

AIRGRAM

DEPARTMENT OF STATE.

UNCLASSIFIED
CLASSIFICATION

3910299 (3)
Project 299
PD-AAD-174-D1

For each address check one ACTION INFO

DATE REC'D.

A.I.D.
Reference Center
Room 1656 NS

3

DISTRIBUTION

ACTION

N-10
INFO.
PRR
AAAC
ITN
ITAD
SHAB
ACONT
SPD

TO - AID/W TOAID A- 772

FROM - USAID/Rawalpindi

SUBJECT - Noncapital Project Paper (PROP)

REFERENCE - (A) Rawalpindi 8086
(B) State 100989, June 20, 1969
(C) State 290509, December 23, 1968
(D) TOAID A-337, August 28, 1967: Noncapital Project Paper for Economic Decision Making, Superior Services (Project No. 391-11-760-299)

DATE SENT
10-1-69

29p

Country: Pakistan Project No. 391-11-760-299

Submission Date: August 1, 1969 Revision No. 1

Project Title: Government Administrative Staff Improvement

U.S. Obligation Span: FY 1969 through FY 1973

Physical Implementation Span: FY 1969 through FY 1973

Gross life-of-project financial requirements:

U.S. dollars	\$ 644
U.S.-owned local currency	
Cooperating country cash contribution	5,000*
(Rs 23.8 mil. at \$1 = Rs. 4.76)	
Other donor	
Total	\$5,644

*See Section I.D, page 5.

State
has
try
BB

Attachment: Table 1 - Noncapital Project Funding

PAGE 1 OF 27

DRAFTED BY <i>M Jones/Rabranson</i>	OFFICE PAD	PHONE NO.	DATE	APPROVED BY: <i>[Signature]</i>
--	---------------	-----------	------	------------------------------------

AID AND OTHER CLEARANCES Edward, DP/P <i>[Signature]</i> TBlacka - AD/C	cc - DP/P (20 cy) UNCLASSIFIED	MKellogg - AD/H <i>[Signature]</i> ERicks - AD/DP(A) <i>[Signature]</i>
---	-----------------------------------	--

CLASSIFICATION

I. SUMMARY DESCRIPTION

A. Introduction

This PROP revision reflects several changes in the opportunities available to the Mission in meeting the objectives of the program; and changed political conditions including popular demand for changing the structure of this civil service.

The most significant change in opportunity is the willingness of the Public Service Commission to utilize consultants to improve the examining procedures for young candidates for elite civil services. Previously, the Commission was unwilling to accept this assistance. Another development which has substantially increased the possibility of success of this program is that the Establishment Division which is responsible for placement and training of civil servants has established a Training Wing and added to its staff a professionally trained Deputy Secretary and two trained Section Officers.

Section II. A. 4, Summary Notes, is added to more clearly summarize the problems of the Pakistan Civil Service, and describe the forces which are active toward change, including the efforts of the Government toward bureaucratic reform. This new section is necessary to provide a clear picture of the need to provide assistance to the Government of Pakistan in implementing those improvements in the Civil Service System which the Government recognizes as desirable.

B. The Problem

The highly complex and compartmentalized Pakistan bureaucracy is inadequate to meet the increasing demands being placed on the government. Organizing and managing large scale operations designed for social and economic development requires systematic and unified management and leadership. There must be an adequate number of capable and specially trained persons to staff the middle and upper level management positions. The current Pakistan bureaucracy hardly meets the necessary pre-requisites.

At least 2,500 top-level executive and approximately 200,000 middle management personnel are required to man the governmental apparatus. If the nation is to continue its progress, it is imperative that these elements operate as a team and be given sufficient power and authority to function within a viably constituted organizational system.

Pakistan had only a few trained and experienced senior officers at the time of partition. Only 82 members of the former Indian Civil Service and the

Indian Political Service came to Pakistan in 1947. Recruitment into the superior services, following the British tradition of the 19th century, favored the young person with a literary-humanities academic background. Only a small percentage of the yearly recruits came from the sciences, engineering, medicine, the behavioral-social sciences or other professional disciplines. Academic training, experience, social background, and prevailing societal attitudes obstructed the development of managerial skills and ability.

Since the 1950s, the government has laid stress upon the development of managerial personnel. A sizeable number of persons have received training abroad and at home. A complex of educational and training institutions has been established in Pakistan. However, there has never been established a systematic and integrated managerial development program which includes pre-service education, pre-service training, on-the-job training, and mid-career and senior executive development. There has been virtually no effort to determine what type of training is necessary to meet government needs and priorities and how to utilize most effectively the trained talent once it is available.

The development of talent has with few exceptions been institutionally based, either at the numerous specialized training institutions (which number over 100 in Pakistan) or the universities (in Pakistan or abroad). While the Third Five-Year Plan mentions the need for on-the-job or in-house training, little has been accomplished in this area, with East Pakistan Water and Power Development Authority the most notable exception.

In organizational terms, major changes are necessary in the recruitment, development and utilization of managerial talent in the critical area of governmental decision-making. This project proposes to improve this total process for the central and provincial superior services of Pakistan with special but not exclusive emphasis being given to the Civil Service of Pakistan, the premier service and the most powerful.

The Civil Service of Pakistan (CSP) is the pivotal service around which the entire administrative edifice of both central and provincial governments is organized, including the public corporations and the semi-autonomous bodies. Over 60 percent of the key positions in the government are held by CSP officers.

Career development of these strategically placed officers follows basically the old British colonial pattern of producing generalist administrators. This pattern is proving to be increasingly inadequate as Pakistani society becomes more complex and sophisticated, socially and economically. The GOP Establishment Division, however, is now willing to make a major shift in its personnel practices, with Mission assistance, in developing career patterns for the central superior services. The Establishment Division also agrees

that the generalist provincial civil services must become more specialized, be upgraded through careful training and placement and should be included in this project.

C. Project Goals and Targets

Soch
The primary goal is to strengthen the decision making capabilities of a select number of persons in the central and provincial superior services who staff the key administrative and planning positions in the government.

To achieve this goal the following targets are set out:

- 2. primarily*
1. Development of a career planning program for the Civil Service of Pakistan and other central and provincial superior services which are under the supervision (or general purview) of the Establishment Division. For these officers, the following career areas will be developed which will directly relate to the organizational structure of the Government: (a) rural (development) administration, (b) urban (metropolitan) administration, (c) municipal administration, (d) planning and financial administration, (e) public enterprise management, (f) personnel and human resource management, (g) systems analysis and data processing technology, (i) legal administration (j) program administration such as health, family planning, statistics, agriculture, and education.
 2. Establishment of an institutional arrangement (in terms of improved coordination and integration of effort) which will support the career development pattern for the areas noted in target 1. This arrangement will include strengthening, expanding and integrating of institutions now in existence in Pakistan towards these ends:
 - (a) Pre-service education: integrate and strengthen particularly the Department of Administrative Science, University of the Punjab, Lahore; the Institute of Business Administration, Karachi University, Karachi; and the Institute of Business Administration, Dacca University, Dacca;
 - (b) Pre-service training: strengthen particularly the Civil Service Academy and the Finance Services Academy at Lahore, as well as the Secretariat Training Institute at Karachi/Rawalpindi, the Gazetted Officers' Training Academy at Dacca and the Provincial Civil Service Academy at Peshawar;

- (c) In-house training: Establish pilot training cells in key agencies;
 - (d) Mid-career development: Integrate and strengthen the National Institute of Public Administration, Rural Development Academies, and the proposed Institutes of Local Government for the East and West wings;
 - (e) Executive development: relate training of the Pakistan Administrative Staff College (P.A.S.C.) to the staffing needs of top-level management. This involves the linking together in goal-oriented managerial development programs of a number of well-established institutions. Nearly all of these institutions were established either by A.I.D. or the Ford Foundation. These institutions conservatively represent a \$20 million investment, equally divided between external donors and the Government of Pakistan.
3. Introduce progressive personnel management practices into the Establishment Division and the Public Service Commission in such areas as manpower planning and evaluation, position classification, placement and job assignment, training needs, survey techniques, training program evaluation, and recruitment and promotional examinations and tests.

D. Self-help Actions

The assistance provided under this project will take place within a well established and large scale institutionally-based managerial development program which is almost entirely supported by the Pakistan Government. The efforts of this project will be centered upon strengthening selected elements of this program and upon redirecting it to better fit the needs of increasingly complex government responsibilities. In comparative cost terms, the Government of Pakistan is conservatively spending each year over one million dollars in rupee equivalent in its managerial development programs. Cost of this project is estimated at \$120,000 in rupee equivalent per year or approximately 10 percent of the Pakistan effort.

Maximum use will be made of institutions already developed in Pakistan through investment by A.I.D. and other donors. Participants ^{to be} abroad for training in career patterns will be selected from a pool of those considered honor graduates of the NIPA ^{a/} three-months advanced management course. In addition, they will receive pre-departure training of several weeks at one

a/ National Institutes of Public Administration at Dacca, Karachi and Lahore.

of the NIPAs on Pakistan's situation in their management specialities before being sent to the United States for advanced work.

E. Action Plan

The general approach of this project falls into three phases: (1) establish a scope of modernization activities, (2) develop training programs and improving systems, and (3) follow-up and evaluation.

Phase I, establish a scope of modernization activities, will be implemented by June 1970, upon the return of two high Pakistani officials, a member of the Public Service Commission and the Joint Secretary of Training of the Establishment Division, from a short study and observation tour in the United States. The basic design of this program will be completed in September 1969, based upon the recommendations and action plans of short term A.I.D. consultants, including Dr. Robert Abramson.^{a/}

Phase II, develop training programs and improving systems, is a continuous activity throughout the life of this project. By July 1970 all training abroad as well as the majority of the training of the NIPAs and the Administrative Staff College will be "job or career pattern related." As this project moves forward, training, (in Pakistan and abroad), placement, and promotion activities will be increasingly integrated together toward the objective of increased organizational performance of these programs vitally effecting Pakistan's progress.

Phase III, follow-up and evaluation, will be continuing feature of this project. However, the last phase, evaluation and follow-up, is scheduled to take place 12 to 18 months following the close out of A.I.D. assistance.

F. A.I.D. Staffing

The effective implementation of this project beyond its initial stages will require the attention of a full-time A.I.D. advisor. Agreement on this point is confirmed in a number of the referenced messages. Mission staffing in the field of Public Administration, is, however, currently in flux. The style and approach of further action in this project will depend very much upon (a) the Public Administration Division Chief who will be taking charge in mid-FY 1970; (b) the imperatives of Mission staffing in relation to program priorities; and (c) the continued interest of the GOP in carrying out this

^{a/} Abramson was until December 1967 Chief of Party of the University of Southern California contract which assisted in developing the National Institute of Public Administration under the Public Administration project (391-11-770-105), FY 1958 to FY 1967. His August 1969 visit to Pakistan was funded under Technical Support. His report, on which the shape of this project will depend heavily, is not yet available at this writing.

project as currently conceived, given the rapid political shifts in Pakistan today.

We have therefore provisionally included one proposed staff position under Public Administration Technical Support as Deputy Division Chief rather than provide a long-term advisor directly under this project. We have done this to provide a greater flexibility of response in the public administration field under uncertain conditions during this fiscal year. Upon confirmation of the project's continued viability, this advisory position can be shifted directly under Government Administrative Staff Improvement.

II. PROJECT SETTING

The description of the structure and composition of the bureaucracy as found in the original PROP is still appropriate. Since its preparation in FY 1967, a new set of political circumstance has emerged which adds a major complex to this project's purposes. The GOP now has under way a number of initiatives to change substantially its bureaucratic organization. A detailed description is provided here which reflects these new developments.

A. Structure and Composition of the Bureaucracy

1. Class Stratification (Structure)

X Pakistan's bureaucratic organization is one of the most complicated systems in existence. The structure has remained virtually unchanged for many years. The bureaucracy has defied the "winds of reform" more than any single institution in Pakistan. The classification, or better still stratification, of services into almost completely functional autonomous cadres (vertically organized) subject to no overall unifying central control is its most prominent characteristic. In addition, the services are classified horizontally as to rank (I, II, III, and IV) and geographically as to Central and Provincial.

The following remarks refer to the central organization of the public services. The same basic pattern is followed in the two provinces, and many of the same features are carried over into the public corporations and semi-autonomous bodies.

The vertical services are classified according to the type of work they perform, which falls into three categories: (1) generalist-administrative such as the Civil Service of Pakistan; (2) functional services, such as the audit and accounts, income tax, and customs and excise; and (3) specialist services, such as health and engineering. Presently there are 16 central superior services. The table below gives an estimate of the

present strengths of the cadres.

Central Superior Civil Services of Pakistan

<u>S. No.</u>	<u>Name of the Service</u>	<u>Estimated Strength as of 1969</u>
1.	Civil Service of Pakistan	530
2.	Pakistan Foreign Service	150
3.	Police Service of Pakistan (East Pakistan)	85
4.	Police Service of Pakistan (West Pakistan)	125
5.	Pakistan Audit & Accounts Service	170
6.	Pakistan Taxation Service	225
7.	Pakistan Military Accounts Service	85
8.	Pakistan Customs and Excise Service	100
9.	Pakistan Railway Accounts Service	70
10.	Telegraph Engineering Service	180
11.	Pakistan Postal Service	65
12.	P & T Traffic Service	30
13.	Pakistan Military Lands and Cantonment Services	80
14.	Geological Survey of Pakistan	120
15.	Central Engineering Service	50
16.	Central Information Service	50
Total:		2,110

The horizontal classification of services is based on the degree of importance and responsibilities of the work. Members of Class I and II Services are gazetted officers and, in practice, are invested with higher powers and responsibilities in regard to management. The Class III civil servants (mostly clerks) carry on routine work under the supervision of Class I and II officers. The Class IV employees carry on manual work and petty jobs.

Members of the Class I services receive their appointments from the Establishment Division under signature of the President. Class II officers are appointed by the secretary of a department or by some other specific higher authority. Class III civil servants are appointed by a Deputy Secretary or equivalent officer, or sometimes even lower authority; and Class IV employees appointed by even lower authority. No civil servant can be dismissed or removed from service, or reduced in rank, by an authority subordinate to that by which he is appointed. Thus one of the basic distinctions between the

four classes of employees is the differences between the appointing and dismissing authority. The conditions of service for each of the four services is different including pay structure, leave, pension, and medical aid. For example, the salary spread including fringe benefits between a class I employee and a class IV employee is from 40 to 50 times, class I and II from 5 to 10 times, and class I and III from 10 to 25 times.

Objection has been taken to this classification on the ground that the system is undemocratic, promotes class feeling, and breeds superiority and inferiority feelings. It gives rise to too much consciousness of class, title, rank, and service membership and too little consciousness of common service. It is closely based upon the social framework of Pakistan's traditional society.

2. Paramount Position of the CSP

The three most important Central superior services from the point of view of exercise of domestic bureaucratic power are the Civil Service of Pakistan, the Police Service of Pakistan, and the Pakistan Audit and Accounts Service. ~~At the~~ The Provincial Civil Services (Generalist) in each of the two wings follows as the next most important service.

Of all the services, the Civil Service of Pakistan (CSP) enjoys the greatest influence and prestige and, as the lineal descendent of the Indian Civil Service, is an elite corps of executives exercising many of the most important functions of the government.

The entire administrative structure of the government is organized around the CSP as the pivotal service. A large number of specified posts, over 700, are reserved for the CSP. The cadre strength, approximately 530, has never been sufficient to fill all of these posts. The pattern of assignment has remained fairly constant over the last ten years with only slight increase of officers in the public corporations and semi-autonomous bodies.

According to the Composition and Cadre Rules of 1974, two-thirds of the posts of Secretary, Joint Secretary, and Deputy Secretary are to be filled by CSP Officers. In January 1969, 15 of the 18 (83 percent) Secretaries in the Central Government were CSP officers. This included the Cabinet Secretary and Principal Secretary, both of whom were key presidential assistants. A total of 145 or nearly 29 percent of the cadre strength was assigned to the Central Government.

When posted in the provinces, CSP officers come under the operational control of the Provincial Governor. Specifically, this means that responsibility is vested with the Governor, who is appointed by the President. Immediate

control over CSP officers in the provinces is delegated to the Chief Secretary, who is always a CSP officer. In early 1969, 205 officers, or 41 percent of cadre strength, were assigned to the West Pakistan Provincial Government and 152 or 30% of the cadre strength to East Pakistan, 67 percent of the ~~xx~~ key secretariat posts were held by CSP officers in West Pakistan and 88 percent in the Eastern province.

On the lower levels, 80 percent of the divisions and 71 percent of the districts are headed by CSP officers. Across the structure of government, usually 89 percent of the Central Government secretaries are CSP officers, as are 66 percent of the provincial secretaries, 75 percent of the divisional commissioners, and 61 percent of the districts.

The CSP has also maintained its hold in the judiciary. Ten percent of the senior judicial posts are reserved for the CSP, of which 13 are now filled, or nearly 3 percent of cadre strength. In recent years there has been a steady increase in the number of CSP officers in the judicial branch of the services.

A significant development is the gradual increase of officers assigned to the government corporations and autonomous agencies. Nearly 10 percent, or 50, of its officers at the end of 1968 held key posts in these organizations. CSP officers held 17 of the 36 chairmanships of the boards, including the four largest corporations except Pakistan International Airlines. There is another dimension: In 1960 there was established an Economic Pool of approximately 125 officers who would serve in the ministries of finance, commerce, and industries. Sixty percent of the Economic Pool officers are to be drawn from the CSP and 40 percent from the other Central Superior Services.

The rotation of CSP officers from the center to the provinces and back is called the tenure system. The common practice is that the CSP officers serve the following terms at the Central Secretariat in offices of ascending rank: Section Officer (formerly called Under Secretary) for 3 years; Deputy Secretary for 4 years; Joint Secretary for 4 years; and Secretary for 5 years. After each period the officers are deputed once more to the provinces. In early 1969 a large number of senior CSP officers were assigned to the Central Government.

Role of CSP: The CSP fulfills a dual role. First, it forms the executive arm of the administration deployed in the field. Second, it assists the ministers both at the center and in the provinces in the formulation of policies. In action terms, some have termed CSP officers as agents of the President (Executive). The role is built around the administrative structure of the Secretariat where in organizational terms policy formulation is separated from program execution. The former being placed in the Central

Secretariat and the latter ^{and a} attached departments. This is an archaic organizational structure ~~and~~ practice that greatly obstructs program development and implementation. A number of reports by foreign consultants have recommended its abolishment.

^{and}
In social ~~and~~ political terms the CSP as an all-Pakistan service has functioned as a unifying force in the country. The members are recruited from all over the country and have acted as a bulwark against centrifugal forces. They tend to bring an all-Pakistan outlook to their work.

3. Central Superior Services: Administration

There are a number of central superior services such as audit and accounts, military accounts, and income tax. These are true central services since their work except on deputation is confined exclusively to the central government and their functional fields. A few posts of Section Officer, Deputy Secretary, Joint Secretary, and Secretary in the Central Secretariat are reserved for officers of these cadres.

a. Recruitment: Recruitment for each superior service is by means of competitive examination administered by the Central Public Service Commission. Prestige of government service continues to be remarkably high and the common situation is that over 100 candidates take the examination for each available position. The superior services have attracted and retained the "cream of the intellectual youth". A recent sociological study revealed that over 50 percent of the recruits in recent years have graduate degrees from European or American universities. Approximately 98 percent came from professional families whose ~~fathers~~ ^{fathers} were following Western-oriented careers.

b. Personnel Establishment: After recruitment each cadre is separately administered and posts are specifically reserved for its members. There is virtually no interchange of personnel between the services, although the rules of each service provide for a small number of deputation posts for members of sister services. Several Government reports have recommended that this situation be corrected and that the principal personnel activities be centralized in the Establishment Division.

The Establishment Division, nevertheless, is systematically developing into a central personnel agency. It is responsible for a variety of programs ranging from reservation of posts for the CSP and other superior services, to operating training institutions, and to issuing detailed regulations for class IV employees on recruitment, promotion, pay, and allowance. Considerable thought has been given to expanding its jurisdiction and authority to facilitate such personnel activities as lateral movement of personnel, establishing an Organization and Management (O&M) and training pool, development of career patterns, and position classification.

The Establishment Division serves as the secretariat for the National Administrative Training Council and has been instrumental in having that body perform a more meaningful role in the development of managerial talent for the public service.

4. Summary Note

Hugh Tinker, a former Indian Civil Servant, describes the officialdom in India and Pakistan as a "soaring pyramid, possessing a refinement of calculated gradation embodying both the Hindu caste system and the English class system."¹ The differences of status and rank between classes of civil servants are emphasized by a number of devices such as systems of recruitment which ensure varying social attitudes and background, the prescription of dress which government officers are required to wear, the number of peons and daftries attached to various posts, and wide variation of service regulations concerning the classes regarding the security of service, transfer, and promotion.

The prevailing concept of the bureaucracy is one large authoritarian family. This creates the familiar tensions and conflicts associated with the joint family system, and accompanies an office-ethos which permits fairly widespread misuse of official vehicles, telephones, etc. Pakistani bureaucracy is a reflection of the large society which it dominates. The bureaucracy in turn is dominated by a small elite of central superior officers, numbering no more than 2,000, of which slightly over 500 are CSPs.

B. Efforts of Bureaucratic Reform

Pakistan has been aware for some time that its bureaucratic structure required reform. In the early 1950s two Ford Foundation consultants, Rowland Eger and Bernard Gadioux, prepared penetrating reports for the government centering upon the critical weaknesses of the bureaucracy. The elite elements of the bureaucracy reacted strongly to the recommendations of these two consultants. In retrospect, it is obvious that the recommendations of these two consultants were doomed to failure since they did not take into account the existing cultural and institutional patterns. They are nevertheless still very much quoted and have been effective instrumentalities to press for reform.

Pakistan has appointed two high-level commissions to examine its bureaucratic structure. The first was under the chairmanship of the Chief Justice of the Supreme Court, Mohammed Munir.²

The report called attention to the wide cultural gap which exists between the Anglo-oriented bureaucratic elite and the tradition-directed masses and lower ranking employees. After the release of the report, this

theme aroused considerable public discussion but resulted in little noteworthy change.

Under the first Martial Law Government, a second commission in 1960 under the chairmanship of Supreme Court Chief Justice A. R. Cornelius was appointed. It completed its report two years later. This report was a frontal attack to alter the power structure of the superior services. The report was judged too radical and released to only a few officials. Nevertheless, the content of the report was public knowledge since it had been given extensive newspaper coverage. The government also deposited a few copies in the libraries of its two premier training institutions, the Civil Service Academy and the Administrative Staff College. It was therefore, never repressed as some persons write. Because, the report was never officially released, however, it did not become a government document against which personnel policy could be framed and initiated.

The position of the government became clear in early 1963 when President Ayub, in a speech to the CSP Association, indicated there would be no changes in the service structure. The President's public statement did not resolve the personnel problem. In time it exacerbated the situation.

During 1963-1965 serious discussion took place in the Establishment Division on broadening the CSP cadre and indirectly alleviating urgent personnel problems touched upon in the Cornelius report. These discussions led to the preparation of the PROP.

In mid-1968 the unrest among the services was steadily increasing. The lower ranks of employees, particularly classes III and IV, were becoming increasingly vocal, largely as a consequence of deteriorating economic conditions. The salary structure had not been changed for several years. As already noted, there exists a wide spread in the salary payments between the four classes of government employees.

A. Besides the problems of economic disparity between the classes of government employees, there was growing unrest in the superior services, both of the central as well as the provincial governments. The CSP had preempted the majority of the choice ex-cadre positions throughout the government. Other superior services felt that CSPs were occupying posts that fell outside their competency, such as the positions of members of finance of the public corporations. The Pakistan Audit and Accounts Service particularly felt that this was an infringement in their areas of government administration. Thus there developed within the bureaucracy a struggle among the superior services for the coveted positions.

In this bureaucratic struggle the conflict between the specialist (technical) officers and the generalist officers also came into the open. Nearly all the officers of the superior services are basically generalists. Many of these officers in the technical services (M.D.s for example), are class II officers. These technical officers have virtually no opportunity to staff high-level administrative positions, even in their own organizations. The generalist executive officers invariably hold the top-level posts.

Unlike the generalist executive officers who resisted administrative training at the National Institutes of Public Administrations, the technical officers readily accepted these training opportunities. Some Pakistani observers feel that the NIPAs more than any single factor were responsible for creating unrest in the technical services, since these officers now felt that after their training they were equipped with the administrative skills and knowledge to staff responsible administrative posts. Undoubtedly, the 3,000 persons trained at the three NIPAs had something to do with the inter al bureaucratic activities to bring about change in the service structure.

These reform efforts mentioned previously are now also being reenforced and accelerated by the public clamor for substantial changes in the public services in order to rid it of inefficiency, corruption and undemocratic stratification.

C. Establishment Division's Enlarged Role

With A.I.D. and Ford Foundation assistance, the Establishment Division's role in the government organizational structure was substantially enhanced by bringing under its control or influence a large complex of training institutions. These include the Pakistan Administrative Staff College in Lahore; the two Pakistan Academies for Rural Development (P.A.R.D.) in Peshawar and Comilla; the three National Institutes of Public Administration in Karachi, Lahore and Dacca; the Secretariat Training Institutes in Karachi and Rawalpindi; and the Civil Service Academy in Lahore.

The position of Joint Secretary of Training was established in 1962 in the Establishment Division. Also established at that time was the National Administrative Training Council, which consists of high-level government officials. The Council has undertaken constructive personnel measures by issuing personnel policies on training and assignment of personnel, controlling personnel assignments, etc.

The CSP cadre has realized increasingly that changes in the service structure are necessary. Much of the thrust for change has come from the younger officers, many of whom have been trained in the United States and

the United Kingdom. Some of the progressive older officers have also become principal spokesmen for change. Many of these persons are fully aware of the shortcomings of the bureaucracy and have vocally and quietly pressed for change. Major changes in personnel practices were being formulated in the Establishment Division and the Central Public Service Commission before the political disturbances in late 1968 and early 1969. Thus the working papers prepared at that time provide the basis for the initiative now under way. The Establishment Division is moving into a meaningful leadership role in personnel reform.

III. STRATEGY

The basic strategy as developed in the ^{original} PPOP remains unchanged. The overall approach to this project builds upon past support given the Pakistan Government by the Mission and other aid donors, particularly Ford Foundation. In institution building terms, the task is first to set career development patterns for the CSP cadre and for other central and provincial superior services; and then to integrate the present educational and training institutions in Pakistan in such a fashion as to support these patterns. This will require establishing position classification schemes; developing career patterns and training policies; relating promotion and placement to training; and instituting related progressive personnel management practices.

A. A Flexible and Pragmatic Approach

One of the first acts of the new Martial Law Administration was the initiation of a major investigation of the civil bureaucracy. Early in the Martial Law Administration a number of interim measures were enacted to strengthen the overall system. None of these, however, pertains to the basic weaknesses and resolves fundamental issues.

Under the present circumstances, a pragmatic and flexible approach must be followed in carrying out this project. Only when the Martial Law Authorities issue precise policy statements will it be possible to work within a framework of significant bureaucratic reforms. Such policies now appear to be in the making.

B. Bases of Reform

A number of bases of reform have already been established or are being developed. There are three types: functional, organizational, supporting.

1. Functional Bases: The central purpose of this project is the linking of the government's principal personnel activities into an integrated system which can best serve the needs of high level manpower development and

utilization. This includes the entire personnel management process; pre-service education and training; recruitment and selection; probationary training; career development and promotion; and placement and transfer.

2. Organizational Bases: Special attention will be given to strengthening the personnel functions of the Establishment Division and the Central Public Service Commission. Change bases will be established in the training and educational complex, particularly in the National Institutes of Public Administration at Lahore, Karachi and Dacca; the Department of Administrative Science at the University of the Punjab; and the Institutes of Business Administration at Karachi and Dacca. These organizational bases will be strengthened further by the emerging professional associations in business and public management such as the West Pakistan Management Association, the Society for the Advancement of Training, and the East Pakistan Public Administration Society.

3. Supporting Bases: This project calls for substantial self-help. Positive elements such as the public service and the professional management associations have been identified to support this activity. A.I.D. can perform a catalytic role in assisting the mobilization of organizational and public support by providing position papers and published materials, participating in seminars, conferences and training sessions, and encouraging individual professional development.

C. Leverage for ~~Change~~ Change

1. Participant Training: The training of certain key officials in Pakistan and abroad constitutes a major means in the implementation of this project. The judicious selection and training of participants under other A.I.D. projects is not unrelated here. For example, under the Government Financial Management project (391-11-780-303) officers of the other superior services, particularly the financial services, are now being trained abroad in specialized areas as well as general management. The return of these officers will increase the confidence of these services in their ability to staff key positions in the government and to contest upon professional grounds positions traditionally held by CSP generalist officers. Merit, as opposed to seniority and length of service, will likely become an increasingly important criterion for assignment.

The Government Administrative Staff Improvement project provides also for the training of selected generalist Provincial Civil Service officers whose work is the same but whose promotion slower than the CSP. They will be contesting more and more the CSP for high level positions and for service and promotional equality.

2. Capital Development Projects: Special attention will be given to relating financial inputs of the United States and other aid donors to the efforts of the Pakistan Government in strengthening its personnel management practices. Already the Mission has had some measure of success in linking together capital inputs with condition precedent of administrative (accounting) reform in the Pakistan Western Railways (PWR). The World Bank has further strengthened the Mission's position. The joint stand of A.I.D. and the I.B.R.D. on the basic requirement of accounting and financial reform as a condition precedent for further capital inputs has greatly strengthened the position of change-minded administrators in the PWR. The use of this tactic will also be explored for the present project as it moves forward.

3. Communications: It is important to establish channels of communications in the achievement of this project's goals. Support to the NIPAs in holding all-Pakistan conferences on timely public administration problems will be continued. In February 1969, NIPA Karachi held a conference on Development Administration and the Fourth Five-Year Plan. This conference passed a number of resolutions on personnel reforms which are now being considered by the government.

The Mission will continue assisting the Planning Commission in the preparation of the public administration section of the next plan. This will provide a policy basis for initiating major personnel reform.

The dissemination of concepts and programs for personnel improvement will be continued. Support to the research and publication programs of the three NIPAs will be utilized, as in the past.

Short-term consultants will be used to introduce new programs and to participate in systems development and overall progress evaluation.

The central as well as the two provincial governments have appointed several high level committees to investigate the subject of personnel reform. Key officials associated with these committees have requested Mission advice and materials. The Mission will continue its advisory contact with these committees.

4. The Impact of the Fulton Report: Pakistan is very much conscious of what takes place in the United Kingdom and India in the way of administrative reform. The Fulton Committee Report⁴, which set out a number of radical changes in the British bureaucracy, is now being studied with great interest in Pakistan. Few reports have ever made such a devastating attack on the generalist tradition. In effect it represents a triumph of modern American principles of public management.

The impact of the Fulton Report should not be overlooked. It has been favorably summarized in the press and many Pakistan observers note that the Cornelius Report reads the same. Briefly the Fulton Report sums up the British bureaucracy as follows:

- a. It is still too much based on the classical 19th century British theory that the "Oxbridge" gentlemen-amateur-generalist is omniscient in affairs of government. This is evident in the Administrative Class (comparable to the CSP in Pakistan) which holds the dominant position in the service.
- b. The present position of classes (there are over 1,400 each with its own separate pay and career structure) seriously impedes its work.
- c. Scientists, engineers and members of other specialist classes are frequently given neither the full responsibility and opportunity nor the corresponding authority they desire.
- d. Too few civil servants are skilled managers.
- e. There is not enough contact between the civil service and the community which it should serve. Indeed, there are civil servants who would maintain, if pressed, that the community exists to serve the bureaucracy. (This view is not unknown in the CSP, with roots in both the British class and Indian caste traditions.)
- f. Personnel management and career planning are inadequate.

The Fulton Report, probably more than any other publication, is now bringing some top Pakistani leaders' to the view that major changes in the bureaucracy are necessary. At this crucial time in Pakistan's history a significant number of strategically placed Pakistani officials are receptive to concepts and principles of American personnel management.

5. Introducing and Controlling Technologies: Pakistan is already experiencing the impact of computers and conventional types of data processing technologies. Planned and systematic control of the introduction of technological change in this area is considered to be one of the principal leverages by which to effect significant change in the bureaucratic organization and its personnel practices.

Since much of the technological know-how and systems as well as equipment will come from the United States, the Mission is in a strong position to influence the shape of change in this area. At this time the Establishment Division is anxious to develop several computer applications including an executive inventory, a census of government employees, and preparation of a gradation list of superior service officers.

D. Cross Relationships

CS
Built into this project is the development of effective working relationships with the other large donors to Pakistan, particularly the World Bank, Ford Foundation and the United Kingdom (Colombo Plan). The Ford Foundation is supplementing the training of a carefully selected number of superior service officers for mid-career programs in development economics and administration at Harvard University and Williams College. The United Kingdom is training each year from 12 to 15 young superior service officers with five to eight years of experience in basic public management.

To carryout this project, the Mission and the Establishment Division are now considering a project model developed by USATD/Turkey in the field of budget reform. In the Budget Administration Improvement project (No. 277-11-750-448), A.I.D. is assisting a cooperative venture in which the Government of the State of New York and the Turkish Government have identified within their respective budget organizations identical counterparts such as budget examiners. In a series of exchange assignments, these individuals study and observe budgetary practices in Turkey and New York. The usual procedure is that a New York budget officer spends three months in Turkey with his counterpart and his counterpart later spends three months in New York. These rotational assignments continue through the life of the project. This has proven to be an attractive model in the Mission's discussions to date with officials of the Public Service Commission and the Establishment Division. A number of possible counterpart positions have already been identified.

IV. PLANNED GOALS, TARGETS, RESULTS AND OUTPUTS

A. Goals and Targets

Goal
P4
Reform of the entire bureaucratic structure is highly desirable but is clearly beyond the capacity of the modest project here proposed. Within the COP reform efforts now underway, the general goal of this project is to strengthen the technical management skills and decisionmaking capabilities of a select number of persons in the central and provincial superior services who staff or will eventually staff key positions in Pakistan's development programs and administrative organization. Administrative systems and programs will be developed which provide for selective training and judicious use of planning and managerial manpower.

UNCLASSIFIED

To achieve this general goal (a) specialized training abroad will be arranged for a selected number of officers in career specialities; and (b) improved personnel practices will be introduced in the Establishment Division, the Public Service Commission (an attached department of the Establishment Division) and related personnel agencies.

1. Goal and Target Requirements: To achieve the above goal major changes in the personnel management practices and operations are required. The nature of the problem permits selective strengthening of important aspects of the personnel management system which will contribute to substantial improvement in organizational performance. The present system is, in short, amenable to improvement.

Considerable expatriate and external assistance also will be required. This is discussed under Cross Relationships (Section III. D) and Course of Action (Section V).

B. Career Planning and Placement

The principal approach in bringing about improvement in personnel management is the introduction of expanded career planning and systematic placement of specialist administrators. The generalist services are under increasing attack because they are not adequately prepared to staff competently the high level and strategic positions in the government's planning and administrative organization.

For the Civil Service of Pakistan the following patterns beyond the two already developed for general administration and the judiciary have been identified:

1. Rural development administration
2. Urban (metropolitan) administration
3. Municipal management
4. Planning and financial administration
5. Public enterprise management
6. Personnel and human resource management
7. Data processing technology and systems
8. Legal administration
9. Program administration (such as health, family planning, statistics, agriculture, and education).

To support the career planning effort, a master development scheme will be prepared projecting the needs for high level managerial talent during the Fourth Five Year Plan period (FY 1971 - 75). In addition this project calls for strengthening or introducing modern personnel management practices.

The manpower training and placement targets projected in the original PDP remain essentially in effect. The five year manpower development plan now in preparation will specify the managerial needs in the special areas.

This project will train in a five year period in Pakistan and abroad 400 officers in career specialities. Over half of these officers will have been trained abroad in the United States, the United Kingdom and Canada. Of the 100 officers sent to the United States, approximately 40-50 will have been trained under A.I.D. sponsorship and the remaining under the auspices of Ford Foundation, Asia Foundation, Eisenhower Fellowships and East-West Fellowships.

C. Improved Personnel Practices

The introduction of career planning and systematic placement will require a number of major personnel innovations: such as an executive inventory system; a position classification program; improvement in the evaluation of individual performance; and new tests for recruitment and promotion. Progressive steps have been taken in these areas over the last two years (See Course of Action, Section V).

D. Institutional Linkages for Managerial Development

This project will strengthen institutional arrangements to support the career patterns developed by the Establishment Division and other personnel agencies.

1. Action Areas

These arrangements includes the expanding, integrating and coordinating of institutions now in operation in Pakistan in these action areas:

a. Pre-service education:

integrate and utilize the Department of Administrative

Science, University of the Punjab, Lahore; Institute of Business Administration, University of Karachi; and Institute of Business Administration, University of Dacca.

- b. Pre-service training: strengthen the Civil Service Academy and the Finance Service Academy in Lahore; the Secretariat Training Institute in Karachi and Rawalpindi; the Provincial Civil Service Academy in Peshawar; and the Caseload Officers Training Academy in Dacca.
- c. In-house training: establish pilot training cells in key agencies.
- d. Mid-career development: integrate and strengthen the National Institutes of Public Administration, Rural Development Academies and the proposed Institutes of Local Government for East and West Pakistan.
- e. Executive development: relate training of the Administrative Staff College to the staffing needs of top level managers.

2. Various Approaches

Several means may be used to achieve these ends:

- a. Stimulate the National Administrative Training Council to provide policy guidance and to follow up on the implementation of established policies.
- b. Hold regular meetings of the directors and staffs of the principal management development training and educational institutions.
- c. Develop specialized programs in training and educational institutions tailored to the needs and priorities of government agencies.
- d. Establish pilot training and career development cells in the large agencies under professional trainers.
- e. Establish non-professional societies similar to the already-established Pakistan Society for the Advancement of Training.

V. COURSE OF ACTION

A. The need for a Flexible Approach

The central theme of this project is that Pakistan's civil bureaucracy is becoming increasingly inadequate to fulfill its appropriate role in accelerating the nation's social and economic progress. For the first time in Pakistan's history, strong and well-organized political forces are successfully contesting the entrenched bureaucratic interests. These groups are demanding progressive and wholesale changes (both political and administrative) with the purpose of overhauling a bureaucracy that has become alarmingly inefficient; ridden with graft and corruption; and arrogant and officious in relations with the public.

The demands of these political forces (including opposition political parties, student and labor groups and subordinate government services) are aimed at changing drastically the present colonial-type civil administration from its traditional pattern of control and dominance by a few elite elements to that of a broadly based democratic structure responsive to national needs. One result of these forces has been the toppling of the 10 year-old regime of President Ayub in early 1969 and a period of popular upheaval and breakdown of law and order that eventuated in martial law being declared on March 25, 1969.

In response to these various political demands and forces, the Martial Law Administration (MLA) has appointed several high level groups to study the civil bureaucracy and to make recommendations for its improvement. Within the next few months the MLA will probably announce a policy and major program for the renovation of the civil bureaucracy. This would be consistent with the major policy changes already announced in education, labor and low-income housing.

The MLA recognizes that significant modification in the civil bureaucracy is required both to support the nation's social and economic progress as well as to prevent the collapse of law and order as occurred during late 1968 and early 1969. Until the MLA indicates clearly the nature and scope of the bureaucratic reform envisaged, Mission inputs must be modest and its operational role sufficiently flexible to take advantage of targets of opportunity. (See Section I.F.)

The GOP has requested Mission assistance to expand the career development patterns for its central and provincial superior services. This innovation will require substantial modification in the present personnel practices: (1) changes in types of persons recruited for the superior services;

(2) revision and expansion of programs for the recruitment and training of public servants (pre-service education, probationary, technical, and mid-career training and executive development); (3) the provision that promotions be based increasingly upon merit through the examining process (promotional examinations) and not seniority; and (4) judicious placement and transfer of superior service officers.

The course of action that follows is largely confined to this scope of activities, with flexibility built in to respond to a broader frame of reference if the situation so requires.

B. Action Phases

The course of action of this ~~project~~ project falls into three phases:

- Phase 1: establish a scope of ^{work for} modernization activities;
- Phase 2: develop training programs and improve personnel systems; and
- Phase 3: follow-up and evaluation.

Phase 1

Establish a Scope of Work for Modernization Activities

This phase builds upon the recommendations of two consultants financed under Technical Support in early FY 1970 ^{c/}. A number of background studies will have been completed against which to develop a detailed action plan. The manpower survey while the Establishment Division has now under way will have been completed and several career patterns will be developed beyond those already established for generalist and judicial careers.

In this phase Mission assistance will consist largely of three short-term consultants.

- one consultant in career planning and training for two months;
- one consultant in civil service reform for two weeks; and
- one consultant in managerial manpower planning for 3 months.

All three short-term consultants will work with the Establishment Division, the Public Service Commission and the Planning Commission.

^{c/} Dr. Robert Abramson (see note b/) and Dr. Glenn Stahl, Ford Foundation.

Two key Pakistani officials will be sent to the United States for short-term observation tours to study the organization and implementation of modern career planning and personnel management systems and practices as these relate to the needs of Pakistan. They will investigate the possibility of making arrangements similar to those developed between Turkey and the State of New York for financial management (See Section III D).

The scope of activities should be fully developed by June 1970, based largely upon the recommendations and findings of the three short term consultants and the two Pakistani officials selected for short term study and observation in the United States.

Phase 2

Develop Training Programs and Improve Systems

This is a continuous activity throughout the life of this project. By July 1970 training will be directly related to meeting the managerial/planning needs. Targets for improvement in the personnel management system will have been identified and action programs initiated.

A major objective of this project is to bring together the disparate training programs and activities of the Establishment Division into a well-designed manpower development effort, ranging from the training of high level executives to first line supervisors. The following general categories of participant training ~~work~~ are planned to cover the need for trained executives, middle managers, supervisors, and professional trainers.

a. Executive Development. One or two outstanding senior officers of Joint Secretary or Secretary rank would spend three months at the Federal Executive Institute, Charlottesville, Virginia, or an equivalent institution. It is proposed that this element be deferred until FY 1971, following review of the reports of the two Pakistani officials sent on short term study and observation tours in FY 1970.

b. Mid-Career Development. Four officers each FY from the central and provincial supervisory services will be selected by merit and proven administrative experience for Masters degree training in development administration, business administration and/or development economics. These officers will be of Deputy Secretary or equivalent rank and have from 10 to 12 years of government service.

In the past few years under other projects² the Mission has sent three groups of superior service officers to this type of training. These officers have been enrolled at Harvard University, Williams College and the University of Southern California.

*Public Administration (Project No. 391-11-770-105) & Government Management (Project No. 391-11-770-140)

UNCLASSIFIED

c. Management Development. A select group of central and provincial superior service officers with 5 to 7 years of service will be sent to the United States for advanced training in various management specialties. The first group of six officers was selected in July 1969 and will depart in September 1969. The following program has been developed for this group in FY 1970. It will be repeated four times during the life of the project:

(1) Pre-departure training for eight weeks at the National Institute of Public Administration at Karachi, July and August 1969. 2

(2) On-the-job training of three to four months in a technical management special from October 1969 to January 1970. 4

(3) University training of one semester in the United States beginning in January 1970 in the technical management specialty of each officer.

(4) A three-week human relations training institute at a leading university.

(5) A concluding eight-week seminar on development administration $\frac{1}{2}$ at a leading university or in Washington, D.C.

(6) Placement of officers back on the job and preliminary evaluation of program, July to September 1970.

The Joint Secretary of Training in the Establishment Division will visit the United States in connection with this training program in February-March 1970.

d. Training of Instructional Staff/Personnel Practices. A selected number of officers from the training institutions, the Public Service Commission and personnel agencies will be trained abroad in training and personnel practices. Two persons a year are tentatively scheduled beginning in FY 1970.

e. American University in Beirut: Supervisory, Middle Management, and Training Staff. In FY 1969 the AID's assisted training facilities in public administration offered through the American University in Beirut were extensively studied and a substantially modified program was begun to meet the training needs for supervisory, middle management and training staff. For the next four years 20 - 25 persons each year will be trained at ADB under the following programs:

- (1) Career Development. 15 officers each FY drawn largely from the Central Secretariat Service (Select on Officers) for a 9 month non-degree program.
- (2) Development administration and business administration. Four junior staff members in FY 1970 drawn from the training institutions under the control or purview of the Establishment Division for a two-year Master's degree program.
- (3) Scholar in residence. Two senior officers each FY drawn from one of the training institutions under the control or purview of the Establishment Division will spend four months at AUB under special study and research programs.

In July 1968 the Mission Chief of Public Administration visited AUB to arrange the details of this program. The Deputy Secretary for Training of the Establishment Division is scheduled for a 1 week visit on Invitational Travel to AUB in early FY 1970 to evaluate further this new program.

Phase 3

Follow-up and Evaluation

Throughout the life of this project evaluation will be a continuing feature. Special studies and reports will be scheduled to provide bench marks against which to measure project progress. A joint evaluation by the Pakistan Government and A.I.D. is planned 12 to 18 months following the end of project activities.

REFERENCES:

1. Tinker, Hugh. India and Pakistan: A Political Analysis. New York: Frederick A. Praeger, 1962.
2. Report of the Pakistan Pay Commission, 2 volumes. Chief Justice of the Supreme Court Sircagel Munir, Chairman. Karachi: Governor-General's Press, 1949.
3. Report of the Pay and Service Commission, Chief Justice of the Supreme Court A.S. Cornelius, Chairman. Karachi: Government of Pakistan Press, 1962.
4. The Civil Service, Volume I, Report of the Committee, 1968-69, Lord Fulton, Chairman. London: Her Majesty's Stationery Office, 1968.
5. Banbanti, S.M.H. The Civil Service of Pakistan. (Duke University Commonwealth Studies Reprint Series) Durham, North Carolina: Duke University Press, 1959.

NONCAPITAL PROJECT FUNDING (OBLIGATIONS IN \$000)

ATTACHMENT
TABLE 1

PROP DATE: AUGUST 1, 1969
EXIGEN Revision No.1
Project No.391-11-760-299

COUNTRY: PAKISTAN Project Title: Government Administrative Staff Improvement

Fiscal Years	Ap	L/G	Total	1/ Personal Services			Participants		Commodities		Other Costs	
				AID	PASA	CONT	U.S. (Agen- cies)	(CONT)	Direct (& U.S. Agen- cies)	(CONT)	Direct (& U.S. Agen- cies)	(CONT)
Prior through Actual FY 1969			30									30
Operational FY 1970			141			7						134
Budget FY 1971			159			7						152
B + 1 FY 1972			157			7						150
B + 2 FY 1973			157			7						150
All Subsequent												
Total Life			644			28						616

1/ Memoranda (nonadd) column.

DECLASSIFIED

TOAID A 772

USAID/Kawalpindi

DECLASSIFIED