

PROJECT APPRAISAL REPORT (PAR)

PD-AAD-737-F1

PAGE 1

1. PROJECT NO. <b>197-11-690-183</b>	2. PAR FOR PERIOD <b>FY 69 TO Mid-FY75</b>	3. COUNTRY <b>Indonesia</b>	4. PAR SERIAL NO. <b>75-4</b>
---	---	--------------------------------	----------------------------------

5. PROJECT TITLE  
**General Participant Training**

6. PROJECT DURATION: Began FY <b>1967</b> Ends FY <b>1981</b>	7. DATE LATEST PROP <b>12-18-1970</b>	8. DATE LATEST PIP <b>-</b>	9. DATE PRIOR PAR <b>1969</b>
---	--	--------------------------------	----------------------------------

10. U.S. FUNDING	a. Cumulative Obligation Thru Prior FY: \$ <b>8,367,000</b>	b. Current FY Estimated Budget: \$ <b>1,031,000</b>	c. Estimated Budget to completion After Current FY: \$ <b>ongoing</b>
------------------	---	---	---

11. KEY ACTION AGENTS (Contractor, Participating Agency or Voluntary Agency)

a. NAME	b. CONTRACT, PASA OR VOL. AG. NO.
- USAID/Indonesia	
- Government of the Republic of Indonesia	

I. NEW ACTIONS PROPOSED AND REQUESTED AS A RESULT OF THIS EVALUATION

A. ACTION (X)			B. LIST OF ACTIONS	C. PROPOSED ACTION COMPLETION DATE
USAID	AID/W	HOST		
X		X	USAID, in collaboration with GOI, should attempt to focus the GPT project (1) in Ministries and institutions having a commitment to staff development and (2) in the specific priority areas of Food and Nutrition, Population and Health, and Education/Manpower Development.	
X		X	Explore the potential for centralising within a "Scholarship Secretariat" the GOI manpower development activities in order to facilitate the determination of requirements, the identification and processing of candidates, and assure their most effective utilisation after training.	
X		X	Explore possibility of conducting a Sectoral Effectiveness Evaluation within GPT on clusters or elements of training. The first stage would be on USAID-sponsored participants who have departed for training.	

D. REPLANNING REQUIRES	E. DATE OF MISSION REVIEW
REVISED OR NEW: <input type="checkbox"/> PROP <input type="checkbox"/> PIP <input type="checkbox"/> PRO AG <input type="checkbox"/> PIO/T <input type="checkbox"/> PIO/C <input type="checkbox"/> PIO/P	<b>April 11, 1975</b>

PROJECT MANAGER: TYPED NAME, SIGNED INITIALS AND DATE <b>M. Aloys Doyle, TRG</b>	MISSION DIRECTOR: TYPED NAME, SIGNED INITIALS AND DATE <b>Richard M. Cashin, Director</b>
---	--

AID 100-28 (10-70) PAGE 2 PAR	PROJECT NO. 497-11-690-183	PAR FOR PERIOD: TO FY 75	COUNTRY Indonesia	PAR SERIAL NO. 75-4
----------------------------------	-------------------------------	-----------------------------	----------------------	------------------------

**N. PERFORMANCE OF KEY INPUTS AND ACTION AGENTS**

A. INPUT OR ACTION AGENT CONTRACTOR, PARTICIPATING AGENCY OR VOLUNTARY AGENCY	B. PERFORMANCE AGAINST PLAN							C. IMPORTANCE FOR ACHIEVING PROJECT PURPOSE (X)				
	UNSATISFACTORY		SATISFACTORY			OUTSTANDING		LOW		MEDIUM		HIGH
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	1	2	3	4	5
1. USAID - Participant Training Div.						X						
2.												
3.												

Comment on key factors determining rating

Actual USAID/TRG duties include selection, pre-departure preparation (language testing, orientation, processing), monitoring of program progress and followup on participants' return. The Audit Report No. 8-497-74-51 of GPT dated March 22, 1974 which covered the period March 1971 - November 1973 said: "In general we found management of project resources to be good."

4. PARTICIPANT TRAINING	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	1	2	3	4	5
						X						X

Comment on key factors determining rating

Given the purpose to bring participants back to Indonesia and back into the economy with a meaningful position, the project has been successful. Having sent 897 to the USA during the period 1969 through 1974, all have returned.

5. COMMODITIES	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	1	2	3	4	5
						X				X		

Comment on key factors determining rating During review period project bought an English language lab equipment and spare parts and loaned it to BNC for language training program there for all AID participants. Project has continued to buy English lang. texts for loan to Outer Island institutions engaged in preparatory English teaching. Has also been an active follow-up program providing journals and other professional material to returned participants.

6. COOPERATING COUNTRY	a. PERSONNEL	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	1	2	3	4	5
	b. OTHER						X						X

Comment on key factors determining rating Cabinet Secretariat and participating Ministries and Agencies of GOI continue to hold primary responsibility for development of training targets and priorities, to which donors (like USAID) are asked to be responsive. USAID Participant Training continues viewed by GOI in positive light, as in the fall of 1974 the GOI agreed to absorb full international travel costs of all Indonesian/USAID participants beginning April 1, 1975. All possible participant selection/nomination is conducted by GOI. GOI has actively supported follow-up program and provides funds for all ceremonial occasions. FY 75 GOI contribution to GPT project is \$755,000. Accumulative total since 1969 is \$3.2 million.

7. OTHER DONORS	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	1	2	3	4	5
						X						X

(See Next Page for Comments on Other Donors) Primary Bi-lateral Donors: Australia, Germany, Netherlands  
 Primary Multilateral Donors: UNDP. Primary Private Sources: SPANCO, Ford, Rockefeller.

II. 7. Continued: Comment on key factors determining rating of Other Donors

All donors engaged in assisting the GOI are supporting off-shore training programs. This includes bilateral, multilateral and private foundations. The total is coordinated by the Cabinet Secretariat. GOI statistics for 1973 (the last available figures) show that 2,590 Indonesians departed for training off-shore during that year. The complete USAID share was 244 or 9%; the GPT project share 151 or 6%.

III. KEY OUTPUT INDICATORS AND TARGETS

A. QUANTITATIVE INDICATORS FOR MAJOR OUTPUTS	(Output Targets begin '69)	cumulative TARGETS (Percentage/Rate/Amount)					END OF PROJECT
		CUMULATIVE PRIOR FY	CURRENT FY		FY 76	FY ____	
			TO DATE	TO END			
1. Cadre of returned Indonesians (effectively)* utilizing training in contributing to management & problem solving activities associated with Indo. development priorities.	PLANNED	950	1062	1105	1260		
	ACTUAL PERFORMANCE	902	1014				
	REPLANNED			1057	1212		
2. Short term participants trained in US or third country. (Actual Funding & departures for training in FYs).	PLANNED	907	-	967	1037		
	ACTUAL PERFORMANCE	521	-				
	REPLANNED			581	651		
3. Long term participants trained in US or third country. (Actual funding and departures for training in FYs).	PLANNED	541	-	640	743		
	ACTUAL PERFORMANCE	355					
	REPLANNED			454	597		
	PLANNED						
	ACTUAL PERFORMANCE						
	REPLANNED						
B. QUALITATIVE INDICATORS FOR MAJOR OUTPUTS	COMMENT: During the period of this review, the participants sent abroad have either returned or are continuing their programs in good standing. Of those returned 95% have been placed in positions which effectively utilize their acquired skills. Approximately 47% of Indonesia's university level and higher institution administrators have been elevated to those positions following USAID training. Former participants are leaders within Indonesian professional societies and are engaged in publishing professional texts, and journal articles.						
1. * Utilization of training and accomplishments of returned participants.							
2.	COMMENT: Note: Quantitative Indicators No.2 & 3 (Actual Performance) are not equivalent to those actually returning and utilizing training, Indicator No.1, since there is always a year or two lag in those departing Indonesia and those returning in any given FY.						
3.							

AID 1020-25 (10-70) PAGE 4 PAR	PROJECT NO. 497-11-690-183	PAR FOR PERIOD: To: FY 75	COUNTRY Indonesia	PAR SERIAL NO. 75-4
-----------------------------------	-------------------------------	------------------------------	----------------------	------------------------

IV. PROJECT PURPOSE

A. 1. Statement of purpose as currently envisaged.

2. Same as in PROP?  YES  NO

Creation of a significant and growing manpower pool of skilled Indonesians effectively working in various functions and activities having a high development priority. (Since Project's inception in 1967, over 1,000 Indonesians have been trained under the USAID/GPT Project and have returned to Indonesia to become an important element of the national manpower pool.)

B. 1. Conditions which will exist when above purpose is achieved.

2. Evidence to date of progress toward these conditions.

1. Reduction of critical shortages of skilled manpower in public sector and to a lesser degree in private sector.

2. Autonomous Indonesian capability to recognize and identify trained manpower requirements and to plan and implement programs to meet such needs.

3. Ongoing Indonesian institutions which are qualified and capable of meeting some of high priority domestic educational and manpower needs.

1. GOI manpower inventory analyses have been conducted by LIPI (science & tech.) and BPP (Edu.). A similar broad-based inventory is underway for the entire Civil Service by the Minister for State Apparatus. The next step is review of needs and develop training plans.

2. Cabinet Secretariat (SEKNEG) continues to develop national strategy to coordinate training requests. Long-term develop. planning has also evolved from spectrum of departments & higher institutions serviced by project, as well as greater awareness & demand on returnees to share knowledge. GOI is likewise developing national awareness & sensitivity to promise & limitations of foreign training in context of Indonesian development.

3. Indo. Institutions continue to develop curriculum and staffs to meet international standards. Number of trained & competent teaching & managerial staffs increased by 20% over past 8 years and total number of graduates from these institutions has increased by nearly 30% since 1965.

V. PROGRAMMING GOAL

A. Statement of Programming Goal

Self-sustained Indonesian economic and social growth through the development of a self-sufficient managerial and technical capability to address development problems, particularly poverty, unemployment and inequity.

B. Will the achievement of the project purpose make a significant contribution to the programming goal, given the magnitude of the national problem? Cite evidence.

Yes. As in most developing nations, Indonesia has a critical need for trained and capable mid-level managerial skills in all sectors in order to sustain economic and social growth. Indonesian resources are available for the continued development and expansion of training facilities aimed at increasing the skilled manpower pool, but a human resource-base of skilled/trained people must first be established for the multiplier effect to take hold. This is the ultimate goal of the GPT project, as well as the training components of other technical assistance projects. The proper utilization of foreign-trained Indonesian manpower is making a significant contribution to this end.

PROJECT DESIGN SUMMARY  
LOGICAL FRAMEWORK

Project Title & Number: PARTICIPANT TRAINING  
PROJECT 497-11-690-10

Date of Report: \_\_\_\_\_  
Date Prepared: April 1973

4  
5.5  
1.8  
4.10  
5.5  
99.0

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	OBJECTIVELY VERIFIABLE INDICATOR	MEANS OF VERIFICATION	REPORT ASSUMPTIONS																																																																																				
<p><b>Program or Sector Goal:</b> The broader objective to which this project contributes:</p> <p>Self-sustained Indonesian economic and social growth through the development of a self-sufficient managerial and technical capability to address development problems, particularly poverty, unemployment, and inequality.</p>	<p><b>Measures of Goal achievement:</b></p> <p>In continuation of targets from the First Five Year National Development Plan (PELITA I), gross domestic product increases in the next five-year plan (1974 through 1979) are targeted at between 40% and 50% with gross domestic product increases on a per capita basis at between 25% and 35%.</p> <p>Primary emphasis during the Second Five-Year Plan is placed on the generation of employment, regional and equitable distributions of welfare, and social justice. Also inherent in the plan is the full development of National Self-Reliance.</p>	<p>Records and Reports from USAID and GOI Department.</p>	<p><b>Assumptions for achieving goal targets:</b></p> <p>Problem-solving within overall national Economic and Social Development is dependent upon managerial and technical capabilities. Increased training of manpower will help to solve current technical and managerial shortages. Other donors will continue to provide training.</p>																																																																																				
<p><b>Project Purpose:</b></p> <p>Creation of a significant and growing manpower pool of skilled Indonesians effectively working in various functions and activities having a high developmental priority.</p>	<p>Conditions that will indicate purpose has been achieved: End of project status.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Generalized manpower requirement analysis and subsequent priority training programs will lead to overall reduction of critical shortages of skilled manpower in the Public Sector, and to a lesser degree, in the Private Sector.</li> <li>Autonomous Indonesian capability to recognize and identify trained manpower requirements, and to plan and implement programs to meet such needs.</li> <li>Ongoing Indonesian institutions qualified and capable meeting some of the high priority domestic educational and manpower needs through the development of trained and competent teaching and managerial staffs.</li> </ol>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>GOI Manpower statistics.</li> <li>GOI and Private educational institution reports and records.</li> </ul>	<p><b>Assumptions for achieving purpose:</b></p> <p>Overseas training will assist in filling skilled manpower vacancies and will, in turn, lead to development of indigenous skilled manpower training institutions and facilities deemed an essential National Priority.</p>																																																																																				
<p><b>Outputs:</b></p> <p>A cadre of returned Indonesians effectively utilizing their training in contributing to the management and problem-solving activities associated with the nation's developmental priorities.</p>	<p><b>Magnitude of Outputs:</b></p> <p><b>Trained Participant Returns</b></p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th rowspan="2">FY</th> <th colspan="2">Short Term (Part.)</th> <th colspan="2">Long Term</th> </tr> <tr> <th>(Part.)</th> <th>(m/a)</th> <th>Degree (Part.)</th> <th>Non-Degree (Part.)</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>69</td> <td>89</td> <td>296</td> <td>38</td> <td>1,376</td> </tr> <tr> <td>70</td> <td>120</td> <td>446</td> <td>51</td> <td>1,669</td> </tr> <tr> <td>71</td> <td>100</td> <td>382</td> <td>75</td> <td>2,150</td> </tr> <tr> <td>72</td> <td>70</td> <td>267</td> <td>35</td> <td>1,180</td> </tr> <tr> <td>73</td> <td>48</td> <td>181</td> <td>23</td> <td>838</td> </tr> <tr> <td>74</td> <td>71</td> <td>225</td> <td>22</td> <td>694</td> </tr> <tr> <td>75</td> <td>60</td> <td>175</td> <td>70</td> <td>696</td> </tr> <tr> <td>76</td> <td>70</td> <td>180</td> <td>72</td> <td>810</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Totals</td> <td>628</td> <td>2,152</td> <td>309</td> <td>9,173</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	FY	Short Term (Part.)		Long Term		(Part.)	(m/a)	Degree (Part.)	Non-Degree (Part.)	69	89	296	38	1,376	70	120	446	51	1,669	71	100	382	75	2,150	72	70	267	35	1,180	73	48	181	23	838	74	71	225	22	694	75	60	175	70	696	76	70	180	72	810	Totals	628	2,152	309	9,173	<p>GOI Manpower Statistics Training Records and Reports.</p> <p>GOI Personnel Statistics.</p> <p>GOI and USC Passport and Visa Statistics.</p>	<p><b>Assumptions for achieving outputs:</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Participants will complete training and return to Indonesia and remain here.</li> <li>Will be assigned work commensurate with their training.</li> <li>Training received remains relevant to Indonesia's development needs.</li> </ol>																														
FY	Short Term (Part.)		Long Term																																																																																				
	(Part.)	(m/a)	Degree (Part.)	Non-Degree (Part.)																																																																																			
69	89	296	38	1,376																																																																																			
70	120	446	51	1,669																																																																																			
71	100	382	75	2,150																																																																																			
72	70	267	35	1,180																																																																																			
73	48	181	23	838																																																																																			
74	71	225	22	694																																																																																			
75	60	175	70	696																																																																																			
76	70	180	72	810																																																																																			
Totals	628	2,152	309	9,173																																																																																			
<p><b>Inputs:</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>USAID/USAMC allocations for devel. of priority courses for management/technical training.</li> <li>Selections (NSI annually presents to USAID approximately 700 candidates to be screened for overseas training).</li> <li>Processing (Screen candidates for professional qualifications and potential contribution to Indonesian development).</li> <li>Language (Screen proposed candidates for English proficiency &amp; provide English training).</li> <li>Orientation (Provide sufficient cultural and administrative orientation training will take place).</li> <li>Individual professional &amp; technical training.</li> <li>Placement (Provide placement training, as identified by NSI, to enable each participant to make the greatest possible contribution to development).</li> </ol>	<p><b>Implementation Target (Type and Quantity)</b></p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th rowspan="2">FY</th> <th colspan="2">Planned</th> <th colspan="2">Actual Oblig.</th> <th rowspan="2">Excess, n/a Dec. 74</th> </tr> <tr> <th>(\$000)</th> <th>(NO.)</th> <th>(\$000)</th> <th>(NO.)</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>69</td> <td>1,791</td> <td>453</td> <td>1,617</td> <td>367</td> <td>1,497</td> </tr> <tr> <td>70</td> <td>1,500</td> <td>415</td> <td>1,130</td> <td>321</td> <td>1,130</td> </tr> <tr> <td>71</td> <td>1,176</td> <td>400</td> <td>975</td> <td>246</td> <td>969</td> </tr> <tr> <td>72</td> <td>1,600</td> <td>166</td> <td>717</td> <td>136</td> <td>713</td> </tr> <tr> <td>73</td> <td>1,280</td> <td>250</td> <td>906</td> <td>166</td> <td>872</td> </tr> <tr> <td>74</td> <td>1,150</td> <td>299</td> <td>1,140</td> <td>157</td> <td>849</td> </tr> <tr> <td>75</td> <td>1,000</td> <td>159</td> <td>1,031</td> <td>159</td> <td>283 (ex. rate)</td> </tr> <tr> <td>76</td> <td>925</td> <td>173</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Total</td> <td>10,492</td> <td>2313</td> <td>7,518</td> <td>1530</td> <td>6,416</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>GOI Contribution (\$000)</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>FY</th> <th>69</th> <th>70</th> <th>71</th> <th>72</th> <th>73</th> <th>74</th> <th>75</th> <th>76</th> <th>Total</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td></td> <td>329</td> <td>383</td> <td>364</td> <td>480</td> <td>364</td> <td>460</td> <td>735</td> <td>770</td> <td>3,905</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	FY	Planned		Actual Oblig.		Excess, n/a Dec. 74	(\$000)	(NO.)	(\$000)	(NO.)	69	1,791	453	1,617	367	1,497	70	1,500	415	1,130	321	1,130	71	1,176	400	975	246	969	72	1,600	166	717	136	713	73	1,280	250	906	166	872	74	1,150	299	1,140	157	849	75	1,000	159	1,031	159	283 (ex. rate)	76	925	173				Total	10,492	2313	7,518	1530	6,416	FY	69	70	71	72	73	74	75	76	Total		329	383	364	480	364	460	735	770	3,905	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Annual Pro-Ag signed by GOI</li> <li>Training Division records - applications</li> <li>Training Division records - FIO/P statements and performance reports.</li> <li>Training Division records - English test results and performance reports.</li> <li>Performance records from Universities and other trainers.</li> <li>Monthly status reports from participants to AID/W.</li> <li>Periodic visit reports by GOI and AID officials to participants.</li> </ol>	<p><b>Assumptions for providing inputs:</b></p> <p>USAID funding and consultancy advisory assistance is available and timely.</p> <p>GOI funding provided for international travel costs, as well as other local costs requirements.</p> <p>An institutionalized "agency" or office will be established for the development of inter-governmental cooperation and coordination and a possible financial loss.</p>
FY	Planned		Actual Oblig.		Excess, n/a Dec. 74																																																																																		
	(\$000)	(NO.)	(\$000)	(NO.)																																																																																			
69	1,791	453	1,617	367	1,497																																																																																		
70	1,500	415	1,130	321	1,130																																																																																		
71	1,176	400	975	246	969																																																																																		
72	1,600	166	717	136	713																																																																																		
73	1,280	250	906	166	872																																																																																		
74	1,150	299	1,140	157	849																																																																																		
75	1,000	159	1,031	159	283 (ex. rate)																																																																																		
76	925	173																																																																																					
Total	10,492	2313	7,518	1530	6,416																																																																																		
FY	69	70	71	72	73	74	75	76	Total																																																																														
	329	383	364	480	364	460	735	770	3,905																																																																														