ISN-34282

PD-AAP-144
XD-AAP-144-A
517-0125/15

UNCLASSIFIED
CLASSIFICATION

PROJECT EVALUATION SUMMARY (PES) – PART I

Report Symbol U-447

1. PROJECT TITLE	2. PROJECT NUMBER	3. MISSION/AID/W OFFICE
Rural Development Management	517-0125	USAID/DR

4. EVALUATION NUMBER (Enter the number maintained by the reporting unit e.g., Country or AID/W Administrative Code, Fiscal Year, Serial No. beginning with No. 1 each FY) 83

☒ REGULAR EVALUATION ☐ SPECIAL EVALUATION

5. KEY PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION DATES			6. ESTIMATED PROJECT FUNDING	7. PERIOD COVERED BY EVALUATION
A. First PRO-AG or Equivalent FY 81	B. Final Obligation Expected FY 86	C. Final Input Delivery FY 86	A. Total $ 1,100,000 B. U.S. $ 1,100,000	From (month/yr.) June 1981 To (month/yr.) June 1983 Date of Evaluation Review Oct. 1983

8. ACTION DECISIONS APPROVED BY MISSION OR AID/W OFFICE DIRECTOR

A. List decisions and/or unresolved issues; cite those items needing further study. (NOTE: Mission decisions which anticipate AID/W or regional office action should specify type of document, e.g., airgram, SPAR, PIO, which will present detailed request.)	B. NAME OF OFFICER RESPONSIBLE FOR ACTION	C. DATE ACTION TO BE COMPLETED.
1. Hire a senior management advisor.	ISA/CARD Director	Action Taken
2. Take actions for retaining ISA/CARD returning staff trainees.	ISA/CARD Director	March 1984
3. Hire short-term experienced case writers.	ISA/CARD Director	December 1983
4. Focus case topics in few priority areas.	ISA/CARD Director	January 1984
5. Transfer funds from Technical Assistance to Equipments in $65,000.	USAID/DR Proj. Com.	Action Taken
6. Speed up disbursement of PL-480 counterpart funds.	USAID/DR Proj. Com.	Action Taken

9. INVENTORY OF DOCUMENTS TO BE REVISED PER ABOVE DECISIONS

- ☐ Project Paper
- ☒ Financial Plan
- ☐ Logical Framework
- ☐ Project Agreement
- ☒ Implementation Plan e.g., CPI Network
- ☐ PIO/T
- ☐ PIO/C
- ☐ PIO/P
- ☐ Other (Specify) _____
- ☐ Other (Specify) _____

10. ALTERNATIVE DECISIONS ON FUTURE OF PROJECT

- A. ☐ Continue Project Without Change
- B. ☐ Change Project Design and/or
  ☒ Change Implementation Plan
- C. ☐ Discontinue Project

11. PROJECT OFFICER AND HOST COUNTRY OR OTHER RANKING PARTICIPANTS AS APPROPRIATE (Names and Titles)

Roberto Castro, Project Manager, ARDO
Marion Ford, ARDO, USAID/DR
Norberto Quezada, ISA/CARD Director

12. Mission/AID/W Office Director Approval

Signature

Typed Name: Philip R. Schwab

Date

AID 1330-15 (3-78)

Special Evaluation For The United States Agency For International Development

XD-AAP-144-A
5170125/17
ISN 34283

Dominican Republic
Rural Development Management
Project No. 517-0125

James A. Lynch
Cambridge Agricultural
67 Dana Street
Cambridge, Ma. 02139
May 10, 1983

I. Summary

As a result of delays in disbursements of PL480 funds from the Government of the Dominican Republic and difficulties in recruiting a senior management advisor, the projected deadlines for case development, program delivery, and facilities construction have been delayed by 6 to 12 months.

The highest priority should be given to hiring an experienced senior management advisor who will provide the guidance essential for the development of the Center in its critical initial stage. Since to a large degree the future success of the Center will depend upon the person hired as senior management advisor, I would urge both ISA and USAID to make every possible effort to identify and attract the highest caliber person for this position. As far as is possible restrictions on salary and national origin should be loosened to facilitate the recruitment process.

II Case Research

The project document has budgeted US $560,000 to fund 2 case writers and one senior management advisor. The plan calls for preparing 118 Dominican case studies during the first phase. If we assume that US $120,000 will be paid for the senior management advisor, we have a case writing budget of $440,000 or roughly $3,700 per case. In terms of individual case writers output this translates to a production of seven to 10 cases per year ($26,000 to 37,000 per case writer).

To date the techical assistance component has employed 38 person months as follows:

	Months Employed	Teaching Events prepared		Teaching Events in progress
		Cases	Exercises	
H.Hobbs	4	4	1	
B.Johnson	13	5	4	6
N.Shipull	17	5		2
M.L.Adams	4	1/2		4
	38	14 1/2	5	12

In addition the following ISA faculty and consultants have contributed to case writing:

			Affiliation
Gritzko Erickson	3	5	ISA
Christian Reyna	2	1	ISA
German Retara	1		INCAE
Javier Morales	1		INCAE
J. Lynch	4		consultant
Domingo Carrasco	1		ISA
R.Mata	1		ISA
K.Byrnes	1/2		consultant
	13 1/2	6	

V

According to the Project Document, the project is projected to prepare 118 Dominican Case Studies during the 5 year period 1981-1985. While the planners should be commended for their ambitiousness, the goal appears to be unattainable under the present set of circumtances.

At a U.S. business school, an experienced case writer developing cases with corporate clients can typically produce 1 case per month or roughly 11 per year.

There are however several significant differences between this model and the actual situation at ISA. To begin with ISA case writers are working in a developing country environment with poor telephone communications, and questionable to non-existent data available to them. There is no case method tradition in the Dominican Republic so every case writing contact necessitates a lengthly prologue -- on what exactly is the case method, how the case will be used, how case subjects can be 'protected', etc.

Case leads are also in short supply. Unlike the situation at instituations such as INCAE or Harvard where administrators,often graduates of the institution, are constantly bringing to the attention of the faculty interesting decisionmaking situations to document with a case study, the researchers at ISA must for the most part find their own way. This means exploring several leads which 'dead end' before finding one which produces a good case.

Working with the public as opposed to private institutions also implies a longer case development time. Private institutions typically have more access to meaningful data which can be used to support a case than do public institutions. "Hard" data which can be analyzed to make a decision is a sina qua non for almost any case. Without good data to back it up a case study becomes merely a "group speculation" about what should or should not be done. To inculcate an analytical, rational, decision-making process in managers one must work with a set of comprehensive, consistent, up-to-date data. In a public

sector, developing country environment, this often requires a considerable amount of time to compile. Ideally as a case writer, one tries to confine oneself to institutions and situations which already have good data available. In the Dominican Republic this is at times impossible.

Considering the shortage of experienced supervision, the newness of some of the researchers to the case method and case writing, the multiple outside duties which are performing in addition to case writing, and the developing country largely public sector world in which they are doing their research, I am quite satisfied with the overall quality and quantity of the cases being written. I do however have some suggestions for improving the organization and implimentation of case research at ISA:

1. As a first step, ISA should hire a senior level faculty member experienced both in case method research and teaching. Ideally this person would reside in Santiago for a minimum of 2 years. However if ISA continues to have difficulty in hiring a full time senior management advisor, I would recommend that they formally retain the services of one or two faculty members at related institutions to help oversee the curriculum development of the ISA program.

2. Case researchers at ISA are not as productive as they can be due in large part to multiple responsibilities which distract them from their case research. Case research is a process which requires frequent travel and working undisturbed for relatively long blocks of time. It does not mix well with either administrative duties or regular course teaching. I would relieve case writers of administrative responsibilities and limit their teaching to seminars and special sessions or lectures in selected courses.

3. Case research during the intial few years should be oriented to major problems in the nations most important policies or industries. Rather than

using "matrix" or shotgun approach which tries to touch a wide spectrum of functional problems from a wide range of industries, I would recommend ISA concentrate in developing an institutional expertise in marketing, finance, and policy in the sugar, coffee, cacao, and tobacco industries.

The advantages will be multiple: First, there is no substitute for knowledge. In order to effectively train managers ISA must not only establish the current local practices but present the "state of the art" in other countries if it differs significantly from local management practices. Second, by concentrating on a few industries ISA will be a valuable national resourse for both government and business management training. Third, by developing an institutional expertise ISA can perhaps begin to establish consulting relationships both domestically and internationally which will play an important role in the future financial viablity of ISA.

With respect to Public Policy I suggest ISA concentrate on Marketing (particularly public marketing of international commodities), land tenancy, energy, and irrigation.

If ISA can focus in on the major problems facing Rural Development in the Dominican Republic and develop an institutional expertise in areas of crucial importance to its clients, its worth to the country will be more immediately perceived and its financial viability more readily assured If ISA trys to be all things for all people I feel that the educational value of the curriculum will necessarily be mediocre.

4. As good case leads produce good cases, more emphasis should be placed upon cultivating case leads. This means establishing a "case leads" file and arranging regular "high level" meetings with government and business leaders to identify appropriate case writing opprotunities. As foreigners the current ISA case writers may not have the access necessary to do this on their own.

4. cont'd

They should be assisted in this task by ISA's Board of Directors and government contracts.

5. Given the probability of a high turnover of faculty it is important that formal teaching notes be written for all ISA developed cases. These should be brief and should be prepared initially by the case writer. Subsequently however they should be revised by the instructors who actually use the cases in the classroom setting.

6. On a more technical note-- the case focus is an opprotunity for the case writer to draw the readers into a managerial frame of mind by presenting a managerial focus. Most ISA cases have neither a managerial focus nor a decision maker per se. Typically the case's protagonist is an agricultural engineer who has been asked to develop a consulting report for the Government by next Tuesday. While this may in fact reflect the realities of decision making in the Dominican Republic it will not further the goal of developing managers who are "action-oriented". If necessary the case focus can be an invention or a similation but it should, when all is said and done, focus on a managerial decision which requires the development of a plan of action based on analysis of the data in the case.

7. Several people mentioned the desirability of a word processor to facilitate case development. This is an excellent idea and should improve case writing productivity in an environment where many cases must be revised frequently and written in both Spanish and English.

8. Case writers should <u>not</u> be used as translators. In spite of the fact that the case writers <u>can</u> write in Spanish it is not their mother tongue. I would much rather see case productivity in English increase at the expense of hiring an occasional translator than see native English case writers producing 20 to 30 % less because they are translating their own work into Spanish.

List of Completed Cases And Exercises
(as of April 1983)

Hunt Hobbs

Cases 1. "Fertilizantes Quimicos del Caribe, SA": Examines a proposal to build a fertilizer plant in the D.R.. Reviews the present system of fertilizer production and distribution in the D.R..

2. " Small Pineapple Producers of Santiago: Small pineapple producers of Santiago contemplate action alternatives in the face of technologically advanced foreign investment in pineapple production.

3. "Indutrias Lacteas Dominicanas, S.A. (INDULAC): A Dominican bank receives an offer to buy a dairy plant which is no longer in operation. The foreign offer requires the cooperation of both the Dominican government and national dairymen.

4. "The Melon Export Project of YSURA": The Dominican Agrarian Institute plans to carryout a project to produce Honey Dew Melons for export on Agrarian reform lands. The case studies the technical and commercial feasibility of the project.

Exercises

5. "The Agricultural Supply Industry of the Future in the D.R.": Exercise involves the contemplation of the future of the Agricultural Supply Industry by the Sub-secretary of Agriculture. Based on the article 'The Agricultural Supply Industry of the Future' by Bob Tamarkin.

Bradley Johnson

Cases 6. "Valley of Azua": Presents a national integrated rural development project involving several government institutions. Considers alternatives for institutional coordination to integrate the individual institutions' efforts.

7. "El CENSERI Mano Pilon": Analyzes the Integrated Rural Service Centers and the degree to which they are solving problems related to distribution of basic foodstuffs, agricultural supplies, and agricultural production for small and medium farmers.

8. "CEA-FRUDOCA 1982": Analyzes alternative arrangements for shifting some state lands from sugar to pineapple production.

9. "Processing of Tomatoes in the D.R.": A look at the tomato processing industry in the Dominican Republic.

Exercises 10. "Jorge Machado": Time-budgeting for the administrator.

11. "The New Job": A, B and C, A new agricultural professional tries to orient himself to his new cooperate surroundings.

12. "X and Y Theories" edited and translated

13. "Listening Actively" edited and translated

Norman Shipull

Cases 14. "El Tiro de la Cana": Analyzes traditional and modern systems to . . haul sugar cane to the sugar mill.

15. "Mechanized Harvesting": Evaluation of a proposed pilot project to mechanize the harvesting of sugar at Boca Chica.

16. "Projecto FUDECO en las Cienagas": Analyzes the efforts of two government institutions to develop a community housing project, orchard, and poultry farm according to the principles of community cooperation and self-help.

17. "The Dairy Industry in the D.R.": Analyzes National Price Policies for the dairy sector in early 1983.

18. "Debt Financing of Agricultural Projects": Presents the procedures and problems of obtaining debt financing for agricultural projects in the D.R. with special reference to the problems of small farmers.

Mary Lee Adams

Cases 19. "Cacao Fermentation Programs in the D.R." (based on prelimnary case study by K.Byrnes): A national program to ferment cacao to receive higher prices in the world market meets with little success.

Gritzko Erickson

Cases 20. "Forestry in the Dominican Republic": Overview of deforestation in the D.R. and alternative long term solutions.

21. "Seeds in the D.R. (A)": Macro overview of the national system of production and distribution of improved seeds. Highlights major considerations in the formulations and implementation of a national system of improved seeds.

22. "Seeds in the D.R. (B)": Private sector look at the present government policies and system for improved bean seeds in the D.R..

Exercises 23. "Searching For Underground Water": Introduction to analytical method of decision making.

24. "Managing and Interpreting Data": Introduction to elementary statistical concepts.

25. "Building a Fence": Introduction to PERT and CPM production planning techniques.

26. "Programming the Critical Path: PERT": Critical Path planning techniques applied.

27. "Decision Trees": An introduction to the decision tree technique of analyzing decisions.

James A. Lynch

Cases 28. "Edible Oils in the D.R. (A): The Deficit in Edible Oils": A committee of national policy-makers discusses alternative courses of action to resolve the mounting deficit in edible oils in the D.R..

29. "Edible Oils in the D.R. (B): The African Palm Project": An African Palm Project is consisdered by a large oil processor as a way to increase domestic oil seed production.

30. "Molinos Dominicanos, CXA": Administrators and stockholders review the results of the Molinos' recovery program and antipcipate future problems.

31. "Reducing Wheat Imports to the Dominican Republic": Policy makers formulate a plan to dramatically reduce the D.R.'s dependence on imported wheat. Local production of wheat as well as wheat substitutes are considered.

Christian Reyna

Cases

32. "Finca La Poderosa": Management control on the finca.

33. "Insumos Agropecuarios, C por A": A company with severe financial problems explores ways to raise capital and improve its administrative controls.

Exercises

34. "The Behavior of JL": Behavior of the upwardly mobile consumer.

German Retana

Case 35 "Plan Sierra": A look at an integrated rural development project: internal organization, inter-institutional coordination, alternatives for financial support, and achievements to date.

Javier Morales

Case 36 "El Municipio de Ocoa": The community of Ocoa analyzes alternatives to obtain increased aid from national development institutions for its locally led effort to improve and conserve the national resources of the community.

Domingo Carrusco

Case 37."Centro Asociativo de Palengue": A look at a combined SEA-FAO project to support a community Agricultural Cooperative which provides supplies, machinery, marketing, credit, technical assistance, irrigation, health and education to local farmers and their families.

Roberto Mata

Case 38."La ECRA del Limon del Yuna, y el IAD": An agrarian reform farmer cooperative faces serious economic and administrative problems.

III. Educational Programs

A. Seminars

To date ISA has offered the following special seminar programs:

1. "Policies for Improving Agricultural Production"
   March 11-13, 1981 -- Puerto Plata, R.D.
- Approximately 50 public and private sector attendees
- 6 cases, 2 lectures
- Offered in conjuntion with CIMMYT, financed by German government.

2. "Administration of Agricultural Export Projects"
   August 26-29, 1981-- Puerto Plata, R.D.
- Offered in conjuntion with SEA,IAD, CEDOPEX, and INESPRE.
- 4 cases, 2 lectures
- Offered to 30+ administrators of agricultural export projects.
- Objectives to improve administrative capacity and ability to negotiate export contracts.

3. "Workshop on the Formulation of Science and Technology Policies for the Agricultural and Forestry Sectors"
   December 2-5, 1981-- Santiago, R.D.
- Cosponsored with the Science and Technical Secretariat of the Presidency, INESPRE, and SEA.
- Attended by 60+ public sector officials.
- Objectives to improve ability to understand and analyze science and technology policies with respect to the Agriculture and Forestry sectors.

4. "Executive Workshop on Farmer-Agribusiness Joint Ventures"
   June 17-20, 1982-- Puerto Plata, R.D.
- Cosponsed with the Fund for Multinational Management Education and the Fundacion Dominicana de Desarrollo.
- Attended by 50 Dominicans from business and professions and 30 U.S. businessmen and development professionals.
- Objectives to discuss project design for joint ventures between farmers and agricultural enterprises.

5. "Policies and Strategies of the Agricultural and Forestry Sectors; 1982-86."
   August 26-27, 1982-- Puerto Plata, R.D.
- Cosponsored with SEA, financed by CADR
- 60+ high level officials from the agricultural sector
- Participants from SEA (25), IAD (4), INESPRE (2), Banco Agricola (5), INDRHI (3) IDECOOP, CEDOPEX (2), ODC (1), INDA, FEDA, ISA (10), and the Direccion General de Foresta(1).
- Objectives to review and discuss the Agricultural Development Plan for the upcoming period 1982-1986.

6. "Symposium on the Agroindustrial Incentive Law No.409"
   November 6, 1982 Universidad Catolica Madre y Maestra (UCMM), Santiago, R.D.
- Cosponsored with the Agronomic Engineering Department at UCMM.
- Attended by approximately 150
- Objectives to discuss the effects of Law No.409 on the economic development of the Dominican Republic as well as strategies for public sector organizations to implement the law.

Ed. Programs cont'd

7. "Interchange on Rural Development Planning and Administration"
   December 7-10, 1982 Kellogg Hall, ISA, Santiago
- Cosponsored with IICA, Fundacion Getulio Vargas, INCAE
- Attended by 25 rural development experts
- Objectives to develop an effective way to plan and administrate rural development.

8. "Molinos Dominicanos in the Production and Marketing of Wheat and Composite Flours"
   January 26-28,1983. Kellogg Hall, ISA, Santiago
- Cosponsored with Molinos Dominicanos.
- 40+ individuals: 9 from Molinos, the remainder from various interested in the research and production of wheat substitutes for the Dominican Republic.
- Objectives to appreciate the precariousness of the D.R.'s dependence on imported wheat and to search for alternatives.

9. "Institutional Cooperation in the Agrarian Reform Sector"
   March 17-18,1983. Kellogg Hall, ISA, Santiago
- Attended by 30+ representatives of IAD, AID, ISA, CADR, and the Land Tenure Center of the University of Wisconsin.
- Objectives to identify the principal problems facing the reformed sector and possible strategies to resolve them. Also under consideration were specific proposals for cooperation among the institutions participating.

10. "Seeds in the Dominican Republic"
    (to be offered) June 22-25,1983. Kellogg Hall, ISA, Santiago, R.D.
- Offered for private and public sector participants involved in the production, importation, and marketing of seeds in the D.R..

B. Seven Week Management Course

The originally planned five-week management course has been expanded to seven weeks. The project document calls for an offering of 3 five-week management programs prior to the official opening of the Center in 1984. Thereafter, the project document calls for offering 5 five-week management programs annually.

To date one seven-week management program has been offered to ISA students; May 24 to July 10, 1982. A second seven-week program was to be offered January 31 to March 18, 1983 to a group of 40 middle level technical personnel from IAD. However, unable to part with 40 of personnel for a 7 week period, IAD has postponed the program and will instead send up to 10 participants to the 7 week program to be offered to the ISA graduating class this spring.

The IAD experience points out a possible difficulty in marketing the seven-week program. While it is easy for an organization to send 10 to 20 of its personnel for a 3 day seminar, it becomes organizationally almost impossible to send larger numbers of personnel for periods of up to 7 weeks.

To resolve this problem IAD requested the 7 week program be offered in four 2 week sessions. ISA however was unable to accomodate the request due to the disruption in scheduling it would cause to the ISA programs and faculty.

Clearly more market research needs to be done to fashion the right middle length management training program for the Dominican environment. For starters I would suggest starting with shorter 2 to 3 week modules and adding more material to suit the demands of the marketplace. Secondly, I would not rely on one institution to send the participants but would try to involve several institutions.

It is satisfying to note that the seven-week program has become an integral and popular offering for ISA students. Even if the 7 week program is eventually offered only once a year to ISA students and 20 to 30 outside participants it should be considered a success.

C. Five Month Mini-Masters

According to the project document two five month degree programs are to be offered annually once the Center officially opens in 1984.

Presently the five month program is in the final stages of design by ISA and CADR staff assisted by outside consultants. Present plans call for a minimum of 40 participants to attend each program which will involve two 10-week trimesters separated by two week break. The curriculum calls for 300 teaching events: 185 cases, 103 workshops and 12 laboratories.

The 75 modules of 4 teaching events each are divided into 8 thematic groups:

1. The National Agricultural Situation in the D.R.
2. Techniques and Concepts of Administration and Economics
3. Setting Goals, Administrative Planning and Decision-Making
4. Organization and Management
5. Evaluation
6. The Organization, the Group and the Individual
7. Communications
8. Integrated Modules

My own impression of the curriculum is that it dedicates too much time to what I would call "luxury" or "soft" subjects such as: Group Dynamics, Group Decision-making, the Individual, Administration of Time, Administrative Styles, Professional Careers, Personnel Selection, etc. The other side of the coin is that I believe too little is spent on "essential" or "hard" subjects such as: Marketing, International Marketing, Commodities, Futures Markets, International Economics, International Finance, etc.

Now granted, this is a matter of judgement but my experience both as a student and a teacher has been that if you are operating in a world of limited resources you cannot and should not try to do everything equally well. In the developing world the overwhelming administartive weakness is Marketing. If ISA is to make a profound and lasting change in the Dominican Republic, let it be in the area of agricultural marketing.

Unless and until the ISA 5-month program has throughly covered the basics

of Marketing, Finance, Management Control, and International Economics, I would recommend that they not spread themselves too thin by trying to cover too many subjects.

IV. ISA Staff Training

Presently seven members of the ISA staff are enrolled in Masters programs in the U.S.:

Gabriel Guzmán, Ohio State, M.S. in Agricultural Economics and Administration, Spring of '83

Osmar Benítez, Ohio State, M.S. in Agricultural Economics and Administration, May 1984

Teófilo Gómez. Wake Forest, M.B.A., May 1984

Ramón García Amparo, Ohio State, M.B.A. May 1984

Rafael Charles Alegría, ESA, Barcelona, May 1984

Bienvenido Castro, U of Pittsburg, M.B.A. Jan of '85

Angel Castillo, INCAE, MAE, May 1984

Two points are worth mentioning with respect to staff training. First it is absolutely essential that formal employment contracts be extered into with scholarship recipients before they leave. The reason for this is quite simple; with ISA starting salaries of RD $700 per month, it will be difficult if not impossible to keep faculty members on the ISA/CADR staff once they return with a Masters degree. While ISA now has a policy of requiring two years of employment for each year of training received, ISA's senior staff expressed doubt that this contract would be easily enforcable. Turnover of Center staff should be monitored closely and if contracts are not being honored I would recommend altering the policy, perhaps adopting a policy of loaning the money for Masters study through a local bank. The loan would be "repaid" out of the years of service to ISA or if faculty choose to leave ISA, the debt would be treated as a normal financial obligation.

Secondly, if ISA is to follow the case method methodology at the Center the Center Staff should be primarily trained at instituations which use the case method. While this appears logical enough, the majority of ISA Staff are currently enrolled in degree programs which do not use the case method.

If this was an oversight it should be corrected in the future. If this was expedient to fulfill the ISA staff training timetables then AID should help ISA overcome some of the obstacles which may exist in entering staff members in case method programs.

V. Facility Development

Current plans project the completion of the Center's facilities by mid 1984, roughly one year behind schedule. The causes are two-fold: an underestimation of the time necessary to develop the final plans and disbursement delays by the GODR.

The projected cost of RD $1.77 million is roughly RD $556,000 over what was intially planned in the project document. The variation from budget is due to an underestimation of costs by the architect and a change in the plans for the office building, the cafeteria, and the dormitories all of which are now larger than originally planned.

The buildings are excellent in both design and construction they are ideally suited to management education in the tropics and can be called "state of the art" without qualification. The planning and construction of the buildings has been well supervised and all deviations from the original plan seem to be thoroughly justified.

VI. Amendments to the Project Document

To facilitate the successful execution of the Project ISA has requested the following amendments.

A. Requested Amendments #2 and 3:

(2): "Reduce by $132,384.97 the 'Techical Assistance' component presently totaling $605,000"

(3): "Increase by $132.384.97 the 'Equipment Component' presently totaling $61,000.

Recommendation:

To operate its management programs properly ISA will need additional equipment not anticipated in the project document. With the addition of $65,000 to its equipment budget, ISA will be able to purchase the needed kitchen equipment and auxiliary electric generator.

I recommend the amendment read:

"Transfer $65,000 from the technical assistance budget to the equipment budget"

B. Requested Amendment #1:

"Increase from two to three the number of case writers to be financed by the AID technical assistance component.

Recommendation:

The purpose of the technical assistance component is to develop a body of high quality case studies on Dominican Rural Development problems. ISA should be given maximum flexibility in disbursing these funds but should of course be held accountable for the resulting quality and quantity of case studies.

I would recommend that categories A1. and A2. of Table II (p.37) on the Project Document be rewritten as follows:

A1. case development $375,000
A2. senior faculty advisor/consultants $165,000

Within these two categories I would give ISA complete freedom to choose between full-time staff and consultants with restrictions only on the total funds dispursed and not on the number of people hired.

C. Requested Amendment #4:

"Expansion of the definition of equipment to include educational materials, classroom equipment, emergency power generator, and food preparation, and service equipment."

Recommendation:

This expansion is certainly justified given the necessity of proper furnishings for the program. I would sugggest "educational materials" and classroom equipment be clearly defined to avoid a future misunderstanding.

D. Requested Amendment#5:

" Extension of the Project Completion date from December 31, 1984 to June 30, 1985"

Recommendation:

Given the delays experienced I would recommend the completion date be extended by a full year to December 31, 1985 to allow ISA time to complete a full academic year with all their facilities and programs in operation.

VII. Impact of the Project to Date

On the basis of nine seminars and one seven-week management course it is difficult to meaningfully assess the "impact of the project on the development of administrative capability of mid-level managers in the Agricultural sector trained under the project."

While efforts have been made to evaluate the effectiveness of the seminars and the management program, the course evaluations are of a rather general nature. So general that it is difficult to draw meaningful conclusions from them.

The idea of critical feedback tends to make people nervous. Nobody wants to be publically reviewed and found wanting. So naturally enough evaluations are often set up to be so general that they become both inoffensive and meaningless. More time and thought should be given both by the faculty and participants to the critical evaluation of programs. What do we want to learn from an evaluation? How can we make our program more effective in the future? Who are our clients? What are their management training needs?

Continual critical evaluation by participants of programs and incorporation of that evaluation into the curriculum redesign process are critical components in the development of innovative management education programs.

VIII Additional Observations and Recommendations

During the coming years the development process of the rural development management center will involve three phases:

I Curriculum/Program Development
II Staff Development
III Institutional Development

I. Curriculum/Program Development

1) The key to this phase will be to attract to ISA an experienced person of high caliber who will actively participate in and supervise the development of case studies and management programs. This person should have subtancial experience in case method teaching and research in both the public and private sector. The individual should of course be bilingual.

Given the specialized nature of these skills I would recommend AID waive the requirement that the individual be a U.S. citizen. In this case the best qualified person should be hired regardless of nationality, the sooner the better.

2) Programs and curriculum should not be developed in a vacuum. The more case research and seminars are targeted toward specific needs of ISA's larger clients the better the programs will be received. Two to three day seminars are an excellent way to develop blocks of material and at the same time generate immediate interest, cooperation, and fi nancial support among clients.

As a general philosophy I would regard the program development stage as an experimental stage. What are the management training needs of agricultural managers in the D.R.? What are the types of management training programs that can best answer these needs? These are questions to be answered in this early phase and the only way to find the answers is to be flexible and experiment. The mark of a good experiement is setting up a hypothesis and testing it.

If we do not continually learn something specific from our experiments we risk designing a product which is either irrelevant or too expensive for our clients. Planning, feedback, and evaluation cannot be overemphasized during this phase.

II Staff Development

Perhaps the biggest challenge for the ISA CADR will be attracting and retaining Dominicans of high caliber. If ISA is to be viewed by Center faculty as more than a springboard for a Masters degree and subsequent top job in Dominican industry or government, ISA salaries must be "competitive". While four year employment contracts for returning M.B.A.'s will cover ISA's short-term faculty requirements, ISA's prestige as an educational institution will be limited unless it can retain its best people and build an experienced Dominican faculty.

Two alternatives are to supplement faculty salaries with consulting income, an approach popular in the U.S. I would avoid this alternative until ISA programs are fully developed and tested. Consulting takes a considerable amount of time and unless ISA has a clear comparative advantage and expertise in an area they risk doing a poor job at both teaching and consulting.

A second approach is to raise endowment funds from a variety of sources: local government, local and multinational corporations, and the international aid community. If a well planned program is commenced with enough lead time ISA could raise the requisite funds to provide ongoing support for 4 or 5 faculty members at the Center.

III. Development of Institutional Relationships

In the long run the key to the survival of ISA's CADR will be developing close relationaships with government, business, and academic communities. These

will be both the source of clients and cooperation.

Given UCMM's present efforts to develop an M.B.A. curriculum, I would recommend ISA cooperate with UCMM on offering an Agribusiness or Rural Development Major. Some potion of the 5-month mini-Masters could be developed to complement UCMM's Master's program. This would avoid a duplication of efforts between the two institutions and provide ISA with a guaranteed flow of students during certain times of the year when capacity is available.

With respect to international cooperation I would suggest ISA co-finance case development of mutual interest with other case method institutions such as INCAE, Harvard, World Bank, Wake Forest, etc. This will allow ISA to take advantage of the existing case development expertise at other institutions and to increase its case output productivity as well.