

6330074001501
PD-AAH-228

CLASSIFICATION
PROJECT EVALUATION SUMMARY (PES) - PART I

Report Symbol U-447

1. PROJECT TITLE <p style="text-align: center;">Botswana Agricultural College Expansion</p>	2. PROJECT NUMBER <p style="text-align: center;">633-0074</p>	3. MISSION/AID/W OFFICE <p style="text-align: center;">USAID/Botswana</p>
4. EVALUATION NUMBER (Enter the number maintained by the reporting unit e.g., Country or AID/W Administrative Code, Fiscal Year, Serial No. beginning with No. 1 each FY) <u>No. 1, FY80</u>		
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> REGULAR EVALUATION <input type="checkbox"/> SPECIAL EVALUATION		

5. KEY PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION DATES <table style="width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="width: 33%;">A. First PRO-AG or Equivalent FY <u>79</u></td> <td style="width: 33%;">B. Final Obligation Expected FY <u>82</u></td> <td style="width: 33%;">C. Final Input Delivery FY <u>83</u></td> </tr> </table>	A. First PRO-AG or Equivalent FY <u>79</u>	B. Final Obligation Expected FY <u>82</u>	C. Final Input Delivery FY <u>83</u>	6. ESTIMATED PROJECT FUNDING <table style="width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="width: 50%;">A. Total</td> <td style="width: 50%;">\$ <u>12,212</u></td> </tr> <tr> <td>B. U.S.</td> <td>\$ <u>7,149</u></td> </tr> </table>	A. Total	\$ <u>12,212</u>	B. U.S.	\$ <u>7,149</u>	7. PERIOD COVERED BY EVALUATION <table style="width: 100%;"> <tr> <td style="width: 50%;">From (month/yr.)</td> <td style="width: 50%;">4/79</td> </tr> <tr> <td>To (month/yr.)</td> <td>1/80</td> </tr> </table>	From (month/yr.)	4/79	To (month/yr.)	1/80
A. First PRO-AG or Equivalent FY <u>79</u>	B. Final Obligation Expected FY <u>82</u>	C. Final Input Delivery FY <u>83</u>											
A. Total	\$ <u>12,212</u>												
B. U.S.	\$ <u>7,149</u>												
From (month/yr.)	4/79												
To (month/yr.)	1/80												
Date of Evaluation Review _____													

8. ACTION DECISIONS APPROVED BY MISSION OR AID/W OFFICE DIRECTOR

A. List decisions and/or unresolved issues; cite those items needing further study. (NOTE: Mission decisions which anticipate AID/W or regional office action should specify type of document, e.g., airgram, SPAR, PIO, which will present detailed request.)

B. NAME OF OFFICER RESPONSIBLE FOR ACTION	C. DATE ACTION TO BE COMPLETED
1. Project funds are short. The construction will require some \$1,700,000 to be shared equally by GOB/USAID. The solar heating will require from U.S.AID an additional amount now estimated at \$450,000. USAID will prepare a PP supplement requesting additional funds required.	GOB-MFDP USAID Mar 80
2. The amount of money budgeted for the SDSU contract may be short some \$400,000.	USAID Mar 80

9. INVENTORY OF DOCUMENTS TO BE REVISED PER ABOVE DECISIONS <table style="width: 100%;"> <tr> <td><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Project Paper</td> <td><input type="checkbox"/> Implementation Plan e.g., CPI Network</td> <td><input type="checkbox"/> Other (Specify) _____</td> </tr> <tr> <td><input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Financial Plan</td> <td><input type="checkbox"/> PIO/T</td> <td>_____</td> </tr> <tr> <td><input type="checkbox"/> Logical Framework</td> <td><input type="checkbox"/> PIO/C</td> <td><input type="checkbox"/> Other (Specify) _____</td> </tr> <tr> <td><input type="checkbox"/> Project Agreement</td> <td><input type="checkbox"/> PIO/P</td> <td>_____</td> </tr> </table>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Project Paper	<input type="checkbox"/> Implementation Plan e.g., CPI Network	<input type="checkbox"/> Other (Specify) _____	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Financial Plan	<input type="checkbox"/> PIO/T	_____	<input type="checkbox"/> Logical Framework	<input type="checkbox"/> PIO/C	<input type="checkbox"/> Other (Specify) _____	<input type="checkbox"/> Project Agreement	<input type="checkbox"/> PIO/P	_____	10. ALTERNATIVE DECISIONS ON FUTURE OF PROJECT A. <input type="checkbox"/> Continue Project Without Change B. <input type="checkbox"/> Change Project Design and/or <input type="checkbox"/> Change Implementation Plan C. <input type="checkbox"/> Discontinue Project
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Project Paper	<input type="checkbox"/> Implementation Plan e.g., CPI Network	<input type="checkbox"/> Other (Specify) _____											
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Financial Plan	<input type="checkbox"/> PIO/T	_____											
<input type="checkbox"/> Logical Framework	<input type="checkbox"/> PIO/C	<input type="checkbox"/> Other (Specify) _____											
<input type="checkbox"/> Project Agreement	<input type="checkbox"/> PIO/P	_____											

11. PROJECT OFFICER AND HOST COUNTRY OR OTHER RANKING PARTICIPANTS AS APPROPRIATE (Names and Titles)

Jack Morris, Agricultural Officer, USAID/Botswana
 Duane Everett, Chief of Party, SDSU
 David Finlay, Permanent Secretary, MOA
 V. F. Amann, Chief Agric. Economist, MOA

12. Mission/AID/W Office Director Approval	
Signature	
Typed Name	Louis A. Cohen
Date	FEB 14 80

633-0074
Botswana Agricultural College Expansion
PES: 4/79 - 1/80

I. PROJECT SUMMARY

Botswana has a manpower shortage in the Agricultural Sector of its expanding economy. This shortage is particularly acute at the lower and middle level of trained personnel. MOA reports 60 vacancies exist currently of 210 A.D. positions and the number of vacancies is increasing. The lack of trained manpower at these levels will have an increasingly serious and cumulative impact on the GOB's capacity to plan, administer and implement agricultural development programs.

The project focuses on improving and increasing the capacity of the Botswana Agricultural College (BAC) to train agricultural manpower. The availability of more trained manpower should contribute to the project goal of improvement of the welfare of Botswana's small-scale farmers and herders.

According to project design, over five years the project will (a) have doubled the annual number of certificate graduates in Animal Health and Agriculture; (b) have institutionalized a new diploma program in Animal Health and Agriculture; (c) be staffed with largely localized teaching personnel whose skills have been significantly upgraded through both long- and short-term training programs; (d) will be staffed with Botswana capable of education planning and administration; (e) have established curricula and teaching techniques which are providing practical training in skill areas relevant to GOB needs.

Project inputs were to include: (1) 19.5 years of long-term technical assistance and 80 person months of short-term technical assistance; (2) the construction of facilities in which to instruct and house additional students and equipment and furnishings for these facilities; and (3) 41.5 years of long-term training to upgrade BAC's staff.

II. EVALUATION SUMMARY

The project is following the original plan, and it appears the necessary schedules for construction, curriculum changes and admission of new students are being met. Training of staff to achieve localization goals is proceeding satisfactorily. The measuring of improved administration and planning is difficult but it is obvious that local participation in these vital areas is greater than in the past.

Sufficient budget allocations may be an outstanding issue. There is a need for some \$2,000,000 to fund cost overruns for the construction and SDSU contracts.

III. EVALUATION METHODOLOGY

The evaluation has been conducted using a collaborative approach between the GOB/Ministry of Agriculture (MOA), USAID and contract team personnel. Major issues were drawn up by the project manager and the chief of party. These issues were reviewed in individual interviews with all members of the SDSU team and appropriate MOA officials (Chief, Planning and Statistics Unit, MOA).

IV. EXTERNAL FACTORS

The rate of inflation in Botswana and world wide has increased the costs beyond that planned. Construction costs continue to be somewhat unpredictable, dependent on oil prices and political events in Southern Africa.

This project is multi-donor in respect to expatriate teachers. It is not possible to eliminate changes in personnel or to ensure timely appointment and arrival of personnel to be provided by other donors.

V. INPUTS

A. Technical Assistance

The project was to provide a Chief of Party, a long-term technical assistant in Extension and Agronomy, a long-term technical assistant in Livestock, and replacement staff members in Range Management, Agricultural Communications and Agricultural Economics.

Comment

Chief of Party, Extension-Agronomy Technical Assistant, and Livestock Technical Assistant were to be on site January 1979. The SDSU*contract with USAID was not finalized until April 15, 1979. The Chief of Party and Extension-Agronomy Technical Assistant arrived in Botswana on April 30, 1979, with the Livestock Technical Assistant arriving May 7, 1979.

The Range Management replacement staff member arrived on schedule. The Agricultural Economics replacement being furnished by Peace Corps was scheduled to arrive July 1, 1979. This individual was delayed for medical reasons until November 25, 1979. CUSO** had agreed to supply a Livestock teacher for the staff. They were unable to supply such an individual. The Agricultural Communications position planned to be provided by SDSU was not filled during a prolonged period while a decision was being made as to the appropriateness of substituting the Livestock position for the Ag

*South Dakota State University

**Canadian University Service Overseas

Communications position. The Ag Communications position recruitment is now underway with anticipated arrival in February 1980. An alternate source of funding is being sought for the Livestock position.

A total of 80 months of short-term consultation is planned for the project. To date, consultants have been utilized to work with local staff members in curriculum restructuring and improvement in the areas of Soils, Plant Pathology, Biological Sciences, and Horticulture. A consultant was utilized to assist local staff in selecting appropriate furnishings and equipment for the buildings. Additional short-term consultants are scheduled in the areas of Entomology, Math, Physical Science, Extension, Beef Breeding, Poultry, Dairy, Engineering and Beef Production. Eleven months of consultation have been provided to date.

A financial review is being carried out by USAID but preliminary T.A. budget estimates indicate some \$300,000 additional T.A. money is needed.

B. Participant Training

The PP indicates that a project-funded total of 41.5 years of training will be accomplished at diploma, degree and workshop levels.

1. Currently three Batswana (MOA funded) are enrolled in diploma course 2nd year and will be returning in May 1980.
2. Five Batswana (MOA funded) were selected and entered first year diploma training in Swaziland in May 1979.
3. Three individuals (USAID funded) were sent to the U.S. for degree training in August 1979. The major areas are Range Management, Animal Science and Pre-Veterinary. Four individuals departed for the U.S. December 28, 1979, for degree training in areas of Ag Communications, Ag Economics, with math minor, and two pre-Veterinary.

Comment: Delay in start-up date of project made it almost impossible to meet PP expectations. A total of 8 persons were to be enrolled in year one of the project. One individual has been ill and to date unable to begin training.

4. Workshops: One individual is enrolled in an 11-month workshop in the Netherlands. The workshop is sponsored by the United Nations.

5. Training sponsored by other agencies: Three Batswana are enrolled in degree training in the U.S. under other AID sponsorship. One Motswana returned to Botswana after extended illness caused termination of his training.

Comment: Training at present seems reasonably on track. The ability of students is yet to be determined.

6. A review of program to date indicates a need for additional trainees. Training should be made available for one person each in Agriculture Extension, Agricultural Mechanization, and Agricultural Science. This is required to carry out the localization plans and upgrade staff to planned levels. The Agriculture Extension trainee is to replace the individual referred to in Item 5 above.

G. Construction

1. Construction of college buildings within this project includes three classroom buildings, two teaching staff office buildings, an administration building, an animal health building, an engineering building, three dormitories each with sixty student capacity and a dining hall-kitchen building, plus additions to the science building, the library and the laundry.

Construction of housing includes five type two houses in Broadhurst, five medium cost houses at BAC, and a total of 27 lower cost type houses. Infrastructure to provide support services will also be constructed.

Comment: The decision was made to proceed with construction in two phases labeled Phase I and Phase II, to facilitate adherence to student admittance plans. This decision occurred after the start-up of the project. Key structures (one classroom, 3 dorms, kitchen and dining room, laundry addition) were identified to enable the project to proceed on schedule.

a. Phase I

Phase I buildings included one classroom building and one dormitory to be completed by March 1, 1980; then the two remaining dormitories, the kitchen-dining hall and the addition to the laundry to follow. This configuration will allow for students to arrive on campus as scheduled in the PP. The three classrooms will relieve crowding which would have taken place. Sixty students are to arrive on campus for the expanded certificate program on March 10, 1980. An additional 60 students will arrive in March 1981 with the first diploma students (30) arriving in May 1981. The final diploma students (30) will arrive in May 1982.

b. Phase II

Phase II buildings include all remaining structures within the project. It is anticipated that these structures will be completed for the March 1981 intake of students. Phase II includes all housing to be built at BAC.

Comment: All structures have been planned to final design by the architect and Chief of Party. Anticipated tender date on Phase II is February 1980.

A shortfall in funding due to very high rates of escalation of costs could have been a problem. The Ministry of Finance and Development Planning and USAID negotiated a solution in which AID and the GOB are to be asked to provide more funds.

2. Housing

A total of 32 houses will be constructed at BAC under the project and an additional five houses will be constructed in Broadhurst to house long-term technical assistants.

Comment: The 32 houses to be constructed at BAC are included in Phase II of the building project. Plans for those houses are complete.

The five houses in Broadhurst have been completed.

3. Infrastructure

Plans have been completed for roads, sewer and electrical distribution systems for the expansion.

4. Equipment and Furnishings

Plans are to equip and furnish all buildings constructed within the project. A listing of such items was completed at the time the project was planned.

Comment: All furnishings have been ordered to equip Phase I buildings. These items, ordered in June 1979, should arrive prior to the opening of the session in March 1980. The equipment and furnishing lists were reviewed with each department to determine if needs were being met. The master list was accordingly altered. A short-term consultant then prepared specifications for each item. These specifications have been placed on appropriate AID forms for order. This activity was completed in November 1979. Only library books, textbooks and some locally purchased items remain to be ordered.

VI. OUTPUTS

A. Participant Training

None completed to date.

Comment: Participant training is well underway; however, no individual has completed training. (See Page 3.)

Constraints:

1. Limited number of well qualified candidates available.
2. Some reluctance by the Ministry of Personnel to supply posts.
3. Limited interest in some areas of study that require social science and math, i.e., soils.

B. Replacement Staff

(Staff to replace teaching responsibilities of BAC teaching staff while in training.)

Project supplied:

Range Management: Staff member arrived on schedule.

Ag Communications: Staff member currently being recruited. BAC did not send Ag Communications trainee nomination until late December 1979. Individual to arrive and be ready for teaching by March 10, 1980. Delay was by design.

Livestock: Position was to be filled by CUSO. They were unsuccessful in recruiting anyone and, therefore, requested to be relieved of responsibility. Currently, recruitment through the USAID OPEX program is being made.

Agricultural Extension: Position was to be filled by an FAO associate expert. They were unable to make placement as no expert was available to supervise an associate expert. Position currently being filled by returned trainee (Ag Extension person who became ill and returned to Botswana).

Agricultural Economics: Position was filled by Peace Corps in late November 1979. Recruit did not arrive on schedule due to illness. Impact of delay on project was nil.

C. Equipment and Supplies

Equipment for Phase I construction (classroom, dormitories, kitchen-dining hall and laundry expansion) has been ordered and is scheduled for arrival prior to the opening of classes on March 10, 1980.

Equipment for Phase II construction - all items except library books and textbooks - have been identified. Specifications have been written and orders are being placed. Some locally purchased items must be arranged.

D. Vehicles

Trucks: Three 1½ ton pickup trucks have been purchased and delivered through the GOB. One of these is a four-wheel drive. Two trucks have been modified and are ready for transporting students. The third is in process of modification. The modified vehicles will accommodate 12-15 students for use in student practical training exercises in and around the college. They can also be used to transport the students over greater distances on field trips.

Station wagon: One station wagon has been ordered through the GOB. Some delay in receipt of this vehicle is due to assessment of make and models of station wagons to be purchased by GOB.

E. Curriculum Revision

Project intent was to revise curriculum to allow changes prior to school opening for the first expanded intake of certificate students. Work has progressed on schedule.

Short-term consultants have worked with local staff members in revising course content and planning for soils, horticulture, science, and plant pathology. They surveyed local facilities and conditions, reviewed existing literature, met with local farmers and producers, met with MOA personnel in the appropriate fields, and worked closely with the agriculture research staff. In some cases, courses and course content were combined or shifted to other areas. A new course in soils was developed.

Plans are to continue this process completing the areas of Beef Breeding, Poultry, Agricultural Extension, Chemistry and Physics, Math and Entomology, prior to the March 10, 1980, intake. Other revisions are programmed to occur prior to the actual term of teaching the subject. Consultants are being programmed accordingly.

Data are being collected for the actual design of the diploma courses to begin in 1981.

F. Administrative Improvement

Several suggestions have been made with actual implementation in process. Most notable at present are proposed changes in budget and budget control, and scheduling of classes.

G. Construction of Buildings and Infrastructure

Because of initial delays both by USAID and the GOB, the start-up of the project was delayed some six months. To compensate for that delay and attempt to keep the project on the original timetable, the decision was made to construct the buildings and infrastructure in two phases.

Phase I: After consultation, it was agreed that priority should be given to one dormitory to house 60 people and one classroom building. These are to be completed by opening of the session on March 10, 1980. Also included in Phase I were the remaining two dormitories, the kitchen-dining hall, and the laundry expansion.

Comment: The contract for Phase I was awarded on September 1, 1979, with the contractor moving to the site on September 2, 1979. Work at this time is on schedule. The classroom building and one dormitory should be ready for the school opening in March. Work has also begun on the two remaining dormitories and with the laundry expansion and kitchen-dining hall building to follow.

Phase II: All remaining structures are in this phase, including infrastructure.

Comment: Plans have been completed on all buildings and are ready for tender. Contract award is scheduled for the end of February. The project has experienced a shortfall of funds due to (a) 3-4 month delay in GOB warranting funds for final design and subsequent delay in initiating Phase I; (b) 3 month delay in architect finalizing design for Phase II and subsequent delay in initiating Phase II; (c) revaluation of the Pula by 5 percent against the U.S. dollar; (d) substitution in Phase II by USAID's request of solar heating for conventional heating facilities at a higher capital cost; (e) USAID original cost estimates incorrectly included inflation contingency for only one year (at 15 percent), whereas the period from project approval to completion of construction should have been more nearly 3 years; and (f) higher rates of inflation than assumed.

USAID has requested that the GOB provide bridging funds to allow tender and construction to proceed on schedule. Final GOB decision

to allocate these bridging funds has been received. The shortfall is estimated at \$2,150,000. USAID/B proposes to provide \$850,000 of a \$1.7 million overrun on the original design plus \$450,000 for installation of solar heating facilities insisted upon by USAID.

Infrastructure will proceed under Phase II with the exception of a limited amount of electrical, water and sewer work made necessary to complete Phase I on schedule.

H. Logistical Support for Project Team

Logistical support for the project team was to be provided by a field support officer. The project was to bear one-half the cost of the support officer's salary plus the salary for one local employee, plus monies for improvement of housing. The field support officer would provide similar support for other projects as well as PASA team support.

Comment: Field support is carried out by a USAID Field Support Officer. Continual supervision by the USAID Management Officer is required.

VII. BENEFICIARIES

Direct beneficiaries are the anticipated graduates of the expanded program and the individual staff members who receive training. A total of 19 staff have received some training to date. With reconstruction of the curriculum, the graduates will begin receiving benefits in March 1980.

Long-term indirect beneficiaries are the rural Batswana who will receive benefit only after graduation of the first class and their subsequent placement in the field.

VIII. UNPLANNED EFFECT

None to date.

IX. LESSONS LEARNED

Although the project is in its early stages, it is felt that the special pre-contract site visit by the Chief of Party was very beneficial. The visit stimulated action on the part of all parties to move forward with preliminary steps in the project, plus allowed some decisions on housing for the long-term staff. As a result, the project team responded quickly after the signing of the contract. This pre-contract site visit complemented the Title XII collaborative design approach used for this project. Two of three SDSU PP design team members, including the team leader, returned to Botswana to implement the project. This process substantially reduced the "breaking-in" time normally required for project implementation teams. To date, this is clearly a Title XII "success story."