-sufficient by the end of 1985.

Credit unions also are self-sufficient at a minimum level. What is needed is upgrading of their technical skills to a true financial management level. Currently, most credit unions are dependent on auditors to prepare their final accounts and government co-operative officers or league field workers to prepare periodic trial balances.

Financial Self-Sufficiency:

Finding: Financial self-sufficiency is defined here as the ability to meet operating costs from earned revenues. By the end of Phase I of the project, six leagues other than Jamaica were scheduled to reach 100% financial self-sufficiency, and four were to be at least 50% self-sufficient. It appears likely that three of those scheduled to be 100% self-sufficient are likely to reach their target, and that three of those scheduled to reach 50% will reach that target.

The CCCU and its leagues need to re-examine the question of financial viability - in other words, how long will it take to become financially self-sufficient given the increased skills and

corresponding costs of becoming technically self-sufficient. Expenditures have grown with the capabilities whereas income has lagged in many cases. By the end of 1983, four CCCU affiliates were 100% self-supporting, four met between 50% and 100% of their costs, and seven were less than 50% self-sufficient, as shown by Table 8. It appears that leagues are now developing the service capabilities necessary to justify dues increases and thus, reaching the financial self-sufficiency targets can be expected to accelerate over the next 2-3 years. However, because of the low potential number of credit unions and credit union members it will be difficult to become self-sufficient exclusively on the basis of dues income. Therefore, self-sufficiency in all cases will be closely related to developing and successfully operating central financial facilities that will generate additional income and bear a portion of the operating costs of maintaining a league and the third tier organization, the CCCU. Financial self-sufficiency for CCCU depends greatly upon the leagues or an alternative organization in each of the territories being self-sufficient.

CCCU met about 20% of its 1983 operating costs from non-regional project grant sources, and thus has partially achieved its revised self-sufficiency target of 30% specified in the confederation's mission statement. In order to increase its earned income, the CCCU is developing a revised dues schedule, a new investment policy and is examining alternative income sources.

TABLE NO. 9

COMPARATIVE MEMBERSHIP GROWTH
Project Period 1979-1982

	Total Membership		1979-82 Percent Growth Rate Per Year	Membership Growth Per Year		Percent Change
	1979	1982		1979-82	1974-79	
Antigua (1)	563	726	29%	163	52	213%
Barbados	5,601	7,269	9	556	198	180
Dominica	23,130	31,160	10	2,677	2,166	24
Grenada	5,510	5,356	-1	-51	292	-118
Montserrat (1)	460	550	20	90	7	1,264
St. Kitts/Nevis	447	868	25	140	51	173
St. Lucia	4,000	5,600	12	533	454	17
St. Vincent	2,786	3,854	11	356	273	31
Belize	11,463	11,915	1	151	162	-7
Cayman	589	816	11	76	NA	NA
Guyana	30,935	29,124	-2	-604	1,765	-134
Suriname	6,580	7,500	4	307	533	-42
Bahamas	2,000	3,800	24	600	NA	NA
Jamaica	171,100	252,109	14	27,003	20,584	31
Trinidad/Tobago	99,187	110,600	4	3,804	9,837	-61
TOTALS	364,351	471,247	9	35,632	36,837	-3

(1) Figures for 1981 instead of 1979.

Nevertheless, CCCU will continue to need external funding during the next five years in order to provide the development services required by the regional credit union system.

8. Growth

USAID: To assist individual credit unions to increase membership, to mobilize member savings, and to provide timely and low cost credit services.

CIDA: To increase credit union membership in the Caribbean region from 330,000 to 572,500 by 1985; to increase the annual rate of growth of savings, loans, assets, and reserves of Caribbean credit unions by at least 10%.

Finding: As noted in the project indicators section, CCCU and its affiliated credit unions are exceeding most growth targets set in the revised project design. This is a result of the increased growth rates shown by CCCU statistics through the end of 1982. The annual growth in membership has increased more than the targeted 10% in eight territories, plus two which were not included in the original project design. Declines in annual membership growth were experienced in five territories; this information is shown in Table 9, Cooperative Membership Growth. Negative growth was experienced in Grenada and Guyana where political and economic pressures may have affected the population's ability to join credit unions and generate additional

TABLE NO. 10

COMPARATIVE SAVINGS GROWTH RATES

	Percent Growth Rates (1)		Percent (2) Change in Growth Rate	Increase in Rate		Decrease in Growth Rate
	Pre-Project 1974-78	Project 1979-82		Greater Than 10%	Less Than 10%	
Trinidad	18	45	150	x		
Jamaica(3)	18	26	45	x		
Guyana	18	22	23	x		
Suriname	69	17	-76			x
Barbados	10	19	83	x		
Dominica	22	22	1		x	
Belize	-3	3	NA	x		
Grenada	21	21	2			
St. Lucia	31	10	-69		x	x
Bahamas	NA	74	NA			
Antigua	15	35	143	x		
St. Vincent	19	24	28	x		
St. Kitts/Nevis	34	53	56	x		
Montserrat	3	6	76	x		
Cayman Islands	<u>NA</u>	<u>51</u>	<u>NA</u>			
TOTALS	26	33	26			

NOTES

(1) Rounded

(2) Based on unrounded percentage rates

(3) Pre-project growth based on U.S. dollar equivalents, not local currency growth.

savings. In Belize, membership in the movement may not have declined, but rather shifted from affiliated credit unions to a large, non-affiliated one. In Trinidad and Tobago it appears that the data supplied may understate actual growth substantially.

The savings growth rate increased substantially during the project period rising from 26% to 33% per year. The annual growth rate of savings increased by more than the targeted 10% in nine territories, two had increases less than 10% and four experienced declines in their percentage growth rates. These data are shown in Table 10, Cooperative Savings Growth Rates.

The annual growth rate of lending by credit unions was up 7% in the project period over the pre-project period, rising from 29% per year to an annual growth rate of 31%. While this growth rate is somewhat less than the targeted 10%, the actual rates are so high that credit unions have been able to maintain a high level of credit service to members in the region. Total outstanding credit in the region increased by 122.8% during the period. Growth of loans outstanding for the project period is shown in Table No. 7.

9. Dominica Sub-Project (USAID): To strengthen and provide support to the Dominica Credit Union League and affiliated credit unions, in order that the credit union movement can assist in Dominica's reconstruction after Hurricane David.

Finding: These objectives have been largely completed as reported in the WOCCU Technical Assistance Report of February 1983. Credit unions in Dominica played a key role in the reconstruction effort through the USAID materials distribution program and the league acted as a vehicle for financial assistance to the banana growers from the Co-operative Development Foundation. The league is now operating an expanded central finance program which has three loans outstanding, primarily for agricultural and business credit. Its basic systems, policies and accounting manual are all well documented. The Dominica league is clearly one of the CDP leaders in reaching technical self-sufficiency in the region.

10. Other Impact Areas of Interest:

Employment

Substantial gains in credit union employment appear to have been generated during the project period. Unfortunately, however, the majority of this employment seems to have been in the area of clerical staff as opposed to employed managers. While this assists credit unions to meet normal service needs of members, the lack of professional managers is a critical constraint to continued development.

Women in Development

Women's participation was found to be quite high throughout the movement. Women's membership was typically in excess of 50% and there were also relatively high levels of participation in leagues and credit unions at the leadership level. The Caribbean is a leader in offering participation to women, both as employees and as leaders.

Throughout the region, women are active leaders on committees and boards at the local credit union level. Credit union and league employees are predominantly female. This is closely linked to the fact that most full-time employees are clerical. In Dominica, Trinidad, Guyana and Jamaica for example, over 75% of the full-time employees at the credit union and league levels are female. In the region, 19 out of 114 League directors, or 17% are women.

The current level of women's employment and board involvement at the League level is shown in Table No. 11. Women's participation at the credit union level as found in surveyed credit unions during the evaluation is shown in Table No. 12.

At the CCCU level, there was not a great deal of participation by women on boards and committees and no women are involved in management at this level.

TABLE NO. 11

WOMEN'S PARTICIPATION IN CREDIT UNION LEAGUES

	Directors			Staff			
	Total Directors	Women Directors	Percent Women	Women Managers/ CUDOs	Women Staff	Total Staff	Percent Women
Trinidad & Tobago	18	2	11%	N/A	4	6	60%
Jamaica	15	1	7	0	19	40	47.5
Guyana	7	3	43	2	5	6	83
Surinam	7	2	29	--	3	5	60
Barbados	5	2	40	--	1	2	50
Dominica	9	0	0	--	2	5	40
Belize	6	2	33	1	1	2	50
Grenada	15	2	13	--	3	4	75
St. Lucia	12	0	0	0	2	2	100
Bahamas	7	2	29	1	1	1	100
Antigua	7	2	29	1	2	2	100
St. Vincent	6	1	17	1	1	1	100
TOTALS	114	19	17%	6	44	76	58%

TABLE NO. 12

WOMEN'S PARTICIPATION AT CREDIT UNION LEVEL
1983 Evaluation

	Membership			Leadership		Employment	
	/ Total Members	/ Women Members	Percent Women	Total Directors	Women Directors	Women Managers	Women Staff
Guyana	29,200	5,800	20%	NA	8	1	19
Barbados	9,800	5,840	60	5	2	N/A	9
Dominica	31,172	18,703	60	198	55	1 out of 8	29 out of 42
Grenada	5,700	2,800	57	NA	10	1	8
St. Lucia	5,600	2,800	50	NA	8		4
Antigua	1,072	608	57	NA	13	--	--
St. Vincent	3,672	2,078	56	NA	10	1	8½
St. Kitts/Nevis	1,104	830	75	7	1	1	3
TOTALS	87,320	39,459	45%	210	107	5	80½

Youth

Relatively low levels of participation by young people in the credit union system was a frequently cited problem. Credit union leadership is typically middle-aged and there is concern whether a new group of leaders is coming through the ranks. This fear seems somewhat allayed by experience in the new, large capital city credit unions where young professionals seem to be taking the lead. On another level, CCCU is aiding several leagues in developing school credit union programs so that young people are familiarized with the services and operation of credit unions.

Project Cost Effectiveness

The CCCU development program is considered to be operating as effectively as possible given the problems of implementing a regional project in a depressed economic environment. As noted previously, most targets are being met ahead of schedule and clear gains have been achieved in developing the institutional capabilities of the leagues, the CCCU and at the credit union level. Total project cost has increased during the life of the period primarily due to additional funding mobilized by CCCU for its field programs. It appears that the cost per beneficiary originally estimated in the project design, will be achieved in part due to greater than expected growth in the beneficiary group.

As of year end 1983, the cost per beneficiary of the project was US\$3.90 (total cost of US\$2,005,354 divided by total membership of 513,660).

The movement mobilized approximately US\$41.1 million more in total savings for 1979 to 1982 due to its increased annual growth rate of 33% than it would have mobilized at the pre-project savings growth rate of 26% per year. The ratio of this increase in the total savings pool divided by total project cost through December 1983 is 20.49 (US\$41,087,000 divided by US\$ 2,005,000). This substantially exceeds the pre-project estimate of US\$11.52 per donor dollar. Project cost as a percent of this net increase in savings is 4.9%.

Total administrative costs of WOCCU and CDF represented about 13% of total project cost (US\$262,033 divided by US\$2005,354) and about 64 basis points (0.64%) of the net additional savings mobilized during the project period (US\$262,033 divided by US\$41,087,000).

Human Development*

The evaluation team was able to take a good look at the Caribbean Credit Union Project at all levels during a recent period of three weeks. In that period of time eight territories were visited and on each, visits were made to the leagues, credit unions (large and small, urban and rural) and government co-op departments. A good cross-section of directors, committee members and staff were interviewed at length. Financial statements, management systems material and other training and educational literature was examined. Problems of implementation were discussed and plans for the future explored. In concluding the evaluation process and the results to date, one was impressed with the substantial accomplishments in such a short period of time. In [this evaluation] a detailed review was made of the [Project] Objectives as revised in '82, the indicators, financial and non-financial, by which performance or results are measured and the important question of self-sufficiency. These for the most part are indicators that one can use for measuring success or failure.

* This eloquent passage is quoted from Rod MacMullin's evaluation report submitted to CIDA.

In addition to those there are other factors that are important in determining the success or failure of a project that is designed for development purposes. Institutional development is easily measured and recognized. Development of people is not so easily measured and is not always easily recognized since it is a spread over time and happens gradually.

Average per member savings has been used as an indicator of performance. The fact that the savings of the average credit union member increased from US\$325.00 in 1979 to US\$590.00 in 1982 is not very impressive in itself. However, when one realizes that a very large percentage of the 471,000 members in credit unions in 1982 never had any savings before in their lives, it puts a different light on the figures. This fact gives a very large group of people in the region some peace of mind, some independence and some encouragement which they did not enjoy before. That pool of savings (US\$590 times the more than 471,000 people, almost US\$290 million) is being used in the region to satisfy human needs for health, education, housing, production and consumer goods. They have pride in the fact that the credit union is their institution, they own it, control it and use it for their development.

Another aspect of development is the training that improves the capabilities as well as the self-worth of individuals. One can assume that for each credit union in the region there

are approximately twenty persons trained as directors, committee members or staff. In the region it means a large body of people gaining new knowledge, improving their skills and generally leading a more satisfying life. This training is ongoing. New directors and committee members are trained as they are elected to boards and existing members receive additional training.

Some of us had the personal experience of visiting a small rural community credit union in Dominica one morning. As we were there a teacher from a nearby school was taking her pupils, about thirty-five of them, back to their classroom after a nature lesson. The children, aged about five years, had to climb a steep hill and then pass the credit union office. Instead of passing she brought all of the children into the office out of the hot sun for a brief rest before going onto the classroom. When the teacher was introduced to us she decided to show us what the children knew of credit unions, money, etc. They were all aware of the credit union, knew what it was for, knew their parents were members and that many people saved money in the credit unions. They knew and we soon found out that the teacher happened to be the president of the credit union and she was passing some of her knowledge and enthusiasm to the children. As evaluators of the project we thought this was a positive sign of the development of people.

The development of credit unions is not going to prove to be as dramatic for development purposes as some mega project that would immediately put large numbers of people to work with good wages, but it will, over time, develop people to be self-reliant, responsible, better informed and better citizens. It takes a long period of time to develop people, even though their institutions may develop more rapidly.

E. INSTITUTIONAL RELATIONSHIPS

CCCU is maintaining effective relationships with both its leagues and the donor agencies. Earlier problems related to league fulfillment of CDP participation criteria have been largely resolved. One area where problems continue is the loan/grant program. There is need for policy and clear statement of grant-loan terms to avoid misunderstandings between CCCU and the recipient leagues.

The joint funding approach employed by CIDA and USAID through CDF and CUNA under the co-ordination of the World Council of Credit Unions, has been highly successful. In the opinion of CCCU, CDF and WOCCU's joint program approach has facilitated reporting and management control while reducing total reporting costs. Single reports have replaced the need for double reports. On a more fundamental level, the joint approach has doubled the total resources available to the movement. In general, most bureaucratic limitations on WOCCU, CDF and CCCU have been considerably reduced by the joint approach. The

only disadvantage cited was the need to reach joint approval in those few cases where major project changes were necessary, particularly the project design revisions of 1982.

The CCCU and its leagues have developed relations with many other regional and local organizations. These relations need to be expanded in the coming years particularly at the regional level if the credit union movement is to have access to the technical and financial resources needed by its membership. Project lists of CDF and USAID in the region have been included for reference purposes in Appendix 3. It is hoped that these listings will provide a starting point for increased operational relations between the CCCU and other organizations at the regional level and the leagues at the territorial level.

APPENDIX I

COUNTRY REPORTS

The following review will provide greater detail to the Country Development Program as seen by the evaluation team.

I. COUNTRY SURVEY VISITS

A. ANTIGUA

Though founded some thirty years ago, the entire Antigua Movement was reactivated, rehabilitated, officially registered and expanded by the project. (League, Teachers, Police, Old Roads, Bendals, Liberta and Urlings). Credit unions were not registered prior to 1982.

The League has developed and maintained full-time operations in the capital city.

Considerable basic training - in League and Credit Union leadership and management has been provided to volunteer leaders and staff.

Government reorganized its Co-op Department and appointed a Registrar, largely in response to the Project.

Better quality leadership has emerged and an active League Board is in place.

St. John's Community Credit Union was established in August 1982 by the CDP to service the capital city and its extensions. It is the largest credit union now and is a source of inspiration to the others. Police and Teachers Credit Unions are also growing nicely. Special CDF assistance has helped the League, St. John's and Teachers, all of which share office space together. Payroll deduction in the Police and Teachers Credit Unions have increased membership and savings growth.

Public awareness is high.

There are some problems to be overcome. In the rural areas, the image of credit unions is poor because of a poor credit union experience in the past. Delinquency levels are too high, mostly a legacy of the past. Leadership skill levels in the League and credit unions need considerable development. The question of self-sufficiency and long-term viability of the league must be faced because of the very small potential available.

All the structures are now in place to help future development. Boards are active in the League and major credit unions, management has been improving and systems are being put in place to provide for better administration. The few rural credit unions are not thriving any may eventually be absorbed or merged with St. John's in the city.

However, this may take time since old loyalties are very strong. With help over the next few years, Antigua will have an effective and thriving credit union movement.

B. BARBADOS

Though the movement has existed for thirty years or more it has been stagnant in recent years with the exception of very few credit unions. The League was organized about twenty-five years ago but it depended upon full-time management and was unable to provide any significant level of services to the credit unions so that it had a very low profile until very recently. Since the project it has been re-organized, re-located to Bridgetown from Christ Church, and assisted so that full-time management could be hired.

Six new credit unions have been organized in the past year, one of these being the new City of Bridgetown Credit Union which is attracting a wide cross-section of the public, including some of the professional people.

The two largest credit unions, Public Service Credit Union and Teachers are growing very rapidly - other societies have some reasonably good growth.

The re-organization of the League has helped a new spirit of enthusiasm and interest develop. More assistance is being given to credit

unions and there is much greater public awareness. However, there are many problems to be faced as the movement in Barbados develops.

There is a lack of skilled managers in most credit unions. There is too much dependence on the Co-op Department for auditing, which most often means bringing credit union books and records up-to-date. The League is not in a position to correct this situation in the near future because of lack of skilled people and lack of other resources.

However, government is very supportive of the movement and has done several things to encourage people to become involved in credit unions. In addition to auditing it has provided tax exemption on credit union savings within certain limits to encourage savings.

Relations between credit unions, particularly the larger units, and the League have improved greatly. A group of non-affiliated credit unions will be encouraged to reconsider affiliation now that the League has more by way of service to offer all credit unions. There is optimism for the future of the credit union movement in Barbados.

C. DOMINICA

The movement in Dominica has been in existence for many years and had the unique good fortune to have had the existence of people like Reverend Sister Alicia who spent many years in an effort to educate the people and develop leaders through an intensive program of adult education. As a result the credit union movement, which grew out of

that kind of program is well established and involves a large percentage of the total population. Based upon 1982 figures there were more than 31,000 credit union members in Dominica out of a population of 74,000 or about 42 percent. This growth continues to increase. There are 22 credit unions in the country with assets in 1982 of US\$6 million.

In the credit unions there has been good growth in members, savings and loans outstanding.

There has been some improvement in accounting but much still remains to be done. Most credit unions depend upon co-op department auditors to complete their books and make annual audits. Only five credit unions have sufficiently trained staff to do the full accounting cycle, i.e. from original entry to monthly and year-end financial statement.

There has been improved capability in staffing but there remains much more to be done. Credit unions have been satisfied to hire people to keep books but have not seen the need as yet to hire more qualified, more mature, trainable and knowledgeable people capable of making management decisions for the successful development of credit unions.

The League has made good progress. It has a central finance facility, one of the very few in the region, has improved its management capability, has instituted fairly complete management and operating systems with established and documented policies to guide management.

There are quite a number of examples of productive and developmental loans being made by the credit unions and the League in Dominica, such as loans for land, agriculture, bus service, dumper for road building, pre-school building, a block factory and a bakery.

Problems to be faced are normal - improved and better trained managers, more training and educational courses for staff, directors and committee members.

League field workers should place more emphasis on on-site training of staff so that all credit unions will be able to generate financial reports monthly.

Relations between credit unions and the League, the League and CCCU and the movement at all levels and government seem to be very favorable. Credit unions are having a significant impact on social and economic conditions in Dominica.

D. ST. LUCIA

In St. Lucia there were twelve credit unions registered according to the 1982 statistics with a membership of 5,600 and assets of approximately US\$1,345,000. Progress has been steady although somewhat slow, with the exception of a few credit unions such as in the Public Service and the Police. Credit unions generally did not report a high degree of project benefits reaching them. Larger credit unions

are seriously thinking of paid full-time management. Smaller credit unions have been suffering from volunteer management that has a record for high turnover.

League is operating on a full-time basis with full-time management. It is now doing some training of credit union boards and making use of assistance from CCCU through training at regional and sub-regional courses. Credit unions require intensive support in training and the development of adequate management and operating systems.

Relations between the League and CCCU have been strained because of a lack of co-operation. St. Lucia did not receive all its CDP grant because it did not satisfy CCCU that it met the established criteria for disbursing funds. On the other hand, CCCU is seen as being insensitive to the needs of the credit unions of St. Lucia. There has also been some strain between the Co-op Department and the League. Some of the problem can be traced to lack of proper communications. Some in the Co-op Department seem to feel threatened by the new role the League is assuming with the credit unions - previously the credit unions depended exclusively upon the Co-op Department for audits and other forms of assistance. People in the Department also seem to feel that the credit unions are now being subject to too much foreign influence and overly sophisticated systems and development procedures.

There is a need for much more training at all levels of the movement, more co-operation between League and Government and CCCU and a

greater effort on the part of League management to foster a better spirit of mutual trust and co-operation between all those involved in developing credit unions in the region.

E. ST. VINCENT

There are six credit unions in this territory with 3,850 members and savings of US\$1.15 million. Growth has been mostly in two credit unions - Government Employees and Teachers. South Rivers is another that is more popular because of a new credit union building which is a focal point in the community and is available for community activities.

League is in need of reorganization to better serve the needs of the credit unions. Larger credit unions particularly have little respect for the League because of its inability to adequately service their needs. Rural credit unions are badly in need of training and it is difficult for the League to provide the necessary assistance to them because of the lack of resources, such as personnel and transportation. Technical self-sufficiency for the League and some of the credit unions is not in the near future. Financial self-sufficiency is somewhat doubtful for the League in view of the small number of credit unions and the limited potential. However, this could change if all the presently organized credit unions can be developed to the point where they can afford good management with the necessary systems and procedures to make their credit unions more attractive to the potential members that are available.

F. NEVIS

The Nevis Credit Union is just over ten years old. It occupies a new two story building in Charlestown. The Co-operative Development Foundation and the government contributed to the erection of the building. There is a staff of three full-time employees now in place. Growth in membership has averaged 60 percent annually and there have been good increases in savings and other financial indicators.

Financial management and operating systems are established; accounting and reporting has improved and delinquency has been reduced significantly by a new and more effective collection system.

Since 1981 Nevis Credit Union has been able to reduce its delinquency on external funding and is now anticipating a balanced budget in 1984.

It has strong relationships with the government Co-op Department.

The credit union has a demand for funds for housing and productive credit that it is unable to meet at present. There is also a need for more indepth training in financial management and accounting.

G. GRENADA

The movement in Grenada has been going through a period of consolidation under the management of the League. The League Board which was largely ineffective prior to the initiation of the country development program, has been revitalized. It has hired a Development Officer (CUDO) to work with the credit unions as well as to manage the daily operations of the League. More supervision by the League along with technical assistance have improved credit union operations considerably. The Coady International Institute of Nova Scotia, Canada, has made available one of its staff to assist in the work of auditing credit unions as well as to train credit union staff in accounting and help them set up proper management systems. The political situation, while not settled, is not likely to be an impediment to credit union development.

The first steps have been taken in the direction of establishing a central finance facility with rule changes authorized at its last annual meeting. Self-sufficiency is also an item very much under consideration although it is not likely that this will be attained in the short run.

There is a good relationship between the credit unions, the League and the government.

Public awareness is much higher as more credit union people are participating in courses sponsored by the League and CCCU who in turn are doing more to promote the credit union idea.

H. GUYANA

The credit union movement in Guyana is faced with serious problems, the major one being that of survival. The faltering economy and government policies in many areas make it difficult for credit unions. It is a large country and many of the credit unions are located in far away rural areas that cannot be reached without proper transportation. The League has improved its capability to service credit unions with a full-time manager, two field officers and a trainee. But, because no transportation is available to the League, most of its attention has been with the credit unions of the Georgetown area. This probably accounts for the fact that a large number of credit unions in Guyana are not affiliated with the League. Credit unions have a great lack of trained personnel so that books are not up-to-date and often audits are some years behind. Government insists upon the audits being done by Co-operative Department auditors. With the lack of training and the lack of adequate auditing it is unlikely that many of these small rural credit unions will survive. Other problems such as migration aggravate the situation both by the fact that people migrate leaving behind uncollectible loans and also by the fact that as people get some training they are more likely to leave the country for jobs elsewhere.

The development of a central financial facility is also not seen as something that can easily happen in Guyana because of government policy that is inclined to direct credit unions to support the Co-op Bank. The largest credit union in the country, the Public Service Union Credit Union is deeply committed to the Co-op Bank and is very unlikely to support a central financial facility with the League. Under the circumstances the League is doing a credible job in its efforts to provide training and technical assistance as well as to encourage participation of Guyana leaders in regional and sub-regional courses.

Technically, self-sufficiency is a long way off for 90 percent of the credit unions although it can be a reality for the League within the next couple of years.

Financial self-sufficiency for the League does not appear to be practical at this time.

II. DOCUMENTATION REVIEWS

A. JAMAICA

Membership growth in Jamaica's Credit Unions continues to be very strong enlisting 30,490 people in 1982. With 252,000 members, the movement has now achieved full reach to every household in the population through its urban rural spread and its plethora of services.

League services to credit unions expanded over the period under review to include accounting and internal audit. An improved data processing service for the entire movement is being prepared.

Through the Cooperative College, the League continues to provide professional training to Jamaican credit unionists. Some courses have been extended to other affiliate countries of CCCU. The College is now offering a one-year Certificate in Management Course, as well as a variety of other short-term credit union courses. A two-week Training of Trainers Course is being organized for July with CCCU coordinating overseas participation.

The League further embarked on a special J\$10 million retail credit program for small business people. Besides, with the cooperation of WOCCU and the Cooperative League of the USA, the League is presently developing a major program for the Cooperative College and the

League's Central Finance Facility under the Caribbean Basin Initiative (CBI) program.

The League expanded its bonding coverage available for credit unions and in concert with CUNA Mutual continues to extend Individual Life coverage to Jamaican citizens.

The League's Basic Schools Program, continues to meaningfully assist Jamaican pre-school children and has further mobilized a Canadian grant to provide play equipment to Jamaican Day Care Community Centres.

By year-end 1982, 61 credit unions had contributed a total of J\$6.5 million to the League's Central Mortgage Fund. Under its Central Finance Facility, the League disbursed lines-of-credit and loans totalling J\$2.9 million. At year-end 1982, deposits to the Facility totalled almost \$J6.8 million and loans outstanding reached J\$5.9 million.

The League's Stabilization Fund has grown to over \$1 million.

A research position has been created within the League. The Officer has already produced a series of credit union analyses and studies on current issues. The League continued to provide marketing and promotion support to its affiliated members. Its quarterly publication "Umbrella" is steadily increasing in national and international circulation.

B. BELIZE

The League successfully negotiated participation in a US\$2.8 million USAID Home Improvement Credit Program for credit union members. A technician has been assigned to the project through the Cooperative Housing Foundation (CHF).

Training for member credit unions was carried out by the League. A training strategy has been drafted. A CCCU staffer conducted the Institutional Analysis and resourced a one day workshop in Budgeting and Financial Planning.

A new Acting Executive Director was appointed. The former officer, Mr. D. Lord, successfully completed the League Management Course.

The hiring of additional staff to manage the on-lending program and to expand the field technical assistance program is an issue this League should resolve in the ensuing year.

C. CAYMAN ISLANDS

Assets of the Cayman Island Civil Service Association Cooperative Credit Union continue to grow and are now in excess of US\$1.4 million. The credit union extended its Bond of Association to relatives and families of Civil Servants and also welcomed employees and families of Cayman Islands into the Bond of Association.

The professional and service capabilities of the credit union continued to grow and membership reached an excess of 940 people.

New management joined the credit union in early 1983, and in May of the same year, CCCU visited Grand Cayman Island to conduct indepth management training for the credit union and its new manager.

Given the increased level of membership and services, the credit union is currently studying new building alternatives.

D. MONTSERRAT

Grants to this Country Development Plan were started this year. Efforts were concentrated on volunteer training, administration, community education and membership increase. Administrative Systems are improving.

The newly formed Montserrat Cooperative Credit Union and the St. Patricks Credit Union have agreed to operate a joint office and staff in Plymouth with effect from July 1, 1983. CCCU continued to support the development of improved systems and an island-wide service.

The Treasurer is scheduled to attend the Family Financial Counselling Course (Trinidad).

One of the participants in the 1982 Leeward Islands Sub-Regional Course will assume the post of Credit Union Development Officer in August.

E. BAHAMAS

The hosting of CCCU's 1982 Convention and Annual General Meeting afforded this relatively New League unprecedented publicity. By September 1982 the two largest units, National Workers and Teachers and Salaried Workers, had employed full-time Managers; both were also improving their management systems.

The League Manager successfully completed the Regional Course, but is no longer employed with the League. The CFTC (Commonwealth Fund for Technical Cooperation) Advisor, Mr. Keith Hall, completed his assignment with this Movement in December.

As a result of a consultation visit by the President (March) and a series of working sessions with the Acting Managing Director (June), communications with the CCCU have improved considerably. The League is utilizing the findings and recommendations of the Institutional Analysis Report to generate and implement short-term and long-range plans. A Mission Statement and the framework for a Five Year Plan have been produced.

Consideration is being given to a merger strategy to improve the viability of member credit unions.

Collaboration with the Cooperatives Division continued to grow. Three credit unions (Teachers and Salaried Workers, Public Workers and Grand Bahamas) received awards for their annual member growth during the recent Cooperatives Month celebrations (June). A joint League-Cooperative Division newsletter is to be published with effect from July 1983.

The League's first two-week Family Financial Counselling Course commenced on June 27, 1983. Fourteen credit unionists attended. CCCU has committed increased support for 1983/1984.

F. SURINAME

The Board continued to play a vital role in sustaining the operations of this League.

The Chef de Bureau successfully completed the League Management Course. He has resigned. A Junior Field Worker was hired.

The League has accelerated its training activities through the major districts, in conjunction with the National Labour Institute (SIVIS). Subject material included development planning, administration, book-keeping, insurance and loan policy formulation. CCCU and the League slated a 3-day national seminar on Credit Union Management (May).

Increased movement stimulation and promotion has resulted from the decision to hold the League's Annual General Meeting in rural Nickeri (June); and the 1984 meeting is planned for another rural district, Albina.

Two capital city units, De Schakel and GODO have embarked on expansion programs. The former has hired a field worker; the latter is recruiting for a similar position. The National Director represented the CCCU at the official opening of the downtown GODO office building (May). Through CCCU's intervention, this project received financial support from the Cooperative Development Foundation (CDF).

Movement end-of-year assets increased from US\$2.5 million to US\$3.5 million.

The League's Supermarket is facing difficulties in securing credit. Full-time management has been hired.

CCCU technical assistance will increase in 1983-84. CUSO has been requested to provide an Extension Worker for this League.

G. TRINIDAD & TOBAGO

Throughout the past year the League held several meetings including two major movement Consultations (November, March) focused on restructuring the organization and its services.

The By-Laws, the Chapter System and the Cooperative Credit Union Bank-League relationship may be restructured. The Minister of Cooperatives has requested a report on the future status of the League and the Bank.

A five year education plan is being developed in consultation with the Chapters. Chapter education and training sessions to impact member credit unions. The League in collaboration with the CCCU has designed a Regional Course in Family Financial Counselling to be conducted July 17-30. Nine other territories have registered participants.

In an effort to generate more credit union information, the field workers have been conducting a statistical survey.

In accordance with the recommendations of the Institutional Analysis and the pre-requirements for funding under the Country Development Program, the League is developing a three year development program. The program includes credit union accounting and audit support, a merger plan, a stationery service, and a medi-care program.

The nationwide publicity given to income tax relief for credit union savers has resulted in end of 1982 movement savings increased of some US\$ 30.9 million or a 20 percent over 1981.

CCCU EVALUATION RECOMMENDATIONS STATUS REPORT

Prepared by: Melvin Edwards

Date: Updated January 22nd 1984

4.1 <u>Institutional Analysis & Planning</u>	Completion Date	Status/Remarks
<u>Recommendations</u>		
4.1.4 The institutional analyses of each League & its member credit union of of CCCU should be completed in 1982.	Studies 8/82 Reports: Leagues 9/82 CCCU 10/82	13 Studies completed. All reports completed & formally presented. CCCU completed 2/83.
4.1.5 A CCCU five-year development plan for the period 1983-87 should be completed by the end of 1982. The plan should be based on the country-level and CCCU institutional analyses & should include revised project objectives & indicators & resource mobilisation requirements for the post-project period.	<u>12/82</u>	Based on CCCU & affiliate I.A.'s: Mission Statement & First Draft Phase II completed 6/83. Second draft to be presented to funding agencies 5/84.
4.2 <u>Country Development Grants</u>		
<u>Recommendations</u>		
4.2.3 Development plans resulting from country-level institutional analyses should be the guide in planning and budgeting for post-1982 grant awards. A revised schedule for disbursement based on both the affiliates' absorptive capacity & CCCU Headquarters administrative, training & field support capabilities should be prepared. Funds should be re-allocated from CDG's which will not be completed at the end-of-project to the CCCU training & field support budgets. Country Development projects not completed by June 85 will require funding in a follow-on project.	<u>6/84</u>	Budgeting & Action Planning processes in place, maintained on annual basis. CDG project budgets revamped in project revision. Long-range planning process implemented in <u>seven</u> countries by year-end 83 : Suriname, Nevis, Montserrat, Dominica, Antigua, Grenada, Guyana. CCCU overall Country Development Strategy completed 10/82. (See Appdx. to Year-end 82 Report). Long-range Plan completed 1983. (See Page 11 1984 Development Plans item 2.1). Others to be completed by 6/84. Revised disbursements approach in Revised CDF Manual 9/82.

CCCU EVALUATION RECOMMENDATIONS STATUS REPORT cont'd

4.2 Country Development Grants con'd

	<u>Recommendations cont'd</u>	<u>Completion Date</u>	<u>Status/Remarks</u>
4.2.4	Expanded policy guidelines and CDG implementation procedures should be documents & implemented	<u>12/82</u>	Revised CDP Manual completed 9/82 and redistributed to affiliates.
4.3	<u>CCCU Headquarters Operations</u>		
4.3.5	Develop a revised 1982 work plan to focus on: a) meeting institutional analysis objectives; b) training approach documentation c) development of HQ/CDG financial management systems; d) documents personnel policy and systems.	<u>2/82</u> <u>2/82</u> <u>2/82</u>	Completed/Implemented Completed December 1982 Accounting/fiscal and budgeting process implemented. Currently in use awaiting Board approval Feb 84. Personnel policy completed - awaiting Board approval which should be granted Feb 84.
4.3.6.	Develop a revised integrated budget for CCCU operations, CDG's (including Dominica Project) and technical assistance.	<u>7/82</u>	Revised CCCU Budget developed 11/82, approved 3/83. Completed.
4.3.7	Reconcile 1981 accounting data with 1980 audit figures, prepare bank reconciliation & new trial balances; complete 1981 audit by April 30, 1982 develop 1982 (cash budget capital, operating, & CDG components);	<u>7/82</u> <u>7/10/82</u> <u>4/30 first half</u>	All completed and being maintained. 5/82. Completed 5/82. Completed 4/82 Completed 6/82

115

CCCU EVALUATION RECOMMENDATIONS STATUS REPORT cont'd

4.3 CCCU Headquarters Operations cont'd

	<u>Recommendations cont'd</u>	<u>Completion Date</u>	<u>Status/Remarks</u>
4.3.7.	document accounting system;	<u>7/82</u>	Completed 11/83
	implement internal controls	<u>6/30</u>	Completed 4/83
4.3.9	Document and implement a uniform personnel system.		System developed as part of personnel policies 12/82. Revised 1983 and evaluated pending formal approval in Feb 84. Ref. 4.3.5.
		<u>7/15/82</u>	Completed
4.3.10	Obtain legal status as a registered institution by the end of Sept. 82.	<u>9/82</u>	CCCU legally registered October 1, 1982. Completed.

4.4 Training

Recommendations

4.4.3	A comprehensive training approach should be documents based on "train-the-trainers" concepts.	<u>12/82</u>	Completed 12/83 Trainer Manual
4.4.4	Technical assistance requirements for the post-1982 period should be determined, resources identified and strategy outlined.		T.A. Resources identified & maintained. H.R.M. Strategy in pla UWI, JACCUL, COADY. Being revised by WOCOU Job description, terms of reference formerly approved.

4.5 Technical Assistance

4.5.4	Terms of refernece for technical advisors' participation in and contributions to CCCU development operations should be clearly documented.	<u>6/19</u>	Completed 1982.
-------	--	-------------	-----------------

116

CCCU EVALUATION RECOMMENDATIONS STATUS REPORT cont'd

4.5 Technical Assistance cont'd

	<u>Recommendations cont'd</u>	<u>Completion Date</u>	<u>Status/Remarks</u>
4.5.5	Teh technical advisor to the Dominica League should have his period of service extended in accordance with the work plan and resolutions adopted by the League Board of Directors. Cost of extension should be borne by the Country Development Grant.	<u>4/82</u>	Extension approved and assignment completed 12/82.
4.5.6	Technical assistance provided to Leagues and Credit Unions by the CCCU, including the Dominica Project, should be managed by the Department of Training and Development.	<u>2/82</u>	In effect since 3/82.

4.6 Project Finance

	<u>Recommendations</u>		
4.6.6	A revised financial plan based on levels of committed funding through the end-of-project should be prepared by staff, approved by the CCCU Board of Directors and submitted to the funding agencies for their approval by the end of August 1982/	<u>6/30/82</u>	Submitted 7/82, revised & submitted 11/82. Donor approved 3/83. Revised plan developed and implemented Incorporates unidentified income sources.
4.6.7	Improved project income and expenditures and formats used by the CCCU should be designed, documented and implemented by the end of April 1982.	<u>4/82</u>	Monthly financial statement being produced within 15 days Quarterly Audits conducted in 1982. Semi Annual Audits produced in 1983. Quarterly Fiscal and Cash Flow Projection Reports submitted regularly beginning 12/82. Completed.

117

CCCU EVALUATION RECOMMENDATIONS STATUS REPORT cont'd

4.6 Project Finance

	<u>Recommendations cont'd</u>	<u>Completion Date</u>	<u>Status/Remarks</u>
4.6.8	WOCCU should prepare and distribute to all participating agencies a quarterly consolidated project budget statement based on the CCCU audited quarterly and annual statements, WOCCU technician support and overhead costs, and CDF administration charges. Formats and procedures should be designed, documents and implemented by the end of April 1982.	<u>6/82</u>	Included in Project Quarterly Reports since 4th Quarter 1982. Completed 5/82.

4.7 Information Systems

	<u>Recommendations</u>		
4.7.3	Development of an information system based on internal project management needs and the overall project indicators should be completed by end of 1982.	<u>12/82</u>	Information system being developed and formalised. Forms existing. Revised indicators completed at 11/82. See WP 84 Section 7.
4.7.4	Quarterly reporting should be oriented toward results achieved rather than activities completed. Results should be expressed in terms of the project's intermediate and final objectives and quantitative indicators.	<u>6/30/82</u>	Results-focussed approach in effect.
4.7.5	The 1983 work plan should include implementation of the information system.	<u>12/82</u>	Partially implemented 1983.

4.8 Resource Mobilisation

	<u>Recommendations</u>		
4.8.3	The CCCU should as part of its own institutional analysis initiate development of a financial self-sufficiency strategy. This would		Self-sufficiency Strategy being developed. Will be documented 3/84 for Phase II presentation

118

CCCU EVALUATION RECOMMENDATIONS STATUS REPORT cont'd

4.8 Resource Mobilisation

	<u>Recommendations cont'd</u>	<u>Completion Date</u>	<u>Status/Remarks</u>
4.8.3	include evaluation of potential sources of service income, including financial intermediation, insurance, training, specialised technical assistance, publications, etc., alternative dues structures; and grants. The latter should include both direct grants to the CCCU and administrative fee recoveries from grants to member organisations.	<u>6/83</u>	Information gathering and preliminary analysis undertaken
4.8.4	Mechanisms should be developed to use accumulated, non-transferable dues income restricted by current foreign exchange regulations of some member countries.		Strategy in effect. Jamaica & Trinidad & Tobago income successfully used in 82/83. Strategy worked out for Dominica using CUNA funds. Guyana account being gradually reduced. Foreign exchange management program designed and half implemented 1/84.

119

DEVELOPMENT INSTITUTIONS

- Barbados National Association of Co-operative Societies (BARNACS)
- Barbados Agricultural Society (BAS)
- Caribbean Conference of Churches (CCC)
- Caribbean Congress of Labour (CCL)
- Caribbean Development Bank (CDB)
- Caribbean Union of Teachers (CUT)
- University of the West Indies (UWI)
- Women and Development (WAND)
- Volunteers for Overseas Co-operative Assistance (VOCA)
- Co-operative Housing Foundation (CHF)
- Inter-American Foundation (IAF)
- International Labour Organization (ILO)
- Peace Corps
- Plunkett Foundation for Co-operative Studies
- Friedrich-Naumann-Stiftung
- National Union of Co-operatives Societies Ltd., Jamaica (NUCS)
- Co-operative Union of Canada (CUC)

ACTIVE OPG PROJECTS

<u>PROJECT NO.</u>	<u>PROJECT NAME</u>	<u>GRANTEE</u>	<u>PROJECT DESCRIPTION</u>
538-0025	Social Services and Loans to Low Income Women	Women in Development, Inc.	The Project aims to improve the socio-economic status of low-income families in Barbados and the LDCs through the provision of loans and technical assistance to low-income women for productive, income-generating activities. Grant funds are being utilized to strengthen WID's capacity to organize women's cooperatives, to provide training in production, marketing, accounting and small business, to establish and administer a revolving loan fund, and to assist those women who have skills in finding employment. Essentially, WID, Inc. seeks to work with women to link skills with income earning opportunities.
538-0035	Caribbean Credit Union Development	Credit Union National Association Incorporated (CINA)	The Project will improve the institutional capabilities of the Caribbean Credit Union Movement at the local, national and regional levels to facilitate a more effective utilization of regional cooperative, financial and development resources. The grant finances the operational costs of the Caribbean Confederation of Credit Unions (CCCU), technical assistance through CINA; and country development grants for participating national credit union leagues.

121

<u>PROJECT-NO:</u>	<u>PROJECT-NAME</u>	<u>GRANTEE</u>	<u>PROJECT-DESCRIPTION</u>
538-0038	St. Lucia Youth Development Program	National Office of Social Responsibility (NOSR)	The Project supports development of a vocational training system and two facilities on St. Lucia which will be responsive to the needs of the island's unemployed youth and the demands of a developing economy. The job training component will provide unemployed youth with skills and work experience that will assist in establishing economic self-sufficiency. Training will be conducted at training centers which will teach skills in agro-processing and handicrafts.
538-0050	Caribbean Family Planning	International Planned Parenthood Federation/ Western Hemisphere Region	The purpose of this grant is to encourage the wider acceptance of family planning in the Caribbean and to improve the capacity of members of the Caribbean Family Planning Affiliation to deliver fertility management and family planning services. Specific objectives of this grant are intended to meet information and education family planning needs in the Caribbean.
538-0054	Health Manpower Development	National Council for International Health (NCIH) and CARICOM	The purpose of this grant is to establish a manpower planning capacity within CARICOM in order to 1) improve the relevance and outreach effectiveness of CARICOM's program and services relating to regional primary health care needs and 2) to assist the participating countries in health manpower planning by providing selected health personnel and related technical services.

122

<u>PROJECT NO:</u>	<u>PROJECT NAME</u>	<u>GRANTEE</u>	<u>PROJECT DESCRIPTION</u>
538-0055	Allied Health Manpower Training	Project HOPE	The purpose of this project is to provide support for the improvement of health care services in eight of the lesser developed countries of the Eastern Caribbean by 1) training public health inspectors, environmental health assistants, as well as, auxiliary dental and child health care personnel, 2) promoting more effective utilization of the trained personnel. Major emphasis is placed on the improvement of the delivery of health care services to the population of St. Lucia, although Antigua, Belize, Dominica, Grenada, Montserrat, St. Kitts/Nevis, Anguilla and St. Vincent are also included as beneficiaries of the project.
538-0070	Child, Family and Community Development	High/Scope Education Research Foundation	The purpose of this grant is to support the efforts of the Government of St. Kitts/Nevis to develop a core network of pre-school/day care centers through the expansion of physical facilities, the equipping and staffing of the centers and the training of program staff. In order to develop a national day care program, a comprehensive needs assessment will be undertaken which will include organizational development and policy research. This development process will be documented in such a way as to support the future expansion and continuation of the program upon completion of this project.

127

<u>PROJECT NO:</u>	<u>PROJECT NAME</u>	<u>GRANTEE</u>	<u>PROJECT DESCRIPTION</u>
538-0079	Dominica Small Enterprise Development	National Development Foundation of Dominica (NDFD)	The Project aims to support a program to stimulate income and employment generation and broaden the entrepreneurial base in Dominica by promoting the development of small/micro businesses. Grant funds will be utilized to assist NDFD to establish and administer a Revolving Loan Fund and provide business advisory services and training for small business entrepreneurs.
538-0073	Regional Non-Formal Skills Training	OAS General Secretariat	The purpose of the project is to provide appropriate non-formal skills training and support services to improve the employability of under-employed and unemployed youth (ages 15-25) in three Eastern Caribbean countries through a modular training program which imparts technical and managerial skills as well as proper work habits. In Dominica, the primary goal will be to assist the Ministry of Education in the development of a functioning national system of non-formal skills training. In Barbados, the goal is to strengthen the Ministry of Labor and Community Services to extend an existing skills training program, under USAID/OAS auspices, to apprenticeship and in-plant training schemes. For St. Lucia, the primary objective will be to reinforce and expand incipient non-formal skills training programs of the Ministry of Youth and Community Development, and

<u>PROJECT NO.</u>	<u>PROJECT NAME</u>	<u>GRANTEE</u>	<u>PROJECT DESCRIPTION</u>
538-0102	Caribbean Marketing Assistance Project	Partners of the Americas	<p>to link them more directly to employment and labor needs. The regional plan for the three participating countries calls for the training and placement of 500 persons in Barbados, 550 in Dominica and 200 in St. Lucia.</p> <p>The project will provide comprehensive marketing assistance to Caribbean manufactureres improving the competitive position and increasing the sales of their products and services in the U.S. market. Specific components of the project are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">a) <u>Partnerships</u> - To be established between St. Lucia, Barbados, and Dominica with counterpart New York partnerships in Rockland, Albany, and Dutchess counties.b) Market Research/Assessment missions.c) Product development, design, and quality control.d) Observational training visits.e) Trade missions.f) Brokering/clearing house function - this will provide a permanent contact point for business people seeking marketing information and opportunities.

125

<u>PROJECT-NO:</u>	<u>PROJECT-NAME</u>	<u>GRANTEE</u>	<u>PROJECT-DESCRIPTION</u>
538-0111	Caribbean Eye Care	International Eye Foundation (IEF)	<p>The purpose of this grant is to provide an adequate level of eye health care services to selected Caribbean countries through:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none">1) establishment of a training program for physicians that will qualify them as intermediate eye care specialists, 2) train at least six physicians as intermediate eye care specialists, 3) provision of eye care training to nurses who will assist the intermediate eye care specialists, 4) assistance to participating countries in integrating primary (clinic level) and secondary (intermediate eye care specialists) eye care services into their systems of health care delivery and establish referral linkages to a tertiary eye care facility, 5) provide initial supplies and necessary equipment to participating countries so they can establish their eye care services systems.
538-0087	Regional Development Training II	BIMAP	<p>The private sector component of the Project is a four-year, three-element, management and consulting activity under the auspices of the Barbados Institute of Management and Productivity (BIMAP). BIMAP provides organizational development, management training, and intermediate enterprise assistance to Antigua, Dominica, Grenada, Montserrat, St. Christopher/Nevis, St. Lucia, St. Vincent, Barbados, Cayman Islands, Anguilla, and</p>

126

PROJECT NO: PROJECT NAME

GRANTEE

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

Belize. In addition to the training and consulting programs, other major elements of the Project include technology, productivity and management assistance, and BIMAP institution-building activities. The public sector component of the Project provides training opportunities for private and select public sector employees through individual participant training grants. These long and short-term grants will upgrade the technical and managerial skills of productive sector participants. RDO/C will contract the services of a U.S. organization to provide all the selection, placement, monitoring, counseling and follow-up services for the participants.

RDO/C:PROGRAM OFFICE: 01/25/84

127

January 19, 1984
Ref: 27815

CARIBBEAN PROJECTS

St.Kitts - Nevis:

Nevis Credit Union Building Construction (27711)
- straight construction
- \$65,000 (approx)

Antigua:

Cedar Hill Co-operative (27673)
- marginal chickens, goats, cows, vegetables
- Barry Stevens (809) 462-4414

Co-op Editors' Tour (C.26)
- tour of Antigua and Dominica
- Milton MacKenzie (416) 481-0797
- \$62,000 (approx)

Women's Consumer Co-op (27681)
- operating capital, supplies
- Arah Hector (female) (21593)
- \$19,680

Womens' Consumer Co-op (27728)
- marketing equipment
- Arah Hector
- \$9,250

Credit Union League - CUSO volunteer (27810)
- credit union volunteer for league for two years
- Ruth Amrose, Manager
P.O. Box 555
- \$57,337

Pat Stonehouse, volunteer
(corner of Tanner and Market Street, Upstairs
St.John's)

Credit Union League Development (27800)
- support staff, equipment, funds used as revolving fund
prior to use for recurring expenses
- Ruth Amrose, Manager
P.O. Box 555

Antigua: cont'd

West Atngiau Co-operative and Appropriate Technology Complex (27710)

- pasture improvement, cattle, vegetables, irrigation, marginal appropriate technology - windpower
- Harold Lovell
George Weston House
- \$20,212

ACT Antigua

- local NGO that likes to do scholarly work
- Vincent Richards (phone 22891)

projects - ACT Legal (27670) \$44,897
ACT Legal Follow-up (27776) \$6,905
AGAPE Support Marketing (27655)

Credit Union League of Antigua

- project for credit union league
- Ruth Ambrose
P.O. Box 555

George Jonas
Registrar
Antigua
Office near cable and wireless

Dominica: Primary Contacts:

Everton Charles
Manager
Dominica Credit Union League
Roseau
(809) 445-4416

Joey Peltier and Ron Green
Small Projects Assistance Team
(809) 445-4377

Sr. Alicia de Treminerie
Woodford Hill
(started Christian Church based development 30 yrs. ago;
phasing out; of historical interest only)

Balthazar Barrie
Registrar
Government Building

Dominica Credit Union League (27418)
- credit union reconstruction - post-hurricane David relief
- \$20,000

Sunderlea Farmers Co-op (27421) Sr.Alicia
- land purchase
- \$25,300

Sunderlea Farmers Co-op (27425) Sr.Alicia
- feeder road work
- \$8,050

Co-op Banana Boxing plants (27605)
- revolving fund from hurricane relief,
via credit union league (first attempt)
- Everton Charles
\$90,221

Agape Craft Co-operative Support (27655)
- marketing assistance by ACT
- see Vincent Richards, Antigua
- \$22,132

Dominica: Primary Contacts cont'd:

Marinica Fishing Co-operative (27625)
- technical assistance
- see Moe Gomez, Prince Rupert
- \$5,943

Dominica Feeder Road, Mahaut (27603)
- 1 1/3 mile handmade road
- Everton Charles (St. Paul's Farmers Co-op)
- \$36,159

Bioche Multi-Purpose Co-operative (27687)
- truck, fishing, daycare, disco
- Everton Charles
- \$8,882

Scene City Fishing, Point Michelle (27685)
- marginal fishing co-operative
- Joey Peltier
- \$29,402

Morne Ramier Farmers Co-operative (27692)
- land, feeder road, sawmill
- Sr. Alicia
- \$19,949

Credit Union Equipment - Massacre (27729)
- chairs
- Everton Charles
- \$6,000

Tans-G-Toc Co-operative (27624)
- cottage agricultural inputs, 3-year staff support
- Everton Charles
- \$11,427

Calibishie Co-operative (27731)
- farmers market
- Everton Charles
- \$24,199

Dominica: Primary Contacts cont'd:

Agape Craft Co-operative (27680)
- marginal craft (sewing) co-operative and revolving fund
- Everton Charles
- \$12,644

Sineku Cattle Co-operative, Carib Reserve (27703)
- marginal agricultural/improve stock
- Fingal Thomas via Everton Charles
- \$18,463

Charcoal Making - L'Eschelle Co-operative (27729)
- kiln for charcoal making at Grand Bay
- Joey Peltier
- \$7,150

Co-operative Bakery, La Plaine (27718)
- wood fired kiln
- Elizabeth St. John via Joey Peltier
- \$7,680

Bense Fishermen Co-operative (27766)
- boats, gear
- Everton Charles
- \$24,320

Caye-en-Bouc Co-operative (27777)
- copra drier, banana boxing, irrigation, revolving fund
- Joey Peltier
- \$28,521

Computer Consultancy Roseau Credit Union (27793)
- technical assistance for computers
- Everton Charels

Newtown Fishing Co-operative
- Technically innovate fishing co-operative
- Mike Pryn
Box 107 Roseau
Tel: 4067

Dominica: Primary Contacts cont'd:

Lion Co-operative (27807)
- push carts for food distribution
- Everton Charles
- \$1,000

Community/Credit Union Building (27808)
- complete building at Vielle Case. Revolving fund
- Everton Charles
- \$32,454

BARBADOS AGRICULTURAL SOCIETY

The Grotto
St. Michael
(809) 426-3434
Contact: Mr. Haynesley Benn, Manager
 Mr. Garvey, President

Barbados Agricultural Society (71602, 70645, 26411)
- institutional development, technical assistance
- \$719,870

BAS Tractor (27737)
- project that group rejected because not effective
- Haynesley Benn
- \$29,245

Artificial Insemination (27666)
- stock upgrading
- Haynesley Benn
- \$97,257

Food Distribution (27696)
- packing shed for export
- Haynesley Benn
- \$24,125

Revolving Fund (27744)
- management training and development, administrative support,
 technical assistance, farm production credit \$200,000
- Haynesley Benn
- \$246,070

Anglo-Nubian Goats (27690)
- stock improvement from Canada
- Haynesley Benn
- \$14,175

134

CARIBBEAN CONFEDERATION OF CREDIT UNIONS (CCCU)

Roseville
Maxwells,
Christ Church
Barbados
(809) 428-4890

Contacts: Mr. Melvin Edwards, Acting Manager
Mr. Kenton Eggleston, WOCCU Advisor
Mr. Richard Lowe, WOCCU Advisor

Management support (27402)
- \$21,400

Caribbean Credit Union Mission (71601)
- credit union study
- Lorrie Hubbert

Guyana Mission (27629)
- credit union study
- Ruth Anne Mitchell
- \$5,907

Supervision/Liaison with CCCU (27646)
- \$22,022

CCCU Exchange loss (27741)
- Kenton Eggleston
- Melvin Edwards
(809) 428-4890
- \$10,236

CCCU Five-Year Project (27601)
- massive credit union institutional development

St. Vincent Credit Union (27649)
- revolving fund, post Hurricane Allen (1980) via CCCU
- \$50,000

St. Lucia Credit Union (27650)
- same as above
- \$59,158

CARIBBEAN CONFEDERATION OF CREDIT UNIONS (CCCU) cont'd

CUSO Volunteer for St.Vincent Credit Union League (27749)

- technical assistance

- \$33,803

Supervision/Liaison with CCCU (27769)

- Ruth Anne Mitchell

- \$34,575

South Rivers Credit Union Building (27682)

- straight construction

- \$29,191

St. Lucia:

Marine Engine Repairs, Vieux Fort (27736)
- CUSO volunteer doing engine repair training
- Carl Braun, Marton Ferrier
 Goodwill Co-operative
- \$96,054

St.Lucia Market Forecasting (27770)
- medium term institutional analysis and marketing study
- St.Lucia Farmers Co-operative
 Mr. Larry Leighton
 (809) 452-0241

St.Lucia Farmers Co-operative (27717)
- operating capital
- Mr. Larry Leighton
- \$8,500

St.Lucia Egg Producers (27702)
- restructuring of co-operative
- Mr. Larry Leighton
- \$7,470

St.Lucia Co-operative League (part of CCCU program)
- Haydon Williams, Manager
 Castries

Grenada:

Contact: NACDA - Mr. Melvin Mitchell for all projects
CUSO - Marlene Green

Butler Co-operative	\$9,760	(27715)
Herbs & Greens Co-operative	\$6,086	(27725)
Tools Technology		(27771)
- failed CUSO appropriate technology project		
- Marlene Green		
- \$50,925.		
Technical Assistance for Credit Union League		(27750)
- individual from COADY who does technical assistance		
in 3-month installments over 2-year period		
- \$57,280		
Grenada Co-operative Development Fund		(27802)
- revolving fund via credit union league		
- \$87,450		
Brizan Co-operative		(27726)
- tomato greenhouse, marginal		
- \$9,881		
Tivoli Co-operative		(27724)
- eggs, vegetable, marginal		
- \$10,186		
JAMS Woodworking		(27791)
- building for craft co-operative at Perdmontemps		
- NACDA		
- \$43,280		
Grenada Credit Union		(70780)
- very early assistance to credit union league		
- \$29,700		
Concord Pig		(27623)
- marginal agricultural co-operative folded		
before funded		
- \$5,500		

ADDITIONAL PROJECTS:

Trinidad Tobago (family CU)
- financial counselling
- \$5,670

Training Support to CCCU
- \$175,421

Surynam, Godo, Building
- \$15,000

Credit Union ancillary projects	\$964,721
Credit Union about to come on stream	\$ 75,000
Co-op projects	<u>\$2,010,662</u>
TOTAL CANADIAN DOLLARS	<u>\$3,050,383</u>

APPENDIX 4

IMPLEMENTATION OBJECTIVES

OUTPUT INDICATORS

PERCENTAGE COMPLETE

EXPECTED COMPLETION DATE

REMARKS

CCCU ORGANIZATION DEVELOPMENT

1. Management Systems

Complete documentation of systems and sub-systems related to:

a) Finance

- 1. Chart of Accounts 100%
- 2. Internal Audit Control System 100%
- 3. Index of accounts to Project Budget 100%
- 4. CCCU Accounting system 100%
- 5. Daily Cash Transaction Base System 100%
- 6. Monthly Financial Statements 100%
- 7. Budget process 100%
- 8. Cash Control System 100%
- 9. Monthly Bank Reconciliations 100%
- 10. Board/Donor Financial reporting 100%
- 11. CDP accounting system 100%
- 12. Cash flow projections system 100%
- 13. Financial Mgt. Policies 0%
- 14. Fixed Asset Register 50%

Dec 31/84
Dec 31/84

- 2. Procedures included in documented Acc't manual July/82
- 4. Documented in Manual
- 5. System being monitored reg'ly.
- 6. Produced by 15th following month.

b) Operations

- 1. Personnel Policies 99.9%
- 2. Travel Policies 100%
- 3. Training Policies 90%
- 4. Management Policies -
- 5. Organization Chart 100%
- 6. Planning Process 75%
- 7. Project Reporting Process 90%
- 8. Tech. Assistance/Service Policies 0%
- 9. General Board Policies 0%

1. Feb/84
3. Feb/84
4. Dec 31/84
6. June/84
7. April/84
8. June/85
9. June/85

- 14. Fixed Asset Register completed but sub sub-register
- 1. Presentation to BOD Feb/84
- 2. Approved by BOD
- 3. Presentation to BOD Feb/84
- 6. Requires documentation
- 7. Finalized for 1st 84 Quarter
- 8. Timely but format req's review

14/84

IMPLEMENTATION OBJECTIVES	OUTPUT INDICATORS	PERCENTAGE COMPLETE	COMPLETION DATE	REMARKS	
c) Office Administration	1) Filing System 2) Library System 3) Office Procedures 4) Equipment & supplies purchase 5) Equipment Maintenance	100% 30% 80% 90% 70%	2) May '84 3) June '84 4) April '84 5) April '84	1) On-going review/revision 2) Requires shelving and document 3) Review and documentation 4) System in Acc't Manual 5) Contract reviewed	
d) Personnel	1) Personnel Policies 2) Recruitment/selection & employment 3) Organizational Chart 4) Staff Position Descriptions	99.9% 60% 100% 100%	1) Feb '84 2) June '84	1) Presentation to BOD 2) Documentation required 3) Phase II Documented to show revised Chart. All documented. 4) On-going up-grading.	
e) Country Development Programme management, monitoring & administration	1) CDP Manual - annual budget format - monthly financial statement - monthly I&E reports - action plan format - quarterly progress report - training activities format 2) CDP Funds Disbursement System 3) Institutional Analysis System 4) Institutional Development Process 5)	100% 100% 100% 100% 100% 100% 80% 100% 90%	2) June '84 4)	1) Revised & distributed & reviewed 2) Requires consistency/doc'mntn. 4) To be documented and distributed	
2. Planning	Complete Institutional Analysis of its members and the OCU.	Members: 1) Antigua 2) Bahamas 3) Barbados 4) Belize 5) Cayman 6) Dominica 7) Grenada 8) Guyana 9) Jamaica 0) Montserrat	100% 100% 100% 100% 0 100% 100% 100% - 100%	5) June '84	1) Documented & reviewed with BOD 2) " 3) " 4) " 5) Operational Survey in '84 6) Documented & reviewed with BOD 7) " 8) " 9) Not scheduled in Phase I 10) Full I.A. not applicable - report documented & reviewed

141

IMPLEMENTATION OBJECTIVES	OUTPUT INDICATORS	PERCENTAGE COMPLETE	EXPECTED COMPLETION DATE	REMARKS
<p>Based on these analyses, a five year regional development plan and self-sufficiency strategy will be prepared</p>	<p>11) Nevis 12) St. Lucia 13) St. Vincent 14) Surinam 15) Trinidad & Tobago</p>	<p>100% 100% 100% 100% 100%</p>		<p>11) Documented & reviewed with BOD 12) " 13) " 14) " 15) "</p>
	<p>OCOU</p>	<p>100%</p>		<p>Documented & reviewed with BOD</p>
<p>3. CDP Management</p>	<p>OCOU Five Year Plan/Self-sufficiency</p>	<p>50%</p>	<p>June '84</p>	<p>1) Phase II completed by May '84 Five Year Plan with S-S to be documented by June '84</p>
<p>Implement and review the CDP's through its monitoring system, in-country visits and training workshops for League and Credit Union personnel</p>	<p>1) In-country monitoring visits 2) Technical assistance visits 3) CDP disbursement system 4) Progress REports/quarterly</p>	<p>100% 100% 80%</p>	<p>3) June '84</p>	<p>1) <u>201</u> visits to date 2) <u>201</u> visits to date 3) 4) <u>8</u> countries regular <u>2</u> delinquent, max 2 months <u>4</u> long overdue</p>
	<p>5) Financial reports/monthly</p>			<p>5) <u>9</u> countries regular <u>1</u> delinquent, max 2 months <u>4</u> long overdue</p>
<p>4. Management Information System</p>	<p>6) Training workshops</p>			<p>6) See training section</p>
<p>Design a Management Information System (MIS) to provide feedback on project implementation and performance data from credit unions and leagues</p>	<p>1) Documented MIS - data gathering forms - marketing/implementation strategy - training in use at national level - motivation - analysis of data system - compilation & reporting</p>	<p>25%</p>	<p>1) July '84</p>	<p>1) Forms in use, irregular reports</p>

1972

IMPLEMENTATION OBJECTIVES	OUTPUT INDICATORS	PERCENTAGE COMPLETE	EXPECTED COMPLETION DATE	REMARKS
OCOU SERVICE DEVELOPMENT				
1. Training				
a) Sub-regional courses will be designed, developed and conducted on a periodic basis	1) Leeward Islands C.U. Development Course	100%		1) Completed in March '82 As a result of course St. John's, (Antigua) Island-wide Montserrat, Basseterre and Police in (St. Kitts) have been organized and Nevis upgraded.
	2) Windwards C.U. Development Course	100%		2) Completed April/83. Barbados also included.
	3) South America Continental (Surinam & Guyana)		3) April '84	
	4) Western Caribbean C.U. Development Course		4) April '84	
	5) E.C. countries c.u. development course		5) May '84	
b) Direct on-the-job in-country training to member affiliate personnel will be provided	(list each in-country training programme with date and country)			
c) Develop a system of identifying and coordinating external and internal resource personnel.	1) Documentation of system	15%	1) Nov '84	1) Resources mobilized but documentation and greater use required
	2) Appointment of Resource Mobilization Coordinator	100%		2) Director of Training & Develop
d) Design, develop and deliver regional training courses	1) League managers - Phase I Feb '82 - Phase II Oct. '82 - Phase III Feb. 83	100% 100% 100%		1) Retention in league positions for original 100 participants equals 38.8%
	2) Annual General Meeting Training - 1981	100%		

143

IMPLEMENTATION OBJECTIVES	OUTPUT INDICATORS	PERCENTAGE COMPLETE	EXPECTED COMPLETION DATE	REMARKS
	- 1982	100%		
	- 1983	100%		
	- 1984	25%	Aug '84	
	3) Family Financial Counseling Trinidad - June '83	100%		
	4) Communications/Insurance/T-t-T	30%	Mar '84	
	5) Phase II Development, St. Kitts	10%	May '84	
	6) Cooperative Legislation & Policy Development - Antigua	10%	Aug '84	
	7) Central Finance Development - BDS	25%	Oct. '84	
e) Each training activity and participant will be evaluated for immediate end-of-training skill development, long-term skill retention and practical application.	1) Documented evaluation system	30%	1) Oct '84	1) End-of-training evaluation takes place & participants interviewed during CDP monitoring visits for retention & feedback
	2) Post training evaluation	100%		
	3) Long-term skill retention	25%	3) On-going	3) this is an on-going process over a number of years.
	4) Practical application	50%	4) on-going	4)
2 Institutional Analysis/Planning				
a) The institutional analysis process will be completed and reports prepared and submitted to the respective boards of directors.	1) Member Institutional Analysis			1) See page 2 No. 2
b) Assist each member country to design and document its long-range development plans	Members			
	1) Antigua	80%	1) Mar '84	1) Draft completed & submitted to
	2) Bahamas	20%	2) May '84	2) Planning session Ap '84 BOD
	3) Barbados	20%	3) July '84	3) Planning session July '84
	4) Belize	20%	4) May '84	4) Planning session April '84
	5) Cayman	20%	5) Oct. '84	5) Ops Survey by June '84
	6) Dominica	90%	6) July '84	6) Updating to incl 84-89
	7) Grenada	100%		
	8) Guyana	80%	8) Mar '84	8) Draft submitted to BOD
	9) Jamaica			
	10) Montserrat	100%		

1984

IMPLEMENTATION OBJECTIVES	OUTPUT INDICATORS	PERCENTAGE COMPLETE	EXPECTED COMPLETION DATE	REMARKS	
c) Assist members in preparation of annual work plans and train staff and volunteers in the planning process	11) Nevis 12) St. Kitts (Nevis) 13) St. Lucia 14) St. Vincent 15) Suriname 16) Trinidad & Tobago	80% n/a 20% 20% 80% 20%	Mar '84 Oct '84 Aug '84 Mar '84 Oct '84	11) Draft submitted to BOD 12) Annual plan to be developed 84 13) Planning session Oct '84 14) Planning session June '84 15) Draft submitted to BOD 16) Planning session Oct 84	
	1984 Annual Work Plans:	1) Antigua 2) Bahamas 3) Barbados 4) Belize 5) Cayman 6) Dominica 7) Grenada 8) Guyana 9) Jamaica	100% 0% 100% 80% 0%	1) CCOU followup planning session '84 2) Planning session Ap '84 3) Planning session July '84 4) Draft submitted to BOD 5) Ops survey June '84	
	10) Montserrat	11) Nevis	100%	8) Submitted to BOD/Followup '84	
	12) St. Kitts	13) St. Vincent	80%	10) Followup planning in 4th Q '84	
	14) St. Lucia	15) Surinam	0%	11) Followup planning in 4th Q 84	
	16) Trinidad & Tobago	1) Documented planning manual	20%	12) Planning session in '84	
	d) A documented planning proces manual will be used for these sessions and will serve as the guideline for training personnel at the credit union level.	1) Documented planning manual	80%	1) Oct '84	13)
					14)
					15) Followup planning in '84
					1) Process developed and format being implemented - requires documentation

145

IMPLEMENTATION OBJECTIVES	OUTPUT INDICATORS	PERCENTAGE COMPLETE	EXPECTED COMPLETION DATE	REMARKS
3. Standard Guidelines and Models				
a) Develop League and Credit Union operating manuals.	1) Model Cooperative Societies Act 2) League Acc't & Financial Systems 3) League audit Program/role & use of audit 4) League BOD & operating polices 5) League Model Bye-laws 6) C.U. Insurance manual 7) C.U. BOD & Operating policies 8) C.U. Acc't & Financial Systems 9) C.U. Internal/external audit system 10) C.U. member service manual 11) C.U. Loan & Delinquency Control policies & operations 12) C.U. Promotion & Organizational Procedures 13) Credit Union Bye-laws 14) C.U. Personnel Policies 15) Train-the-Trainer	10% 25% 100% 80% 75% 100% 100%	1) Aug '84	1) UWI team to present to AGM 2) Reporting forms documented (3-15) Manuals Development project presented for '84 implementation
b) Marketing of league /credit union manuals	1) Distribution to the system	20% of material produced		
c) Technical Papers	1) Credit Unions & You 2) OCCU Foundation 3) Central Finance	100% 100% 70%	3) Oct/84	
4. Insurance				
Coordinate the development and maintenance of a comprehensive insurance protection programme for credit union savings & loan and credit union members.	1) Appointment of Coordinator 2) Initiate coordination 3) Insurance workshop	100% 100% 100%		1) Director of Training & Devel 3) Held at '83 AGM
Initiate a review of insurance services available and propose alternate and/or additional services to OCCU member institutions.	1) Design & implement review 2) Regional Insurance Survey 3) Document recommendations	100%	3) Nov '84	1) Review workshop at '83 AGM

IMPLEMENTATION OBJECTIVES	OUTPUT INDICATORS	PERCENTAGE COMPLETE	EXPECTED COMPLETION DATE	REMARKS
5. Standard Forms	Review and revise standard operating forms for league and credit unions.	1) Accounting 100% 2) financial reports 100% 3) Planning 100% 4) personnel evaluation 40% 5) programme reporting 100% 6) CDP management 100% 7) statistical gathering 75% 8) Institutional Analysis 100%	4) Oct. '84 7) July '84	1) Included in C.U. acc't manual 2) Included in CDP manual 3) Included in CDP manual 5) Included in CDP manual 6) included in CDP manual 7) Included in MIS 8) Included in I.A. manual
6. Resource Mobilization	a) Design & document a resource mobilization strategy for teh OCCU Headquarters, its training and technical assistance services, and for its member institutions.	1) OCCU HQ's Strategy 75% 2) OCCU Foundation 100% 3) Training & Technical Assist Strategy 75% 4) Member Institutions 50%	1) June '84 3) June '84 4) June '84	1) Documented with Phase II 2) Initiated at '83 AGM 3) Documented with Phase II 4) Documented with Phase II
	b) Included in this process will be the provision of a specific project development service for member countries	1) Dominica Banana Boxing Plant 100% 2) St. Lucia Hurricane Relief/loans 80% 3) St. Vincent Hurricane relief/loans 100% 4) St. Vincent Soufrier relief 100% 5) Nevis Building Project 100% 6) Antigua C.U. Admin Support 30% 7)		
7. Audit Monitoring	Design and document an audit monitoring implementation programme ensuring that appropriate audits are conducted and utilized within the Caribbean credit union system.	1) Documented monitoring programme	100%	1) All league are being monitored for audit programmes. Auditing at credit union level still inadequate.

IMPLEMENTATION OBJECTIVES	OUTPUT INDICATORS	PERCENTAGE COMPLETE	EXPECTED COMPLETION DATE	REMARKS
8. Central Finance				
a) Design and document a central Finance facility base.	1) Regional Central Finance Strategy 2) National Central Finance Strategy 3) Central Finance Policies & procedures documented 4) Central Finance Seminar	30% 50% 40% 20%	1) June '84 2) June '84 3) Oct. '84 4) Oct. '84	1) As part of Phase II 2) As part of Phase II
b) Given this base, work to generate national credit union central finance facilities.	1) Dominica C.F.F. 2) Grenada C.F.F. 3) Jamaica 4) St. Vincent 5) St. Lucia 6) Belize 7) Barbados 8) **** 9) Bahamas 10) Antigua 11) Surinam 12) Trinidad & Tobago 13) Guyana	100% 60% 100% 25% 25% 60%	2) Mar '85	1) In operation 2) Bye-laws amended, policies to be documented 3) Not as result of project on-going & operational 4) Special league on-lending programme in operation 5) Special league on-lending programme in operation 6) Special housing on-lending project through league in operation 7) Special housing on-lending project being negotiated with Government- 8) CFF not applicable to Nevis wide credit unions 9) Phase II 10) Strategy for island-wide credit union CFF may not be applicable 11) Phase II 12) Depends on resolution of League & Credit Union Bank. 13) Not feasible in foreseeable future.

1/8

IMPLEMENTATION OBJECTIVES	OUTPUT INDICATORS	PERCENTAGE COMPLETE	EXPECTED COMPLETION DATE	REMARKS
DOMINICA				
Organization Development				
1) Management Systems				
Document & implement essential & appropriate management systems;				
a) Financial Management	1) Chart of Accounts 2) League Accounting System - monthly financial statements - cash management - bank reconciliations 3) Budget Process 4) Board/donor reporting systems 5) Cash Flow projections system 6) Financial Mgt policies & procedure 7) Fixed asset register	80% 100% 80% 100% 100% 80% 80%	1) Dec/84 3) Dec/84 6) Dec/84 7) Dec/84	1) Documentation of all policies required 3-7) Documentation required
b) Operations Management System	1) Travel Policies 2) Management Policies 3) Organizational Chart 4) Training & Development Policies 5) Planning Process	80% 90% 100% 80% 80%	1) Dec/84 2) Dec/84 4) Dec/84 5) Dec/84	1-2, 4-5) Documentation required Being compiled/Policy decision documented
c) Personnel System	1) Personnel Policies 2) Recruitment, selection & employment system	80% 80%	1) Dec/84 2) Dec/84	1) To be documented 2) To be documented
d) Office Administration System	1) Filing System 2) Library & Documentation System 3) Office Procedures 4) Equipment & supplies purchase 5) Equipment maintenance 6) Communication	80% 80% 80% 80% 80% 80%	1) Dec/84 2) " 3) " 4) " 5) " 6) "	1) To be documented 2) 3) 4) 5) 6)

149

IMPLEMENTATION OBJECTIVES	OUTPUT INDICATORS	PERCENTAGE COMPLETE	EXPECTED COMPLETION DATE	REMARKS
<p>2. Identify priority service needs of member societies as a result of "Hurricane David" as well as the longer term service needs.</p>	<p>1) Documented service needs of members</p>			
<p>Design and manage required feasibility studies and present the results to Management</p>	<p>1) Feasibility study design 2) Compilation of information 3) Documentation of recommendations</p>			
<p>3) Prepare medium and long-term development plans for the including, including resource mobilization strategies.</p>	<p>1) Medium term development plans 2) Long-range development plans 3) Self-sufficiency plans 4) Resource mobilization strategies</p>	<p>100% 50% 90% 70%</p>	<p>2) Dec/84 3) Dec/84 4) Dec/84</p>	<p>2) No detailed strategies; projections not updated 3) ditto 4) Not documented</p>
<p>4) Develop financial and work plans for project implementation, coordinate joint project activities, and assure that project activities are effectively integrated into league planning, implementation and evaluation systems.</p>	<p>1) Documented work plans 2) Annual budgets 3) Integration of planning, implementation & evaluation system</p>	<p>100% 100% 80%</p>	<p>3) Dec/84</p>	<p>3) To be documented</p>
<p>5) Design an agricultural lending programme</p>	<p>1) Document needs 2) Document funds mobilization strategy 3) Document agric lending policies</p>	<p>50% 70% 100%</p>	<p>1) Dec/84 2) Dec/84</p>	<p>3) Included in CFF policies</p>

150