

CLASSIFICATION
PROJECT EVALUATION SUMMARY (PES) - PART I

Report Symbol USAID

1. PROJECT TITLE PL 480 TITLE II Food for Peace			2. PROJECT NUMBER N.A.	3. MISSION/AID/W OFFICE USAID/Honduras
5. KEY PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION DATES			4. EVALUATION NUMBER (Enter the number maintained by the reporting unit e.g., Country or AID/W Administrative Code, Fiscal Year, Serial No. beginning with No. 1 each FY) 522-81-9	
A. First PRO-AG or Equivalent FY <u>N/A</u>	B. Final Obligation Expected FY <u>N/A</u>	C. Final Input Delivery FY <u>N/A</u>	- <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> REGULAR EVALUATION <input type="checkbox"/> SPECIAL EVALUATION	
6. ESTIMATED PROJECT FUNDING			7. PERIOD COVERED BY EVALUATION	
A. Total \$ <u>5,893,449</u>			From (month/yr.) <u>10-78</u>	
B. U.S. \$ <u>5,405,203</u>			To (month/yr.) <u>9-80</u>	
			Date of Evaluation Review <u>January 22, 1981</u>	

8. ACTION DECISIONS APPROVED BY MISSION OR AID/W OFFICE DIRECTOR

A. List decisions and/or unresolved issues; cite those items needing further study. (NOTE: Mission decisions which anticipate AID/W or regional office action should specify type of document, e.g., airgram, SPAR, PIO, which will present detailed request.)	B. NAME OF OFFICER RESPONSIBLE FOR ACTION	C. DATE ACTION TO BE COMPLETED
1. The computerized game-simulation program of the PL 480 Title II food distribution program in Honduras was developed during 1980. A training plan for its use with field personnel must be developed.	Margaret Gorecki CARE/GOH John Contier, CRS/CARITAS Santiago Valladares, A.I.D.	6/30/81
2. The Government of Honduras has committed itself to an increase in the Caritas de Honduras' annual financial subsidy (\$50,000 to \$118,000) in CY1982 (GOH fiscal year is the same as the calendar year). Given Caritas de Honduras' financial constraint A.I.D. should strongly support Caritas in its efforts to have this subsidy increased at the earliest opportunity (earlier than CY 1982, if possible).	Margaret Gorecki CARE/GOH John Contier, CRS/CARITAS Santiago Valladares A.I.D.	12/31/81
3. In May, 1981 the Caritas "outreach" proposal was forwarded to AID/W for review and approval. AID/W action on this proposal should be carefully monitored and actions taken, as necessary, to expedite approval.	Margaret Gorecki CARE/GOH John Contier CRS/CARITAS Santiago Valladares A.I.D.	7/31/81
4. Improve the supervision and coordination of activities related to the food distribution programs. Specifically, (a) AID representatives should ensure procedures governing the distribution of foods under the Title II program are more closely followed.	Margaret Gorecki CARE/GOH John Contier CRS/CARITAS Santiago Valladares A.I.D.	7/31/81

9. INVENTORY OF DOCUMENTS TO BE REVISED PER ABOVE DECISIONS

<input type="checkbox"/> Project Paper	<input type="checkbox"/> Implementation Plan e.g., CPI Network	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Other (Specify) <u>CARE & CRS</u>
<input type="checkbox"/> Financial Plan	<input type="checkbox"/> PIO/T	<input type="checkbox"/> Operational Plans
<input type="checkbox"/> Logical Framework	<input type="checkbox"/> PIO/C	<input type="checkbox"/> Other (Specify)
<input type="checkbox"/> Project Agreement	<input type="checkbox"/> PIO/P	<u>N/A</u>

10. ALTERNATIVE DECISIONS ON FUTURE OF PROJECT

A. <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Continue Project Without Change
B. <input type="checkbox"/> Change Project Design and/or
<input type="checkbox"/> Change Implementation Plan
C. <input type="checkbox"/> Discontinue Project

11. PROJECT OFFICER AND HOST COUNTRY OR OTHER RANKING PARTICIPANTS AS APPROPRIATE (Names and Titles)

Margaret Gorecki, CARE & GOH
John Contier, CRS/CARITAS
J. H. Stone, AID/Assistant Director for Human Resources Development
L. Ruelas, AID/Mission Evaluation Officer
D. Bernius, AID/DMD's Office
S. Valladares, AID/Food for Peace Officer

12. Mission/AID/W Office Director Approval

Signature John R. Oleson
Typed Name John R. Oleson, USAID/H Dir.
Date May 29, 1981

(b) Discussions should be initiated with the Ministry of Health and their expanded nutrition unit to facilitate program coordination and supervision. As appropriate, the issue of priority areas of food distribution will be discussed/explored.

Margaret Gorecki
CARE/GOH
6/30/81

John Contier,
CRS/CARITAS

Santiago Valladares
A.I.D.

MISSING PAGE
NO. 3

The CARE Maternal Child Health (MCH) Program is carried out by the Ministry of Health (MOH) and the National Social Welfare Board (JNBS). The program is effective since JNBS provides, in most instances, transportation of commodities for its own centers and the MOH centers.

Caritas de Honduras' MCH program is hampered by financial problems. The yearly subsidy of \$50,000 presently provided by the GOH is inadequate to cover the costs of proper program management and a substantial increase is urgently needed if the Caritas program is to reach the desired number of recipients and is to be properly supervised.

While budgetary constraints in the GOH undoubtedly have contributed to the situation, the history of this problem is important in understanding why this subsidy has not been increased. Caritas has long been active in community development and campesino organizational efforts. In the early 1970's, this activity was centered in the Department of Olancho as Caritas maintained a Training Center in Juticalpa. During this same period problems ensued in this same geographic area, the military intervened and occupied the Caritas Training Center and a number of campesinos were shot in confrontations with the military authorities. This led to a certain amount of suspicion which has impeded Caritas' efforts in getting a subsidy increase.

ach
1

This "suspicion" has yet to be totally dissipated. Caritas prefers to work independently and has, in the past, not fully coordinated its programs with those of the GOH. In part, this attitude resulted from having to "go it alone" given the inadequate staffing and weak supervision of the Caritas program by the Ministry of Health. Caritas however, may also have contributed to the problem through its desire for independence and its dislike of controls and sponsor monitoring.

v,

MISSING PAGE
NO. 5

The PL480 Title II Program and the Nutrition Planning Project (522-0124) form essential elements in our nutrition strategy. Under the Nutrition Planning Project, the capabilities of the GOH to analyze, plan, execute and evaluate nutrition programs are being strengthened. This will pay direct benefits in terms of improved PL480 Title II management. Funds from the Nutrition Project were also used to finance the 1979-80 PL480 Title II impact evaluation. Lastly, PL480 commodities are being provided to groups involved in production and community development projects - some of which are also involved in the Nutrition Planning Project. The overall goal is to increase governmental interest and support of nutritional programs while simultaneously increasing production of food crops and improving overall nutritional well-being.

14. Evaluation Methodology

This evaluation has been conducted in order to improve implementation of ongoing supplementary feeding programs carried out in Honduras by both CARE and Catholic Relief Services.

A random selection of several incoming shipments were traced from the date of arrival at port of entry in the country to the final distribution points. Storage facilities at all levels were visited, and the handling of commodities and maintenance of records pertinent to the receipt, transport, distribution and inventories were checked in order to ascertain the adequacy of commodity control. Reports from the Vol-ag's also were used. Of particular assistance in the evaluation was the 1980 AAG audit of the Title II program. Evaluation participants were vol-ag personnel and USAID staff.

15. Documents to be Revised

None

16. External Factors

As a result of the Nicaraguan and Salvadoran political turmoil, large numbers of refugees arrived in the country which required special food efforts. During FY'79 and FY'80, 140,600 lbs. and 279,562 lbs. of food were distributed among Nicaraguan and Salvadoran refugees respectively. It is expected that during FY'81 food distribution for this purpose will be minimal, since the UNDP will provide food for the Salvadoran refugees as needed.

17. Goals and Subgoals

Improve the health status of the Honduras population, this will be attained by means of an improved nutritional status resulting from the consumption of PL 480 Title II supplementary food made available to already identified groups of needy people.

Beneficiaries

Approved level of beneficiaries for FY'79 and FY'80 were as follows:

CARE

<u>Category</u>	<u>Authorized Recipients</u>	
	<u>FY'79</u>	<u>FY'80</u>
MCH-Mothers	10,000	10,000
MCH-Child	60,000	60,000
OCF/Institutions	3,000	3,000
OCF/Day Care	2,000	2,000
School Feeding	180,000	220,000
Total	<u>255,000</u>	<u>295,000</u>

Caritas de Honduras

<u>Category</u>	<u>FY '79</u>	<u>Authorized</u> <u>Recipients</u>	<u>FY '80</u>
	MCH	30,000	
Food for Work Workers	5,000		5,000
Dependents	<u>20,000</u>		<u>20,000</u>
Total	<u>55,000</u> -----		<u>55,000</u> -----

18. Purpose

PL 480 Title II programs provided supplementary food to groups of malnourished people in both rural and marginal urban areas. Food is made available to needy people through programs such as MCH, SF, OCF and FFW carried out by both CARE and Caritas de Honduras.

19. Inputs and Outputs

Commodities provided under the program are approved by the Mission upon receipt and review of AER's submitted by both CARE and CRS.

The Government of Honduras' contributions to the CARE program are made annually under an agreement signed by CARE and the Ministry of Education for the School Feeding Program and with the Ministry of Health for the Maternal Child Health Program and other feeding programs. The amounts provided by the GOH cover CARE administrative and logistical support costs of the program.

The Government of Honduras also contributes to the Caritas program through an agreement with the MOH. The amount provided has remained the same for over the past five years at \$50,000 per year and as noted in the summary now is insufficient to cover the costs of proper program management. As a result, the program reached only 16,554 of the authorized 3,000 MCH recipients. The USAID is supporting CRS efforts

to secure this necessary increase in GOH funds.

A detail of inputs for the program for FY'79 and Fy'80 is as follows:

<u>CARE</u>	<u>Commodity</u>	MT*		<u>Est. ccc \$ Value</u>
		<u>FY'79</u>	<u>FY'80</u>	
	Flour (AP)	389	616	\$ 172,634
	NFDM	447	784	523,049
	Rice (LNG)	678	616	469,632
	W.S.B.	2883	3238	1,831,685
	Veg. Oil	<u>194</u>	<u>408</u>	<u>473,058</u>
	Sub-Total	4591	5662	3,470,058
		=====	=====	=====

CRS

	Rice	-	842	371,322
	Bulgur	667	-	224,062
	CSM	862	708	570,348
	NFDM	354	326	310,132
	SFRO	148	162	84,320
	Veg. Oil	<u>255</u>	<u>258</u>	<u>374,961</u>
	Sub-Total	<u>2286</u>	<u>2296</u>	<u>1,935,145</u>
	Grand-Total	6877	7958	5,405,203**
		=====	=====	=====

*As approved by ISC

**This amount does not include ocean freight

The GOH contribution for FY 1979 and 1980 for both CARE and CRS was \$244,123.00 (CARE \$194,823.00 and CRS \$50,000 per year).

Recipients that have benefited by the food distribution under the feeding programs carried out by CARE and CRS are as follows: (Sept. 1978 thru December 1980.) Figures obtained from the Recipients Status Reports prepared by both vol ags.

	<u>CARE*</u>	<u>CRS**</u>
MCH*	42,427	16,554
SF**	170,625	-0-
OCF*	4,587	-0-
FFW*	-0-	16,847

* These figures represent the monthly average of beneficiaries reached.

** The figures represent the number of children reached during the period divided by 8 months (the school year.)

20. Unplanned Effects

Not pertinent at this time

21. Changes in Design or Execution

N/A

22. Lessons Learned

While this is an ongoing program and there were no unexpected lessons learned, this evaluation has, nonetheless, served to illustrate, once again, the essential need for:

- Close supervision and coordination by implementing agencies at both the central and regional levels.
- Well-maintained distribution and reporting systems.
- Close monitoring of beneficiary impact.

Recommendations have been made and accepted regarding the need for closer supervision, particularly at the regional levels, of commodity distribution and of sanitary conditions at the various distribution/feeding locations. Additionally, recommendations - largely minor and clerical - concerning agency distribution and reporting systems have been implemented. Widespread improvements in the CARITAS program remains heavily dependent on increased governmental support. Until this support is forthcoming, CARITAS will experience personnel shortages and will be unable to exercise the degree of field supervision suggested or necessary.

In late 1979-early 1980, an impact evaluation was conducted of the PL480 Title II program by Community Systems Foundation (CSF). Funded under Project 522-0124 Nutrition Planning, this evaluation resulted in a number of recommendations to increase program efficiency and outreach. It is anticipated that a follow-on impact evaluation will be undertaken in mid-FY1982 to reexamine beneficiary impact and to examine the results of previous changes recommended by the CSF evaluation, this report and regular program monitoring activities. No impact evaluation is anticipated for FY1981.

23. Special Comments and Remarks

To improve the management and inventory of supplementary foods, a contract was signed to develop a computer simulation game designed to teach better food distribution in the field. This was originally planned for CY 1979 but the computer, which was to be used in this exercise, unfortunately did not arrive until late in the calendar year. During 1980, personnel were trained in the use of this game for simulation training of field personnel. Actual training of the field personnel will take place in CY 1981.

CARE and Caritas need to improve planning and personnel utilization. This would serve to reduce some of the duplication and confusion that presently exists while ensuring a more optimal utilization of total agency resources.

Improvements in their current distribution and reporting systems will also pay benefits in ensuring a more efficient commodity flow, reduce time lost in organizing shipments, etc. and improve the utilization of PVU personnel. Specific recommendations were made during the course of the evaluation which should lead to system improvements. These included recommendations on record-keeping, filing, entry of commodity transactions, etc. These are under implementation.

Lastly, increased governmental support of Caritas is essential. Until such support is received, Caritas will be unable to reach the total number of beneficiaries desired and will be unable to exercise the close program supervision which is essential to this program.