

PD-ADD-507-B1/4920236 (6)

A.I.D. Reference Center Room 1656 NS

RS/PS REPORT U-441

PAGE 1

PROJECT APPRAISAL REPORT (PAR)

1. PROJECT NO. 692-11-995-236	2. PAR FOR PERIOD: April 1 1971 TO March 1972	3. COUNTRY Philippines	4. PAR SERIAL NO. 72-10
5. PROJECT TITLE			

Provincial Development (School Reconstruction) 8p

6. PROJECT DURATION: Began FY <u>71</u> Ends FY <u>72</u>	7. DATE LATEST PROP N/A	8. DATE LATEST PIP N/A	9. DATE PRIOR PAR None
10. U.S. FUNDING	a. Cumulative Obligation Thru Prior FY: \$ 1.5 M	b. Current FY Estimated Budget: \$ 0	c. Estimated Budget to completion After Current FY: \$ 0

11. KEY ACTION AGENTS (Contractor, Participating Agency or Voluntary Agency)

a. NAME Officer in Charge of Construction (OICC) Southwest Pacific	b. CONTRACT, PASA OR VOL. AG. NO. Contract
--	--

I. NEW ACTIONS PROPOSED AND REQUESTED AS A RESULT OF THIS EVALUATION

A. ACTION (X)			B. LIST OF ACTIONS	C. PROPOSED ACTION COMPLETION DATE
USAID	AID 'W	HOST		
X			Prepare case study based upon the planning, programming and implementation of this project for utilization as a guide for this and other USAID Missions.	June 30, 1972

D. REPLANNING REQUIRES						E. DATE OF MISSION REVIEW	
REVISED OR NEW:	<input type="checkbox"/> PROP	<input type="checkbox"/> PIP	<input type="checkbox"/> PRO AG	<input type="checkbox"/> PIO/T	<input type="checkbox"/> PIO/C	<input type="checkbox"/> PIO/P	March 20, 1972
PROJECT MANAGER: TYPED NAME, SIGNED INITIALS AND DATE R.C. Kriegel				MISSION DIRECTOR: TYPED NAME, SIGNED INITIALS AND DATE T.C. Niblock			
Controller				Deputy Project Officer			

AID 1020-25 (10-70) PAGE 2 PAR	PROJECT NO. 492-11-995-236	PAR FOR PERIOD April, 1971 TO March, 1972	COUNTRY Philippines	PAR SERIAL NO. 72-50
-----------------------------------	-------------------------------	---	------------------------	-------------------------

II. PERFORMANCE OF KEY INPUTS AND ACTION AGENTS

A. INPUT OR ACTION AGENT CONTRACTOR, PARTICIPATING AGENCY OR VOLUNTARY AGENCY	B. PERFORMANCE AGAINST PLAN							C. IMPORTANCE FOR ACHIEVING PROJECT PURPOSE (X)					
	UNSATISFACTORY		SATISFACTORY			OUTSTANDING		LOW	MEDIUM		HIGH		
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	1	2	3	4	5	
1. Officer in Charge Construction (OICC/SWP) (Personnel)							X						X
2. (Other)							X						X
3.													

Comment on key factors determining rating: **The OICC under terms of a Memorandum of Understanding provides USAID with vital technical services including field inspection and surveillance, design review, material testing and the reproduction of construction documentation. A highly qualified and competent staff of field inspectors operating in the Provinces monitor, surveil and inspect all phases of the construction process. Their inspection provides the basis of USAID's acceptance of partially and completed school buildings and subsequent reimbursement. Inspection has been timely, conscientiously applied and very effective in maintaining the very high standards of construction set for this project. Reproduction of documentation has been timely and professional. However the mobil testing laboratory concept has proved ineffective and was eliminated. OICC reporting has been consistent, accurate and basic to the implementation of USAID's role in this project.**

4. PARTICIPANT TRAINING	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	1	2	3	4	5
-------------------------	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---

Comment on key factors determining rating:

None

5. COMMODITIES	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	1	2	3	4	5
----------------	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---

Comment on key factors determining rating:

607 excess property paint totalling approximately 4,000 gallons has been obtained for this project. However, much of it is metal paint of dark colors only suitable for the GI roofing. Very little has been suitable for wood or concrete surfaces.

6. COOPERATING COUNTRY	a. PERSONNEL	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	1	2	3	4	5
	b. OTHER				X								X

Comment on key factors determining rating:

A. National Disaster Control Center -- RP-US Bayanihan School Reconstruction Committee:

The NDCC as a GOP national coordinating center is charged with the responsibility of the project. Operating under its organizational structure, the RP-US Bayanihan School Reconstruction Committee was created and delegated the authority to plan, program and implement the Project. Committee membership includes DND, NDCC Exsecretariat, TCE/ AFP, BFW, BPS, DSW, NEC and USAID. NDCC directives and actions initially were often time consuming and bureaucratic. However, the Committee has consistently performed with a high degree of effectiveness, enthusiasm and dedication.

(see continuation sheet)

7. OTHER DONORS	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	1	2	3	4	5
-----------------	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---

(See Next Page for Comments on Other Donors)

PAR CONTINUATION SHEET

This sheet is to be used for any Narrative Sections for which sufficient space has not been provided on the form. Identify each narrative by its Part and Section Designation.

	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	1	2	3	4	5
a. Personnel						x						x
b. Other					x						x	

B. TCE/AFP -- The Chief of Engineers (TCE)/Armed Forces of the Philippines (AFP)

In compliance with a Presidential directive the AFP has been delegated the overall responsibility for managing the project. Thru its Centralized Construction Group (CCG) the TCE is directly involved at all levels in the planning, programming and implementation of the project. The CCG has closely and effectively monitored construction progress problems and financing and has maintained a close working relationship with Committee members.

	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	1	2	3	4	5
a. Personnel				x								x
b. Other				x							x	

C. TCE/AFP/PPA -- Provincial Project Administration (PPA)

The TCE/CCG field officer representative is the PPA who serves as the counterpart of the BPW/District Engineer (DE). The PPA has overall responsibility for the project in his assigned province. Operating under a unique situation and assisted by a small staff including 2 officers and 8 enlisted, he monitors, inspects and coordinates the construction activities of the BPW/DC. Equally important he organizes at the school site the necessary Bayanihan (self-help) effort of the PTA, Barrio Council and local populace. The PPA's vary greatly in effectiveness. Most are functioning under the AFP's civic action structure (Home Defense Center (HDC)) which is chronically short of transportation, qualified personnel and funds.

	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	1	2	3	4	5
a. Personnel			x							x		
b. Other			x							x		

D. OCR/AFP -- Office of Community Relations (OCR)

The OCR has been delegated by the NDCC the responsibility for coordinating Food for Work (FFW) activities involved in this project. Performance has been disappointing partially because the implementation of school reconstruction has lagged far behind schedule. Thus, FFW commodities were stock piled in some province as early as February, 1971 and construction did not commence until June-September. FFW commodities became damaged in storage and transit. Record keeping was often inadequate. However on the positive side FFW was used effectively and properly in three provinces. Catholic Relief Service (CRS) and the USAID/FFP office have performed outstandingly in providing FFW support. Recent agreements between CRS and OCR has included the shipping of FFW commodities directly from CRS to the job site, thus eliminating the handling and storage by OCR at a provincial center. The PPA will continue to monitor the use of FFW as a component of the Bayanihan concept in the project.

UNCLASSIFIED

492-11-995-236

PAR CONTINUATION SHEET

This sheet is to be used for any Narrative Sections for which sufficient space has not been provided on the form. Identify each narrative by its Part and Section Designation.

	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	1	2	3	4	5
a. Personnel						x						
b. Other				x								x

E. BPW (Hqs) -- Bureau of Public Works (BPW)

The Assistant Director, BPW has the responsibility for the overall coordination and management of BPW's role in the project. He is assisted by two regional engineers, each having a specified geographic area of responsibility. BPW/Hqs has recently increased its support of field operations with observable positive results, including greatly increased financial assistance. Previously it had confined its role to monitoring progress and problems and tended to respond too slowly to problems. It is imperative to the success of this project that BPW/Hqs continue to maintain its current direct involvement and high level of support of the BPW/DE and provincial program. In Jan. 1972 the BPW Director personally involved himself in this project with an immediate improvement in BPW project activities and progress.

	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	1	2	3	4	5
a. Personnel							x					x
b. Other						x						x

F. BPW/A/SDD -- Architectural and Structural Design Division (A/SDD)

The BPW (A/SDD) has been responsible for the basic design plans and specifications of the Bayanihan School. It has monitored the construction program and has provided immediate review improvement and modification as needed to meet field problems. Without exception it has provided effective and efficient support in all matters relating to its responsibilities. Key members made field visits upon short notice and under adverse conditions.

	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	1	2	3	4	5
a. Personnel				x								x
b. Other				x								x

G. BPW/DE -- District Engineer (DE)

The BPW/DE is the key man in the project - this is where the buck stops. The DE has the absolute responsibility for all BPW projects, including this project within his District (usually an entire province). Traditionally DE's have a considerable degree of flexibility and independence in operations. However, they usually operate within definite financial budgets and limitations. Political factors, both national and local exert great influence upon the DE particularly during election years. In the project one DE has consistently performed outstandingly and is well ahead of his construction schedule. Several have fallen far behind schedule often because of inadequate program management. In some cases the problems are beyond the control of the DE, especially the initial lack of GOP funding. Recently all DE's have begun making significant progress and appear to have overcome most of this operational problems.

UNCLASSIFIED

SECURITY CLASSIFICATION

UNCLASSIFIED

492-11-995-236

PAR CONTINUATION SHEET

This sheet is to be used for any Narrative Sections for which sufficient space has not been provided on the form. Identify each narrative by its Part and Section Designation.

	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	1	2	3	4	5
a. Personnel				x					x			
b. Other				x					x			

H. BPS -- Bureau of Public Schools, District Superintendent

The BPS/DS have played a relatively minor role in the project. Initially they coordinated the location and registration of destroyed school building, the selection of project school sites, and the initial approval of the building design, plans, and specifications. They have authorized the involvement of teachers especially industrial arts teachers in monitoring the storage and utilization of building materials at construction sites.

	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	1	2	3	4	5
a. Personnel					x							x
b. Other					x							x

I. BPS (PTA and Teachers)

The PTA's in coordination with Barrio Councils have been the focal point of the Bayanihan input of this project. At every school site the PTA is providing labor and funds (often as much as P4,000) for the sand, gravel and fill dirt, classroom partition desks, tables, blackboards and landscaping. The unskilled labor force is drawn largely from the PTA. PTA members are often closely monitoring the utilization and storage of construction materials and the utilization of FFW commodities.

	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	1	2	3	4	5
a. Personnel					x							x
b. Other					x							x

J. Barrio Council (BC)

The Barrio Councils share with the PTA's responsibility of handling the Bayanihan portion of this project. Generally the Barrio Councils have taken real interest in this project and have coordinated closely with the PTA's in fund raising and procurement of Bayanihan labor. In remote area, the PTA/BC's are vital to the successful completion of the school reconstruction and it is not uncommon for them to raise up to P4,000 for this purpose, and to maintain a consistence labor force of 10-20 unskilled workers; most often working Saturday, Sunday and Holidays.

	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	1	2	3	4	5
a. Personnel			x					x				
b. Other			x					x				

K. The Bureau of Public Highways (BPH)

The BPH although not a member of the Committee has provided in several provinces limited support to this project. This has been primarily in the loaning or rental of trucks to haul sand and gravel.

UNCLASSIFIED

PROJECT NO. 492-11-995-236	SUBMISSION <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> ORIGINAL <input type="checkbox"/> REVISION _____ (Number)	DATE	PAGE 21 of 4 PAGES
--------------------------------------	---	------	----------------------------------

	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	1	2	3	4	5
a. Personnel			X					X				
b. Other			X					X				

L. Department of Social Welfare (DSW)

The Department of Social Welfare initially was involved in the planning phase because it has provided for FFW transportation costs and primarily the relief aspects that existed in remote barrios.

	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	1	2	3	4	5
a. Personnel				X				X				
b. Other				X				X				

M. Provincial Government (Governor's Office)

The involvement of Provincial Government in this project has been an area of confusion and conflict within the Committee. In effect the EPOC has not solicited the direct involvement of Provincial Government. In one province, however, the excellent progress enjoyed by the DSW/DE is to a considerable extent due to the Governor's interest in the project. In one other province the Governor has loaned a significant sum of pesos to the DE to supplement the limited DSW funds. In other provinces the provincial government has paid only lip services to this project and in one province the Governor has been relatively hostile to the project.

	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	1	2	3	4	5
a. Personnel						X		X				
b. Other						X		X				

N. Peace Corps

The initial involvement of Peace Corps Volunteers included the design of a typhoon-resistant school structure which was ultimately adopted by the DSW as the basic Boyanihan school design. The Peace Corps School Partnership Program was being undertaken in several of this Project's provinces and initially there was the possibility that the PCV's would be an integral part of the project. However, these plans were not realized and PCV involvement has been very limited.

ID 1020-25(10-70) PAGE 3 PAR	PROJECT NO. 492-11-995-236	PAR FOR PERIOD: 4/71/ to 3/72	COUNTRY Philippines	PAR SERIAL NO. 72-80
---------------------------------	--------------------------------------	---	-------------------------------	--------------------------------

II. 7. Continued: Comment on key factors determining rating of Other Donors

U.S. Army Civic Action Group

The U.S. Army Civic Action Group operating under the aegis of JUSMAG Philippines has the responsibility for undertaking the total construction of a specified number of schools in Albay Province and for coordinating with the BPW/DE in establishing a joint prefabrication center. The US Army with its organic equipment and qualified officers and non-commissioned officers has set an excellent example of organizational and construction technology and dedication.

III. KEY OUTPUT INDICATORS AND TARGETS

A. QUANTITATIVE INDICATORS FOR MAJOR OUTPUTS		TARGETS (Percentage/Rate/Amount)					
		CUMULATIVE PRIOR FY	CURRENT FY 72		FY ____	FY ____	END OF PROJECT
			TO DATE	TO END			
School Unit Construction completions (100% with USAID inspection acceptance)	PLANNED		324	500			500
	ACTUAL PERFORMANCE		87				
	REPLANNED						
School unit construction starts	PLANNED	40	400	500			500
	ACTUAL PERFORMANCE	32	410				
	REPLANNED						
	PLANNED						
	ACTUAL PERFORMANCE						
	REPLANNED						
	PLANNED						
	ACTUAL PERFORMANCE						
	REPLANNED						
B. QUALITATIVE INDICATORS FOR MAJOR OUTPUTS		COMMENT:					
1.	Quality of Construction	All construction is inspected and approved by USAID/OICC field inspectors and must be in accordance with standards set by the BPW/USAID.					
2.	Cost Fixed Bill of Materials at P17,000 per school unit. (3 classrooms)	COMMENT: USAID will reimburse the GOP the total amount of P17,000 for each 100% completed, inspected and accepted school. The P17000 is the amount of an agreed upon bill of materials.					
3.		COMMENT:					

AID 1020-25 (10-70) PAGE 4 PAR	PROJECT NO. 492-11-995-236	PAR FOR PERIOD: 4/71 to 3/72	CCOUNTRY Philippines	PAR SERIAL NO. 72-80
-----------------------------------	-------------------------------	---------------------------------	-------------------------	-------------------------

IV. PROJECT PURPOSE

A. 1. Statement of purpose as currently envisaged.

2. Same as in PROP? YES NO

The purpose of this project is to construct a total of 500 typhoon-resistant three classroom school building by June 30, 1972 in the seven provinces most heavily devastated by a series of typhoon in 1970.

B. 1. Conditions which will exist when above purpose is achieved.	2. Evidence to date of progress toward these conditions.
<p>500 typhoon-resistant 3 classroom school buildings.</p> <p>60,000 children will have a cool, adequately lighted, and ventilated secured classroom.</p>	<p>As of March 3, 1972, 87 schools have been 100% completed and USAID accepted.</p> <p>As of 1972, 42 RP-US Bayanihan schools are in use accomodating approximately 9,600 children.</p>

V. PROGRAMMING GOAL

A. Statement of Programming Goal

The programming goal of this project was to provide emergency relief by constructing a significant number of schools for nearly 400,000 school children whose schools were severely damaged or totally destroyed in a series of typhoons during 1970.

B. Will the achievement of the project purpose make a significant contribution to the programming goal, given the magnitude of the national problem? Cite evidence.

On a programming basis the RP-US Bayanihan School reconstruction project covers approximately 15% of the total GOP school reconstruction effort. However, the GOP total school reconstruction program has faced problems of great magnitude primarily because of the large number of badly damaged and totally destroyed classrooms in some 27 different provinces throughout the Philippines. As of January 1, 1972 the GOP program was behind schedule and its actual construction program reportedly was less than 40% of the programmed construction. Thus the RP-US Bayanihan Project provides a significant input to the total GOP school reconstruction achievement.

PROJECT NO.

492-11-995-236

SUBMISSION

ORIGINAL

REVISION

(Number)

DATE

PAGE 4a of 4 PAGES

IV. C. Progress Towards Achievement of Goal

The following accomplishments has significantly contributed to the continuing progress towards the achievement of the project goal of constructing 500 typhoon-resistant classroom school unit by June 30, 1972 in the 7 provinces most devastated by a series of typhoons in 1970.

1. The organization and functioning of the NF-55 Bayanihan School Reconstruction Committee as the focal point for coordinating the multitude of national, international, and local organizations involved in the project.
2. The design and preparation of plans and specifications for a typhoon-resistant 3-classroom school which could be constructed in even remote areas utilizing locally obtainable material and manpower.
3. The conception of a management program whereby the GOF, utilizing its own resources builds the schools according to GOF/USAID plans and specifications and USAID reimburses the GOF a fixed amount in which covers the Bill of materials (P17,000) per completed 3-classroom unit.
4. The fielding of a competent USAID/OICC cadre of Field Inspectors who insure that GOF/USAID construction and quality control specifications are attained.
5. The implementation of the Bayanihan (self-help) concept is reflected in the fact that 447 of the 500 schools will be constructed with labor assisted by Food for Work commodities. As of March 10, 1972 over 135 school sites had already utilized FFW and 12,000 bags FFW commodities are in the process of being transported to 228 specific project sites. On almost all sites the PTA and Barrio Council have provided material support including approximately 50 cubic yards of concrete aggregate and earth fill. They have also completed the furnishing of interior components of the individual classrooms.