

6980389101501

PD-AAN-171
15N 26169

UNCLASSIFIED
CLASSIFICATION

PROJECT EVALUATION SUMMARY (PES) - PART I

Report Symbol U-447

1. PROJECT TITLE TIVAOUANE WOMEN'S PROJECT - WID	2. PROJECT NUMBER 698-0388-10	3. MISSION/AID/W OFFICE Senegal (Regional)
	4. EVALUATION NUMBER (Enter the number maintained by the reporting unit e.g., Country or AID/W Administrative Code, Fiscal Year, Serial No. beginning with No. 1 each FY) 698-80-05 <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> REGULAR EVALUATION <input type="checkbox"/> SPECIAL EVALUATION	

5. KEY PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION DATES A. First PRO-AG or Equivalent FY 78 B. Final Obligation Reported FY 80 C. Final Input Delivery FY 80	6. ESTIMATED PROJECT FUNDING A. Total \$ 373,500 B. U.S. \$ 210,000	7. PERIOD COVERED BY EVALUATION From (month/yr.) May, 1978 To (month/yr.) Jan, 1980 Date of Evaluation Review Feb, 25, 1980
--	---	--

8. ACTION DECISIONS APPROVED BY MISSION OR AID/W OFFICE DIRECTOR

A. List decisions and/or unresolved items; cite those items needing further study. (NOTE: Mission decisions which anticipate AID/W or regional office action should specify type of document, e.g., program, SPAR, PIQ, which will present detailed request.)	B. NAME OF OFFICER RESPONSIBLE FOR ACTION	C. DATE ACTION TO BE COMPLETED
1. Extend Project Completion date until 5/81	J.A. Murphy	3/80
2. Request a special waiver for purchase of medicines for village pharmacies from low-cost local government medical distributor or GOS seek support from other sources for supply of medicines.	J.A. Murphy/ A. MBengue	4/80
3. Review design and economic viability of sheep pens and sheep raising component	Dr. W. Thomas Livestock Ad.	3/80
4. Alternate trees species should be considered to replace the Eucalyptus that have died due to lack of water and poor fencing.	J.A. Murphy/ A. MBengue	5/80

<p>9. INVENTORY OF DOCUMENTS TO BE REVIEWED FOR ABOVE DECISIONS</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Project Paper <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Implementation Plan e.g., CPI Reports <input type="checkbox"/> Other (Specify) _____</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Progress Plan <input type="checkbox"/> PIQ/T _____</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Logical Framework <input type="checkbox"/> PIQ/C <input type="checkbox"/> Other (Specify) _____</p> <p><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Project Agreement <input type="checkbox"/> PIQ/P _____</p>	<p>10. ALTERNATIVE DECISIONS ON FUTURE OF PROJECT</p> <p>A. <input type="checkbox"/> Continue Project Without Change</p> <p>B. <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Change Project Design and/or <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Change Implementation Plan</p> <p>C. <input type="checkbox"/> Discontinue Project</p>
--	---

<p>11. PROJECT OFFICER AND HOST COUNTRY OR OTHER MAJOR PARTICIPANTS AS APPROPRIATE (Initials and Title)</p> <p>- Ms. Jo Anne Murphy, Project Manager, USAID</p> <p>- Ms. Aminata Mbengue-NDiaye, Project Manager Senegal</p> <p>AFR/NA, Jeannette B. Callahan <i>JBC</i></p>	<p>12. Mission/AID/W Office Director Approval</p> <p>Signature _____</p> <p>Title Name _____</p> <p>AFR/NA/ENR/office/Senegal/USHEAF</p> <p>Date _____</p>
--	--

13. Summary

This two-year, \$219,000 WID project received initial funding in May 1978 and is designed to improve the quality of life through a program that increases women's incomes and promotes their role in rural development. The first year of the project was devoted to start-up activities, and explaining the project components to women's groups. During the second year, inputs are being provided and will be in place within the next 6 months. Even though the project paper allowed two years to complete the project, the evaluation team found that this was insufficient and did not allow for either a start-up, educational phase or for a follow up phase that will be required once the inputs are in place and outputs are coming on stream. Thus, it is our opinion that the project completion date be extended by one year until March, 1981. This extension should require no additional funding.

It is also the evaluation team's recommendation that certain inputs, especially the design of sheep pens and economic feasibility of the sheep growing component, be reviewed by the USAID livestock advisor. The team feels that this component may be too elaborate as designed and may prove too expensive to continue when project funds are no longer available.

With minor changes in these components, the evaluation team believes the purpose and goal of the project can be achieved. The women's groups interviewed in the course of the evaluation were eager to participate in the economic activities. It appeared that the implementing agency, Promotion Humaine, has done a creditable job in extending the concept of the project to the beneficiaries and with the additional time proposed, will be able to follow-up with the groups and assist them in realizing the maximum benefits from the project outputs.

14. Evaluation Methodology

This evaluation was conducted at the mid-point of the project to measure progress and assist where possible in improving project design and implementation. As this is one of three regionally-funded WID projects in Senegal, it is hoped that the evaluation will assist project and program staff in designing similar type projects or components of larger, integrated projects elsewhere in Senegal.

The USAID and GOS project managers, a USAID Agronomist and a program officer met in Dakar to review project documentation. This included the Project Paper, Grant Agreement and GOS and USAID progress reports.

Following the study of documentation, a two-day field visit was conducted in order to discuss project implementation

with field personnel as well as with the participants. In the field, the team was accompanied by representatives of Promotion Humaine and by technical services that have provided assistance on well digging, agriculture, reforestation and construction.

Data presented in the summary were gathered from on-site observation and from reports provided by the GOS.

15. External Factors

The major external factors affecting project implementation were weather and the devaluation of the dollar (20%) since the project was approved.

Because of poor rains in the area during the 1979/80 growing season, no manioc and only small quantities of cow-peas (niebe) were produced.

The devaluation of the dollar has resulted in higher than expected costs for several inputs including the construction of the sheep pens and wells, and operation costs for vehicles. The latter has curtailed some activities of Promotion Humaine staff (which is implementing the project) due to insufficient funds to travel to villages to conduct village extension activities or monitor project inputs.

Another factor that has directly affected activities is the lack of means for technical agents from ministries other than Promotion Humaine to travel frequently to the villages participating in the project. Although this is generally the case throughout Senegal, it has meant that technical advice that was called for in project design has not always been available in a timely manner.

16: Inputs

Most project inputs are just being put in place. The wells are 80% complete and cannot be finished until the end of the dry season in June-July, 1980, to insure that they are of adequate depth to supply year round water. The sheep pens are 40 to 70% complete and no sheep have yet been purchased. Trees for the village woodlots have been planted but have not yet had time to become established. The two millet mills are in place but only one has been in operation for a sufficient length of time to determine if it will benefit the women's group. Manioc fields were not planted. This was primarily due to the fact that manioc in the area was attacked by an insect and the women decided not to plant it. Instead the groups planted peanuts, which in normal year would have earned approximately as much money as manioc.

As yet no medicines have been purchased. The funds proposed for this purpose were inadequate to purchase the medicines required to stock the local pharmacies. It is the design

team's recommendation that the project managers determine if there will be sufficient funds to cover this cost from other budget line items. The UNICEF village pharmacy program should be contacted as a possible alternative source of supplies until the program can pay for itself.

In general, the supply of inputs has not encountered undue delays. Those that have occurred have been solved or are being solved. The rural engineering service required the contractor building the sheep pens to destroy the bricks it had made and make new ones as the first batch was of inferior quality. The hydraulic service also terminated a contract for the digging of 5 wells because the contractor was not constructing the wells according to specifications. The hydraulic service ultimately accorded the task of completing the wells that had been started and digging the remaining wells to one contractor who has been making satisfactory progress. These two actions may have delayed implementation, but demonstrate that the technical agencies were concerned with quality and also were monitoring the activities of the project.

The evaluation team recommends that one or two aspects of the project inputs should be reviewed and attention to some of them now will prevent problems as the project progresses.

There were some questions on the part of the evaluation team about the economic justification of the elaborate sheep pen structure. The cement block walls and enclosed buildings were more costly than anticipated, and are more substantial than seems necessary. There are questions as to the need for the closed-in roofed areas and concern for the adequacy of air movement and problems of heat during the hot season. Also the roof slants into the containment yard which may cause moisture and attendant disease problems during the rainy season. An open thatched roof for protection from rain and sun and that would allow air movement might actually be more healthy. This design should be reviewed and monitored carefully during the first operational season. Assistance should be sought from the AID livestock advisor who has experience in this area.

The choice of Eucalyptus as the sole variety of tree to be planted in the village woodlot came under question by the evaluation team. According to the reforestation agent, Eucalyptus requires watering for three dry seasons to establish itself but there are other trees which need to be watered for one season only. Plantings have all been made but watering has not been adequate. At the time of the evaluation the first dry season was only half over and already the mortality rate of the trees ranged from 10 to 90% depending on the village.

In many cases wells intended to water these woodlots have not been completed as planned and water had to be carried long

distances from other village sources. It is a major task to draw water by hand for 1/2 hectare of trees from wells that are up to 30 meters deep and some distance from the woodlot.

Consideration should be given to other more hardy tree species and those that serve the double purpose of providing both wood and fruit. Neem or cashew were suggested both by villagers and the Water and Forests technician on the evaluation team. Apparently Eucalyptus was originally chosen because of a national tree planting campaign at the time the project was designed. The idea of growing one's own wood is very new for these villagers. For this reason, the tasks of tending the trees should be kept as simple and easy as possible until its merits can be established. It is clear that many of the woodlots will have to be replanted the next season. Strong consideration should be given to planting other species in addition to eucalyptus. An additional woodlot problem is keeping village animals from browsing the new seedlings. The three-strand, barbed wire fence has not been successful. Most of the lots visited had open gates and the wire was not stretched well. As a result, the sheep and goats went over and through this fence. The barbed wire is expensive and relatively ineffective. Viable alternatives should be sought. Cashew used as a living fence was suggested; traditional thorn fences are another possibility. Either of these options should cost much less and eventually be more utilitarian.

Outputs:

a) Crops

Crops planted this year have in general been a failure primarily because of low rainfall in the area and possibly in some cases because of the late arrival of seed. This was the first season for planting a crop by the women's groups and the failure seems to have been accepted as part of the high risk one takes in this marginal farming area. The women seemed willing to try again having set aside seed for next year. It is an activity deserving continued effort. More effort needs to be put in fencing to protect the crop. Fines for owners of the animals may be one solution.

b) Millet Mills

Two millet mills have been purchased for two individual villages. One has been in place for almost a year and one for only a few weeks. Proper installation seems to be a problem. Trouble has come from not getting the mills anchored properly with mountings which take up the vibration of the mill in operation.

The millet mill in NDomor has been operating for about one year. It seems to have been operating quite well. The approximate income over the year has been about 120,000 CFA.

The mill costs 480,000 CFA. No figures are available for operating costs but depreciation over a 5 year period with 10%/annum (50%) inflation requires a 144,000 CFA income per year to amortize the mill at the end of the 5th year. To cover the operation costs the per unit charge of 10 CFA/kg should be increased. The women's group in this village has used some of the income received from milling for other purposes, such as to buy food for the men digging a well for them.

It should be made clear that if the group is to continue to operate the mill and pay for its repairs and replacement then an adequate charge must be paid and some of this set aside so it will be available when needed.

Actually this village seemed aware of this financial status and the evaluation team found this quite promising. A little work with the leaders should put them on a sound, long-range financial basis. At a minimum, the villagers must be made to understand the problem of amortization so that if they choose to spend most of current income for other purposes, they do so understanding clearly what this does to the future of their enterprise.

A less tangible but no less important output observed during our visits was the growth of the women's groups in developing leadership and social organization. This varied considerably from village to village partially depending on the support given by the male village leadership. Problems dealt with and solved provide a kind of "experience in the bank" for the next problem to be faced.

A very critical time is just ahead as the economic enterprises begin to come out of the preparation stage into a start-up or operational stage. The project will require close attention particularly to organization and training in the technical areas.

18. Purpose:

The quoted purpose of this project is to alleviate the heavy burden of daily tasks performed by village women, to offer as work alternatives a variety of economic and social activities within a pre-cooperative structure and improve the quality of village life through a program which increases women's economic incomes and promotes their role in rural development.

In general, this purpose remains valid, although the outputs to increase the incomes of the women participating in the project have not been fully realized at this time.

The women's groups that were visited by the evaluation team were interested in the project, understood what it meant for them and had organized themselves in such a manner as to assure the success of the project when outputs have been realized.

This understanding can be directly attributed to project management that has been working closely with the women's groups, and through educating the women in the development process.

This was very encouraging to the evaluation team. With the experience gained in managing their own resources and planning their uses the women will be better able to control the process of development that influences their lives.

At this point however, there should be some mention made of the conception of women's projects. It appeared to the evaluation team that from the time the project was designed until the inputs are in place the women have very little voice in how the inputs are managed and are expected to contribute very little to this stage of the project. The contracting and the construction is done by outside agencies. All material is brought in and there was according to the evaluation team, perhaps too much rigidity in adhering too literally to the project agreement.

For instance, barbed wire was used for fencing the woodlots when local material would have perhaps been more appropriate. A very sophisticated sheep pen structure is being built where perhaps a less costly and more supportable enclosure made of local products would suffice.

Also eucalyptus trees were planted, even though the technical service in charge of this activity had doubts about the viability of this species under village conditions.

The result could be that the women see this project as a turn key "foreign" project and that, after the inputs are in place, and as long as operational funds from project sources are available, the activities will continue. Future projects, should attempt to involve the women during the entire project. Also, to the extent possible, the groups should be included in providing contributions to inputs to help them understand more clearly that this is "their" project for which they are responsible.

To assist in achieving this, perhaps simpler inputs could be provided early in the project that will provide income and provide the groups with experience in working together and managing the more complex components as the project progresses.

Goals

The goal of AID's assistance to women's groups is to improve women's economic and social well-being and to assist them in exerting decisive role in the development of their milieu.

It is the opinion of the evaluation team that this project is directly contributing to the goal and that the goal is still valid.

In looking at this activity two levels of development should be discussed. The village women, through participation in this project, will receive additional incomes that will benefit themselves, their families and the community as a whole. It will also give them a voice in the village activities that had before

been left entirely to men. The funds earned from the project, will be an avenue to increase the participation by women in the village decision making process. The leadership of the village will now have to include women in making decisions that affect the women and the village. It was gratifying to note during the field visits that the women were aware of this situation and were controlling their "caisse" with a strong hand.

The other women benefiting from this, as well as similar type projects, are those of regional and national level. These projects are providing experience and stature to those designing and implementing them. It was encouraging to see women in this position and the evaluation team was impressed with the leadership and expertise demonstrated by those women implementing the project.

20. Beneficiaries

The beneficiaries of this project are those identified in the Project Paper.

21. Unplanned Effects; not pertinent at this time.

22. Lessons Learned

A. Duration of Project:

Though small in terms of dollars involved, this project is complex in terms of the number and type of activities involved and has many of the same problems as larger integrated rural development projects. These include the coordination and sequencing of inputs both technical and material, so that they support and build on each other; development of social, organizational and leadership structures; development of patterns of cooperation between government organizations; development of new individual and group skills such as record keeping, budgeting for depreciation, maintenance and replacement of equipment; developing procedures for using resources made available by the projects (i.e., means for the safe keeping and handling of group funds and jointly owned materials); plus development of the skills involved in a number of new technologies.

B. Participation by women's groups

Participation should be encouraged throughout the entire life of the project. Contributions of an in-kind or monetary nature should be prerequisite before going on with a certain aspect of the project. Contracting and other external inputs should be kept to a minimum. Even though this may be more expensive in the short run, over the long run, the women would gain experience in handling funds and working together to accomplish a goal.

C. Substituting one type of work for another

Care should be taken to ensure that project activities do not supplant one type of work for another, for instance, the use of a millet mill or raising of sheep may reduce the women's work load but the watering of trees may increase the work load of those participating in the project. If this takes place one should be sure that the women perceive the result as a net gain to them, i.e., easy access to firewood in years to come or additional income from the sheep raised.