PD-AAP-305
ISN 34953

File
OIC
Ghana Eva
17.

Barnett & Engel
9 MARION ROAD
WESTPORT, CONNECTICUT 06880
203 / 226-0118

FINAL REPORT

END-OF-PROJECT EVALUATION OF OIC/GHANA PHASE II

NON-FORMAL COMMUNITY-BASED VOCATIONAL EDUCATION PROGRAM

Stanley A. Barnett
Jehu K. Akushie
Rosemary Burke
Quy D. Nguyen
Andrew Swanzy Essien
James R. Washington
Cheryl D. Williams

AID Project No. 641-0076

10 June 1980

OIC INTERNATIONAL

OPPORTUNITIES INDUSTRIALIZATION CENTERS INTERNATIONAL, INC.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREFACE iii

I. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY 1
   A. Major Findings, Conclusions and Recommendations. . . 1
   B. Guidelines for Future Activity. 5

II. BASIC DESIGN ELEMENTS 8
   A. Aim of the Project. 8
   B. Project Strategy for Accomplishing the Task 8

III. EVALUATION OF RESULTS THROUGH MARCH 1970. 10
   A. Project Goal. 10
   B. Project Purpose 11
      1. Purpose Assumptions 11
      2. Achievement of End-of-Project Status Conditions 12
         - Rate of Placement/Retention/Job Performance. 12
            - Rate of Placement 12
            - Job Retention 13
            - Job Performance -- Placement Survey . . . 13
            - Note on OIC/Ghana Statistics. 15
         - Training Efficiency (Cost-Per-Student) . . . 17
         - Local Support for the Programs 18
         - Emulation of OIC Training Methods/Concepts . 19
         - Generation of Interest for New OICs. 19
         - Training/Placement of Middle School Dropouts 20
         - Trainee Wastage. 21
         - Trainee Help to Defray Training Expenses . . 21
         - Relevance of Training Course Content 22
         - Four-Year Graduate Totals. 23
   C. Project Outputs 24
      1. Three-Center Outputs in Terms of Trainees . . . 24
         - Trainees Receiving Feeder Training 24
         - Placements from Vocational Courses 25
         - Participation in the GOG's Civil Service Retraining Program. 28
         - Administrative and Service Systems to Support the Training Programs. 28
      2. Training and Office facilities. 29
      3. National Office Coordination and Support Services 30

- Program and Policy Coordination 30
  - National Office/Local Office Coordination. 30
  - Internal Communication 31
  - Area Coordination. 31
  - Long-Term Planning 32
  - Coordination of Fund-Raising Activities. 33
  - Research into Needs and Requirements . . 34
  - Programmatic Evaluation. 34
  - Management Information System. 35
- Provision of Entrepreneurial Management Services for OIC/Ghana Enterprises . . . 37

4. Community Consciousness and Support. 38

APPENDICES

A. List of Persons Interviewed. 39

B. Methodology of the Placement Survey. 42

PREFACE

The End-of-Project evaluation covered by this report was undertaken in accordance with Part IV.C, "Evaluation Plan" of the Project Paper for OIC/Ghana Phase II, "Community Based Vocational Education" project No. Ghana 641-0076.

The evaluators numbered seven:

- Stanley A. Barnett, Partner, Barnett & Engel, Economic Development Planning Consultants -- Team Leader.
- Jehu K. Akushie, Controller of Apprenticeship Programs, Ghana National Vocational Training Institute (NVTI).
- Rosemary Burke, Program Officer, OICI/Central Office.
- Quy D. Nguyen, Evaluation Officer, OICI/Central Office.
- Andrew Swanzy Essien, Director, Industrial Liaison Career Guidance and Counseling Unit, Ghana Education Service.
- James R. Washington, Education and Human Resources, USAID/Ghana.
- Cheryl D. Williams, Education Officer, OICI/Central Office.

The team arrived in Ghana on 19 April 1980 and departed on 9 May. The foci of team attention were the National Office of OIC/Ghana and the OIC/Accra Training Center, both in Accra; and the OIC Training Centers in Kumasi and Secondi-Takoradi (henceforth called OIC/Takoradi in this report). OIC/Kumasi and OIC/Takoradi were assessed concurrently by different groups of evaluators, between April 28 and 30.

To determine the degree of achievement for key Purpose-level End-of-Project Status (EOPS) conditions regarding OICI/Ghana trainee placement, retention and performance, the evaluators conducted a random sample survey of 41 employers/supervisors who have employed almost one-quarter of trainees placed by the three centers during Phase II, and of 27 OIC trainees who were employed at the firms. The survey began on 23 April and ended on 2 May.

The names of persons interviewed in Ghana are listed in Appendix A to the report (pages 39-41).

On May 7 and 8, the evaluators' preliminary findings, conclusions and recommendations were separately reviewed with (1) representatives of USAID and the GOG; (2) members of OIC/Ghana's National Board of Directors; and (3) the Executive Director of the National Office and the Project Advisor. The draft evaluation report was reviewed by OIC/Central on 4 June 1980.

Financial data in the report are in dollars. Where deemed appropriate amounts are given in Ghanaian cedis and converted, parenthetically, into dollars.

We thank the Ghana Ministry of Education, Culture and Sports; the Ghana Ministry of Labor; and USAID/Gnana for for assigning staff specialists as full members of the evaluation team. The others among us benefitted from their acute insights and knowledge, and their contributions, conclusions and recommendations are incorporated into this report.

Because the Ghana-based members of the the team did not have the opportunity to personally review the report before its publication, the undersigned, as editor, accepts primary responsibility for any errors or misinterpretations of their ideas that may exist.

Stanley A Barnett

I. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

I-A. MAJOR FINDINGS, CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

OIC/Ghana attempts a most difficult task -- the training of the least educated, most underprivileged element of the nation's youth, generally those in their teens and early twenties who, for the most part, have never held a job and who, at best, face a life of under-employment and casual labor.

OIC transforms this raw material (considered unpromising by many) into carpenters, masons, typists, plumbers, electricians, commercial artists, motor mechanics, caterers and bookkeepers whose skills are generally average and above average among entry-level employees.

This is testimony both to the quality and inherent ability of Ghana's youth and the the ability of OIC/Ghana's atypical, non-formal approach to transforming school leavers and dropouts into useful, productive citizens.

The program is fundamentally strong, viable and of great service to Ghana.

- OIC's Training Programs

The basic validity of OIC/Ghana training techniques and methodology is shown by the superior performance of its graduates compared to workers trained elsewhere to the entry level. An intensive placement survey by the evaluators revealed that almost 53% of employers and supervisors consider OIC trainees above-average and an additional 30% are considered average -- far above what might have been expected of the program's target group.

During the four-years of Phase II, the program can be expected to make some 850 placements, 63% of plan. Approximately 950 trainees, 59% of plan, will complete Feeder instruction. Both slowdowns result primarily from the longer-than-anticipated passage of trainees through the system. Feeder training takes four to five months, rather than

the three planned, and Vocational instruction takes 18-19 months, double the time anticipated. The slowdown appears unrelated to recruitment procedures (each of the three Training Centers boasts large waiting lists of applicants) or lack of job opportunities (OIC reports that it was able to fill only one-quarter of the jobs developed for its graduates). Delayed openings of OIC/Kumasi and OIC/Takoradi are contributing factors in past lack of performance, but significant increases cannot be expected unless course length is reduced.

OIC training results in far higher income for graduates, most of whom lack previous work experience.

At the end of April 1980, OIC was training 241 redundant civil servants for the Government of Ghana (GOG). The added, special effort has put the Centers on two-shift operation and caused instructors to work overtime. Care must be taken to ensure that instruction effort and preparation time do not suffer.

OIC/Ghana's careless compilation and use of statistics has caused self-inflicted wounds to a basically solid training experience. The number of individuals placed during Phase II is substantially fewer than the number reported by the program. OIC/Ghana equates "individuals placed" with "number of placements," which includes multiple placements of the same individuals.

Although OIC/Ghana's unusual definition of graduate placement ensures a 100% rate, jobs have not been found for a number of OIC graduates who have completed instruction and undergone on-the-job training. The true placement rate, undoubtedly high, is unknown to the evaluators. The claimed 94% rate of job retention after six months probably has not been met. However, failure to attain that target does not necessarily indicate poor job performance; there is a great deal of "job-hopping" on the part of OIC trainees and other entry-level employees, in their skill categories, in search of higher pay.

Training course content appears relevant to identified industrial needs. Curricula for the various skills areas are comprehensive and job-related. Lowered industrial activity and heightened employer selectivity are decreasing the marketability and bargaining power of OIC graduates who lack the nationally recognized NVTI Trade Test Grade II Certificate. Therefore, OIC/Ghana is incorporating NVTI training standards and syllabi into its curricula.

Many, probably most OIC trainees have enrolled with less than a middle school certificate, although OIC/Kumasi appears to require one for entrance. The program should better match trainees by educational

background to the demands of the skills courses, Post-secondary and post-middle school leavers should not be indiscriminately grouped in Feeder with middle school dropouts.

Although OIC/Ghana's open enrollment, individually paced non-formal training is not strictly comparable to other vocational programs, its cost-per-trainee-per-year appears close to levels reported by other institutions in the country. Trainee wastage is about 20% -- one-third higher than target.

In-service training and planning are inadequate. There is some shortage of training tools and equipment.

The evaluators found no tangible evidence indicating that OIC training concepts and methods have been emulated by other Ghanaian vocational education programs (see page 12).

- OIC/Ghana Facilities

Training facilities in Kumasi and Takoradi are adequate. In Accra, the Training Center, Arts & Crafts Center and the National Office are old, not designed for current usage, and overcrowded. The new Accra training/office complex called for by the Project Paper is still in the design stage. Plans appear over-elaborate.

- Community Consciousness and Support

The National and local Boards of Directors consist of prominent business, civic and lay leaders who devote exceptionally long amounts of time, consistently, to program affairs.

OIC/Ghana's local share of project financing has averaged about half of the 16% target set by the Project Paper. The target appears over-optimistic in view of the intensive fund-raising efforts made by the program.

The National Industrial Advisory Committee and local Technical Advisory Committees have been inactive for well over a year.

Lack of funds and National Office assistance characterize the faltering efforts of Ghanaian communities interested in establishing new OIC training facilities.

- National Office Coordination and Support Services

OIC/Ghana program and policy coordination is characterized by lack of long-range planning and reduced effectiveness. To a degree, this results from a partial reduction in the size of the TCT team before counterpart training had been completed. Inadequate sharing of pertinent information at the National Office hinders efficient delivery of technical assistance to local programs.

In the absence of specific, detailed procedures governing the interrelationships among local programs, local Boards of Directors and the National Office, misunderstandings have arisen. Absence of a comprehensive internal SOP manual partially explains continuing confusion regarding lines of authority and inadequate record keeping and documentation. OIC/Ghana's limited implementation of OICI's programmatic MIS represents a failure in the transfer and absorption of OIC technology. The MIS is a project management tool intended to help ensure efficient operation after phaseout of OICI's technical assistance. The National Office has failed to respond to OICI/Central's recommendations for a general overhaul of its management practices and system.

The National Office area coordinators act as project advisors to the local OICs. Technical specialists who double in the coordination function, they lack the experience and perhaps the ability to solve management and organizational problems encountered.

The absence of a Research/Evaluation Officer until early 1980 has minimized OIC/Ghana's accomplishments in those key planning areas. A more simplified method of program evaluation should be developed to make the tool more productive and economical.

The evaluators recommend that:

- o A total review of OIC/Ghana's documentation and information systems be jointly initiated by OIC/Ghana and OICI's Central Office, in order to ensure more effective documentation and improved program statistics in terms of quality, quantity and reliability. Priority attention should be given to data produced by OIC/Accra.
  - ▷ OICI's Central Office should provide TDY technical assistance to OIC/Ghana in this regard in the immediate future.
- o Roles and responsibilities of the three local programs vis-a-vis the local Boards of Directors and the National Office be defined with greater clarity and increased detail, particularly with respect to reporting systems and lines of authority.

- The National Office review and synthesize its numerous operational guidelines into a comprehensive, well-coordinated set of Standard Operating Procedures (SOP). Importantly, the SOP should specify lines of authority and should detail the procedures of delivering logistical support and technical assistance to the local programs.
- A more detailed timetable of technical assistance to local programs be developed, to ensure that the various aspects of program operation are monitored effectively on a continuing basis, and that programs receive needed support. The scope of the technical assistance and the verifiable indicators of achievement of objectives also should be clearly defined.
- A system be devised to provide technical staff of the National Office equal opportunity to review pertinent reports and information emanating from local programs.

I-B. GUIDELINES FOR FUTURE ACTIVITY

The Phase III proposal of OIC/Ghana calls for:

- A five-year budget of $8,100,000 that is twice as high as the Phase II budget.
- A doubling of the number of training centers from three to six.
- A change of training site locale from urban to suburban and rural areas.
- A project that is to directly benefit 3,525 graduates -- over two-and-a-half times the number called for by the Phase II Project Paper and perhaps five times the number of individuals who actually will be placed during Phase II.
- The introduction of courses that train in new vocational and technical skills, including some allied to current courses (Automotive Preventive Maintenance and Rural Building -- a combination of Motor Mechanics, Carpentry, Masonry, Electricity and Plumbing).
- The introduction of courses in new-to-OIC/Ghana skills (Child Care and Printing).
- An entry into agricultural training, through courses in Crop Production and Animal Husbandry.

OIC/Ghana's development of the Phase III concept is a laudable and imaginative attempt to meet Ghana's increasing and changing needs in community-based vocational education.

However, several aspects of the current Phase II program suggest that the Phase III proposal requires further study and may be overly ambitious for OIC/Ghana at this time:

1. The Phase III proposal requires further elaboration in many substantive areas. For example, the scope and subject matter of the new vocational courses are not detailed. They are only listed by title and duration.

2. Expansion of the urban-based OIC program into agricultural development is fraught with potential problems and requires in-depth proposal-design research and analysis. Included among the areas that must be studied by professionals are: soil analysis; selection of the proper crops and animals to be raised; fertilizer usage; needs and availabilities of water, electricity, shelter, drainage and roads; storage facilities and marketing channels; food and equipment for the trainees; health facilities; transportation and communication; and seasonal growing patterns. The necessary study will take time.

3. Planning, organizational and operational inefficiencies hamper the current effectiveness of the Phase II program. Unless they are remedied before inception of the new program, Phase III will lack a firm base. The new phase, with its proliferation of training centers, enrollment and vocational courses, requires more efficient management than ever before.

4. Major lessons learned from key problems that continue to trouble Phase II may not have been applied to the Phase III design. This is suggested by the lack of a detailed implementation plan in the Phase III proposal; the absence of a detailed mechanism through which the National Office is to provide its services to the individual centers; and lack of a sufficiently detailed budget.

The end of Fiscal 1980 is less than four months distant. Proposal analysis and funding procedures of both the GOG and AID may require more time than is now available for the expanded program to become operational on October 1, next.

In addition, OIC/Ghana must assess the extent to which the additional workload represented by its major participation in the GOG's Civil Service Retraining Program affects its ability to concurrently operate a greatly expanded Phase III program in the immediate future.

In view of the aforenoted considerations, the evaluators recommend (a) that OIC/Ghana withdraw the current Phase III proposal and (b) that USAID/Ghana consider extending the Phase II program for an additional year, through Fiscal 1981, at about its present level of funding.

Further that, during FY 1981, OIC/Ghana:

1. Present convincing evidence that it has improved and strengthened its operating effectiveness along the lines recommended in this evaluation report. The changes will improve the program's outlook for successful Phase III expansion.

2. With the assistance of OICI's Central Office, USAID and appropriate GOG agencies, OIC/Ghana should prepare a comprehensive project proposal for Phase III that will be completed with sufficient speed and in sufficient detail for consideration and action by potential sponsors for FY 1982 funding.

II. BASIC DESIGN ELEMENTS

II-A. AIM OF THE PROJECT

Urban unemployment in Ghana has been estimated at more than 25% of the work force -- a level that represents a serious waste of human resources and loss to the economy and portends serious social problems. Concurrent with pervasive unemployment, demand exists in Ghana for skilled manpower at many vocational and technical levels.

The 1976 AID-OICI-OIC/Ghana Project Paper for Phase II found the supply of skilled labor inadequate to meet demand. It reported that existing vocational and technical training programs in Ghana turned out too few graduates and that many suffered from common deficiencies that reduced effectiveness and raised costs in terms of trainees placed inadequate facilities and equipment, lack of qualified instructors, rote teaching methods, curricula that overly reflected on the academic rather than the practical aspects of vocational training, lack of coordination between job training and job opportunities, lack of motivational instruction, long formal training periods and high trainee "wastage."

Phase II of the OIC/Ghana program began some three and one-half years after initiation of Phase I project No. 641-13-610-063 of 6 December 1972. The purpose of Phase I had been to "develop a (private) indigenous vocational training program...to demonstrate to government, industry and to other educational institutions an alternative to traditional vocational education approaches." The previous project's success in attaining training objectives and in demonstrating the effectiveness in Ghana of the OIC vocational education approach led to the Phase II expansion of the program.

II-B. PROJECT STRATEGY FOR ACCOMPLISHING THE TASK

The Phase II Project Paper called for extension of the then active OIC/Ghana program in Accra to two other major urban centers -- Kumasi and Takoradi; for the conduct of training courses and administrative

service systems (counseling, curriculum development, job placement, in-service training, etc.) at each of the three local operating centers; quadrupling annual production of "job-ready" trainees to 460 by FY 1980; establishing a National OIC/Ghana Training Center in the Accra area; and creating a National Coordinating Office under the OIC/Ghana Board of Directors to guide and coordinate the three-center program.

The project target group consists largely of unemployed urban middle school leavers and dropouts without skills and without the educational background or income to pursue other training opportunities.

OIC/Ghana training develops entry-level skills. It stresses innovative non-formal educational concepts and techniques, including education of the "whole person" to a job-ready level. The whole-person concept embodies the belief that successful vocational job training for discouraged individuals with little formal education involves the development of positive attitudes about self and work, as well as development of technical skills.

To instill trainees with confidence in themselves and their new skills, trainees are counseled from initial entrance into a center through to placement and performance on a job. They begin instruction with several months of "Feeder" training that upgrades trainees in the basic communications, numeracy and social skills required for job competence. The OIC/Ghana concept calls for training to be directly related to job opportunities and needed skill requirements, so that trainees can move directly to productive employment.

Under Phase II, training was to be expanded from six to 10 vocational fields. The courses were to vary in length from six to 12 months, with most geared to a nine-month completion schedule. Trainees, however, were to proceed at their individual pace through competency-based instruction, moving to the next instructional module after acquiring the necessary skills. Upon completion of vocational training OIC/Ghana was to place trainees in jobs and follow up to ensure successful adjustment.

Four-year Phase II costs were estimated at $4,032,000, with AID financing $1,900,000 (47%), the GOG $1,476,000 (37%) and OIC/Ghana private sources the remaining $656,000 (16%).

Section III of the report, following, assesses OIC/Ghana's accomplishments during the first three and a half years of the four-year project.

III. EVALUATION OF RESULTS THROUGH MARCH 1980

This is an End-of-Project evaluation. Thus, it focuses on attainment of Purpose End-of-Project Status (EOPS) conditions of the Project Paper's Logical Framework and conformity with and deviation from that project design, including assessment of validity of initial assumptions Objectively Verifiable Indicators (OVIs) of Project Output often detail clarify or extend Purpose EOPS; for this reason, the evaluation report also discusses achievement of Output OVIs. Subsection III-A, below, starts with a brief consideration of Project Goal. Subsections III-B and III-C cover the Purpose EOPS and Output OVIs, respectively.

III-A. PROJECT GOAL

OIC/Ghana Phase II's broad objective is to contribute to the expansion and increased efficiency of vocational/technical education in Ghana. There is no doubt that the project contributes, probably significantly, to the goal, as a review of the Purpose EOPS and Output OVIs indicate.

The assumptions for achieving Goal targets remain valid:

"1. The national economy continues to create a demand for skilled vocational workers at the entry level and higher levels."

Since the October 1976 start of OIC/Ghana Phase II, the country has experienced an economic downturn that has negatively impacted many of the firms in which OIC/Ghana graduates are placed. This has been complicated by a shortage of foreign exchange and currency devaluations that have created shortages of spare parts and imported raw materials (metal rods, cement), tools, equipment and machinery, which have slowed the construction trades and activity in the skills (e.g., Motor Mechanics) that OIC/Ghana has stressed. Nevertheless, the three OIC training centers report that current demand exceeds OIC's capacity to train by several times.

"2. Other vocational training programs are insufficient to meet the demand for job-ready workers."

The assumption is still valid for the vocational skills (except perhaps for Motor Mechanics) which OIC/Ghana teaches.

III-B. PROJECT PURPOSE

III-B-1. PURPOSE ASSUMPTIONS

"1. OIC trainees do not have access to other government or private technical training because of lack of educational qualifications and/or financial resources."

The assumption is true for the majority of OIC trainees who lack the Middle School Completion Certificate and/or funds for lodging and subsistence at geographically distant vocational training institutions.

"2. OIC graduates will not be artificially barred from work commensurate to their actual working knowledge and experience by lack of (a nationally recognized) certification."

This is still generally valid for OIC graduates, although there is reason to believe that the low level of industry activity and resulting heightened employer selectivity among job applicant may, in time, markedly decrease the marketability and bargaining power of OIC graduates who are not equipped with a nationally recognized NVTI Trade Test Grade II Certificate. Even now, graduates of the OIC Office Skills course who lack the NVTI Grade II Certificate are barred from permanent employment at government agencies or enterprises.

OIC/Ghana has obtained NVTI Training Standards/Syllabi for pertinent skills areas and has incorporated them into OIC curricula, making the course content more relevant to Ghana's industrial standards/requirements. At OIC/Accra, the Office Skills trainees are encouraged to take the NVTI test when they are deemed job-ready. The evaluators encourage this trend.

"3. Training will result in higher income for trainees."

OIC/Ghana annually measures the impact of OIC job placements upon the economy. Its calculations for FY 1979 indicate that average earnings of the 226 trainees "placed" in jobs that year were 35 cedis before entering OIC and 2,544 cedis after placement by OIC. (Reportedly only 24% of such placements had a previous employment history.) OIC indicates that, over the past nine

years, placed trainees have averaged from 13 to 34 times the annual salary they made before entering an OIC training center. Although the evaluators did not verify the calculations or the methodology used, it is apparent that OIC graduates derive far higher incomes from their training than were available to them beforehand.

"4. Other vocational training programs are willing to adopt new concepts/methods."

OIC/Ghana's management and staff report that some OIC training concepts and methods have been adopted by other vocational training programs. GOG vocational trainers and educators deny the influence on their institutions, noting, however, that OIC concepts may have been adopted by private training entities. The evaluators could find no tangible evidence linking OIC/Ghana concepts to other training institutions in the country.

III-B-2. ACHIEVEMENT OF PURPOSE END-OF-PROJECT STATUS CONDITIONS

The purpose of OIC/Ghana Phase II is "to expand and replicate a low-cost community based non-formal vocational training program for middle school leavers and dropouts and to develop the human and technical skills needed for productive employment."

The Logframe's 10 End-of-Project Status conditions are reviewed in order, immediately below:

- PURPOSE EOP #1: "The rate of placement, retention and performance of OIC graduates is high -- 99% of persons completing training are placed in jobs and 94% retained after six months on the job. Job performance of graduates is superior to other workers trained elsewhere to the entry level."

Rate of Placement: OIC/Ghana defines "completion" as follows: "Trainee are not considered to have 'completed' OIC training...until they have successfully held a job for three months following their course work."* Pursuant to the definition, trainees who have been declared job-ready, close to the finish of their vocational skills course, are not deemed to have completed their training. Even those who have undergone

---

* OIC/Ghana's Phase III Proposal, April 1980, page 17.

on-the-job training (OJT) after finishing their skills course, but have not been placed, are not considered to have completed their training. Only the trainee who has finally been placed in a paying job is considered to have completed training.

As a consequence of OIC's unusually narrow interpretation of "completion it reports in various project documents either that 99% or 100% of trainees who have completed training have been placed. Whereas the definition ensures 100% placement of persons completing training, it masks a number (unknown to the evaluators) of persons considered "graduates" in the normal sense of the term who are not placed. For example, seven of 12 trainees in the first Office Skills group at OIC/Takoradi finished the course at the center and completed their OJT with firms, but were never placed. They reportedly have since returned to their homes, where their typing and secretarial skills have eroded and perhaps disappeared.

Job Retention: OIC/Ghana project documents pick up the EOP status condition and claim 94% job retention after six months. The evaluators could find no study measuring the factor.

In order to assess the job performance of OIC graduates, we conducted a Placement Survey during eight days of the assignment. The survey is covered in Job Performance, below. Our findings that only a little over half of the trainees selected at random (28 of 52) from among those placed between FY 1977 and FY 1979 still work for the firm at which they were placed by OIC, and reports from employers and supervisors and employers of OIC graduates, suggest that the 94% EOP status condition is not being realized.

A higher-than-expected employee turnover performance is not necessarily bad, however. Our survey revealed a great deal of "job-hopping" by entry-level workers in the skills that OIC teaches. In 90% of the cases where employees had changed employer after placement, the employers reported that the OIC trainees had left on their own to seek better pay elsewhere and the large majority reported that they would continue to employ OIC graduates.

Job Performance -- Placement Survey: The evaluators conducted a placement survey among firms and government entities in Accra, Kumasi and Takoradi in order to determine whether the "job performance of OIC graduates is superior to other workers trained elsewhere to the entry level." We had considered the job performance goal high, because OIC/Ghana works with a less qualified human resource (generally little-educated middle school dropouts and leavers) than other Ghanaian vocational training institutions. We had considered that if employers

reported that OIC graduates were "average" in job skills and attitude toward work, the result would indicate in a tangible way the strength of OIC's training methodology and concepts.

The on-site survey was conducted during eight days between April 23 and May 2, 1980. During the period, we interviewed 27 placed OIC trainees and 41 of their employers or supervisors. The employers and supervisors had had first-hand experience with 129 placed OIC trainees -- 21% of the 609 Phase II placements listed on rosters that had been specially prepared by OIC for the evaluators. (Appendix B to this report details the methodology of the Placement Survey.)

Figure 1. OPINIONS OF EMPLOYERS/SUPERVISORS REGARDING OIC GRADUATES WHO WERE STILL EMPLOYED BY THEM OR HAD ONCE BEEN PLACED WITH THEM

	Number of OIC Placements Assessed			
	Accra	Kumasi	Takoradi	Total
Above Average	51	6	11	68 (52.7%)
Average	37	2	0	39 (30.2%)
Below Average	19	0	3	22 (17.1%)
	107	8	14	129 (100%)

Source: April-May 1980 Placement Survey

Twenty-three of the employers/supervisors interviewed employed or had employed OIC/Accra trainees, 11 reported on OIC/Takoradi trainees and eight employed or had employed OIC/Kumasi trainees.

The results of the employer/supervisor questionnaire and interviews (see Figure 1, above) were unexpectedly positive. For 52.7% of the identified 129 OIC graduates, the employers/supervisors judged them much better or slightly better than the average for similar entry-level employees trained elsewhere, or having had no previous training. In 30.2% of the cases, OIC graduates were judged average; and in 17.1% of the cases, OIC graduates were considered below average. In all, 82.9% of the graduates were judged above average or average.

In general, employers and supervisors spoke more highly of the job skills of OIC trainees placed with them than of the trainees' work habits. Most criticisms of work habits or attitude-towards-the-job mentioned the younger age of OIC graduates and their consequent

lessened maturity. Government employers of Office Skills graduates told of inability to employ on a permanent basis trainees who lack the NVTI Grade II Certificate. The percentage of Plumber placements of OIC/Accra who were reported to be below average in performance was atypically high; the evaluators deem the sample too small to draw generalizations concerning the teaching of that skill at the Center.

From the comments of employers/supervisors and our interviews with placed OIC graduates, it is apparent that they tend to arrive at the work place below average in communication skills. This area, stressed in Feeder training, may have to be further reinforced for the sake of the graduates.

Analysis of the submitted placement lists reveal that many firms have employed multiple graduates of OIC/Ghana. The 577 placements of OIC/Accra represent 334 firms; the 13 placements of OIC/Kumasi 10 firms; and the 19 placements of OIC/Takoradi 8 firms. In all, 609 placements represent 352 firms. At least 29 firms had taken four or more OIC trainees. The largest users:

- Redco - 36 trainees (6 carpenters, 29 masons and one office skills worker).
- Furnart (Ghana) Ltd. - 21 (all carpenters).
- Mankoadze - 14 (3 carpenters, 9 masons and 2 plumbers).
- Philip Afeku - 11 (all masons).

Measuring the chronological pattern of employment by individual firms offered no helpful insights on satisfaction with OIC trainees. Some firms have taken OIC graduates on a consistent basis throughout Phase II; others (e.g., Redco, which employed 25 during March and April 1978) have employed large numbers at specific times but few before or after. Firms' employment patterns regarding OIC graduates appear based on business conditions, skills needs and availability of OIC graduates, rather than the degree of satisfaction or lack thereof with placed individuals. (We note earlier in the report that the survey indicates general satisfaction with OIC graduates.)

Notes on OIC/Ghana Statistics: The Placement Survey revealed confusion and/or misunderstanding on the part of OIC/Ghana concerning the term "placement. Page 19 of the Project Paper, "Outputs, Vocational Courses defines placement as the "number of trainees completing (vocational) courses and placed in jobs." However the Placement Survey lists (see Figure 2, atop next page) reveal that placement figures for OIC/Accra include multiple placements of the same person to a degree that

Figure 2. PLACEMENTS MADE BY OIC/ACCRA AND INDIVIDUALS PLACED BY OIC/ACCRA, BY VOCATIONAL SKILL, FOR PHASE II THROUGH MID-MARCH 1980

Vocational Skill Course	(1) No. of Placements Made	(2) No. of Individuals Placed	(3) Difference	(4) Inflation Factor a/
Carpentry	144	103	41	39.8%
Masonry	105	88	17	19.3%
Office Skills	85	74	11	14.9%
Plumbing	72	57	15	26.3%
Arts & Crafts	51	45	6	13.3%
Motor Mechanics	41	38	3	8.0%
Electricity	62	55	7	12.7%
Catering	11	9	2	22.2%
Bookkeeping	6	6	0	0.0
Total	577	475	102	21.5%

Source: Lists prepared by OIC/Accra, March 1980.
Key: a/ Difference (Column 3) divided by Number of Individuals Placed (Column 2).

seriously distorts totals in OIC's widely publicized placement statistics.

The 577-name placement-by-skills list prepared for the evaluators by OIC/Accra contains the names of numerous placed individuals who were replaced a second, a third and a fourth time. The list of 144 Carpentry course placements, for example, contains four individuals placed four times each, six placed three times each and 17 placed twice.*

* The 577 placements consist of 486 placed from FY 1977 through FY 1979 and 91 placed through mid-March in 1980. OIC/Accra official totals for vocational placements during FYs 1977-1979 are 528, 42 more than on the list prepared for us. OIC/Accra was not able to account for the discrepancy during the evaluation.

The proven ability of OIC/Accra to make multiple placements of individuals indicates strength rather than weakness in the process. However, OIC's placement statistics are misleading and sometimes contrary to fact. Thus, OIC/Ghana's 1979 Annual Report states (page 10) that, during the FY, "OIC placed 226 previously unemployed persons in meaningful employment," when it refers to (1) 226 placements (and perhaps 40 fewer individuals) and (2) at least several individuals who had been sent by employers to OIC for upgrading and who subsequently returned to their firms.* Placement statistics reported by OIC/Kumasi and OIC/Takoradi are free from this distortion.

Placement statistics are further discussed in Subsection III-C-1, "Outputs in terms of Trainees," starting on page 24.

- PURPOSE EOP #2: "Training is conducted at less cost and in a shorter time than equivalent training elsewhere."

Average Local Cost Per Trainee Per Year: OIC/Ghana's open enrollment, individually paced, non-formal training is not comparable to that offered at NVTI pilot training centers or at the technical schools operated by the Ghana Education Service. The cost of the American Technical Cooperation Team (TCT) members and their support (some 20% of Phase II's planned budget) is another atypical factor.

For illustrative purposes, however, we list 1979 annual cost-per-trainee calculations (reported to represent actual figures) for the two GOG efforts and that for OIC/Ghana:

	Cost in Cedis	Cost in $
NVTI annual cost-per-trainee calculated for relevant vocational courses varies from a high of 3,636 cedis for Welding to a low of 1,976 cedis for Electricity.	1,976 to 3,636	719-1,322 a/
Ghana Education Service cost-per-trainee in technical schools operated by it, as it varies by institution.	1,950 to 3,000	709-1,091 a/
OIC/Ghana cost-per-trainee, annually, from FY 1977 through FY 1979 (continued atop page 18, next):		

* The Placement Survey uncovered two instances in which an employer, Ghana News Agency, had done that.

	Cost in Cedis	Cost in $
o FY 1977: local costs (224,332 cedis) + TCT expenses ($186,625) divided by 317 trainees served (total enrolled less total discontinued during year). c/	708 d/ 1,385 e/	616 d/ 1,204 e/
o FY 1978: local costs (670,809 cedis) + TCT expenses ($218,026) divided by 589 trainees served. b/	1,139 d/ 1,693 e/	759 d/ 1,129 e/
o FY 1979: local costs (800,242 cedis) + TCT expenses ($121,678) divided by 670 trainees served. a/	1,194 d/ 1,694 e/	434 d/ 616 e/

Exchange rates: a/ 1979-80, 2.75 cedis = $1; b/ 1978, 1.50 cedis = $1; c/ 1977, 1.15 cedis = $1.

OIC costs: d/ Total local cost per trainee--the sum of expenditures from the OICI allocation, the GOG input and funds raised by OIC/Ghana. Depreciation not included in the calculation.

e/ Total local cost per trainee plus total TCT cost per trainee. For purposes of computation, we have assumed that total TCT effort is chargeable only to training of students. In reality, the effort also is directed to in-service training of OIC/Ghana staff (for transfer of technology) and Boards of Directors (to further institutionalization). Total therefore is conservative.

In terms of dollars, OIC cost-per-trainee for local-plus-TCT-expenditures decreased by 50% between 1977 and 1979. In terms of cedis, OIC cost-per-trainee rose by 22% from 1977 to 1978 and remained stationary in 1979, because of devaluation of the cedi.

- PURPOSE EOP #3 — "Local support for OIC/Ghana programs, including Accra, Kumasi and Takoradi programs, meets self-sufficiency targets of the Project Paper."

Table 6 of the Project Paper projects OIC/Ghana's share of project financing as follows:

FY 1977: $108,400, or 11.5% of total project financing.
FY 1978: $156,000, or 17.7% of total project financing.
FY 1979: $185,400, or 16.4% of total project financing.
FY 1980: $206,200, or 19.1% of total project financing.
Four-year total:
$656,000, or 16.2% of total project financing.

According to OIC/Ghana's reports, fund-raising activities and in-kind contributions consistently have met about half of projected goals:

FY 1977: $10,732 in cash + $46,760 in-kind, for a total of $57,492, or 53.0% of $108,400 goal.

FY 1978: $33,221 in cash + $42,595 in-kind, for a total of $75,816, or 48.6% of $156,000 goal.

FY 1979: $38,902 in cash + $55,100 in-kind, for a total of $94,002, or 45.6% of $185,400 goal.

The three-year total: $82,855 in cash + $144,445 in kind, for a total of $227,310, or 50.8% of $449,800 goal.

To date, OIC/Accra has led in fund raising, having collected the equivalent of $54,971 in cash. The National Office is a poor second with a three-year total of $12,089 in cash, followed by OIC/Kumasi with the equivalent of $11,526 in cash and OIC/Takoradi with the equivalent of $4,269 in cash. The OIC/Accra and National Office fund raising activities appeal to overlapping constituencies. The two new centers -- especially OIC/Takoradi -- have encountered severe problems in fund raising.

Fund raising has become increasingly difficult in Ghana as the economy has faltered. To the degree that the effort creates and reinforces community involvement, it strengthens the program. Insofar as it may distract from the overwhelming emphasis required by OIC's training function, too strong a stress on fund raising can harm the program. Fund raising activity must be kept in perspective.

OIC's local-funding-to-total goal of 16.2% may be an unrealistically high requirement of the Project Paper. Many in Ghana -- Ghanaians and American alike -- made unsolicited comments to the evaluators concerning the intensity of OIC's fund raising effort. Certainly the shortfall is not a function of lack of trying.

- PURPOSE EOP #4: "Other vocational training programs emulate OIC training methods and concepts."

We noted earlier, in discussing Purpose Assumption No. 4 (page 12), that we found no tangible evidence to indicate that GOG vocational training programs have adopted OIC's methods and concepts.

- PURPOSE EOP #5: "Other local groups generate sufficient local interest and contributions to permit the initiation of OIC training for locations other than Accra, Kumasi and Takoradi."

A number of Ghanaian communities have evinced interest in establishing OIC training facilities. According to OIC/Ghana's Executive Director,

Interest Groups have been formally organized in Kpando (November 1976), Adukom and Cape Coast. Only in the case of Kpando has OIC/Ghana recognized the Interest Group as having the right to call itself an OIC program. Stirrings of interest are reported in Tamale, Koforidua and Nkasaem.

The experience of the OIC/Kpando group -- by far the longest and best organized, and the only one to have initiated training -- demonstrates the problems involved in semi-official "shoestring-financed" efforts. Initial discussions began in July 1976, when OIC/Ghana staff were invited to Kpando by the paramount chief. The Kpando Interest Group was organized several months afterward, a site was acquired and the group declared itself ready to begin training. In early 1977, the Group prepared a proposal for formal recognition, and in May of that year, it enrolled 10 Masonry and 10 Carpentry students and began training. Thereafter, for almost two years, the program struggled on its own -- training and requesting formal recognition by OIC/Ghana and the right to call itself an OIC.

Finally in April 1979, the National Office forwarded 10,000 cedis to Kpando and the program was reorganized with nine trainees and three staff. The agreement was signed and recorded several months afterwards. To date the National Office has provided minimal assistance to the program. Currently OIC/Kpando requires money to pay three instructors who have not been paid for five months. Weakness of the Kpando program is attributed by the Project Advisor to insufficient funds and lack of assistance from the National Office.

- PURPOSE EOP #6: "The OIC/Ghana program is effective in training and placing the 60% of trainees who have enrolled with less than a Middle School Certificate."

Our review of Purpose EOP #1. above, demonstrates the high placement and job performance of OIC graduates. Although OIC/Ghana reports that 60% of its trainees lack the Middle School Certificate, we were unable to verify the percentage. It is clear, however, from spot checks, that many enrollees are middle school dropouts/leavers.

At OIC/Accra, the training of students with below Middle Form 4 background in the Feeder program is geared to prepare them for skills training in Arts and Crafts, Masonry, Carpentry and Plumbing. Because the level of mathematics, science and related other subjects is higher in Auto Mechanics, Electricity, Catering, Bookkeeping and Office Skills, the center confines training in those skills to students possessing the Middle School Certificate.

OIC/Accra should review the criteria for matching trainees to the skills courses. Masonry, Carpentry and Plumbing involve much mathematics and science. Middle Form 4 leavers would be better able to master these subjects in a shorter period of time than those who have dropped out before that grade. On the other hand, Catering, Arts & Crafts and Motor Mechanics may be less difficult for Middle School Form 1 or Form 2 leavers.

Dropouts from secondary school are enrolled at OIC/Accra, as are a few post-secondary school leavers, in order to permit parents who cannot again sponsor children to acquire further training elsewhere to have their children learn a vocational skill free of charge. Ideally, post-secondary and post-middle school leavers should not be mixed with middle school dropouts in the Feeder program. If such mixing cannot be avoided entirely, they should be handled in separate groups, for their abilities and educational backgrounds differ greatly

- PURPOSE EOP #7: "Trainee wastage is less than 15% and is lower than equivalent training programs."

Since Ghana has no equivalent training programs that provide non-formal education to school dropouts and school leavers on an open-admissions, individually paced basis, the evaluators could not compare OIC/Ghana's wastage rate with others'.

Table 3, next page, indicates that the program's wastage rate was 20.6% for the first three years of Phase II. This is one-third above the condition set by the EOP. The fact that the FY 1977 wastage of OIC/Accra was 12.9% suggests that 20.6% may be high and that the rise in subsequent years is related to disruptions occasioned by the concurrent opening of two new training centers.

A comparison between OIC/Ghana's performance and those of OICs in other African countries may provide the best measure concerning the reasonableness of the 15% wastage figure.

- PURPOSE EOP #8: "Trainee self-help is used to defray training expenses in accordance with self-help schedules."

Trainees are active participants in OIC fund raising activity. They clean and maintain the course areas. Carpentry, Masonry and Electrical trainees make minor repairs and maintain the facilities in

Figure 3. TRAINEE WASTAGE, OIC/GHANA PHASE II, FY 1977-1979

OIC Center	Fiscal 1977		Fiscal 1978		Fiscal 1979		3-Year Totals*	
	Total Enroll-ment	Tot.Dis-contin-uences	Total Enroll-ment	Tot.Dis-contin-uences	Total Enroll-ment	Tot.Dis-contin-uences	Total Enroll-ment	Tot.Dis-contin-uences
OIC/ Ghana	364	47 (12.9%)	709	165 (23.3%)	854	184 (21.5%)	1,927	396 (20.6%)
OIC/ Accra	364	47 (12.9%)	523	110 (21.0%)	633	134 (21.1%)	1,520	291 (19.1%)
OIC/ Kumasi			89	33 (37.1%)	97	23 (23.7%)	186	56 (30.1%)
Tako-radi			97	22 (22.7%)	124	27 (21.8%)	221	49 (22.2%)

* 2-year totals for OIC/Kumasi and OIC/Takoradi

Definitions:

Total Enrollment: Number of Feeder trainees on rolls Oct. 1 at start of FY + number enrolled in Feeder during year and otherwise admitted + number of Vocational trainees on rolls Oct. 1 + number readmitted to vocational and otherwise admitted (but not including those transferred from Feeder to Vocational, to avoid double count).

Total Discontinued: Number discontinued in Feeder not including those transferred to Vocational or placed in employment + number discontinued in Vocational not including those placed in employment.

Sources: OIC/Accra Monthly Report, October 1977; OIC/Ghana Report 30 November 1978; OIC/Ghana Monthly Report, October 1979.

in which they are enrolled. Motor Mechanics trainees assist in OIC's Texaco service station operation.

- PURPOSE EOP #9: "Training course content is relevant to identified industrial skill level needs."

The National Office Curriculum/Training Officer, Technical Supervisor and local office instructors are involved in curriculum development. They are theoretically assisted by Technical Advisory Committees, composed of technical specialists from industry and commerce. In

theory, the Committee members work with the OIC centers to outline needs of their firms in terms of skills, review training materials and equipment, and suggest modifications to make the vocational courses more responsive to market-place desires. Technical Advisory Committees have seldom met during the past year or so.

The curriculum development program is organized by the Training/Curriculum Officer of the National Office. Syllabi are reviewed periodically and industrial visits reportedly are made by instructors to obtain feedback for changes to update the courses. The evaluators found no record of such visits, however. The curriculum developers also report consultations with other training institutions to assess curriculum level and relevance. Here again, we did not find records.

At OIC/Accra, curricula are revised periodically. The curriculum for the Masonry course was revised in 1977; in 1978, the Office Skills and Electricity curricula were revised; and in 1979, the Plumbing and Carpentry curricula were revised.

The National Office's Training/Curriculum Officer states that all training course curricula will be changed to include the standards set by the NVTI.

- PURPOSE EOP #10: "OIC/Ghana training programs increase to 460 persons completing training annually in FY 1980, and directly benefit 1,360 graduates over the four-year project development period."

The evaluators anticipate that OIC/Ghana will make approximately 295 placements in FY 1980, 64.1% of the EOP status condition of 460 persons completing training that year.* Over the four-year term of the project, it will make some 850 placements (representing perhaps 700 individuals), compared to the EOP status condition of 1,360. Both totals are far below Project Paper expectations. In Section III-C-1, "Outputs in Terms of Trainees," we review and further detail this OIC output and delve into the reasons behind the shortfall.

---

* See "Notes on OIC/Ghana Statistics," pages 15-17 of the report, for a discussion of OIC's confusing and sometimes contradictory use of the terms "placements" and "individuals placed." Phase II placement totals have included significant proportions of 2nd, 3rd- and 4th-time placements of the same individuals.

III-C. PROJECT OUTPUTS

The Logframe lists three major assumptions whose lack of validity would adversely affect Output performance:

"1. Mutually harmonious and efficient working relationships can be achieved between (a) the OIC/G Boards of Directors and (b) the OIC/G National Coordinating Office and local OIC management."

The assumption is generally valid, although lack of adequate definition of or differentiation between overlapping responsibilities and absence of a clearcut, fully detailed "chain of command" structure cause problems and inefficiencies. Section III-C-3, under the heading "Program and Policy Coordination," reviews this concern.

"2. Trainees will understand and fully participate in self-help efforts to defray training expenses." This has happened (see discussion under Purpose EOP No. 8, above).

"3. Training facilities will be furnished as local in-kind contributions in Kumasi and Takoradi." The facilities have been furnished under the stated conditions.

III-C-1. THREE-CENTER OUTPUTS IN TERMS OF TRAINEES

- Trainees Receiving Feeder Training

Feeder training -- prevocational training -- is concerned with remedial and upgrading education and attitudinal development. Its aim is to provide trainees with middle school competency in computational and communications skills.

The Project Paper forecasts almost 1,600 trainees completing Feeder at OIC/Ghana's three Centers during the term of Phase II. Figure 4, next page, indicates that OIC will achieve less than 60% of that number. Of the total, OIC/Accra should reach 700, 63.6% of a planned 1,100; OIC/Kumasi should reach 100, 41.7% of plan; and OIC/Takoradi should reach 140, 54.9% of plan.

OIC/Accra's inability to come close to plan appears to result from several factors including a bottleneck of trainees remaining longer than anticipated in the vocational skills courses. (Until a placement

Figure 4. FEEDER TRAINEES PASSED THROUGH TO VOCATIONAL COURSES DURING PHASE II

	OIC/ Accra	OIC/ Kumasi	OIC/ Takoradi	OIC/ Ghana
FY 1977	115	0	0	115
FY 1978	113	61	62	236
FY 1979	224	4	39	267
FY 1980	248	35	39	322
4-Yr Total	700	100	140	940
4-Yr Plan	1,100	240	255	1,595
% of Plan Achieved	(63.6)	(41.7)	(54.9)	(58.9)

Sources: 1977-1979 actuals from OIC/Ghana Feeder statistics and reports; 1980 estimate by Project Advisor, modified by the evaluators.

---

is made from the Vocational level, there is no room at that level for a new trainee from Feeder; and unless a Feeder trainee passes on to the Vocational level, there is no room for a new entrant into Feeder.) OIC statistics indicate that trainees remain in Feeder an average of four to five months, rather than the three months estimated in the Project Paper.

A substantial portion of the Feeder shortfall at OIC/Kumasi and OIC/Takoradi results from the Centers' late commencement of training. Both began almost a year behind schedule.

Certainly the overall 58.9%-of-goal performance is not caused by lack of applicants for OIC training. Each Center has a long waiting list.

- Placements from Vocational Courses

OIC/Ghana's placement statistics reveal much the same situation at the Vocational level.

Figure 5, next page, indicates that 850 placements will have been made by OIC/Ghana's Training Centers during Phase II -- 62.5% of the 1,360

Figure 5. PLACEMENTS BY OIC/GHANA AND ITS COMPONENTS, PHASE II

	OIC/ACCRA			OIC/KUMASI			OIC/TAKORADI			T O T A L S		
	Numbers		% of	Numbers		% of	Numbers		% of	Numbers		% of
	Plan	Act.	Plan	Plan	Act.	Plan	Plan	Act.	Plan	Plan	Act.	Plan
FY 1977	150	140†	93.3	0	0	-	0	0	-	150	140	93.3
FY 1978	220	189	85.9	50	0	0.0	55	0	0.0	325	189	58.2
FY 1979	270	203	75.2	75	8	10.7	80	15	18.8	425	226	53.2
FY 1980	300	245	81.7	75	25	33.3	85	25	29.4	460	295	64.1
4 Years 1977-80	940	777†	82.7	200	33	16.5	220	40	18.2	1360	850	62.5

Key: † Includes 4 placed from Feeder instruction.

Sources: 1977-1979 figures - OIC/Ghana placement statistics in Monthly Reports. 1980 - estimate by evaluators.

---

anticipated by the Project Paper.*

OIC/Accra should have the best performance, placing 777, or 82.7% of plan. Because of their late start and startup difficulties, OIC/Kumasi with 33 placements (16.5% of the 200 anticipated) and OIC/Takoradi with 40 placements (18.2% of the 220 projected) will be far behind.

Generally, lack of job opportunities for those who complete OIC vocational training does not appear to be a problem. OIC/Ghana's "1979 Annual Report" states (page 19) that "Job Developers were able to develop a total of 904 jobs (during the year). However, we were only able to place 226. The demand for workers exceeded our capacity to train."**

---

* In our earlier discussion, "Notes on OIC/Ghana Statistics," (pages 15-17), we note the confusion resulting from equation of the terms "numbers of placements" and "individuals placed." The 850 anticipated placements will represent about 700 individuals placed, should current methods of calculation be continued.

** All OIC Training Centers occasionally experience placement problems however. OIC/Accra has found the placement of Motor Mechanics trainees difficult, because lack of spare parts has hampered automotive repair;

Whether the placement goals were overly optimistic is moot. A more measurable cause for the low level of achievement is the apparent clogging of the system, in part because trainees are in Feeder a month or two beyond plan, but mostly because trainees are in vocational courses almost twice as long as originally planned:

Figure 6. AVERAGE LENGTH OF OIC VOCATIONAL COURSES

Source of Data	Duration Range	Weighted Average
o PROJECT DESIGN, PER 1976 PROJECT PAPER	6-12 months	9 months
o OIC/Ghana FY 1979 Annual Report, pg.20	0-48 months	19.3 months
o 1980 Placement Survey by evaluators; names from random-sample list	6-44 months	18.3 months
o OIC/Kumasi, information regarding length of courses, 1980	15-21 months	----
o OIC/Takoradi, information regarding course lengths, 1980	12-26† months	----

† The 26-month figure represents 14 Auto Body Repair/Arc Welding trainees, still in training because of a lengthy delay in installation of air compressors. The trainees are not expected to be ready for OJT before midsummer 1980, at the earliest.

OIC/Kumasi was slow in developing job slots for the first batch of Plumbing trainees who were job ready, because of non-availability of raw materials in the construction industry; and as noted earlier, OIC/Takoradi has failed to place post-job-ready typists because of restrictions against the employment of individuals who lack the NVTI Grade II Certificate.

- Participation in the Government of Ghana's Civil Service Retraining Program

By going from one-shift to two-shift operation, OIC/Ghana is making a significant contribution to the GOG's Civil Service Retraining Program (the so-called "Crash Program") to retrain redundant office messengers in vocational skills. OIC/Accra began the retraining in February; the two newer centers started in March 1980.

At the end of April 1980, 241 civil servants were attending OICs:

- OIC/Accra had enrolled 144 Crash Program trainees: 51 in Bookkeeping, 28 in Office Skills, 22 in Electricity, 18 in Plumbing, 15 in Carpentry and 10 in Masonry.
- OIC/Kumasi had enrolled 42: 15 in Plumbing, 13 in Office Skills, nine in Carpentry and five in Masonry.
- OIC/Takoradi had enrolled 55: 17 in Office Skills, 15 each in Auto Body Repair and Carpentry, and eight in Masonry.

Because of the background and age of the civil service trainees, Feeder instruction is not a discrete entity. Its major subject areas are included in the vocational training. "Regular" OIC trainees study for five hours in the morning. The "Crash Program" trainees attend for five hours in the afternoon. (Instruction formerly was six hours per day.) Instructors at all three Centers work overtime to handle the increased enrollment. Although no instructors have admitted that the new program has an adverse effect on their regular work, the evaluators echo the concern recently expressed by the AID auditors that instruction and preparation time may suffer. Only OIC/Accra has added part-time instructors to assist in the expanded effort

- Administrative and Service Systems to Support the Training Programs

Recruitment: Because of the magnitude of waiting lists at the three Training Centers, formal recruitment is not carried out. Selection criteria boil down to "first-come, first-served." Preference is given to middle school dropouts, who are to amount to 60% of total enrollment; the remaining 40% are to be individuals possessing Middle School Form 4 Leaving Certificate. This breakdown is not applied at OIC/Kumasi, where the evaluators discovered that no middle school dropouts were enrolled.

Based on the results of an entrance diagnostic test, the OIC Training Centers prepare an individual training/employabliity plan for each

trainee. Additionally, progress charts showing individual performance by curriculum unit are maintained in the classroom. This is an effective system which should be kept up to date at all times. The situation in this respect that prevailed at the time of the AID audit has improved.

In-service training generally is insufficient: new employees undergo a week's orientation at the National Office, but very little in-service training is provided to the local staffs. Instead, the local OICs conduct their own in-service training programs. The Student Services Officer of the National Office was unable to show written evidence of her monthly visits to the Centers to provide assistance and training to instructors.

Curriculum development: We note earlier in the report that curricula for the various skills areas are comprehensive and job-related, that syllabus review appears to be accomplished in an effective manner, and that curricula are being revised to include standards set by the NVTI. Trainees may apply for the NVTI Grade II test once job-ready. No records are kept of the students who sit for or pass the examination. OIC/Ghana claims that 60% of OIC trainees who take the test pass it. NVTI indicates that the percentage is closer to 25%.

Lack of sufficient tools and equipment may be a causal factor in the stretch-out in the duration of vocational skills courses noted in our discussion of vocational level placements earlier in the chapter. Teaching aids also are in short supply.

Due to frequent resignations of job developers at OIC/Accra, records are not accurately maintained and effective followup has not taken place. There does not appear to be a standard system for job development records at OIC/Accra. We were unable to verify that many of the scheduled followup visits to placed trainees actually had been performed. OIC's Standard Operating Procedures should be enforced in this area.

OIC/Ghana needs an annual in-service training plan that will set specific dates and times for various aspects of the in-service program. Separate plans should be developed for instructors, counselors, job developers and supervisors.

III-C-2. TRAINING AND OFFICE FACILITIES

Except in Accra, the OIC/Ghana facilities appear adequate for current and near future program needs. The Kumasi Center is new and in ex-

cellent condition; its Board of Directors plans to expand the facility to accomodate planned additional skills courses. While the Takoradi Center needs some renovations, it too is basically sound and its physical layout provides space for growth. However, the Accra Center, the National Office and the Arts & Crafts Center -- all in the capitol city -- are inadequate for the training programs and operating personnel based there. This is one of the reasons that the Project Paper calls for construction of a new, permanent OIC/Ghana training center in the Accra area.

The new center was to have been partially completed and in operation by the last half of FY 1980. The Project Paper budgeted its cost at $826,000, a sum that has been seriously eroded by inflation during the subsequent four years. The permanent center is still in the architectural design stage. OIC/Ghana reportedly submitted a version of the building plan to USAID/Ghana, whose approval is required before $100,000 set aside in the Project Paper for the structure can be obligated. USAID responded in August 1978, a month after submission, urging reconsideration of the plans as presented. As of early May 1980, USAID had not received revisions. USAID, OICI and others are understood to consider the original plans too elaborate.

III-C-3. NATIONAL OFFICE COORDINATION AND SUPPORT SERVICES

• Program and Policy Coordination

National Office/local program coordination: The OIC/Ghana National Office was formally organized in spring 1977. Substantial time was devoted to its establishment at the beginning of Phase II. The task was made difficult by the absence of detailed pre-planning in the proposal development stage.

Once in operation, the National Office staff and OICI's TCT members designed a system to coordinate OIC/G policies and programs on a nation wide basis. Memoranda and directives were issued defining the roles of the National Office vis-a-vis local OIC programs and specifying the services of National Office staff. The roles and responsibilities of the National Office were formally defined in October 1977. A December 1977 memorandum by the National Executive Director detailed arrangements for area coordination of programs and assignments of specific duties to National Office area coordinators. Subsequent bulletins (apparently prepared by TCT staff members) further outlined the services of the National Office and technical assistance delivery methodology.

OICI's Student Services Specialist and Training/Evaluation Specialist completed their tours in Ghana in August 1978. The two specialists' services in training Ghanaian counterparts at the National Office lasted for less than two years, and one of the counterparts resigned from OIC/Ghana a month after the OICI specialists had departed.

The simultaneous efforts to set up the National Office, to recruit and train its staff, and to start the Kumasi and Takoradi programs may have negatively affected the overall effectiveness and efficiency of the early stage of Phase II implementation. And in hindsight the phaseout of the two OICI specialists appears to have been premature, considering the behind-schedule start-up of the National Office and the new local programs, and the enormous task of institutionalizing the National Office.

Internal communication: The National Office monitors the operations of local programs through monthly reports submitted by the local OICs, monthly and trip reports of its area coordinators, and visits to programs by other National Office staff.

In spite of the substantial volume of information received by the National Office, inadequate internal sharing appears to hinder the effective coordination of technical assistance to programs. The tendency of National Office and local program staff to approach indiscriminately both the Project Advisor and the National Executive Director in search of answers aggrevates the communication and coordination gap.

Area coordination: The area coordinators provide the major links between National Office and local programs. They are in charge of the followup and coordination of local program activities, to ensure that program needs are identified and properly met by local management and/or the National Office. They act as "program advisors" to the local OICs. Area coordination activity currently is assigned as follows:

- Coordinator for OIC/Accra: the National Office Training/Curriculum Officer.
- Coordinator for OIC/Kumasi: the National Office Research/Evaluation Officer.
- Coordinator for OIC/Takoradi: the National Office Student Services Officer.

Area coordination services provided by the National Office appear to have been less effective than envisioned. Area coordination work

requires the combination of managerial skill, technical talent and experience which can command the agreement and cooperation of local staffs. While the area coordinators are specialists in their respective technical fields, they may lack the managerial talent. Although cooperation with the National Office has been satisfactory to date, with few exceptions, local program staff indicate mixed feelings regarding their area coordinators' sensitivity and ability to deal with management and organization problems. We question whether the National Office has the capability to develop the missing or embryonic skill.

In part, this may result from the fact that, except for the National Executive Director and Financial Controller who have been with OIC/Ghana since 1970, only one technical staff member of the newly formed National Office possessed previous OIC/Ghana experience. In addition, the OICI Student Services and Training/Evaluation specialists were on hand too short a time to ensure adequate counterpart training in area coordination work or delivery of technical assistance to the new OICs.

A major modification of the technical assistance delivery technique envisioned for Phase II also appears to have weakened the effectiveness of the effort. The Project Paper calls for National Office staff to be seconded to local programs for "specified periods," to provide technical assistance. The seconding technique was replaced by short, one-to-a-few-days visits. (In all fairness, however, it must be admitted that the Project Paper failed to allocate the financial resources needed to underwrite the seconding technique it had proposed.)

Long-term planning: Although each local OIC has its own Board of Directors, planning and operational activities also are monitored by the National Office, which derives its administrative power from the National Board of Directors. Consequently, programs must simulteneously report to their respective local Boards and the National Office. In the absence of specific and detailed guidelines and procedures governing the interrelationships between local programs, local Boards and the National Office, instances of misunderstanding, mistrust and conflict have arisen among the entities concerned.

The National Office has yet to develop a comprehensive internal Standard Operations Procedures manual. Its absence and that of a document synthesizing separately issued guidelines partially explain continuing problems of inadequate communication, misinformation, confused perception of lines of authority and inadequate record-keeping and documentation.

The only long-term work plan adopted by the National Office has been the 1976-1980 Project Performance Tracking System (PPT) detailed in the Project Paper. However, no documented adjustment of the PPT has been made, except for changes of target dates due to differences between planned and actual time of project phase-in. The unchanged PPT does not reflect important programmatic changes that have occurred since inception of Phase II. Consequently, it appears to have become irrelevant to project activity. except for the quantitative targets of trainees and placements, which are still observed.

The National Office plans its activities on a quarterly basis, developing a new PPT every three months. So do the local OICs, except for OIC/Kumasi, which developed an annual work plan for FY 1980. Only fund-raising activities are planned on an annual basis at both the national and local levels.

Finally, there is no document, either at the National Office or at local OICs, indicating that work plans have been assessed and that new strategies have been formulated to increase operational efficiency. This reportedly has been done orally, but memory is, at best, uncertain.

- <u>Coordination of Fund-Raising Activities</u>

The National Board of Directors developed a National Fund Raising Policy in 1977 with guidelines that include: limiting fund-raising expenses to 10% of the fund-raising goal; National Office responsibility for raising 40% of the overall OIC/Ghana goal; supplying local programs with fund-raising ideas and techniques; and scheduling annual special events for fund-raising purposes. In 1978, the Board established a National Fund Raising Committee to guide the effort.

Goal of the fund-raising policy has been to meet the annual local contribution targets set forth by the Project Paper. Our review of Purpose EOP No. 3 on page 18 of this report notes that OIC/Ghana's fund-raising activities and in-kind contributions have met about half of projected target since inception of Phase II. As early as April 1978, the National Board of Directors concluded that the "20% budgeted was not realistic." We agree. A more practical goal would be to set the fund-raising target at 20% of total anticipated local program costs.

The evaluators found inconsistencies in OIC fund-raising statistics. Data from the local offices do not always agree with those produced by the National Office. Local financial officers often do not learn

of in-kind donations and thus fail to report donations in the MIS forms. We recommend that the National Office devise and record a standard methodology for reporting local fund-raising receipts for all offices and implement the methodology through formal staff development sessions.

- Research into Needs and Requirements

Although the Project Paper specifies that the National Office is to research national manpower needs, industry requirements and perform other operational research tasks, including development of new base-line and progress data -- it has had a staff Research and Evaluation Officer only since February 1980. Consequently little pertinent documentation has been developed. The former Training/Curriculum Officer researches industry trends when formulating curricula, but not on a regular basis.

The Research and Evaluation Officer has not yet developed a long-range plan for his function. In its absence, he performs research upon request. The research appears to involve as much management information investigation as it does programmatic research.

- Programmatic Evaluation

The major "outside" Project-Output-oriented evaluation called for by the Project Paper at the mid-point of Phase II did not occur. The evaluation had been intended to initiate project redesign, if needed. In place of the mid-point evaluation, Wolf and Company in spring 1978 made a brief assessment of OIC/Ghana as part of an overall evaluation of OIC/Central and three representative country programs. The Wolf and Company evaluation confirmed the relevance of OIC/Ghana to the nation's development needs and the marked acceptance of the program by its public and private sectors. It also identified short-falls in job development and resource mobilization.

OCIC/Central's Planning Director and its Evaluation Officer visited the three local programs of OIC/Ghana in fall 1978. As a result of their survey and a followup spring 1979 survey by OIC/Central's Vocational Curriculum Specialist, the following recommendations were made and communicated to OIC/Ghana:

1. OIC/Ghana needed upgrading in the planning and operation of its training programs.

2. It needed a general "overhaul" of its management system, in preparation for the projected phasing-out of OICI assistance at the end of FY 1980.

3. Expansion to new locations was inadvisable in view of deteriorating local economic conditions.

4. A TCT specialist with strong background in management and vocational training should be added to the program for the remaining year and a half of Phase II.

OICI's recommendations do not appear to have been implemented.

The National Office evaluated the local OICs once during FY 1978 and once during FY 1979. There is no formal documentation indicating that followups were made to assess compliance with evaluation recommendations. OIC/Accra and OIC/Kumasi conduct semi-annual evaluations of program performance on an irregular basis; for these, there is again no solid evidence of followup to verify implementation.

OIC/Ghana has lacked in-house evaluation capacity at both the National Office and local program levels. Its best evaluations appear to have been conducted by transient National Service interns who have since left the organization.

The evaluation methodology applied by the National Office and local OICs was developed by a TCT member in 1977. It is extremely long, is excessively detailed, and focuses mainly on the quality of training. It does not consider project goals and quantitative objectives. We recommend that OIC/Ghana develop a simpler, more economical-of-effort method of evaluation -- one that will facilitate the monitoring of and follow-through on evaluation findings.

- Management Information System (MIS)

Fiscal reports: To ensure continuing reimbursement, fiscal reports submitted by OIC/Ghana to OICI/Central have met basic MIS requirements. However, a factor underestimated in the planning of Phase II is the length of time needed by local programs to obtain the reimbursements from the United States. Unlike the process in Phase I, fund flow from OICI/Central to local programs in Phase II includes the receipt and re-transfer of funds by OIC/Ghana's National Office to the local programs.Fiscal reports to OICI/Central also must pass through the National Office.

Similarly, the Project Paper seriously underestimated the time required to secure the GOG's formal commitment to provide financial support and

the time and effort needed to obtain periodic GOG release of requested funds.

OICI's programmatic MIS was developed in Ghana with the input of the TCT team and local OIC staff during Phase I. However, the system has not been fully adopted by OIC/Ghana. This represents a failure in the transfer and absorption of technology, inasmuch as the MIS was intended for the use of OIC/Ghana as a project management tool before and after the phaseout of OICI's technical assistance.

Local programs have demonstrated the capacity to generate key MIS reports for submission to local management and to the National Office. Although the reports reflect definite progress relative to that observed by OICI a year ago, the MIS still is far from being implemented as a system. The deficiencies include:

1. Absence of major MIS files which otherwise would ensure adequate program documentation, proper record keeping and accuracy.
2. Partial changes in MIS practice initiated by OIC/Ghana without the necessary modifications in other parts of the system.
3. Non-compliance with MIS requirements regarding the flow and dissemination of information.
4. Shortcuts in report preparation (some caused by missing and/or never-established key MIS files) that forfeit the system's built-in element of statistical control for optimal accuracy.
5. Negligence in completing MIS forms, resulting in erroneous and/or missing information.

OICI/Central has initiated efforts to directly train local staff in MIS implementation, both during Participant Training in Philadelphia and at a 1979 MIS workshop in Accra. Adequate followup of these efforts has not taken place.

The National Office is drafting its own MIS manual, possibly to standardize the implementation by all local programs of a simplified version of the MIS. OIC/Ghana, however, may lack the necessary technical skills to properly carry out the project. OIC/Ghana does not use OICI's standard "MIS Users' Guide."

Non-MIS activity reports: The paperwork system of the National Office and the local programs is characterized by large numbers of reports of varied types. Some (e.g., area coordinators' trip reports) are excellent in structure, specific in purpose and are decision-making oriented. Others (e.g., some monthly narrative reports submitted by

local programs to the National Office) are of little help in the managerial decision-making process. Generally, the combined reports submitted by the National Office to OICI/Central lack specificity.

OIC/Ghana's reports can be upgraded if results are reported concurrent with activities; comparison is made between planned and achieved objectives; specific measures are developed to ensure eventual attainment of objectives; and reports are structured to contribute to information and decision-making.

- Provision of Entrepreneurial Management Services for OIC/Ghana Enterprises

The National Office supervises OIC/Ghana efforts to start up and operate ventures intended to generate profits to defray OIC training expenses (e.g., petrol service stations), provide non-profit but self-supporting training facilities (e.g., the canteen at USAID) and/or generate job opportunities or capital for expanded ventures.

OIC/Ghana also has been interested in small-enterprise ventures to help overcome cash flow problems that result from irregular and unpredictable funding. Erratic cash flow has been compounded by inflation, unstable economic climate and inability of businesses to make long-term commitments for contributions.

OIC/Ghana's long-term vehicle for enterprise development and income funneling into the program is "Ghana-Self-Reliance Investment, Ltd. (GSIL)," registered in 1973. GSIL follows the concept of the "10-36 Plan" of OIC/America. Its aim is investment of capital in businesses and donation of an agreed percentage of the dividends to OIC/Ghana. The company has 33 of 50 authorized subscribers (shareholders) who have contributed 3,080 cedis of 12,000 planned for seed money. No general meeting of subscribers has been held to date.

The National Office's Special Projects Officer has been investigating economic venture possibilities. In early 1979, she submitted for consideration of the National Board of Directors preliminary feasibility studies for OIC projects involving the operation of bus services between Accra and Kumasi and Accra and Takoradi; and poultry farming (the raising of broilers and layers). However, concentration of her efforts upon fund-raising has slowed new enterprise development on the part of OIC/Ghana. National Office staff lacks experience in that form of endeavor.

Technoserve Inc., an American PVO, operates a Business Advisory Services program in Ghana (BASIG) to assist and advise indigenous and

foreign private voluntary organizations in the implementation of programs and projects to benefit the low in income. BASIG evaluates and assesses ongoing economic activity, conducts feasibility studies and provides management consulting and financial planning assistance. Its services might benefit OIC/Ghana in its business enterprise development activities, especially those that are rural (e.g., poultry farming) in orientation.

III-C-4. COMMUNITY CONSCIOUSNESS AND SUPPORT

Output No. 6 calls for community consciousness and willingness to support the OIC/Ghana program through active Boards of Directors (National and local), Technical and Industrial Advisory Committees and fund-raising activities.

The National and local Boards of Directors consist of prominent business, civic and lay leaders who devote exceptionally long amounts of time, consistently, to the affairs of the program.

The National Industrial Advisory Committee, originally formed for fund-raising purposes and to garner information about changing trends in industry, has not met for years. Similarly, the local Technical Advisory Committees are reported not to have met recently.

The fund-raising aspect of community consciousness and support has been covered earlier in the report under "Local Support for OIC/Ghana Programs" (pages 18 and 19).

APPENDIX A

LIST OF PERSONS INTERVIEWED

J.E. Abekah, Carpentry/Joinery Instructor, OIC/Takoradi.
Daniel Acquah, Carpentry Foreman, Comazzi Brothers, Takoradi.
Mr. Acquah, Resident Engineer for Ghana Education Service at work-site at which OIC employees of Comazzi Bros. are assigned.
G. K. Addo, Personnel Director, Tema Steel Works, Tema.
Samuel Adidi, Junior Foreman, REDCO; placed Masonry trainee of OIC/Accr
S. A. Afful, Research & Evaluation Officer, OIC/Ghana.
George Afohquah, Administrative Manager, Ghana Sanyo, Tema.
Francis C. Agboka, placed Masonry Trainee of OIC/Accra.
Bossman Agyako, Personnel Manager, Accra Brewery Ltd.
G. Boakye Agyeman, placed Plumbing trainee of OIC/Kumasi.
E.P. Agyiri, Office Skills instructor, OIC/Accra.
Wasa Aidu, Secretary, Obosu Company, Ltd., Accra.
Larry A.A. Aiedewe, Job Developer, OIC/Kumasi.
Sabina Amamoo, placed Office Skills trainee of OIC/Kumasi.
J.L. Amarteifio, General Manager, Ghana Loans and Woodworking, Accra.
L.C. Adzedeweh, Job Developer, OIC/Kumasi.
Stephen Ampong, businessman, former Welding trainee of OIC/Accra.
James Amponsah, placed Masonry trainee of OIC/Takoradi.
J.K. Anane, Executive Chairman, J.A. Lumber Ltd., Kumasi.
Samuel Anobil, Plumbing instructor, OIC/Kumasi.
G.L. Anyigba, Masonry instructor, OIC/Accra.
Andrew B. Arbuah, Job Developer, OIC/Takoradi.
J.K. Arthur, Finance Officer, OIC/Ghana.
James Asare, Feeder instructor, OIC/Kumasi.
Alex O. Ashley, Chief Engineer, Footwear Division, State Footwear, Kumas
Eric Ativor, Director, Recruitment and Placement, VALCO, Tema.
G.K. Attor, Finance Officer, OIC/Kumasi.
Fred Ayensu, Personnel Officer, Ghana Timber Marketing Board, Takoradi.
Francis Baiden, placed Office Skills trainee of OIC/Kumasi.
Grace Bentil, placed Office Skills trainee of OIC/Takoradi.
Kwami Boaheve, Senior Counsellor, OIC/Accra.
S.A. Boakye, Administrative Manager, Poku Transport/Sawmillers, Kumasi.
P.B. Bortey, Electricity instructor, OIC/Accra.
K.B. Brown, General Manager, Ghana News Agency, Accra.
E.K. Buadee, Warehouse Keeper, Guinness Ltd., Takoradi.

Charles M. Cann, Esq., Chairman of the Board of OIC/Takoradi.
Theophilus Carboo, placed Plumbing trainee of OIC/Accra.
Christopher Coffie, placed Carpentry trainee of OIC/Accra.
I.T. Cofie-Obuobi, Deputy National Executive Director, OIC/Ghana.
Emmanuel Comazzi, General Manager, Comazzi Bros., Takoradi.
J.K. Dadsie, Office Skills instructor, OIC/Takoradi.
Anthony Dickson, Afromedia (Gh) Ltd., Accra.
Seth K. Drah, placed Carpentry trainee of OIC/Accra.
A.S. Duah, Presbyterian Church, Accra.
Rebecca Edwards, placed Office Skills trainee of OIC/Kumasi.
Edward Essel, placed Carpentry trainee of OIC/Takoradi.
Emmanuel Essuman, placed Carpentry trainee of OIC/Takoradi.
Daniel Agyei Fordwuah, Carpentry instructor, OIC/Accra.
Sam Aggrey Forson, Assistant Headmaster,Ghana Secondary Technical School at Takoradi; Board member of OIC/Takoradi.
R.K. Gardiner, Gardiner's Plumbing, Accra.
Christina Ghartley, Board member of OIC/Takoradi.
F.K. Gollo, Barrister/Solicitor, Gollo's Chambers, Kumasi.
Natoma Gyadya, placed Motor Mechanic trainee of OIC/Accra.
F.B. Hagen, Feeder instructor, OIC/Takoradi.
Paul Hodzie, Supervisor of Personnel, YMCA/Accra.
Moses Impraim, placed Carpentry trainee of OIC/Takoradi.
Albert T. Jacobs, OICI Project Advisor, OIC/Ghana.
Paul Henry Kersey, Altraco, Accra.
Edward Komla, Masonry instructor, OIC/Accra.
J.A. Korney, General Manager, K Furniture Point, Accra.
Mr. Kwabi, Operations Officer, OIC/Accra.
S.N. Kwatu, Office Skills instructor, OIC/Kumasi.
Kingsly Kwayie, Administrative Manager, Guinness (Gh) Ltd., Kumasi.
E.K. Kyei, Chief Accountant, Guinness (Gh) Ltd., Kumasi.
Mrs. Laryea, Personnel Manager, Alfa Motors, Accra.
J.K. Lavoe, Finance Officer, OIC/Accra.
Eric Lutterodt, placed Electrical trainee of OIC/Accra.
Elizabeth Mallet, placed Office Skills trainee of OIC/Kumasi.
William Mansu, placed Plumbing trainee of OIC/Accra.
John Matey, Public Relations Officer/Administrator, Guinness (Gh) Ltd., Kumasi.
Joyce Mensah, placed Office Skills trainee of OIC/Kumasi.
Captain F.W. Micah, Executive Director, OIC/Takoradi.
Victoria A. Mills, Counsellor, OIC/Kumasi.
S.K. Mingle, Assistant for Personnel, Mankoadze Fisheries, Tema.
A. Mustapha, Senior Inspector of Lands, Western Region, Secondi.
M.K. Nanegbeym, Managing Director, Universal Laboratory and Technical Services, Accra.
Anna J. Nyasunu, Special Projects Officer, OIC/Ghana.
Comfort Ocansey, placed Office Skills trainee of OIC/Accra.
J.A.A. Ocansey, Training Supervisor, Student Services Dept., OIC/Accra.

W.K. Oduroh, Training Supervisor, OIC/Kumasi; Acting Carpentry instruct
Samuel O. Ofei, placed Plumbing trainee of OIC/Accra.
E.A.K. Ofori-Atta, Executive Director, OIC/Accra.
Samuel Ofosu, Plumbing instructor, OIC/Accra.
Peter Ogoe, placed Office Skills trainee of OIC/Takoradi.
Emilia Oguaah, Student Services Officer, Area Coordinator, OIC/Ghana.
George S. Okraku, Job Developer, OIC/Accra.
Mr. Oku, Administrative Director, Somaco Ltd., Accra.
William D. Opare, National Executive Director, OIC/Ghana.
Collins Opoku, placed Arts and Crafts trainee of OIC/Accra.
J.O-A Opong, Training/Curriculum Officer and Area Coordinator, OIC/Ghan
S.W.A. Oppong, Production Manager, Carpentry Shop, A. Lang Ltd., Takora
Felix Otchere, Feeder instructor, OIC/Accra.
Dora Otu, Administrative/Commercial Supervisor, Afromedia, Accra.
Theophilus Dodoo, placed Plumbing trainee of OIC/Accra.
Sam Owu, Executive Director, OIC/Kumasi.
R.A. Owusu, Chairman of the Board, OIC/Kumasi.
E. Kofi Owusu, Masonry instructor, OIC/Kumasi.
Basil Papaioannou, General Manager, Xylotech Ltd., Accra
Ayim Poakwah, Personnel Manager, Ghana Sanyo, Tema.
Alfred Quaynor, head, typing pool, Auditor General, GOG, Accra.
Irene Randall-Bull, Catering instructor, OIC/Accra.
Jim Robertson, Plumbing instructor, OIC/Accra.
E.E. Sackey, Financial Controller, OIC/Ghana.
Henry Sam, Assistant Chief of Works, new-city project of REDCO, Accra.
E.K. Samba, Training Supervisor, Vocational, OIC/Accra.
E.A. Sarpong, Assistant Quality Control Officer, Ghana Timber Marketing Board, Takoradi.
Emily Senalor, Counsellor, OIC/Accra.
Isaac Tandoh, Carpentry instructor, OIC/Accra.
Benat Tattah, Jr. Foreman, REDCO, placed Masonry trainee of OIC/Accra.
E.K. Tawian, Personnel Manager, Comazzi Bros., Takoradi.
S.K. Thompson, Counsellor, OIC/Takoradi.
Christopher Tsiagbe, Finance Officer, OIC/Accra.
Muhammed Zakari Zarak, placed Arts and Crafts trainee of OIC/Accra.

APPENDIX B

METHODOLOGY OF THE PLACEMENT SURVEY

In Accra: At the request of the evaluators, OIC/Accra prepared a list of the names of trainees placed by the Center from the inception of Phase II (1 October 1976) through mid-March 1980. The list contained 577 names, several mentioned more than once. Starting at random with the sixth name, we selected every thirteenth for interview, proceeding to the succeeding name on the list when it was a duplicate, or represented a trainee placed in FY 1980. (To confine the interviews to those who had employment records of nine or more months, we had planned to interview only trainees placed through FY 1979.) Thirty-seven names were chosen in this manner.

In Kumasi we planned to interview all eight trainees placed through FY 1979. In Takoradi, we planned to interview eight of the 15 placed through FY 1979, picking every other name listed.

Separate questionnaires were prepared for interviews with the placed OIC trainees and with their employers and/or supervisors. Because many of the involved firms and government entities had employed multiple OIC trainees, the latter questionnaire sought information concerning the firm's overall experience with OIC graduates, as well as its evaluation of the individuals to be interviewed.

Interviews were conducted "on-site" (at the firm or at a construction site at which employees of the firm were assigned) by a member of the evaluation, or, in some cases, two members of the team. An OIC Job Developer also was present during the sessions. Interviews of OIC trainees and of employers and/or supervisors who had personal knowledge of the randomly selected trainees varied. The trainee interviews averaged about 15-20 minutes; interviews with employers and supervisors averaged 25-35 minutes.

Because numbers of the randomly selected trainees had been placed in FY 1977 and FY 1978, as well as in FY 1979 -- and because of employee absences caused by illness or assignment to other sites, and unexpectedly high employee turnover at the firms visited -- we quickly

decided to interview ex-OIC trainees whose names did not appear on the survey list, in cases where the designated trainee was unavailable or had left the firm.

The placement surveys were conducted for five days in the Accra/Tema area and one-and-a-half days each in Kumasi and Takoradi. A sixth day's survey in Accra was cancelled because of a suddenly scheduled national holiday.

In all, 41 employers and supervisors were interviewed (23 in Accra, 10 in Takoradi and eight in Kumasi). Seventeen of the trainees appearing on the random-sample lists were interviewed (eight in Accra, five in Kumasi and four in Takoradi). And 10 additional OIC graduates were interviewed who had not been on the random-sample lists. Seven of them were in Accra, two in Takoradi and one in Kumasi.