6900083-(2)
PD-AAC-869-B1

DEPARTMENT OF STATE

AGENCY FOR INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT

WASHINGTON 25, D. C.

6900830042-01

rec'd 5/31/79 4 p.

OFFICE OF
HE ADMINISTRATOR

PROJECT AUTHORIZATION AND REQUEST FOR ALLOTMENT OF FUNDS

PART II

COUNTRIES : Botswana, Lesotho, Swaziland and Zambia

PROJECT : Southern Africa Academic Skills Training

PROJECT NO.: 690-0083

Pursuant to Part II, Chapter 4, Section 531 of the Foreign Assistance Act of 1961, as amended, I hereby authorize for FY 1977 the allotment and obligation of not to exceed Five Hundred Ninety-Eight Thousand United States Dollars ($598,000) to help in financing certain foreign exchange and local currency costs of goods and services required for the Southern Africa Academic Skills Training Project as described in the following paragraph.

The Project consists of financing graduate, undergraduate and specialized non-degree training in the U.S. and Africa for nationals of Botswana, Lesotho, Swaziland, and Zambia to assist these countries in meeting their development related managerial and technically skilled manpower needs. Training under this project will begin in FY 1977 for nationals of Zambia and Botswana and in FY 1978 for nationals of Lesotho and Swaziland.

I approve the total level of A.I.D. appropriated grant funding planned for this project of not to exceed Fourteen Million Five Hundred Thousand United States Dollars ($14,500,000) during the period FY 1977 through FY 1982, including the FY 1977 funding authorized above and increments during FY 1978 through FY 1982 of up to $13,902,000, subject to the availability of funds and in accordance with A.I.D. allotment procedures.

I hereby authorize the initiation of negotiation and execution of the appropriate obligating documents by the officer to whom such authority has been delegated in accordance with A.I.D. regulations and Delegations of Authority, subject to the following essential condition; together with such other terms and conditions as A.I.D. may deem appropriate:

Source and Origin of Goods and Services

Goods and services financed by A.I.D. under the Project shall have their source and origin in the United States, Botswana, Lesotho, Swaziland, Zambia, or in any African country in which training is to be undertaken, provided that such African country is included in A.I.D. Geographic Code 941. Ocean shipping financed under the Project shall be procured in any eligible source country except Botswana, Lesotho, Swaziland or Zambia.

AUG 18 1977

Robert H. Nooter
Deputy Administrator

Clearances:
As shown on Action Memorandum

GC/AFR:TJBork:jlo:8/8/77

AUG 12 8 12 AM '77

AUG 5

EXECUTIVE SECRETARIAT

ACTION MEMORANDUM FOR THE ADMINISTRATOR

THRU : ES

THRU : AA/PPC, Alexander Shakow

FROM : AA/AFR, Goler T. Butcher

SUBJECT: Training Project for Southern Africa (SSA Countries)

PROBLEM: This is to request approval for a Southern Africa Academic and Skills Training project (SAAST). This new project was part of a previously approved FY 76 Africa-wide manpower project. It reflects a basic change from the FY 76 project only in use of Security Supporting Assistance funds rather than Development Assistance funds. A Congressional Notification was submitted for this project on 7/11/77 and the fifteenth day ended on 7/25/77. No objections were received from Congress.

The pervasive and limiting constraint common to all countries in Southern Africa is in the area of skilled manpower. The extraordinary presence of expatriates or non-African personnel distinguishes this area from other regions in Africa. It slows the rate and breadth of development; it is a major drain on foreign exchange; and it challenges the political integrity of the new nations of the region. In this regard this project fully meets the purposes of Section 531 of the FAA.

In response to this overall critical need for African managerial and technically skilled manpower, an Africa-wide manpower training project, African Manpower Development project (AMDP), was begun in FY 76. However, two southern African countries participating in that project, Botswana and Zambia, were designated "Security Supporting Assistance" countries in FY 77 and two others, Swaziland and Lesotho, are so designated for FY 78. Because Section 115 of the FAA prohibits the use of Development Assistance funds in countries where Security Supporting Assistance is provided, these countries can no longer participate in the AMDP. To continue assistance for manpower training to these countries as approved under the AMDP, it is necessary to submit a new project using SSA funds but retaining the basic purpose and details of the AMDP.

This new project, Southern Africa Academic and Skills Training (SAAST), will include Zambia and Botswana beginning this FY and

Lesotho and Swaziland beginning FY 78. As in the AMDP, academic training will be provided in both U.S. and African institutions. Additionally, specialized non-degree study to meet specific development requirements will also be provided. It is expected that the project will provide academic training for approximately 360 students and short-term specialized training for approximately 620 persons over a six year period at a cost of approximately $14,500,000.

RECOMMENDATION: That you approve the attached Project Paper for the Southern Africa Academic and Skills Training Project - No. 690-0083.

APPROVED: _____

DISAPPROVED: _____

DATE: 8/15/77

Drafter: L. Hobson, AFR/DR/SDP:7/29/77:dmb

Clearances: J.Withers, AFR/DR(draft)
O.Cylke, AFR/ESA(draft)
C.Ward, AFR/DP(draft)
T.Bork, AFR/GC
M.Ball, GC
E.Hogan, PPC/DPRE
W.H.North, DAA/AFR
T.H.E.Quimby, AFR/SA(draft)

AGENCY FOR INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT

PROJECT PAPER FACESHEET

1. TRANSACTION CODE: [ ] A = ADD, C = CHANGE, D = DELETE

PP

2. DOCUMENT CODE: 3

3. COUNTRY/ENTITY: So. Africa Regional

4. DOCUMENT REVISION NUMBER: [ ]

5. PROJECT NUMBER (7 digits): 690-0083

6. BUREAU/OFFICE: A. SYMBOL: AFR; B. CODE: [ ]

7. PROJECT TITLE (Maximum 40 characters): So. Afr. Academic & Skills Trng.

8. ESTIMATED FY OF PROJECT COMPLETION: 83

9. ESTIMATED DATE OF OBLIGATION: A. INITIAL FY 77; B. QUARTER 3 (Enter 1, 2, 3, or 4); C. FINAL FY 82

10. ESTIMATED COSTS ($000 OR EQUIVALENT $1 –)

A. FUNDING SOURCE	FIRST FY 77 B. FX	C. L/C	D. TOTAL	LIFE OF PROJECT E. FX	F. L/C	G. TOTAL
AID APPROPRIATED TOTAL						
(GRANT)	(564)	(34)	(598)	(13 065)	(1 435)	(14,500)
(LOAN)	( )	( )	( )	( )	( )	( )
OTHER U.S. 1.						
OTHER U.S. 2.						
HOST COUNTRY		32	32	–	1220	1220
OTHER DONOR(S)						
TOTALS	564	66	630	13 065	2655	15,720

11. PROPOSED BUDGET APPROPRIATED FUNDS ($000)

A. APPROPRIATION	B. PRIMARY PURPOSE CODE	PRIMARY TECH. CODE C. GRANT	D. LOAN	E. 1ST FY 77 F. GRANT	G. LOAN	H. 2ND FY 78 I. GRANT	J. LOAN	K. 3RD FY 79 L. GRANT	M. LOAN
(1) SSA	600	600		598		2524		3221	
(2)									
(3)									
(4)									
TOTALS				598		2524		3221	

A. APPROPRIATION	N. 4TH FY 80 O. GRANT	P. LOAN	Q. 5TH FY 81 R. GRANT	S. LOAN	LIFE OF PROJECT T. GRANT	U. LOAN
(1)	3171		3021		14,500	
(2)						
(3)						
(4)						
TOTALS	3171		3021		14,500	

12. IN-DEPTH EVALUATION SCHEDULED: MM YY

13. DATA CHANGE INDICATOR. WERE CHANGES MADE IN THE PID FACESHEET DATA, BLOCKS 12, 13, 14, OR 15 OR IN PRP FACESHEET DATA, BLOCK 12? IF YES, ATTACH CHANGED PID FACESHEET. [1] 1 = NO, 2 = YES

14. ORIGINATING OFFICE CLEARANCE

SIGNATURE

TITLE: Mr. Owen Cylke
Office Director, AFR/ESA

DATE SIGNED: MM DD YY

15. DATE DOCUMENT RECEIVED IN AID/W, OR FOR AID/W DOCUMENTS, DATE OF DISTRIBUTION: MM DD YY

AID 1330-4 (3-76)

Part 1. Project Summary and Recommendation:

A. Description of Project:

This project will provide academic and skills training in the U.S. and Africa. Training will be in priority areas of development, consistent with the emphasis in the A.I.D. legislation. Geographic focus for selection of trainees will be those countries in the southern Africa region receiving Security Supporting Assistance (SSA) with specific focus in FY 77 on Zambia and Botswana and extending to Lesotho and Swaziland in FY 78. Selection of trainees will be made jointly by A.I.D. (Embassy) and the host country through joint committees or other mechanisms. Selection for academic placement in the U.S. will be solely job related, with competitive academic selection continuing under the same procedures as the Manpower Development Project under AFR/RA. A contractor will be selected for the placement and management of students selected for training in African institutions. Funds under this project will cover international travel, tuition, per-diem, and other costs directly related to training. The host country will be asked to finance or assure continuation of salary and any in-country per-diem or similar costs. Missions will include relevant cost sharing information in obligating documents, (PROAGS, PIO/Ps, PIO/Ts). Training locations/ institutions will be limited to those in the U.S., and African countries included in A.I.D. Geographic Code 941. Academic training in African universities will be provided in countries other than the home country of the trainee.

B. Summary Findings:

Emphasis in this project on selection of job-related candidates for U.S. academic training was influenced by the large number of candidates under this category in manpower plans received from the field. To date, numbers proposed for graduate competitive selection have been very small. In that the regional character of the current AAI contract under the on-going AMDP will permit AAI to continue selection and management of competitively selected graduate students from SSA countries, those few candidates recommended for competitive selection will continue to be managed under the AMDP. The Southern Africa Academic and Skills Training Project (SAAST) will focus exclusively on selection of job-related candidates for U.S. training.

Given the large number of requests for undergraduate training in the U.S., despite the relatively high costs involved, this project will include a small number of placements, five per year for each country with two years of new starts. While participation in U.S. undergraduate programs is not encouraged, the limited number of openings in African universities and the continuous high demand for this level of training argued for inclusion within this project. These placements will be limited to those situations where there are inadequate host country or African training opportunities. Candidates for U.S. graduate and under-graduate training will be placed by the Office of International Training (OIT).

Part 2. Project Background and Detailed Description:

A. Background:

During the 1960's many newly independent African nations had little or no means of meeting the demand for highly trained, indigenous, professional manpower. The existing university facilities were limited and their programs of study were not adapted to the development needs of their respective countries. In response to this demand for high level manpower, A.I.D., in addition to providing project-oriented participant training, provided three special scholarship programs:

1. African Scholarship Program of American Universities (ASPAU),
2. African Graduate Fellowship Program (AFGRAD), and
3. Inter-African Universities Scholarship Program (INTERAF).

The ASPAU project was initiated in 1961. Its objective was to increase the availability of professional manpower at the undergraduate level by supporting the efforts of U.S. universities and colleges to provide training for selected African Students. Under this program over 220 American institutions have provided tuition-free, four year scholarships. The student's home country paid international travel costs and A.I.D. financed their subsistence and administrative costs. The project was administered by the African-American Institute (AAI) and terminated at the end of FY 75.

At its termination, approximately 1,600 students had completed study for undergraduate degrees in various disciplines. The AFGRAD project, also administered by AAI, began in 1963 as a cooperative effort between the U.S. Council of Graduate Schools, several African governments and A.I.D. The objective is to provide graduate level training in U.S. universities for selected African students in disciplines related to specific development activities, when such training is not available in Africa. Candidates are trained to fill technical or scientific positions in academia, in the private sectors or in government service. Under this program, U.S. graduate schools provide tuition-free scholarships, African governments finance all international travel, and A.I.D. finances support and administrative costs. Since 1967, A.I.D., in addition, has provided as a component of AFGRAD a special program called African Graduate Study Awards (AGSA) to students with 3-5 years of work experience who do not meet the high academic requirements under the AFGRAD project but who are admissible to U.S. graduate schools. This project will terminate at the end of FY 1980 (with the last group of students starting their training in September 1976). At this time over 1,000 students will have completed study for their graduate degrees and will have been placed in or returned to study-related jobs.

As the staffs and facilities of many African institutions of higher education improved, A.I.D. began a scholarship program designed to

increase the role of these institutions in training African students at the undergraduate level. The purpose of INTERAF, which was initiated in 1967, is to increase the availability of trained high level manpower in Africa by increasing the flow of African students to African colleges and universities, and to provide a basis for strengthening cooperation among these institutions. The program was administered by AAI from 1967 to 71, and since 1971 by the Association of African Universities (AAU). This project is also scheduled to terminate at the end of FY 1980 (with the last group of participants starting their training in September 1975), at which time approximately 2,000 students will have completed study for their undergraduate degrees. Evaluations of this program have revealed that inter-African study has the highest repatriation rate of the three projects.

The three projects have undergone extensive evaluations and reviews[a/] to determine their efficacy as well as the need and alternative approaches for future assistance. One response to that evaluation was to develop the African Manpower Development Project (AMDP), which provides a flexible means of continuing to meet training needs for recipients of development assistance in Africa. The Southern Africa Academic and Skills Training Project (SAAST) provides the

---

a/ Practical Concepts Incorporated, "Evaluation of ASPAU, AFGRAD, and INTERAF: Impact of Regional Scholarship Programs on Manpower Needs in Africa:, 1973; Overseas Liaison Committee of the American Council on Education, "Report on the Evaluation of AFGRAD and INTERAF Programs, 1974; and R.E. Springwater, African-American Institute, "Comments on the Overseas Liaison Committee/American Council on Education's Report on AFGRAD and Interaf", 1975.

same means for those countries receiving Security Supporting Assistance (SSA) and is necessitated by Section 115 of the FAA which prohibits the use of development or humanitarian assistance funds in countries where Security Assistance is provided in the same fiscal year.

B. Detailed Description:

1. This regional multi-year project will provide training in areas critical to reducing African countries' human resources shortfall. Africa ranks far below other continents in the number of students per inhabitant and to the ratio of students in the 20-24 year age group (See Table 3). In spite of this situation, A.I.D. has not allocated sufficient amounts to the human resources area in Africa and the lack of skilled personnel was identified in the majority of African DAPs as a critical bottleneck.

The level of training will be decided on the basis of job requirements but may include graduate level, undergraduate, and special training. These types of training will provide the flexibility for participating African countries to train critically needed indigenous manpower for positions in specific development oriented assignments. This project is designed to meet critical requirements for managerial and technically skilled manpower in selected African countries by providing persons trained in Africa and the U.S. It will increase the availability of trained Africans who can contribute to economic and social development in fields most relevant to programs in these countries.

2. Each participating African government in cooperation with the A.I.D. (or Embassy) field office will submit an annual training proposal. Training proposals will be based on a joint analysis of priority training needs in the country in accordance with the project approaches and criteria listed below. Training requested will include a statement on the potential contribution to development, relation to DAP strategy, potential impact on the poor majority, and the institutional effect of the proposed training. A training proposal outline is included in Annex A. Country training proposals will be reviewed by OSARAC for completeness and justification, potential for impact on development, and relationship to the poor majority and the integration of women. Assistance in helping to identify priority manpower needs will be provided upon request under the project either by direct hire personnel or consultants.

3. A Regional Training Officer is planned for assignment in the field to monitor implementation of the project, particularly the organization and management of the special (scheduled) short term training requirements in the field. This officer will be a direct hire or a contractor funded for the duration of the project.

4. The following training will be available geginning in year 1977/78:

(a) U.S. Academic Training:

A major sub-activity of this project will be academic training, primarily in graduate programs in the U.S. Training, as identified in the training proposals, will generally be to meet: (1) pre and post

project training which is not available in the person's home country or in Africa, and (2) programs for future university staff and key government ministries in priority development areas where a direct relationship can be traced to programs related to reaching the majority of people in the developing African country. Degree training, when required for the position, will be largely for master's or special short duration undergraduate programs, with a limited capacity for full term under-graduate programs. Undergraduate placements will be limited to those situations in which there is inadequate training opportunity in Africa. Doctoral degrees will be considered on a case-by-case basis. U.S. training will be stressed principally for those disciplines which do not exist in Africa or where African Universities are unable to accommodate qualified candidates. Fields of training are listed in the Technical Analysis.

Candidates for master's degrees will be required to do theses and dissertations on topics relevant to development. Provisions will be made for research to be conducted in a candidates home country to the extent that satisfactory arrangements are made with the home country and approval of the degree-granting institution.

Selection of candidates for U.S. academic training will be job-selected candidates. It is assumed that countries with substantial A.I.D. programs will be selecting most of their candidates for training from persons already employed in sector or project related jobs and that appropriate training will require a combined academic/

practical training experience which may or may not involve a degree. Training for job-selected candidates will be submitted under PIO/Ps.

(b) Special Programs:

Another activity will be special training programs in-country, in Africa, or in the U.S. for intensive training/observation in a specific subject in relation to a particular job. It will be used to give specialist training to generalists: for example, trained agriculturalists can be given a short-term special course in agriculture co-ops, agriculture credit, or agriculture extension; supportive training could be provided in such areas as management, project analysis or economic analysis.

Special programs will be supported in-country if the demand justifies; in such cases a contract would probably be required to provide U.S. or African instructors to develop the course of study and curriculum with host country personnel. Normally, A.I.D. funds will not be authorized for in-country travel and per diem of participants. Variance from this policy will be approved only after special justification and then only for a limited number of participants for short periods of time.

Attendance at existing institutions in other countries offering non-degree short-term training (such as Pan African Institute of Development (PAID), CAFRAD[1/], and the Regional Road Maintenance Training Center (RRMTC) in Africa or the U.S. Department of Agriculture and

1/ African Training and Research Center in Administration for Development.

Department of Labor short courses in the U.S.) will be authorized when related to priority development needs of the participating country. Regional training programs will be set up on a group basis in Africa or the U.S. if similar training requests are received from several SSA countries and arrangements are feasible. The number of persons receiving special training is difficult to estimate but it is planned that approximately one half of the training will be in the U.S. and one half in Africa each year. Implementation arrangements will be by either PIO/P or PIO/T as described in Part 4.

(c) African Academic Training:

Academic training will be available in Africa for training which is not provided or available in the home country. Job-related training is planned for approximately 20 selections annually in priority development areas in fields where a direct relationship can be traced to programs related to reaching the poor majority. Pre- and post project training is encouraged. Training arrangement will be made by a contractor such as the Association of African Universities (AAU) as explained in Part 4. Fields of training are covered specifically in the Technical Analysis (p. 12).

5. Training will be primarily for personnel of government and/or quasi-government institutions, with private sector employment approved on a limited case-bycase basis. Training requests will satisfy one or more of the following criteria.

(a) Pre-project training of selected key personnel required in development of proposed projects. Such training can help reduce the time lag required in training personnel to assume responsibility for operations. (Initiation of pre-project training under this project will not constitute implied approval of the project). 5A

(b) Post-project training for personnel identified after the completion of a project as necessary for the successful continuance of the project activity. This will eliminate the need for training proposed for support under "Program and Development Support" project which is to be reserved for project planning and design.

(c) Training for sector related non-project activity which contributes to achievement of a sector strategy or objective.

(d) Training for trainers in which the training will provide for the broadest possible multiplier effect.

(e) Training to upgrade skills of personnel in specialized positions critical to development priorities.

(f) Training for persons to fill specific positions identified as a priority development area. Persons may be nominated who show promise but may have limited or no work experience.

Part 3. Project Analyses

A. Technical Analysis

1 Type and Location of Training

The location, number and fields of training have been developed based on submissions from A.I.D. field offices and discussions with U.S. and African organizations with experience in African manpower development. A large proportion of the training plan requests consist of specialized U.S. graduate level training which is not available in Africa. The 1974 OLC report by Liddle and Johnson[c/] emphasized the continuing requirement for graduate training for the African continent which is far below Latin America, Asia and the Near East in the percentage of graduate trained persons. A large proportion of African research, university faculty and middle level government positions are filled by expatriates.

A criticism of the ASPAU program has been the low return rate; this is not true for AFGRAD. The AAI reports as of November 1975 that employment of former AFGRAD participants shows a return rate of 91.4% as well as a broad distribution in government employment and African universities.

EMPLOYMENT OF FORMER AFGRAD PARTICIPANTS
(as of November 20, 1975)

In Africa:

Faculty, Researchers, Administrative Staff of African Universities	288

c/ Overseas Liaison Committee, "Report on the Evaluation of AFGRAD and INTERAF Programs" 1974.

In Africa (continued)

Civil Service, and Professionals and Scientists Employed by Government	203
Professionals with International Organizations (IBRD, IMF, UNCTAD, UN Secretariat, UNDP, UN Atomic Energy Agency, CIMMYT, CAFRAD, African Development Bank, Association for Teacher Education in Africa, West African Examirations Council)	21
Secondary School (Principals and Staff)	18
Post-Secondary Institutions	11
Private Sector:	
Medical Facilities	12
Other	35
Military	5
Other	62
Deceased	7
Total in Africa	662

In United States and Canada

Pursuing PH.D. Studies	30
Teaching at Universities	8
Practicing Medical Doctors (Including Residencies)	12
Private Sector	4
Other	9
Total in United States and Canadada	63

There is a growing need for graduate training for Africans but it will be some time before African universities can provide graduate facilities and faculty, although continued U.S. graduate training will help.

On the other hand, most countries in Africa have at least one university or college (and some several) providing undergraduate courses in most fields. The Secretary General of the Association of African Universities (AAU) indicated in a letter dated November 17, 1975 that the needs for students to move from one country to another in Africa for undergraduate courses is less than it was at the beginning of the INTERAF program in 1967. He recommended support for certain specialist and professional courses such as Forestry, Dentistry, Pharmacy, Architecture, Veterinary Medicine, Engineering and Medicine which are not provided in every university. While a large proportion of the INTERAF scholarships were in these fields (44% in 1973/74), there were limited requests for continuing scholarships in these same fields from Missions submmiting country training plans in early 1976 in response to AIDTO Circular A-625. The Secretary General of AAU also indicated that direction of future funding to regional post-graduate and specialist training and research at a network of regional centers would have more impact. A major deterrent to this approach is that regional centers do not exist and would require additional staffing and equipment. The development of such a network would be expensive for African governments even with donor help and it will be some time before such training sites will be available.

A major new provision of this project is the inclusion of specialized non-degree training both in the U.S. and in Africa, including the home country. Many A.I.D. Missions have pointed out that priority training is not directed only toward undergraduate or graduate degrees. For example, Dakar indicated the need for short-term training in the U.S., Senegal and other African countries; Niamey saw a need for graduate level non-degree training in agricultural credit, extension, project analysis, management, budget administration, economic analysis; Monrovia required non-degree specialized training in agriculture, engineering, and health; Addis Ababa wanted non-degree graduate level training as well as short-term, non-academic work oriented training; Conakry needed post graduate training in agricultural fields in the U.S. Numerous training plans have cited the desire to take advantage of training programs announced by Circular Airgrams and developed by U.S. universities. Many such programs address key sector priorities, such as development economics, rural motivation and agricultural management but there has been no means to finance this training.

In contrast to this project the AFGRAD and INTERAF programs have been essentially scholarship programs in fields meeting priority manpower needs leading to social and economic development. The scholarships were not tied to a coordinated, project-oriented technical assistance program but were primarily in

fields decided by the university or the Ministry of Education in the sending country, with limited A.I.D. input on selection. This project will require A.I.D. involvement in the selection process and joint planning of priorities with the host country. In countries without A.I.D. representation it may be more difficult to relate training to priority development activities but this will be attempted through A.I.D. review of the annual training plan. Where an A.I.D. office does exist, however, programming of this project will insure that training is an integral part of the overall country development effort.

2. Field of Training:

a. Academic Training:

The fields of training for this project both in Africa and the U.S. will be directly related to country priorities and will be more limited than the present AFGRAD and INTERAF program by tying requests to more specific fields of training. Such tying will assure that the training will ultimately benefit the development needs of the country. Identification of such fields is somewhat subjective since it ultimately depends on the position which the trained person will hold and the use made of training. An illustrative list of subjects follows. Others may be proposed in annual training proposals given sufficient justification. Selection in each field will give specific attention to including women in order to help integrate women into national economies.

SUBJECT MATTER AREAS

- Agricultural Crop and Livestock Research and disciplines related to food production such as Agronomy, Entomology, Plant Pathology, Extension, Home Economics, Rural Sociology, etc.
- Agricultural Economics/Farm Management
- Veterinary Medicine/Animal Husbandry
- Cooperatives
- Agricultural Education
- Public Health and Paramedical
- MCH/FP/Nutrition
- Rural Development/Social Anthropology
- Communications/Transportation
- Public Administration, Project Management and related disciplines in supply, procurement, accounting and other areas supporting rural-oriented programs.
- Economics with emphasis on Macro and Micro, cost benefit analysis, operations research, development, money & banking, international trade, finance
- Education Economics/Education Technology
- Business Administration & Management
- Urban & Regional Planning and Administration Housing
- Non Formal Education
- University Faculty in fields related to establishing or strengthening instruction at the universities which relates to programs involving and assisting the poor majority

-- Civil Engineering/Ecological Engineering/Energy Mineral Engineering, Chemistry, Geology, Hydrology

b. Special Training:

Types of training authorized on a regional or country basis will fall in three major categories. The first is training offered by African training institutions on a scheduled basis. This would include courses given by the Pan-African Institute of Development (PAID), CAFRAD, RRMTC, IDEP and other established facilities which will be identified and information provided to Mission.

The second category is special courses designed and tailored to meet unique regional or country needs. Such courses may be organized through African regional or country institutions on an ad hoc basis (with U.S. technical assistance where required) in order to meet special program needs identified by African countries or A.I.D. Missions. It is difficult to specifically identify priority areas for this second type of training. The most frequently mentioned field of training is in agriculture and, the second, management. Examples of Mission proposed requirements which we believe most nearly fit the project purposes are range livestock management (2 months in-country), and heavy equipment maintenance (2 months in-country).

The third type of special training under this project will be specialized U.S. training for either a special course, such as those offered by USDA, in U.S. universities such as the Williams

College or Harvard program, or for short specially arranged training in the U.S. in some field such as rural development, financial management or maternal and child health -- all for persons who are qualified well placed persons who need finishing courses or observation programs.

Part 4. Implementation Arrangements:

A. Analysis of Administrative Arrangements:

1. Overall Responsibility:

OSARAC will have overall supervision, exercised in cooperation with SER/IT and AFR/DR.

2. Advance Notice from Field:

Each AID/Embassy office will submit an advance indication of requirements in June of each year at the time of the Annual Budget Submission. This notice will enable OSARAC to estimate requirements for obligation in the next fiscal year.

3. Identification of Training Priorities:

Each A.I.D. (country officer (or Embassy in absence of an A.I.D. officer) will submit an Annual Training Proposal by November 30 for the number and types of training requested for the following calendar year under this project (see outline at Annex A). The Annual Training Proposal will be developed in cooperation and conjunction with appropriate host country committee should include broader representation than the Ministry of Education and university

officials who have usually been involved with AFGRAD and INTERAF. AID/Embassy offices will advise OSARAC the composition of the country committee working on the training proposal.

Training plans will be reviewed by OSARAC and approval of training requested given by airgram or cable to AID/Embassy offices. Approvals will involve inclusion of the amount of the approved training in the total project OYB, and guidance on the preferred approach for selection and obligation.

4. Selection of Persons:

(a) U.S. Academic (job selected):

Implementation will be through submission of PIO/Ps against OSARAC allotment and appropriation symbols. Selection will be similar to regular A.I.D. project related participant training using the same mechanism. Training may include on-the-job practical training on a specially arranged basis. Placement and reporting for short term practical training will be arranged by SER/IT as in regular A.I.D. participant training and will usually involve use of contract or other government agencies.

(b) U.S. Special (job selected):

Implementation will be by submission of PIO/ Ps to attend training programs organized by U.S.

government agencies, educational and other institutions as per usual participant training.

c) African Academic

Implementation arrangements for Inter-African training will be the primary responsibility of a contractor such as the Association of African Universities (AAU) or the International Institute for Education (IIE). The contractor will be responsible for processing and transmitting documents necessary for admission to African universities, facilitating placement and admission, pre-providing departure briefings and arranging transportation, and providing required support to students during the training period. Non-obligating PIO/Ps will be submitted to AID/W for record purposes. The contractor will be required to report to AID/Embassy and host country offices at least twice annually on student progress.

d) African Special (scheduled courses):

Arrangements will also be explored for managing this category of training under a contract similar to that for the African academic portion.

The regional training officer will assist with implementation until contractual arrangements can be worked out.

(e) African Special (tailored courses)

Implementation will be through submission of a detailed airgram to OSARAC, Mbabane, Swaziland, describing the program, inputs required, costs, etc. After review, OSARAC will advise on program and administrative arrangements. In some cases, these may involve submission of a PIO/T to obtain technical services to halp develop and run the program. In some instances, it may also involve a grant to an African institution to develop and operate the program.

B. Implementation Plan

First Year*

Project Approval	- May 1977
OSARAC Approv. of Training requested (Training plans received previously)	- June 1977
Documentation Submission	- June 1977
Obligations (based on above	- June 1977
Negotiation of Contract(AAU)	- June 1977

Second Year and Annually Thereafter

Advance Notice from Field	- June
Training Proposal Committees meet in Field	- October/November
Submission Training Plan	November 30
Approval of Training	- December 31
Negotiation of Contract	- January
PIO/P and Airgrams Submitted	- January/March
Obligations	- February/March
Academic Training Begins	- August/September
Special Training Begins	- Various

Planned Performance Network Tracking Chart is attached as Annex C.

B. Financial Analysis and Plan

1. The various financial components of the project are:

a) U.S. Training

i. Academic: Tuition, maintenance, books, U.S. travel, etc. is estimated at $10,200 annually where full costs are programmed by A.I.D.

ii. Special: SER/IT inclusive costs are 1600 per month, excluding international travel.

iii. International Travel: Under SAAST, AID will pay international travel. Travel costs from Africa to the U.S. average $750 one way.

b) Africa Training

i. Academic (INTERAF-type): Tuition, maintenance, books, etc., is estimated at $2900 annually.

ii. Special (Scheduled): Tuition, maintenance, books, etc., estimated at $400 monthly.

iii. Special (ad hoc): Funds will be used primarily for hiring U.S. personnel to develop and conduct special training. Costs for maintenance and international travel will be paid by the project if conducted at a regional institution. Maintenance, in-country travel and facilities will be borne by the country for training in-country. An estimated lump-sum of $75,000 is planned for manpower planning and $300,000/yr. for FY 1978 through FY 1982 for ad-hoc training.

2. An estimate for number of persons anticipated for training are listed below by fiscal year. These numbers are illustrative for budgeting purposes and will vary depending upon the requests contained in annual training proposals.

Number of Persons Beginning Training

	FY 77	FY 78	FY 79	FY 80	FY 81	FY 82
U.S. Training						
Academic (Graduate)	20	60	60	60	60	0
Academic (Undergrad)	10	20	20	0	0	0
Special	20	60	60	60	60	60
African Training						
Academic	10	20	20	0	0	0
Special (Scheduled courses)	0	60	60	60	60	60
Special (ad hoc)	0	numbers will be on ad-hoc basis				

3. Based on these projections the estimated costs of the project are included on the attached table.

C. Economic and Social Analysis

The economic aspects of this project can be analyzed through examination of alternative courses of action. A primary issue is whether graduate training should be provided in African universities rather than the U.S. It is difficult to calculate the cost of establishing and operating an African graduate school due to wide variations, government subsidies and the absence of budgeting data. With few exceptions, there has been limited investment in graduate education in Africa (aside from specialized schools, such as medicine) in recent years. Primary reasons are the high percentage of national budgets already going into formal education and limited African faculty requiring recruitment of expatriates. Many universities (in Ethiopia and Sierra Leone, for instance) are emphasizing outreach programs at the undergraduate level rather than investment in graduate facilities. On the other hand, U.S. graduate schools desire African students and have either surplus capacity or are willing to make space available for overseas students.

Based on this limited analysis, we do not believe it would be cost effective to use these funds for the establishment of African graduate institutions. Persons will be programmed, however, to use existing African schools whenever appropriate educational programs are available.

The same approach will be used in the case of programming special students. Existing special programs in Africa and the U.S. will be used whenever available. Special programs will be set up only when addressing high priority fields and will be arranged on a regional basis to the extent possible. The economic and social loss to Africa of the potential brain-drain in the past has been over-training in a specialty which commands

high salaries in the U.S. such as medicine or where facilities do not exist in a less developed country such as nuclear chemistry. This project relates training closely to less developed country needs and is intended to avoid over-training. Another cause has been rejection of the tribal or national group by the Government as in the case of Ibos in Nigeria and Asians in Uganda. It is difficult to predict future political problems within Africa so this problem, although minimal, cannot be avoided.

The inclusion of special training and academic training for persons already employed by African governments will greatly reduce the recurrent budget impact of employment of persons trained under this project compared to educating students who must be employed upon their return. However, the return of persons who were not previously employed usually has a positive economic effect since the Africans often replace expatriates who are employed at considerable higher cost.

Integration of women into project selections will be addressed in Annual Training Proposals. There are no adverse environmental consequences from this training project.

C. Relationship to other AID Training Projects

RELATIONSHIP WITH OTHER AID FUNDED TRAINING ACTIVITIES

The SAAST takes its place beside the following special purpose training activities in Southern Africa:

a) Development Training for Southern Africa - this project, approved in FY 76, provides training for students from the minority-ruled countries of Rhodesia, Southwest Africa, and South Africa. Funds are provided for graduate studies in the U.S. and for non-degree, remedial, technical and

vocational and special academic courses in the US and Africa. US undergraduate training is approved by AID only with "extraordinary justification". The project is monitored by AFR/ESA and is being implemented via a contract with the African-American Institute and via a small grant ($50,000) to the Phelpes-Stokes Foundation. The latter provides supplemental support to students from Rhodesia, South-West Africa and South Africa already studying in the United States.

b) Southern Africa Development Personnel and Training (SADPT II)

The purpose of SADPT is to assist Botswana, Lesotho and Swaziland in overcoming their extreme shortages of manpower by providing selected operational personnel (OPEX) and by providing training for local personnel who will eventually replace the OPEX technicians. Training is also available to upgrade staff in organization units to which OPEX technicians are assigned. SADPT II, in fact, consists of separate projects for each of the three countries. These projects are costed in the aggregate at approximately $6.4 million from FY 78 to FY 82. During this period training will be provided for 20 BSCs, 20 MSCs, 20 third country programs and 8 in-service and in-country programs. Training arrangements are coordinated by the AID Office of International Training (OIT).

(c) Development Training for Portuguese-Speaking Africa

The Africa regional project approved in FY 75 includes training for Mozambique and Angola, two southern African countries which might eventually be included under SSA funding. The project is DA funded at $10.2 million for five countries. Funds can be used for training at the post-primary and post-secondary levels (Implementing agent: AAI) and for short-term training (Implementing agent: OIT). To date 45 Angolans and no Mozambicanos have begun training under the project, although Mozambique may provide candidates for training in FY 78.

These special purpose straining projects, if carefully managed, complement but do not duplicate training proposed under SAAST. SADPT II and SAAST do offer graduate, undergraduate and in-country training opportunities in Botswana, Lesotho, and Swaziland but SADPT II training is restricted to OPEX-related training opportunities.

D. Evaluation Arrangements

AID Office/Embassy Actions

Evaluation comments should be a part of the Annual Training Proposal since the most useful evaluation of participant training is a continuous process which is integrated into the training program. Evaluative comments will include the content of the training to determine whether the training as specified and scheduled was in fact provided to the participant.

The ultimate evaluation of training is the presentation of evidence that after completion of training, the participant does in fact perform development related functions over a period of time (year 1, 2, 3, etc.) in the manner specified in the training documentation.

A.I.D./Embassy officers should ascertain by review of training proposals, progress reports and participant comments that the kind and amount of training specified is provided to the participant. This verification of training content should be a continuous process which takes place for the duration of the individuals' training.

The project related accomplishments of returned participants

should also be a major concern. The absence of significant participant effect on sector or activity goals should be a signal for review and renegotiation of project arrangements or revision of training management procedures. During the life of the project evaluation information should be obtained and submitted by the AID/Embassy on which a judgment can be based that the training is accomplishing what it was intended to do. This will require periodic surveys of returned persons from which information can be drawn to assist in selection of other persons and bring about program improvements. Consideration will be given to provide assistance, if required, to AID/Embassy offices in tracing persons trained after their return to determine whether the training is being used and what they are doing.

AID Action

Project Appraisal Reports will be prepared annually by the OSARAC Project Officer based on evaluation received from AID/Embassy offices and reports received from contractors.

Further evaluation of all aspects of this project will take place by an outside evaluator at the end of 21/2 years of project operation at which time adequate experience should have been obtained. This evaluation will include selection processes, appropriateness of training arrangements, return rate, utilization of training, and other factors.

TABLE 1.

NUMBERS OF TRAINEES AND ESTIMATED OBLIGATIONS***

		FY 1977		FY 1978		FY 1979		FY 1980		FY 1981		FY 1982		Total	
		No.	Amt.	No.	Amt.	No.	Amt.	No.	Amt.	No.	Amt.	No.	Amt.	No.	Amt.
U.S. TRAINING															
Academic Graduate 1/	New	20	234	60	702	60	702	60	702	60	702	-	-		3042
	Cont.	-	-	20	204	60	612	60	612	60	612	60	612		2652
Academic Undergrad 1/	New	10	117	20	234	20	234	-	-	-	-	-	-		585
	Cont.	-	-	10	102	30	306	50	510	40	408	20	204		1530
Special 2/		20	158	60	474	60	474	60	474	60	474	60	474		2528
AFRICA TRAINING															
Academic INTERAF 3/	New	10	44	20	88	20	88	-	-	-	-	-	-		220
	Cont.	-	-	10	36	30	109	50	182	40	145	20	73		545
Special - Scheduled 4/		-	-	60	156	60	156	60	156	60	156	60	156		780
Special - Ad Hoc 5/		-	-	-	240	-	240	-	240	-	240	-	240		1200
REGIONAL TRAINING OFFICER		-	25	-	60	-	60	-	60	-	60	-	60		325
MANPOWER PLANNING		-	20	-	40	-	-	-	-		-	-	-		60
TOTAL			598		2336		2981		2936		2797		1819		13467
8% Inflation			-		188		240		235		224		146		1033
GRAND TOTAL			598		2524		3221		3171		3021		1965		14,500

*** FY 1977 nos. of trainees and amounts are for Botswana and Zambia only. FY 1978 and subsequent years include Botswana, Zambia, Lesotho, and Swaziland, and assume an equal number of trainees from each country.

FOOTNOTES FOR TABLE 1

1/ U.S. Academic Training (Graduate and Undergraduate): $10,200 per year per student, plus $1,500 international travel (one time cost per new start).

2/ U.S. Special Training: $1,600 per month per student times average length of request (to date four months), plus $1,500 international travel. Total cost $7,900 per student.

3/ Africa Academic Training: $2,900 per year per student, plus $600 inter-Africa travel (one time cost per new start), plus 25% for administrative costs.

4/ Africa Special Training - Scheduled: $400 per month per student times average length of request (to date five months), plus $600 inter-Africa travel. Total cost $2,600 per student.

5/ Africa Special Training - Ad Hoc: Estimated at $60,000 per year for each country.

TABLE 2

SUMMARY COST ESTIMATE AND FINANCIAL PLAN
($000)

SOURCE	A.I.D.		HOST COUNTRY		OTHERS		TOTAL
	FX	LC	FX	LC	FX	LC	
Academic Training	8192	382	-	60			8,634
Special Training	3518	990	-	1,160			5,668
Regional Training Officer	325	-	-	-			325
Manpower Planning	60	-	-	-			60
Inflation Factor	970	63	-	-			1,033
Contingency	-	-	-	-			-
TOTALS	13,065	1,435	-	1,220			15,720

Table 3

Comparative Educational Status of
Africa and Other Continents

I. Number of Students Per 10,000 Inhabitants

Continent	1960	1970
Africa	7	12
Asia	27	48
Latin America	27	57
Europe	73	135
Oceania	98	159
North America	190	402

II. Ratio of Student Numbers to Total 20-24 Year-Old Age Group: Enrollment Ratio (as percentages)

Continent	1960	1970
Africa	0.8	1.4
Asia	2.8	5.7
Latin America	3.2	6.7
Europe	8.8	17.8
North America	30.6	48.0

Source: UNESCO

~~Annex A~~

Attachment I

Annual Training Proposal
for Southern Africa Academic and Skills Training Project

Country:_____ Date:_____

1. Summary of Proposal

   A. Content and Broad Objectives by Sectors Proposed

   B. Priority Skills Bottlenecks

   C. Relation of Training Proposal to AID country Program and total Country Development

   D. Relation to Poor Majority and Integration of Women

   E. Plans for Selection

   F. Evaluation Comments on Prior Years

2. Training Requested - (breakdown under following headings)

   a) U.S. Training

      i) Academic (AFGRAD II)

      ii) Academic (undergrad)

      iii) Special (under six months)

   b) Africa Training

      i) Academic (INTERAF II)

      ii) Special (Scheduled courses under six months)

      iii) Special (ad hoc)

Number	Field	Duration

(under each item include brief comment on need for skills and job relationship (utilization) of training, justification of degrees, selection plans, and availa-

bility of persons for training.

3. Host Country Contribution

Contributions in terms of payment of salaries, and support of families while in training, and contributions in kind should be estimated.

690083-3
PD-AAC-870-A1

AIRGRAM

DEPARTMENT OF STATE

UNCLASSIFIED
CLASSIFICATION

For each address check one	ACTION	INFO
TO - AID/W TOAID A-25	X	

DISTRIBUTION
ACTION
INFO.

DATE REC'D.
60p.

[690008300150 1]

DATE SENT
Aug. 28, 1979

FROM - GABORONE
E.O. 12065 N/A
SUBJECT - Project Evaluation Summary - Project 690-0083.1
Southern Africa Academic and Skills Training Project (SAAST)
REFERENCE -

We are enclosing a Project Evaluation Summary (PES) on the subject project.

NORLAND file

Enc. a/s

PAGE 1 OF 1 PAGES

DRAFTED BY	OFFICE	PHONE NO.	DATE	APPROVED BY:
ala ALArent:ala	DIR		8/24/79	Louis A. Cohen, Director

A. I. D. AND OTHER CLEARANCES

UNCLASSIFIED
CLASSIFICATION

AID-5-39 (10-71) (Do not type below this line) PRINTED 5-73

CLASSIFICATION

PROJECT EVALUATION SUMMARY (PES) – PART I

Report Symbol U-447

1. PROJECT TITLE	2. PROJECT NUMBER	3. MISSION/AID/W OFFICE
Southern Africa Academic and Skills Training Project (SAAST)	690-0083.1	USAID/Gaborone

4. EVALUATION NUMBER (Enter the number maintained by the reporting unit e.g., Country or AID/W Administrative Code, Fiscal Year, Serial No. beginning with No. 1 each FY) No. 5FY79

☒ REGULAR EVALUATION ☐ SPECIAL EVALUATION

5. KEY PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION DATES			6. ESTIMATED PROJECT FUNDING	7. PERIOD COVERED BY EVALUATION
A. First PRO-AG or Equivalent FY 77	B. Final Obligation Expected FY 79	C. Final Input Delivery FY 81	A. Total $ ____	From (month/yr.) 9-30-77
			B. U.S. $ 1,313,000	To (month/yr.) 5-31-79
				Date of Evaluation Review 6-30-79

8. ACTION DECISIONS APPROVED BY MISSION OR AID/W OFFICE DIRECTOR

A. List decisions and/or unresolved issues; cite those items needing further study. (NOTE: Mission decisions which anticipate AID/W or regional office action should specify type of document, e.g., airgram, SPAR, PIO, which will present detailed request.)	B. NAME OF OFFICER RESPONSIBLE FOR ACTION	C. DATE ACTION TO BE COMPLETED
1. Develop improved annual training plan and priorities for all GOB Ministries and Departments.	Gant	On-going
2. Provide GOB with results of PES evaluation and attempt to increase number of participants from MOE.	Gant	8/79 and On-going
3. Include in participant training programs administrative and teaching/learning courses as appropriate.	Dambe/OIT	On-going
4. Prior to participants departure, provide extensive orientation.	Dambe	On-going
5. Encourage Directorate of Personnel employees to apply for training courses in administration, personnel, and manpower training.	Gant	On-going
6. Review participant living allowances on a periodic basis. Insure timely arrival of stipends. Contact participants and/or campus advisors on regular basis. Review length of times and agenda of Washington briefings.	OIT	On-going
7. Provide support to GOB Ministries and Departments and in-country training institutions for planning and implementing local in-service workshops for Government personnel. Utilize returned participants as part of the training teams.	Gant/Dambe	On-going
8. To further develop and articulate USAID training policies that identify priority areas for utilization of SAMDP support and funding.	Gant	12/31/79

* The SAAST program (0083) and overall objectives will be combined and integrated into the SAMDP (0069) project at the beginning of FY 80.

9. INVENTORY OF DOCUMENTS TO BE REVISED PER ABOVE DECISIONS

- ☐ Project Paper
- ☐ Financial Plan
- ☐ Logical Framework
- ☐ Project Agreement
- ☐ Implementation Plan e.g., CPI Network
- ☐ PIO/T
- ☐ PIO/C
- ☐ PIO/P
- ☐ Other (Specify) ____
- ☐ Other (Specify) ____

10. ALTERNATIVE DECISIONS ON FUTURE OF PROJECT

- A. ☒ Continue Project Without Change *
- B. ☐ Change Project Design and/or ☐ Change Implementation Plan
- C. ☐ Discontinue Project

11. PROJECT OFFICER AND HOST COUNTRY OR OTHER RANKING PARTICIPANTS AS APPROPRIATE (Names and Titles)

Don Gant, Education Officer, USAID/Botswana
John Pielemeier, Evaluation Officer, USAID/Botswana
Charles Gordon, Program Officer, USAID/Botswana

12. Mission/AID/W Office Director Approval

Signature

Typed Name: LOUIS A. COHEN

Date: August 14, 1979

AID 1330-15 (3-78)

13. Summary

The Southern Africa Academic and Skills Training Project (SAAST) was designed to provide academic and specialized training to Government of Botswana (GOB) and quasi-GOB personnel. The project focus (also, all training components within other GOB/USAID projects) has been to train:

(1) under-qualified GOB local staff in operating positions,

(2) local GOB staff to operate expanding government services and development programs, and

(3) additional local GOB personnel to replace the large number of expatriates still in operating positions.

A wide variety of in-country and out-of-country, in-service and pre-service, academic and on-the-job training, short-term and long-term activities has been supported within the SAAST project. Prior to the commitment of AID funding each year, the GOB has developed an annual training plan based on an analysis of projected training priorities. The study fields and subject areas have concentrated on courses directly related to the development of Botswana, and most have been complementary and related to on-going GOB/USAID programs, or soon-to-be-implemented GOB/USAID programs.

The reception of this project, and other USAID supported training, has been enthusiastic. All project targets have been substantially met. No major problems have been encountered.

14. Evaluation Methodology

At the beginning of FY 80, the present SAAST program will be combined with the Southern Africa Manpower Development Project (SAMDP). The training objectives of these two projects will be maintained, and for the SAAST portion of the unified project, normal OIT participant procedures will be followed. In addition to evaluating SAAST program objectives, the mission has attempted through this Project Evaluation Summary (PES) to measure the success and practicality of all GOB/USAID supported participant training programs.

It was felt that given the nominal number (79) of returned Botswana participants to date, and with the projected increases in training over the next few years, that all possible returned participants should be interviewed as a means to measure effectiveness of training from the participant's point of view, to clarify training and general program/training objectives, and to improve, as possible, future participant training selection, training design and implementation.

All available returned participants were approached by a professional researcher under a USAID evaluation contract. For a discussion of the Research Methodology, refer to the evaluation study attached, Summary section, and page 9, No. 2, Outline of the Research Methodology.

The evaluation was completed with the permission and assistance of the GOB Directorate of Personnel, than AID-funded researcher, Dr. D. Clement-Jones, and through the collaboration of 56 of the 79 Batswana that have returned from training in other African countries and in the United States. All results and findings of this evaluation were discussed in draft with GOB and other related donor officials.

15. External Factors

Despite the constantly changing and difficult political problems that confront Botswana, the GOB is continuing to emphasize policies and programs that will lead toward rapid economic growth, economic independence, sustained development, and social justice. There continues to exist a critical shortage of qualified manpower that is an overriding constraint to development in all major sectors of the Botswana economy.

For several years, the GOB has strongly supported and has itself fully funded many university scholarships for Botswana high school graduates. Until 1978, the GOB was moderately successful in placing students at other African institutions of higher education. For 1979, the placement outlook in African universities has changed drastically. Not one Motswana* has been accepted at the Universities of Kenya, Tanzania, Nigeria, and Zambia. This reflects the ever-increasing national demands for higher education in these other countries and has no reflection on the abilities of the Botswana applicants. When this increasing demand for university education and the circumscribed admission policy throughout Africa is combined with the limited academic programs at the national university, the situation is bleak for the GOB to meet national development goals.

Fortunately, most other international donors can expand educational intake and find additional placements for both pre-service and in-service government and quasi-government sponsored students. The SAAST and SAMDP and other AID sponsored manpower training and personnel improvement projects in the U.S. will take on ever increasing importance to the GOB's attempt to meet development goals and localize the government service.

Additional positive indicators have been the U.S. Government's attention and increasing interest in Southern Africa and the direct support to Botswana. The GOB and USAID have also examined in more detail the manpower constraints and have a better understanding of the training priorities.

*A Motswana is a citizen of Botswana. The plural of Motswana is Batswana.

16. Inputs

The GOB has provided participant candidates on a timely basis, but it should be noted that most participants have a relatively low level of educational preparation in the academic area of mathematics, science, and English communication skills. In certain instances, this has required remedial work for selected participants before initiating the planned program of studies.

A total of $1,313,000 has been obligated under SAAST to date. Of that amount, on June 25, 1979, all but $17,672 has been earmarked for specific participant and development training purposes.

Total SAAST Allocations and Agreements

7-30-77 (FY 77)	Agreement No. 77-B-20	$213,000
4-23-78 (FY 78)	Agreement No. 78-633-15	500,000
8-31-78 (FY 78)	Agreement No. 78-633-15 Amendment #(1)	100,000
1-4-79 (FY 79)	Agreement No. 78-633-15 Amendment #(2)	350,000
3-23-79 (FY 79)	Agreement No. 78-633-15 Amendment #(3)	150,000
		$1,313,000

17. Outputs

An important output indicator for SAAST and other mission funded participant training projects is the number of trained participants that complete training and return to GOB positions. As of May 1979, seventy-nine Batswana have returned from training in other African countries and in the United States; 55 are presently studying and 33 new participants are scheduled to depart in September 1979. All but one of the returned participants satisfactorily completed the planned courses and more than 90 percent are employed directly in the fields for which they were trained.

Only 55 percent of the returned participants (79) to date are living and working in and around the capital area of Gaborone. This information suggests that much of the training provided under SAAST is being directly utilized for the benefit of the rural areas and people in the country.

A second output indicator for SAAST relates to the quality and appropriateness of the training received. According to returned participants interviewed as part of this evaluation, the following improvements in training programs should be made:

(1) Training examples and case studies employed by the U.S. or third country training institutions should be more specific and practical to Botswana.

(2) Administrative and teaching methods courses should be included as a part of all training.

(3) The GOB "parent" institutions should be encouraged to utilize returned participants for trainers, even more than they presently are doing.

(4) Since only those participants who attended longer training courses were given more responsibilities and promoted, orientation and very short courses should be examined for cost and benefit to the GOB participant and to USAID.

The management of the training programs was cited for efficient administration in the areas of travel, accommodations, and stipends. However, there were cases of hardship because of inadequate, reduced, or delayed allowances and it is recommended that allowances and stipends are provided on time and reviewed regularly.

It is also recommended that the necessity for and cost-effectiveness of Washington orientation be reviewed. It would not be possible for AID training officers in Botswana to provide more orientation as suggested, but it may be useful to review the orientation presently provided in Washington for its overall length and benefit.

The majority (65 percent) of participants interviewed found their course to be appropriate, interesting, useful and relevant. Nearly all returned participants (90 percent) are still being employed in the field for which they were trained. The exceptions mainly comprise people who were promoted into higher administrative positions.

The majority of respondents (66 percent) had already initiated, or were planning to initiate, some innovative changes in their workplace as a direct result of their training and many felt that their job performance had improved since they returned. Finally, since many returned participants are formally involved in training others, there has been a substantial "multiplier effect" through wide dissemination of the knowledge gained through participant training.

For a complete listing of returned participants (outputs), the areas of training, and the present assigned GOB position, refer to Appendix II of the attached evaluation study.

For all participants funded under USAID programs from 1973 to 1979, GOB training outputs are summarized as follows:

USAID/Botswana Training Project Number and Name	Returned	Studying	Pending for September 1979	Total
083 - Southern Africa Academic Skills and Training	23	40	27	90
015 - Botswana Range and Livestock Management	4	3	1	8
005 - Regional Testing Resource and Training Ctr.	4	-	-	4
032 - Maternal and Child Health/Family Planning Training	37	4	-	41
030 - Southern Africa Development Personnel Training	10	3	-	13
056 - Botswana Crop Production Project	1	3	-	4
067 - Botswana Agricultural Planning	-	1	3	4
078 - Botswana Health Services Project	-	-	2	2
069 - Southern African Manpower Development Project	-	1	-	1
	79	55	33	167

Summary of SAAST Participants by Area of Training
to 30 June 1979

	Long Term Over 1 Year	Short Term Less than 1 Year	Total Participants
Agriculture	22	14	36
Health	4	8	12
Education	1	-	1
Rural Development	-	3	3
GOB Finance/Economics Planning	1	1	2
Engineering/Mechanical Technologies	1	8	9
TOTAL	29	34	63

The above summary represents the areas and numbers in which the SAAST training has been concentrated. Agriculture, health, engineering/mechanical technologies, rural development, planning and education, in descending order, have been the major recipients of SAAST participant training support. It should be noted that all project participants are within the areas mandated by the U.S. Congress, and all areas of training support and complement GOB/USG development priorities and programs.

Since manpower training at either the diploma and/or degree level demands long-term effort and support, it is anticipated that the education sector will nominate increasing numbers of candidates. The projected future areas of concentration for USAID support under SAAST will be the agriculture, education, health, and rural development sectors.

18. Purpose

"To provide academic degree, non-degree and special technical training in the United States and Africa for Batswana in skills which are directly related to Botswana's priority economic and social development efforts."

The results of the interviews conducted as part of this evaluation indicate that the skills learned during training are being applied in Botswana. The concentration of training funds on agriculture is highly appropriate to Botswana's development efforts, since over 80 percent of the country's population depend primarily on agriculture for their livelihood.

19. Goal/Subgoal

Over the past three years (1976-79), USAID has contributed approximately 10 percent of the total number of long- and short-term scholarships provided to the Government of Botswana. The SAAST project, which has concentrated exclusively on improving the professional skills and efficiency of government and semi-government officials, has had an impact that is greater than the number of scholarship places might indicate. By concentrating training on career GOB employees, a small but growing cadre of trained returned participants have begun to plan, implement, and direct the many social and economic development projects promulgated by the GOB. Over 90 percent of the USAID funded Batswana ex-participants are working in the positions for which they were trained under the SAAST and other AID supported training projects. Trained manpower, the key constraint to development efforts in Botswana, was and will continue to be a serious problem for years. But there is no "quick-fix" to manpower development, and Botswana is moving forward. If the overall effort continues and receives priority support from the GOB and other international donors, the program for staffing and localizing key government positions can be completed on schedule.

20. Beneficiaries

Direct beneficiaries of the project are the participants who have received overseas training and the GOB employees who have received in-country training. Indirect beneficiaries are the citizens of Botswana who have benefited from improved government services and the extension of these services to the rural and poorer citizens throughout the country. One can also assume that trained and motivated GOB employees will provide productive and more efficient service and will help to implement national development policies and goals in a more professional and effective manner.

21. Unplanned Effects

There were no unplanned project effects except for the unanticipated demand that returned participants cooperate in and organize training programs throughout the country for other Botswana citizens. This positive acceptance and recognition of the value of training, and the utilization of ex-participants as teachers and informants, has identified a need to provide all participants with teaching/learning methodology courses to enable them to be able to transfer information in an effective and interesting manner.

22. Lessons Learned

A. The SAAST type project is an effective and useful mechanism for providing assistance to countries with severe manpower needs. It allows both large and small missions to respond quickly and positively to host government requests and to begin training for host government personnel where regular bilateral projects might be carried out in the future.

B. A manpower/training project can be most successful where the host government has an up-to-date manpower plan that clearly identifies priority needs for technical assistance.

C. A manpower development project of this nature ideally should be implemented via a single government coordinating office such as Directorate of Personnel. However, when this government coordinating department does not function well and does not coordinate in an efficient and equitable manner, there are clearly costs to this approach. Nevertheless, both the GOB and USAID/Botswana continue to believe that the single contact approach has great merit in encouraging host government control of its own training of personnel. Special efforts to strengthen the host government coordinating office are often necessary to facilitate project implementation.

23. Special Comments

None.

AIRGRAM **DEPARTMENT OF STATE**

UNCLASSIFIED
CLASSIFICATION

For each address check one ACTION | INFO

DATE REC'D.

DISTRIBUTION
ACTION
INFO.

TO - AID/W TOAID A-25 X

DATE SENT
Aug. 28, 1979

FROM - GABORONE
E.O. 12065 N/A
SUBJECT - Project Evaluation Summary - Project 690-0083.1
Southern Africa Academic and Skills Training Project (SAAST)
REFERENCE -

We are enclosing a Project Evaluation Summary (PES) on the subject project.

NORLAND

Enc. a/s

PAGE 1 OF 1 PAGES

DRAFTED BY	OFFICE	PHONE NO.	DATE	APPROVED BY
ala ALArent:ala	DIR		8/24/79	Louis A. Cohen, Director

A. I. D. AND OTHER CLEARANCES

UNCLASSIFIED
CLASSIFICATION

AID-5-39 (10-71) (Do not type below this line) PRINTED 5-73

6910083005301

EVALUATION REPORT

OF

GOVERNMENT OF BOTSWANA/USAID

PARTICIPANT TRAINING PROGRAMMES

DR. D. CLEMENT-JONES

JUNE 1979

BEST AVAILABLE COPY

SUMMARY

As of May 1979, seventy five Batswana have returned from training in other African countries and in the United States, having been sent abroad on scholarships arranged by the Agency for International Development.

Originally Botswana's training requirements were subsumed under the AID scholarship programme for the whole of Southern Africa (including Botswana, Lesotho, Swaziland, Malawi, and Zambia). More recently Botswana's increasing economic and social growth rate as well as the Government of Botswana's policy of rapid localisation of key positions in the Ministries, has augmented the demand for skilled personnel in middle and higher technical and managerial positions. AID has sought to meet this demand by developing specific manpower development programmes for Botswana itself. The continuing expansion of these programmes has merited an interim evaluation study.

This report is based upon information obtained from participants who have completed their training. Several different training programmes have been operating in Botswana recently, but this report aims to evaluate participant training per se rather than each specific participant training programme. The research was therefore conducted in order to discover the extent of the success of the various training programmes from the individual returned participant's point of view.

To this end a questionnaire was developed, piloted, and sent to returned participants working in outlying districts. The researcher interviewed all other available participants in and around Gaborone. In all, 43 people were interviewed and 13 returned the questionnaires they had been sent. The report is therefore based upon the opinions and experiences of 56 people, or 75% of all returned participants.

The research was directed to investigate (as far as this was possible given the scope of the evaluation):

(a) the overall relevance of the training received

BEST AVAILABLE COPY

(b) the effects of the training upon the career prospects of the returned participants

(c) the extent to which the information obtained during training was being utilised and disseminated within the "target" Ministries

(d) the efficiency of the administration of the programmes

(a) Relevance of training received

The majority (65%) of respondents found their courses to be appropriate interesting, useful and relevant. However, not all felt that their training was sufficient to the demands made upon them on their return to Botswana, and many (64%) suggested improvements that could have been made to their courses.

A major criticism was the fact that many of the examples and case studies employed during lectures, as well as much of the practical work, were specific to American problems and conditions, and could only be applied in abstract to Botswana.

It is recommended that whenever possible short courses and practical work should be conducted within Botswana.

Another improvement suggested by some participants was the inclusion of more administrative courses in academic and the longer "special" (i.e., job-related) training courses. Several PIO/P's specified the inclusion of such courses, but these requirements were not always fulfilled.

It is recommended that either (i) participants should be encouraged to attend administrative classes where these are offered at the institution in which they are placed, or (ii) participants should routinely attend such a course immediately upon their return to Botswana.

A third improvement suggested by respondents was the inclusion of teaching courses in their training curricula. The advisability of including such courses was highlighted in the research by the following facts:

(i) 55% of the respondents were involved in formal training of their juniors

(ii) an additional 25% were passing on the information that they

BEST AVAILABLE COPY

had learnt to their colleagues informally

It is recommended that either (i) participants should be encouraged to attend teaching courses where these are offered, or (ii) participants should routinely attend such a course immediately upon their return to Botswana.

These first three major recommendations could be fulfilled by means of greater utilisation of the facilities of the Institute of Development Management, the University of Botswana and Swaziland, the National Health Institute and the Botswana Training Centre. Specific courses could be developed by AID in conjunction with these institutions to meet the particular needs outlined above.

(b) The effects of training upon the career prospects of the returned participants

Since returning to Botswana the status, salary, and responsibility of half of the respondents had increased, and nearly all (90%) are still being employed in the field for which they were trained. The exceptions mainly comprise the "success stories" of some people who were promoted into higher administrative positions: examples include the Permanent Secretary of the Ministry of Education. However almost all of the respondents complained of the handling of their careers by the Directorate of Personnel. This Department appears to be a major obstruction to the efficient utilisation of the skills gained through manpower development programmes in Botswana.

(c) The extent to which the information obtained during training is being utilised and disseminated

The majority of respondents (66%) had already initiated, or were planning to initiate, some innovative changes in their workplace as a direct result of their training, and many felt that their job performance had improved since they returned.

Another positive result of the programme has been the wide dissemination of the knowledge gained through training that has occurred subsequently. As mentioned earlier, many returned participants are formally involved in training others and a further substantial percentage have found opportunities to pass on information to their colleagues. In fact, nearly all nurses' training now takes place in

BEST AVAILABLE COPY

in Botswana, and several new courses appear to be the direct result of the training that some of the tutors received under AID scholarship programmes.

It had been thought in the past that the shorter "special" training courses are more cost-effective than the longer academic degree training. However, the research showed that this was not necessarily the case. Only those who attended the longer special training courses were given more responsibility and promoted to more influential positions, whereas nearly all of those who received academic training felt that their training had appreciably advanced their careers and improved their job performance.

Orientation/training was found to be somewhat unsuccessful because (i) the participants and (ii) the orientation/training itself, were not selected with care. It was found to be both expensive and badly administered from a financial point of view. It appears that such orientation exercises are only of limited benefit to Botswana.

It is recommended that training courses that do not lead to recognised degrees or diplomas should be considered carefully before being accepted as being potentially beneficial or appropriate for participants from Botswana.

(d) The efficiency of the administration of the programmes

The administration can be faulted on several counts. On the whole travel, accommodation, and stipends were well administered. However, cases of hardship arose because allowances were either (i) inadequate, (ii) reduced, or (iii) delayed. It appeared to the researcher that the difficulties involved in communication and coordination between the bureaucracies of the international and national agencies involved were responsibility for the lack of efficiency that was evident.

It is recommended that allowances and stipends are researched carefully and reviewed regularly. It is very important that people staying in foreign countries should be able to have confidence in the fact that their money will always arrive promptly and in full. The feeling of insecurity experienced when such responsibilities are not fulfilled is severe.

The extensive and detailed orientation in Washington was seen as being inconsistent with the difficulties some participants encountered with

their stipends.

It is recommended that the necessity and cost-effectiveness of this orientation period be investigated with a view to replacing it (for those attending shorter courses) with lengthy personal interviews with AID representatives in Botswana prior to the participants' departure to their country of training.

BEST AVAILABLE COPY

CONTENTS

		Page
	Summary	1
1	Introduction	7
1.1	Background	7
1.2	Aims of the report	7
2	Outline of the research methodology	9
3	Returned participants	9
4	Type of training	10
4.1	Academic training	10
4.2	Special training	10
4.3	Orientation/training	10
5	Information obtained in the research	11
5.1	(a) Who was sent for training?	12
5.2	(b) Where were they sent and which subjects did they study?	14
5.3	(c) How relevant was the training?	16
5.4	(d) To what use is the information gained during training being put at the moment?	18
5.5	(e) Did the participants have any problems either prior to or during their training?	28
6	Review of recommendations	36

Appendix I Copy of the questionnaire

Appendix II Complete list of returned participants

BEST AVAILABLE COPY

1 INTRODUCTION

Background

In recent years the Agency for International Development has arranged scholarships for over 150 citizens of Botswana. The scholarships have enabled these people to further their education in various institutions in other African countries and in the United States.

The main objective of the scholarship programmes that have been running in Southern Africa is to "provide training in skills which are directly related to Botswana's priority economic and social development efforts". This report aims primarily to investigate the extent to which participants from Botswana found this main objective to have been fulfilled by their training.

The scholarship programmes were not intended to be generalised training programmes providing scholarships for individuals. They were instead intended to meet the requirements of the Ministries of the Government of Botswana in upgrading the skills of personnel already employed in Government. Originally only 5 or 6 Batswana were sent for training each year, and Botswana's needs were subsumed under the AID programme for the whole of Southern Africa. But latterly, specific programmes have been developed for Botswana itself and the flow of participant trainees has gained momentum since 1977.

As of May 1979, seventy five participants have returned to Botswana having completed their training under the auspices of various AID training programmes. These people come mainly from the "target" Ministries of Health, Agriculture, and Education as these have been identified as being those Ministries most closely concerned with meeting the needs of Botswana's underprivileged rural population. These Ministries are also currently involved in other development projects assisted by AID.

1.2 Aims of the report

The report will be based upon subjective information obtained from the participants who have returned from training. It was not considered appropriate to approach their superiors for an evaluation of the returned participants. Neither is it within the scope of this evaluation to examine the achievements of the training programmes

BEST AVAILABLE COPY

in the wider context of other AID projects or Botswana's overall development strategies.

The research was therefore directed towards discovering:

(a) the relevance of the training received for the positions in which participants are currently employed

(b) the effect of the training upon career prospects of returned participants (and therefore its potential effect on influencing the overall policy-making of the Government of Botswana)

(c) the extent to which the information obtained was being utilised and disseminated within the "target" Ministries

(d) the efficiency of the administration of day-to-day running of the programmes from the individual returned participant's point of view

2 Outline of the Research Methodology

All available returned participants were approached by the researcher either personally or by means of a questionnaire. A copy of the questionnaire is appended to this report. It was also used as a guide by the researcher when conducting the interviews, and ensured that each participant was asked the same basic questions.

Of the 25 questionnaires that were sent by post, a total of 13 (52%) were returned completed. Such a high response rate testifies to the success of the research instrument. The questionnaire consisted of ten main sections and comprised forty eight items in all. Nine of these forty eight items had multiple choice responses.

3 Returned Participants

Of the 75 people who had returned from training, it was discovered that only 41 were living and working in and around the capital of Gaborone (this finding will be discussed in Section 5.4 of the report) Outside the capital only eight were easily accessible by car in one day. It was therefore resolved that the researcher would attempt to interview these 49 people and that the questionnaire would be sent to the people working in the more outlying areas. It was not possible to interview six of these for the reasons enumerated in the list of ex-participants appended to the report. Finally, therefore, 43 people were interviewed and 13 returned the questionnaires they had been sent. The evaluation is consequently based upon the experiences and opinions of 56 people - or 75% of all returned participants.

BEST AVAILABLE COPY

4 Type of Training

4.1 Academic training

Higher undergraduate and post-graduate degrees have been termed "academic" training courses. In the past it had been suspected that the benefits reaped from sending people off on long courses of this nature rarely outweigh the costs. Nevertheless this type of training accounts for a large number of the scholarships provided for Batswana by AID. Academic training aims, in the case of undergraduate courses, to provide participants with a thorough general and vocational education. It is generally envisaged that, armed with such an education, participants will be able to tackle, at a higher or managerial level, any of several related jobs within Government. At a Master's level the training aims to strengthen specific professional skills at these higher levels of employment.

4.2 Special training

The experience of AID representatives in other parts of Africa had led them to believe that the cost-effectiveness of scholarship training programmes was the highest for what have been called "special" training courses. As their name implies, these consist of relatively short (4 weeks to one year) intensive training or observation in a specific subject in relation to a particular job. Such training also comprises a large part of AID's scholarship programme. They include seminar and "workshop" type courses as well as the more widely recognised short diploma courses. The aims of special training are to provide participants with a specific rather than general education and to enable them to carry out their duties more efficiently and with greater skill and effectiveness.

4.3 Orientation/training

Orientation/training must be flexibly defined. Included under this heading have been international congresses, small seminars and workshops, exhibitions, and conferences. The intention behind assisting people to attend such events is generally to broaden the outlook of the people involved, to encourage communication and cooperation between developing countries, and to assist in the dissemination of knowledge and experience gained by people working in similar fields in different countries.

5 Information obtained in the research

The questionnaire was designed in order to elicit information in answer to the following questions:

(a) who was sent for training?
(b) where were they sent and what subjects did they study?
(c) how relevant was their training?
(d) to what use is the information being put at the moment?
(e) did the participants have any problems prior to and during their training?

The answers provided by the respondents to these questions are described in the following pages.

BEST AVAILABLE COPY

5.1 (a) who was sent for training?

A complete list of returned participants is appended to this report. Women accounted for 60% of all returned participants but only 55% of the respondents. This disparity is due to the fact that the majority of the posted questionnaires that were not returned were sent to nurses working in remote rural areas. The distribution of participants in favour of women is an encouraging finding, though the majority of the women come from the nursing profession and will not therefore be expected to occupy influential positions in the future. The respondents ranged in age between 25 and 54 years of age and all had completed their primary education. All but one had had at least three years of secondary education.

In accordance with the explicit objectives of the programmes, the majority (84%) of the total returned participants came from the Ministries of Health (55%) and Agriculture (29%). The Ministry of Education was comparatively underrepresented (6%) considering that one of the stated aims of the programmes is to attempt to ensure that the information received during training is subsequently made available to as many people as possible. (See Table I)

Table I

All returned participants (total number = 75) from different Ministries who were sent away for academic, special and orientation training

	Health	Agric-ulture	Educ-ation	Other	Total
Academic	7 (8%)	12 (15%)	4 (5%)	1 (1%)	24 (29%)
Special	32 (39%)	9 (11%)	1 (1%)	6 (7%)	48 (59%)
Orientation	6 (7%)	3 (4%)	0 (0%)	1 (1%)	10 (12%)
Total	45 +(55%)	24 (29%)	5 (6%)	8 (10%)	82(100%)

+ Totals to nearest whole number

Example

The Permanent Secretary of the Ministry of Education was interviewed as a returned participant and was questioned concerning the relative paucity in recent years of candidates for training from his Ministry. His comments, while they bear possibly little relation to

the facts, should be noted if AID wishes to increase its involvement in this priority area. The Permanent Secretary feels both critical and distrustful of AID for the following reasons:

(i) He criticised what he called AID's "inflexibility". He explained that by this he refers to the fact that, when approached with requests from Government for specific items, AID is unwilling to fund anything that cannot be either (a) subsumed under a large, currently running project, or (b) expanded into a new project run exclusively by AID. He went on to compare AID unfavourably with the Swedish and British agencies in this respect. A representative comment was "Botswana knows what Botswana needs better than AID knows what Botswana needs".

(ii) His distrust arises from an incident where he claims that AID promised a certain amount of money for particular scholarships, but then withdrew and refused to meet their commitments. Consequently some people were forced to return to Botswana without completing their training. The researcher has discovered one group of students who were mistreated in a way similar to the way he describes. This group will be discussed further in the following pages.

Recommendation 1

It is recommended that a brief, readable report of the results of AID's scholarship programmes in Botswana be produced and circulated around the Ministries, with particular emphasis on the Ministry of Education. The variety of training offered should prove an effective defense to the accusation of inflexibility.

Recommendation 2

It is also recommended that greater efforts be made to foster closer relations with the Ministry of Education, with a view to greater consultation and cooperation regarding nominations of teachers and higher educators for further training.

5.1.2 Selection for Training

In principle it has been stated that participants could be either

(i) job selected (i.e., selected from Ministry personnel by senior members of a particular Ministry in conjunction with the Directorate of Personnel) or

(ii) competetively selected (i.e., selected from applicants replying to advertised placements).

In practise it was discovered that all but one of the respondents had been job selected. This fact also contributes to the reticence

BEST AVAILABLE COPY

of members of the Ministry of Education to put forward their personnel for training through AID. The Ministry feels that all scholarships, whether job selected or competetively selected, should be processed by the Bursaries Unit. In fact, it appears that only placements for which candidates will be competetively selected are processed by this unit. The Ministries of Health and Agriculture are held culpable by the Ministry of Education for what they call "hand picking" of personnel for training.

Recommendation 3

It is recommended that the principle of "job selection" be reviewed in this light by AID in conjunction with the Bursaries Unit so that some compromise can be reached whereby more scholarships are advertised within appropriate Ministries.

5.2 (b) Where were they sent and which subjects did they study?

A complete list of the subjects studied can be seen in Appendix II. Tables I and II show the participants from different Ministries subdivided according to the type of training (academic, special, or orientation) they received. It will be evident from these figures that some people were sent away more than once under AID scholarship programmes: 9% of all returned participants and 11% of the respondents went away twice.

Table II

Respondents (total number = 56) from different Ministries who were sent away for academic, special or orientation training.

	Health	Agriculture	Education	Other	Total
Academic	6 (10%)	10 (16%)	4 (6%)	1 (2%)	21 (34%)
Special	20 (32%)	7 (11%)	1 (2%)	4 (6%)	32 (52%)
Orientation	6 (10%)	2 (3%)	0 (0%)	1 (2%)	9 (14%)
Total	32 (52%)	19 (31%)	5 (8%)	6 (10%)	62(100%)

The largest group of returned participants comprises those from the Ministry of Health who attended special training courses. This group

BEST AVAILABLE COPY

is composed mainly of nurses attending various courses organised by the Meharry Medical College in Tennessee. More recently , returned participants from these and other training courses have been involved in expanding and upgrading Botswana's own National Health Institute, and it is no longer necessary to send nurses abroad for training in Maternal/Child Health and Family Planning. This thereby contributes towards Botswana's important aim of achieving independence from foreign aid. There are also plans afoot to initiate a Nurse Practitioner training programme. This proposal almost certainly stems from the group of five nurse practitioners trained under AID scholarship programmes. Hopefully this will set the pattern for the expansion of in-country training in Botswana.

Another large group of returned participants consists of those placed in various American institutions by the United States Department of Agriculture (16% of all participants and 18% of respondents) for special or orientation training.

Table III shows the percentages of people sent to other African countries and the United States. Although it is AID policy to place students within Africa wherever possible, it can be seen that the majority of participants received their training in the United States, and that Third World training establishments were only utilised for special and orientation training. This latter finding is due to the difficulty of placing Batswana for longer courses in Africa's crowded universities.

Table III

Percentages of people sent to other African countries and the United States

	Africa (and Philippines)	United States
Academic	0 (0%)	21 (34%)
Special	3 (5%)	29 (47%)
Orientation	5 (8%)	4 (6%)
Total	8 (13%)	54 (87%)

BEST AVAILABLE COPY

5.3 (c) How relevant was the training?

5.3.1 Job relevance

Table IV demonstrates that academic and special courses were approximately equally relevant to the occupations held by the respondents immediately after they returned to Botswana. The data concerning their current positions (where these differed from those they occupied on their return - 24% of respondents had changed their jobs at least once) is shown on Table V, but in this case there are too few observations to allow any conclusions to be drawn.

Table IV

Relevance of different types of training to occupation held immediately after participants return to Botswana

	Academic	Special	Orient-ation	Total
"nearly all" 80 - 100%	6 (28%)	12 (39%)	1 (11%)	19 (31%)
"most" 60 - 80%	8 (38%)	10 (32%)	3 (33%)	21 (34%)
"about half" 40 - 60%	4 (19%)	3 (10%)	4 (44%)	11 (18%)
"a bit" 20 - 40%	2 (10%)	2 (6%)	0 (0%)	4 (6%)
"hardly any" 0 - 20%	1 (5%)	4 (13%)	1 (11%)	6 (10%)
Total	21(100%)	31(100%)	9(100%)	62(100%)

It is very encouraging to observe that the majority (65%) of respondents thought that "most" or "nearly all" of their training was relevant and useful to their occupation when they returned. This result is paradoxical when taken in conjunction with the finding that 34% of these people were disappointed with the training they received - even though much of it was useful. This apparent contradiction is resolved when one realises that many respondents felt that their training, while useful, did not contain sufficient relevant information.

Table V

Relevance of different types of training to current occupation (where this is different to that represented in Table IV)

	Academic	Special	Orient-ation	Total
"nearly all" 80 - 100%	1 (20%)	4 (40%)	0 (0%)	5 (33%)
"most" 60 - 80%	2 (40%)	4 (40%)	0 (0%)	6 (40%)
"about half" 40 - 60%	1 (20%)	1 (10%)	0 (0%)	2 (13%)
"a bit" 20 - 40%	1 (20%)	1 (10%)	0 (0%)	2 (13%)
"hardly any" 0 - 20%	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)
Total	5(100%)	10(100%)	0(100%)	15(100%)

5.3.2 Suggested Improvements

The protocols from interviews as well as the answers to the items in Section 8 on the questionnaire (which invited suggestions for inclusions and exclusions from the curricula of the training courses) make the previous point clear.

(i) Inclusions

64% of the respondents suggested improvements that could have been made to their courses in the form of inclusions. These suggested improvements fall into 4 main categories (which are not, of course, exclusive)

(a) 9% would have preferred more administrative courses
(b) 11% would have liked more information concerning teaching aids and methods
(c) 21% were vexed at the lack of relevance of the examples used in their training to conditions in Botswana
(d) 7% would have preferred more practical work

The other additions mentioned were variously psychiatric nursing, planning, computer programming, mathematics, basic science, and English.

BEST AVAILABLE COPY

(ii) Exclusions

On the other hand 45% mentioned parts of their training that they thought were unnecessary:

(a) the largest category was those people who studied for Bachelor's degrees. They all found certain of their required "non-core" courses superfluous and felt that they would have profited more from extra tuition in their major subjects instead.

(b) the cases where the waiver system failed to operate to prevent some nurses attending classes with whose content they were already familiar

(c) information specific to conditions in the United States only - people studying nursing or agriculture were dealing with equipment and facilities far in advance of anything they could hope to meet in Botswana in the near future.

Recommendation 4

It is recommended that participants should be advised and encouraged to select their optional non-core courses with care in order to include, if available, only those subjects which will benefit them subsequently when they return to Botswana. Administrative and teaching or communication courses are particularly recommended as suitable subjects to be included, wherever possible, in participants' curricula. This argument will be taken up again in Section 5.4.1.

5.4 (d) To what use is the information gained during training being put at the moment?

5.4.1 Fulfilment of PIO/P's (Project Implementation Orders for Participants)

The purpose and justification of training each participant is established by AID in conjunction with the Directorate of Personnel and the Ministries involved before the participant embarks upon his or her training course. This information is specified in the PIO/P. Certain requirements with regard to course content are identified by the Government for AID to fulfil. For its part the Government undertakes to provide employment for returned participants so that they can utilise their new skills as fully as possible. In most cases (82%) the two parties to this agreement carried out the responsibilities they

had undertaken - as far as this could be ascertained from the information obtained from the respondents. The exceptions to this overall history of success are described below.

Example

Mr. Baitsile has been an instructor at the Botswana Training Centre for seven years. He instructs lower and middle level personnel in various aspects of stockroom management. He was sent away for 7 weeks in early 1978 to Malawi to attend a course entitled "Training of Trainers in Management". His PIO/P stated that "...he stands to benefit a great deal from attending this course which...will materially widen his background in management...the concepts learnt will be employed in carrying out his own in-service courses...".
In fact Mr. Baitsile was confused and distressed about the course and suggested that some misunderstanding might have arisen concerning the course title. While he had expected to be trained in training stockroom and other managers and had anticipated a course comprised of teaching aids and methods, he received a management course including many concepts far in advance of anything he is ever expected to teach. He opined that an administrator or an economist would have benefited far more. Consequently he was unable to understand the terminology used in the greater part of the training and "only settled down in the fifth week when we did the practical study work".

Example

Sister Chakalisa is a staff nurse at Lobatse Mental Hospital; David Poonyane teaches in-service trainees in Psychiatric Nursing at Lobatse. In September 1978 they spent eight days in Nigeria at the Pan African Psychiatry Conference. Their PIO/P stated "...it is hoped that the information gained will be useful in the expansion of the psychiatric service in the country...(they will) gain insight into how other countries handle their mental health problems....what approach to adopt in the preventative, promotive, and rehabilitative aspects of health care...".
In fact the content of the papers presented was almost exclusively concerned with new psychoactive drugs and drug regimes and only two papers dealt with comparative psychiatry in Africa. Both participants thought that Botswana should have been represented by a psychiatrist rather than two nurses, because they are not able or required to (i) prescribe or (ii) understand the drugs given to the patients under their care.

BEST AVAILABLE COPY

Example

Rose Makgoeng was still at university and Mrs. Manyeneng was a registered nurse midwife when they were selected to go to Massechusetts for eighteen months to study Health Education to Bachelor's level. They were to return to Botswana to join the newly formed Health Education Unit. While their training dealt with most of the information that they would have to impart, they were given no training whatsoever in teaching. Yet their major duty is to produce booklets and posters and to plan and conduct lectures and seminars. Both participants felt very disadvantaged by their lack of training in teaching methods and visual aids.

Example

James Masokwane is a Ranch Extension Officer and Gaseitsiwe Seitshiro is the Acting Range Ecologist at the Ministry of Agriculture. They both went to New Mexico in August 1975 to study for their BSc in Range Management. Their PIO/P suggested that administrative subjects should be included in their training. However, although both men were generally happy with their training, neither received any instruction in administration.

Example

Mr. Gulubane is presently working as the Water Engineer in the Ministry of Agriculture. His case presents some problems because on the one hand he was satisfied with his training and is philosophical about its lack of application to the work he is doing. On the other hand, his superiors have voiced their anxiety about the fact that he appears not to have the knowledge necessary to do his job properly. He went to South Dakota in May 1976 to read for a BSc in Agricultural Engineering. His PIO/P states that "the focus of the training...should be on the land and water aspect...Specific training in small and intermediate size pond construction and in borehole operations and maintenance is essential...training in advanced theory (should) not be included...public administration, bookkeeping, report writing, personnel administration, and budgeting would be useful...".
In fact he received what amounted to a basic engineering degree with a great deal of background science theory and only a small number (10% approximately) of "water-related" subjects - and no administrative training at all.

Example

Mr. Morapedi is a Planning Officer in the Ministry of Agriculture. In July 1978 he went to Washington on a six week course in "Agricultural Policy Making and Analysis". While he enjoyed his training he feels that he was the wrong person to attend it because, as a Planning Officer in his Ministry, he is not responsible for policy making, and has no influence on the policy makers. His role is to implement their decisions. As he sees no possibility in the near future of being in a position to utilise his training, he has returned frustrated to his former duties.
Incidentally, his PIO/P refers to a completely different course to the one he attended: this was one concerned with Extension, which would have been completely inappropriate for a Planning Officer to attend.

Example

John Mfosi has resigned from the Directorate of Personnel. He is now working as the Personnel Manager of the Gaborone Town Council. His PIO/P states that he should be offered a course at degree level so that he could return to head the newly established Manpower Planning Unit and replace the expatriate there. However, he only attended a three month course and returned to his previous position. His frustration, disillusion, and exasperation with the system in which he was working led to his resignation.

Recommendation 5

It is recommended that, where at all possible, all participants who are likely to have administrative duties when they return, should have either (i) administration courses as required parts of their degrees, or (ii) routinely attend special administration training courses either in their country of training, or immediately on their return to Botswana .

Recommendation 6

Similarly, it is recommended that all participants who will be expected formally to pass on the information they have gained during training should have either (i) a communications course included in their training, or (ii) should routinely attend such a course either while they are abroad or soon after they return to Botswana.

BEST AVAILABLE COPY

Recommendation 7

It is recommended that there should be more dicussion about the training course content with potential participants prior to their embarking on their training, or even before a course is selected finally. This would both reduce the disorientation felt by several participants who "did not know why I was there", and also ensure that people are not sent on irrelevant courses.

5.4.2 Career Progress and Change

(i) Promotion and Responsibility

The effects of training upon the careers of the returned participants was generally encouraging, as Tables VI and VII demonstrate.

Table VI

Career Progress

	No change	1 Change	2 or more changes	Total
Academic	5 (8%)	8 (13%)	8 (13%)	21
Special	16 (26%)	13 (21%)	3 (5%)	32
Orientation	9 (14%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	9
Total	30 (48%)	21 (34%)	11 (18%)	62

Table VII

Increase in Responsibility

	No change in responsibility	More responsibility	Total
Academic	6 (10%)	15 (24%)	21
Special	14 (23%)	18 (29%)	32
Orientation	9 (14%)	0 (0%)	9
Total	29 (47%)	33 (53%)	62

Over 50% found that they were employed in a higher position to that which they occupied before they left the country, and 53% had had

an increase in the responsibility that they were expected to shoulder in their work.

As expected academic degree training was comparatively more effective in promoting career progress than the special training courses; and orientation training had no effect whatsoever. Career advancement appeared, therefore, to be directly related to the total amount of time spent on training.

In keeping with the above results, 48% of all respondents felt that their training had made no difference to their future promotion prospects. Surprisingly this figure included three returned participants who received degree training. They commented that they would have advanced just as far if they had remained in Botswana. In fact this was a remark made by several other respondents, though it in no way reflects on the success of the training programmes per se. It instead implies a criticism of the Directorate of Personnel who are responsible for salary increases and promotions. This point will be discussed further below.

In most cases (90%) the returned participants were still being employed in the fields for which they were trained. Exceptions are of two main types: Firstly those people who appear to have been sent on the "wrong" course; and secondly those people who have been promoted <u>beyond</u> their original training objectives and whose occupations are now largely administrative. The former cases have already been discussed above in Section 5.3.1. The latter include the Permanent Secretary of the Ministry of Education, the Chief Animal Production Manager in the Ministry of Agriculture, and the Assistant Matron at Botswana's main hospital. These people attended vocational rather than administrative courses.

As mentioned previously, only 55% of the returned participants to date are living and working in and around the capital of Gaborone. This means that much of the training is being utilised where, it can be argued, it is most needed, i.e., in the rural areas.

<u>(ii) Salary</u>

Only 29% received formal recognition of their training in the form of a salary increase in <u>addition</u> to that which would have accrued

to them automatically over time (see Table VIII). 50% have received no increment at all since they returned, though the majority of these people were those who attended special and orientation training.

Table VIII

Salary increments received since participants returned from training.

	No increment	Unrelated increment	Related increment	Total
Academic	1 (2%)	9 (14%)	11 (18%)	21
Special	21 (34%)	4 (6%)	7 (11%)	32
Orientation	9 (14%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	9
Total	31 (50%)	13 (21%)	18 (29%)	62

(iii) Directorate of Personnel

There appear to be no guiding principles underlying the Directorate of Personnel's treatement of each returned participant. Its policy is therefore difficult to ascertain. For example, some nurses who underwent Maternal/Child Health and Family Planning training were immediately promoted to sister, senior sister, or even matron (with attendant salary increases) when they returned to Botswana; while the status and salary of others were unaltered.

Several respondents were indignant of their treatment as regards salary in particular, and all who attended the longer special courses and degree training drew the distinction between "a promotion that I should have earned by getting my degree/diploma" and "a promotion I should get from working better with the skills I learnt while I was away". It appears that the Directorate of Personnel is reluctant to recognise either of these principles.

There appears to be some confusion in the Directorate concerning salary scales. Two people who returned with BSc's in Health Education are employed on different salary scales at the Health Education Centre - one is on the nurses' scale, and the other on the technician

scale. The five Nurse Practitioners seem to present a special problem for the Directorate. None of them has received any recognition of their advanced training because the exact status of a Nurse Practitioner is not understood by the Directorate of Personnel.

The Directorate of Personnel is clearly a major stumbling block to the successful utilisation by Government of the skills provided via AID training programmes in Botswana.

Recommendation 8

It is recommended that many people would benefit if senior personnel in the Directorate went for training in administration, personnel matters, and manpower planning. Mr. Mfosi (mentioned below in Section 5.5.1) returned from his training in these subjects full of ideas and enthusiasm, but was unable to implement any of his plans because of his junior status.

5.4.3 Effect of training on job performance

The majority of returned participants felt that there had been either a "slight" (35%) or a "great" (50%) positive effect of their training on their performance at work (see Table IX). Predictably it was again those who had received academic degree training who felt the greatest benefits, though 50% of those who embarked upon special courses also thought that there had been a substantial improvement in their work.

Table IX

Change in job performance

	Training made no difference	Changed slightly	Changed a great deal	Total
Academic	2 (3%)	4 (6%)	15 (24%)	21
Special	3 (5%)	13 (21%)	16 (26%)	32
Orientation	4 (6%)	5 (8%)	0 (0%)	9
Total	9 (14%)	22 (35%)	31 (50%)	62

BEST AVAILABLE COPY

These figure are encouraging if they reflect a real improvement in the standards of performance of the Ministries represented by the returned participants in question.

A majority of respondents (66%) reported that they were planning, or had already instituted certain changes in their workplace. In some cases the changes were of an administrative nature (for example, the Farm Manager from the Ministry of Agriculture's experimental farm who has initiated record keeping for the first time!) and, as mentioned earlier, many people commented favourably on the administrative parts of their training and would have preferred more administrative courses. However, there have also been substantial technical or professional innovations. Many of the nurses have begun new clinics, introduced certain screening procedures and follow up studies, and have started informal in-service training for their juniors. There are also plans for more staff and student participation in the decisions taken by the Gaborone Town Council and the Botswana Agricultural College. Two other returned participants reported that they were planning to arrange meetings of people of like occupation in order to exchange ideas and experiences. Enquiries are also underway into the possibility of purchasing new equipment for the operating theatre at the hospital in Gaborone, and for the Agricultural Information Unit.

Those who had made no appreciable changes and were not planning any (34%) were not less motivated than the majority. On the contrary, many of them were too overworked to contemplate adding to their responsibilities. This fact accounts for the relatively poor result

Table X

Percentage of those making or planning changes in their workplace as a direct result of their training.

	Yes	No	Total
Academic	10 (16%)	10 (16%)	20 (36%)++
Special	23 (41%)	5 (9%)	28 (50%)
Orientation	4 (7%)	4 (7%)	8 (14%)
Total	37 (66%)	19 (34%)	56(100%)

++Calculated on an individual participant basis rather than on a single course basis.

in terms of innovativeness on the part of those who were sent for academic training. However, some returned participants found that they were not in sufficiently senior positions for implementing new ideas.

5.4.4 Dissemination of knowledge and potential influence

The stated objective that the information gained from training should be as widely disseminated as possible has been met to a large extent by these programmes. Many returned participants are currently involved in formal (55%) training of their juniors, and others (25%) are passing on new information to their colleagues informally. (see Table XI). The group who felt that they had no opportunity of imparting their knowledge was mostly composed of those who were constrained by time and staff shortages.

Table XI

Dissemination of information gained during training

	Formally	Informally	None	Total
Academic	13 (23%)	5 (10%)	2 (3%)	20++
Special	15 (27%)	7 (13%)	6 (11%)	28
Orientation	3 (5%)	2 (3%)	3 (5%)	8
Total	31 (55%)	14 (25%)	11 (20%)	56

++ Calculated on an individual participant basis rather than on a single course basis.

This large percentage of returned participants who are involved in formal and informal pedagogical activity further strengthens the recommendation made earlier that some classes in teaching and communication be automatically included with the longer training courses.

5.4.5 Promotion prospects and aspirations

52% of the returned participants thought that their promotion prospects had improved as a result of their training. These respondents were mostly those who had attended academic and the longer of the special courses leading to diplomas (see Table XII). The responses to the items concerning aspirations were fairly

Table XII

Promotion Prospects

	Helped greatly	Helped	Slight help	No difference
Academic	9 (14%)	5 (8%)	4 (6%)	3 (5%)
Special	8 (13%)	1 (2%)	5 (8%)	18 (29%)
Orientation	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	0 (0%)	9 (14%)
Total	17 (27%)	6 (10%)	9 (14%)	30 (48%)

predictable. Given the close correlation between training/qualifications and salary/status mentioned earlier, many of the respondents (34%) expressed their desire for further training at home or abroad. In addition, given the fact that Government is by far the largest employer in Botswana, offering job security and adequate income, most respondents indicated the likelihood of their continuing in public service.

5.5 (e) Did the participants have any problems either prior to or during their training?

5.5.1 Notification and Orientation

Only eight (14%) respondents complained that they thought that there had been an unnecessary delay between the date of their selection and the date of arrival in their country of training. In general it appeared that this aspect of the programme was handled well. However, some (8%) respondents were given very little notice of their impending departure because course places were confirmed at the last moment.

An orientation course is conducted in Washington for participants attending US institutions. Many participants spent a period of up to two weeks there prior to departing for their training institution. Orientation appears to consist of various talks about currency, climate, and the political and social situation in the United States at that time, as well as a general tourists' introduction to Washington DC itself.

All respondents benefited from this interlude, though some (12%) were unable to attend it. This was either because their training was

deemed too brief to merit extensive detailed orientation, or because placements were finalised at short notice and participants went straight to their training institutions to commence training. In some cases participants even missed the beginning of their courses. Conversely some (7%) attended the Washington orientation when there was no need because they had lived in, or visited, the United States previously.

Two people spontaneously suggested that it would have been better to have received the greater part of this orientation information before leaving Botswana, and that, while enjoyable, the larger portion could have been dispensed with. Much of the information came too late to be of any use to the participants. For example, in Botswana it is assumed that all boarding establishments provide bedding for their students. Not so in every American institution. If participants had known this in advance they would have been able to bring their own sheets and blankets with them, instead of spending much of their initial stipend on such items.

Recommendation 9

It is recommended that the necessity of such an elaborate orientation exercise be investigated. It is questionable whether a whole week is necessary for participants attending special courses, because many of them are accommodated in hotels as opposed to having to fend for themselves on their stipends. Perhaps it could be replaced, for these participants at least, by a lengthy briefing interview given by AID representatives in Botswana prior to their departure. This interview could be supported by leaflets containing appropriate information relevant to that participant's course and destination. If such a scheme were introduced for all participants it would also ensure that they had all the information they might need before they left Botswana.

5.5.2 General living conditions and the day-to-day running of the programmes

(i) Accommodation and Finances

Generally people were happy with their accommodation, though all found it expensive, and several found opportunities to move to cheaper accommodation. Similarly most (64%) people managed easily on their stipends and per diems. There were, however, a few isolated cases of hardship.

Example

The first concerns three members of the National Health Institute who were sent to Dillard University in New Orleans to study for a BSc in Advanced Nursing. In their final year of training they were informed by the Meharry representatives who were administering their placements that their stipend was to be cut by 40% (i.e., from $382 to $229 per month). The reason given was that when they commenced training there was no established allowance for Dillard students. So they were allocated the same amount as students attending a university nearby. But later the Dillard rate was reviewed and set at $229 per month. To the researcher as well as all the people who became involved in contesting this reduction (the Dean of the University and an organisation called SECID), this seems a drastic cut - especially since the student accommodation in which the girls were living cost $200 per month alone. However, none of the intervention that was attempted to avert this cutback was successful and the girls were forced to move out of their rooms and share a single room in somebody's basement until they had completed their courses. Fortunately they all managed to perform outstandingly in their examinations.

They have still not received any reimbursement to compensate them for their hardship, nor a full explanation for what occurred. Incidentally, one of these three fell ill in the middle of her training. But when she went to a doctor for treatment he refused to accept an AID insurance form. Apparently no doctor in New Orleans will accept such forms as surety for payment. He insisted she should pay her fees in advance and then reclaim from AID herself, because he was not willing to endure the long delays that reputedly result with AID health payments. This prediction was borne out subsequently when she attempted to reclaim - she had a great deal of trouble and finally only received 70% of the costs incurred.

Example

A second complaint came from the Permanent Secretary from the Ministry of Local Government and Lands. AID had been requested to meet part of his travel costs and his per diem allowance during his study tour of the United States. However, the per diem provided by AID compares poorly with that which he would have received from the Government ($35 as opposed to $75 per day) and only covered his accommodation in an inexpensive hotel. However, as he was asked to host the later discussions in one international seminar he attended, and

was forced to chair meetings in his hotel room, it was necessary for him to move to a more prestigious establishment and meet the extra costs himself.

The researcher feels that since the assistance provided served also as a diplomatic gesture, and since the man in question was also touring the United States with a view to expanding his Ministry's involvement in AID education programmes, it would have been appropriate to have provided for this participant more handsomely. In his case the diplomatic gesture was lost in the resentment engendered by the participant's felt hardship.

Example

A doctor from the Ministry of Health at an international conference in Nairobi, and two nursing sisters at a different international conference in Manila also had problems managing their hotel bills on their per diem. All three felt that it would have caused fewer problems if their allowance had been calculated taking into account the prices of the hotels they would have to stay it.

Example

Similarly, another participant arrived at his destination several weeks before the university accommodation was open and had to spend his settling in allowance on staying in a hotel. He claims that this meant that he had to borrow winter clothes from his colleagues.

Other problems were caused either by the allowance arriving up to a month late (12%) (one participant - the Town Clerk of Gaborone - was forced to remain in Pittsburg a week after his short course had finished, waiting for his allowance to arrive so that he could pay his hotel bills), or by participants not having sufficient information about currency restrictions, etc. in their country of placement.

Admittedly some respondents complained of insufficient funds because they were unable to manage efficiently on a perfectly adequate allowance. However, the cases cited above appear to be true cases of hardship. It must be realised that when people are abroad, they are in most cases totally dependent upon their stipends or per diems. A great deal of real distress can be caused by delays, reductions, or insufficient funds.

Recommendation 10

It is recommended that prices of hotels etc. should be investigated prior to a per diem being set for special and orientation training courses. The calculations should take into account that in the case of international conferences the accommodation that is normally available is likely to be occupied and participants may have to stay at more expensive hotels.

Recommendation 11

It is strongly recommended that the administration of stipends should be improved so that they always arrive promptly.

Recommendation 12

Stipends set for various institutions in different parts of the United States should be reviewed regularly, with particular reference to the availability and cost of suitable accommodation.

It seems a pity that AID should be so lavish with their Washington orientation and yet stint their generosity for individual participants' stipends and per diems.

(ii) The Institution

Most respondents were happy with the institution to which they had been sent. The exceptions were few (20%) and consisted mostly of those who attended the more advanced courses at the Meharry Medical College. They complained that their instructors were not sufficiently qualified or experienced to teach courses at this level. Five of these nurses who attended the Nurse Practitioner course at Meharry were badly mistreated in addition to allegedly receiving poor tuition, and their case will be described in full below. Some participants from the Ministry of Agriculture would have preferred larger institutions with a bigger choice of subjects; it was necessary for them to travel to different schools to attend certain of their courses.

Example

Five nurses attended the Nurse Practitioner course of approximately one year's duration. The first part of their training was obtained from Meharry Medical College. As theirs was an advanced training course many of their classes were taken with medical students. However, their status as potential medical practitioners was not recognised

either by the other students, or by the instructors. They felt that they were discriminated against because they were nurses and claimed that the instructors ignored them to the extent of marking their practical examinations without looking at what they had done. They also reported the only case of colour prejudice such that the white students refused to allow the black ones to practise on them. These problems were, however, minor compared to the fact that they were required to be on duty continuously for 36 hours every fourth day - this in addition to attending their normal classes. Although only 284 nursing hours were required for completion of their Adult Nursing course, they all worked 960 hours ! These long periods of duty were not even spent in gaining useful experience relevant to their training. Instead, they were required to perform tasks more menial than those that would have fallen to them in Botswana.

One girl reported that during her medical practise outside the College she received no supervision whatsoever from the doctor to whom she was assigned. The doctor apparently just appeared every so often to collect the money that patients had paid for the nurse's services.

These five girls were unanimous in their condemnation of the Meharry establishment. In fact they were independently unanimous (three returned questionnaires from remote rural areas) in their criticisms of the same occurrences, which lends extra credence to their complaints.

Recommendation 13

It is strongly recommended that participants are contacted regularly by their AID representatives in the United States and that strict monitoring of their practical workload is undertaken to guard against such exploitation occurring in the future.

5.5.3 Academic Problems

Most respondents (91%) found their previous education to be sufficient to the demands of their training, though 30% would have preferred some background training prior to commencing and felt a deficiency in some subjects. Some (15%) went for "remedial training" in mathematics or basic nursing subjects before embarking on their main courses. But in spite of this, 16% still experienced difficulty with the numerical aspects of their training. However, in no case did this problem present

an insurmountable obstacle, and participants were never alone in their difficulties.

Approximately half of the respondents (46%) found their courses to be "slightly" or "quite" difficult (see Table XIII) but this was discovered to be largely due to the quantity of the material they were expected to digest (18%) and the unfamiliarity of the presentation of the subject matter (13%), as opposed to the abstract level of the course content. In this latter respect it should be noted that primary, secondary, and further education in Botswana is traditional in many ways: information is spoon-fed to the students, learnt by rote in many cases, to be regurgitated at an appointed time. There is little student participation at school or university level. Consequently, some of the "workshop" type courses were found to be intimidating to be participants from Botswana. Similarly, some respondent mentioned that even on their degree courses the presentation of the material caused them difficulties initially.

Recommendation 14

It is recommended that short special courses with "unfamiliar" non-traditional presentation and content be avoided in the future. Much time is wasted in initial orientation and little can be learnt by a confused and intimidated student.

Table XIII

Academic problems with training

very easy	3	5%	30 (54%)
quite easy	10	18%	
slightly easy	17	30%	
slightly difficult	10	18%	26 (46%)
quite difficult	15	27%	
very difficult	1	2%	

Another problem of orientation consisted of the "hidden curriculum" in American education such that some basi knowledge is taken for granted. Abbreviations, jargon, some basic technical facts, and the

use of examples from US culture to illustrate lectures all contributed towards difficulties in this area.

On the other hand some respondents (5%) found their training very easy due to the fact that much of it was redundant as a result of their previous education and experience. However, this level of redundancy was rare because of the system of waivers which operates in most institutions.

5.5.4 Expectations and preferences regarding training

In response to the open-ended question "was the training as you expected?", 30% replied that it was better than they expected and 28 % that it was not as good as they had hoped. This item elicited many comments (as it was intended to) which have been dealt with above in Section 5.3 concerning the relevance of training.

Only a few said that they thought that some of their training could have been received in Botswana at the time at which they went away. The Institute of Development Management was mentioned as one of the possible institutions that could fulfil some requirements. The National Health Institute was also suggested as an alternative source of training by the respondents.

Recommendation 15

It is recommended that the cost-effectiveness of these programmes might be improved if some special courses could be conducted in Botswana, using the facilities of the University of Botswana and Swaziland and the Botswana Training Centre as well as those institutions mentioned above. The money spent on sending participants abroad and maintaining them there could be used either to institute new courses for which the Ministries felt a need, or even to supply expatriate tutors for short periods for specific courses. In this way it could be ensured that courses fulfil the specific needs of Botswana, thereby eliminating the redundancy that inevitably occurred in the United States where American examples and practical experience were employed in the training. In this connection, 13% suggested that they would have preferred to have had their practical training in Botswana.

6 Review of Recommendations

1. It is recommended that a brief, readable report of the results of AID scholarship programmes in Botswana be produced and circulated around the Ministries, with particular emphasis on the Ministry of Education, in order to counter that Ministry's accusation of "inflexibility" on the part of AID.

2. It is recommended that greater efforts be made to foster closer relations with the Ministry of Education, with a view to increasing consultation and cooperation regarding nominations for further training from that Ministry.

3. It is recommended that the principle of "job-selection" be reviewed in the light of its unpopularity with members of the Ministry of Education, with a view to reaching a compromise such that more placements are advertised within appropriate Ministries.

4. It is recommended that participants should be advised and encouraged to select their optional non-core courses with care in order to include only those subjects which will benefit them subsequent to their return to Botswana.

5. It is recommended that all participants who are likely to have administrative duties when they return should have <u>either</u> (i) administrative courses as required parts of their degrees, <u>or</u> (ii) should routinely attend special administrative courses either in their country of training, or immediately on their return to Botswana.

6. Similarly, all participants who will be expected formally to pass on the information gained during training should have <u>either</u> (i) a teaching course included in their training, <u>or</u> (ii) should routinely attend such a course before assuming their duties in Botswana.

7. It is recommended that the content of the training curriculum should be discussed fully with each participant before he or she embarks on a training programme, or even before such a training programme is selected. This would both reduce the disorientation felt by several participants, and also ensure that people are not sent on irrelevant courses.

8. It is recommended that many people would benefit if senior members of the Directorate of Personnel went for training in administration, personnel matters and manpower planning. At present the Directorate is a major stumbling block to a successful manpower development programme in Botswana.

9. It is recommended that the necessity of the Washington orientation exercise for people going on shorter courses be reviewed, with the intention of replacing it with lengthy briefing interviews given by AID representatives in Botswana, prior to a participant's departure to their country of training.

10. It is recommended that prices of hotels etc. should be investigated prior to a per diem being set for special and orientation training. The calculations should take into account that, in the case of international conferences, the accommodation that is normally available is likely to be occupied, and participants may have to stay in more expensive hotels.

11. It is strongly recommended that the administration of stipends should be improved so that they always arrive promptly.

12. Stipends set for various institutions in different parts of the United States should be reviewed regularly, with particular reference to the availability and cost of suitable accommodation.

13. It is strongly recommended that participants are contacted regularly by their AID representative in the United States and that strict monitoring of their practical workload is undertaken.

14. It is recommended that short special courses with "unfamiliar non-traditional presentation and content be avoided in the future.

15. It is recommended that the cost-effectiveness of these programmes might be increased if some special courses could be conducted in Botswana using the facilities of the University, the National Health Institute, the Institute of Development Management, and the Botswana Training Centre. The money spent on sending people abroad and maintaining them there could be used to initiate new courses for which the Ministries felt a need, or even to supply expatriate tutors for short periods for specific courses. In this way it could be ensured that training

BEST AVAILABLE COPY

fulfils the specific needs of Botswana, thereby eliminating the redundancy that inevitably occurred in the United States, where American examples and practical experience were employed during training.

Dr. D. Clement-Jones

United States of America
Agency for International Development
PO Box 90, Gaborone.

Please answer every question and return to the above address by 1 May 1979

1.	a. Name (please underline family name)	b. Date of Birth c. Sex
	d. Education (total number of years of education completed)	e. Highest Educational Level Attained (excluding training covered in this questionnaire)
2.	Details of Training a. Name of Institution	
	b. Duration of Training	c. Field of Study
	d. Subjects Studied (please list the main subjects that were included in your training course)	
	e. Qualification Obtained (Degree, Diploma, Certificate, etc.)	
3.	a. Date of Selection for Training	b. Date of Arrival in Country of Training
	c. Did you feel there was an unnecessary length of time between these two dates ?	
4.	a. How difficult did you find the training course? (please tick) very easy quite easy slightly easy	very difficult quite difficult slightly difficult
	b. Which of the following things caused problems for you during training? (please tick) knowledge of English knowledge of Mathematics lack of previous training in subjects studied during training something else - what?	

4. c. Were you sent for additional background education before you started your training?

d. How long was this additional training?

e. What subjects were studied?

f. Did you find your previous education was enough for you to handle the training course?

5. a. Was the training what you expected? (please tick)

better than I expected
as I expected
not as good as expected

b. Do you think that you could have received part of your training in Botswana? Which parts?

c. Do you think it would have been better to have sent you somewhere else for training, either to a different country, or different institution?

d. Where would it have been better to have sent you? Please give your reasons.

6. a How much information were you given about the following before you left Botswana?

	enough information	a little information	no information
climate and clothing			
food			
where you would live			
money, etc.			

b. Did you have enough money?

c. How did you feel about your fellow students? Did you like them? Did you make many friends? Did you feel excluded or left out? Please give details.

7. a. What was your job before leaving Botswana?(please give dates)

7. b. What was your job when you returned to Botswana after training?(dates)

c. What is your present job?

d. Have your responsibilities changed since you returned to Botswana? (please tick)

more responsibility
no change in responsibility
less responsibility

e. Did you receive an increase in salary directly related to your training under this project?

f. Do you feel that this training has helped your chances for promotion? (please tick)

greatly helped
helped
slightly helped
made no difference

8. a. How much of the training course is useful for your present job? (please tick)

nearly all of it (80 - 100%)
most of it (60 - 80%)
about half of it (40 - 60%)
a bit of it (20 - 40%)
hardly any of it (0 - 20%)

b. How much of the training was useful for the job you had just after you returned to Botswana, if different from your present job?(please tick)

nearly all of it (80 - 100%)
most of it (60 - 80%)
about half of it (40 - 60%)
a bit of it (20 - 40%)
hardly any of it (0 - 20%)

c. Which parts of your training do you feel were the most useful?

d. Which parts were the least useful?

e. Are there any subjects which you feel should have been included in your training? Which subjects do you think would have been more useful?

9. a. How has your training changed the ways in which you do your job? (please tick)

changed them a great deal
changed them slightly
made no difference

b. Are you using any new techniques or methods that you were taught during training? Please give details.

c. Please give details of any changes you may be planning in your place of work in the future that are related to your training.

d. Have you had any opportunity to pass on your training to others?

e. Have you been formally involved in training other people? How many have you trained since your return to Botswana?

f. Do you feel that it would be useful to increase the opportunities for passing on your training to others?

10. a. Do you intend to stay in Botswana?

b. Do you intend to remain working for Government?

c. What do you hope to be doing in 5 years' time?

Thank you very much for your help.
Debbie Clement-Jones.

Ministry	Name	Information	Previous Occupation	Date sent for training	Duration of training	Subjects and Qualification	Institution	Present Occupation
AGRICULTURE	Maloiso	I	Instructor Botswana Agricultural College	12/73	2 yrs	BSc Animal Science MSc Educat. Agric.	Western Illinois University	Principal of Botswana Agricultural College
	Kemsley	I	Instructor BAC	12/73	2 yrs	BSc Ag/Mech./Eng MSc Eng./Educat.	Western Illinois University	Lecturer Botswana Agricultural College
	Mokone	CX	Asst. Marketing Officer	1/76	2 yrs	BSc Agric. Economics	New Mexico State University	(presently in Lesotho)
	Seitshiro	I	District Agric. Officer	8/75	2½yrs	BSc Range Science/ Management	University of Arizona	Acting Range Ecologist
	Masokwane	O	Animal Production Officer	9/75	3 yrs	BSc Range Management	New Mexico State University	Ranch Extension Officer (Francistown)
	Pilane	I	Planning Officer	8/76	2 yrs	MSc Agric. Economics	Oklahoma State University	Same
	Kwerepe	QX	Animal Production Officer	5/76	2 yrs 3 m	BSc Range Managemt Range Managemt. and Forage Prod.	Fort Haves State University	(stationed in Maun)
	Morei	I	Farm Manager	5/76	2½yrs	BSc Agribusiness	Western Illinois Universuty	Acting Estate Manager
	Gulubane	I	Technical Officer	6/76	2½yrs	BSc Agric. Engineering	South Dakota States University	Water Engineer
	Mudarikirie	Q	Farm Management Supervisor	6/78	6 wk	Enumerator Training	United States Dept. Agric.	Technical Officer Farm Management
	Mukuwa	Q	District Agric. Officer	5/78	3 m	Aquatic Weed Control	United States Dept. Agric.	Aquatic Weed Control Officer

AGRICULTURE CONTD.	Oageng	I	Extension Officer	5/78	10wk	Agricultural Extension	USDA	Same
	Taukobong	OX	Crop Marketing Officer	6/78	6 wk	Grain Storage and Marketing	USDA	(away in the field)
	Mosinyi	I	Graphic Artist	7/78	6 wk	Graphic Design	USDA	Same
	Bingana	I	Chief Aminal Prod. Officer (Veterinary Asst)	3/78 1964	6 wk 3 yrs	Admin. Organisatn. Development BSc Animal Science	Cleveland	Same Chief Animal Production Officer
	Tlale	I	Deputy Director Agriculture	3/78	6 wk	Admin. Organisatn. Development	Cleveland	Same
	Moranyane	I	Agric. Information Officer	6/78	18wk	Agricultural Extension	USDA	Same
	Morapedi	I	Planning Officer	7/78	6 wk	Agric. Policy and Analysis	Washington	Same
	Nkwe	CX	Research Assistant	9/78	3 wk	Rural Sociology Workshop	Nairobi	(Manchester University for training now)
	Batsoghile	I	Staff Training Officer	10/78	2 m	Agric. Training Development	USDA	Same
LOCAL GOVERNMENT AND LANDS	Temane	I	Permanent Secretary	11/78	5 wk	Study tour	Wisconsin and Cornell	Same
	Njavera	OX	Social Welfare Officer	10/78	9 wk	Design etc. of Rural Devel. Progs.	USDA	Same (Francistown)
	Lekoko	O	Clerical Officer	10/78	9 wk	Ditto	USDA	Asst. Land Board Training Officer
	Modibedi	O	Admin. Secretary Barolong Farms	10/78	9 wk	Ditto	USDA	Same
	Leteane	I	Town Clerk	10/78	1 m	Leadership Seminar	Pittsburg	Same

EDUCATION	Masogo	I	Research and Testing Centre	8/71	1½yrs	M. Education	Pittsburg	Permanent Secretary
	Masie	I	Teacher	8/71	1½yrs	M. Education	Pittsburg	Research Officer (Research and Testing Centre)
	Lecoge	I	Teacher	8/74	1½yrs	M. Education	Pttsburg	Ditto
	Madibame	I	Research and Testing Centre	4/74	1½yrs	M. Education	Pittsburg	Ditto
	Baitsile	I	Botswana Training Centre Instructor	3/78	7 wk	Training of Trainers	Malawi	Same
HEALTH	Manyoneng	I	Staff Nurse	1/76	1½yrs	BSc Health Educ.	Massechusetts	Health Education Officer
	Mokgwathi	I	Student at University in Botswana	9/74	3 yrs	BSc Nursing	University of Tenn-Knowville	National Health Inst. In-service programme
	Leisi	I	Clinical Instructor NHI	1/76	2½yrs	BSc Nursing	New Orleans	Tutor NHI
	Makgoeng	I	Student at University in Botswana	1/76	1½yrs	BSc Health Educ.	Massechusetts	Health Education Officer
	Phumaphi	I	Clinical Instructor NHI	9/75	2 yrs	Diploma Advanced Nursing	Nairobi	Nursing Tutor NHI
	Mosiemange	I	Ditto	9/77	2 yrs	Ditto	Nairobi	Ditto
	Thobosi	CX	Staff Nurse	10/74	2 yrs	Ditto	Nairobi	Resigned from Govt. (training in England)
	Nleya	I	Clinical Instructor at NHI	8/76	3 yrs	BSc Nursing	New Orleans	Instructor NHI in Lobatse
	Tlale	1	Sister-in-charge Senior sister	8/73 8/76	10 m 6 m	MCH/FP BSc Nursing	Meharry New Orleans	Senior sister Senior Tutor NHI
	Saleshando	Q	Nurse Midwife	1/78	12 m	Nurse Practitioner	Meharry	Same - Tutume Clinic

HEALTH CONTINUED

Seleka	I	Nurse Midwife	1/78	18 m	Nurse Practitioner	Meharry	Family Nurse Practitioner
Setlhabi	I	Staff Nurse	1/78	1 yr	Ditto	Meharry	Ditto at Lobatse
Tlhabiwe	Q	Nurse	1/78	1 yr	Ditto	Meharry	Ditto at Selebi Phikwe
Radise	Q	Nurse Midwife	1/78 6/74	1 yr 4 m	Ditto MCH/FP	Meharry Meharry	Ditto at Francistown Nurse Midwire
Chakalisa	I	Staff Nurse	9/78	1 wk	Psychiatry Conference	Nigeria	Same
Poonyane	I	Clinical Instructor	9/78	1 wk	Ditto	Nigeria	Same
Mahloane	I	Medical Officer	2/79	1 wk	Congress for International Year of Child	Nairobi	Same
Dikeledi	I	Theatre Superintendent	10/78	4 dys	Operating Nurses' Conference	Manila	Same
Kgolokgolo	I	Nurse Anaesthetist	10/78	4 dys	Ditto	Manila	Same
Meswele	QX					Meharry	Nursing in Molepolole
Kewakae	CX		9/75	6 m	Short nurses' training	Meharry	Studying in Ghana
Malema	QX	Staff Nurse	8/74	6 m	MCH/FP/Admin	Meharry	Nursing in Selebi Phikwe
Kobue	I	Asst. Principal NHI	?/72	2 wks	Workshop on MCH/FP	Meharry	Same
Masunga	Q	Matron	8/74	5 m	MCH/FP/Admin	Meharry	Matron at Mmadinare
Mabuse	I	Clinical Instructor NHI	2/75	5 m	MCH/FP	Meharry	Same
Lekuntwane	QX					Meharry	Nursing in Serowe

BEST AVAILABLE COPY

Yane	OX	Sister-in-charge				Meharry	Assigned from Govt.
Paqwe	QX	Sister	7/74	6 m	MCH/FP/Admin.	Meharry	Nursing in Pilikwe
Lesego	Q	Sister-in-charge	7/74	6 m	MCH/FP/Admin.	Meharry	Nursing in Serowe
Seitei	I	Sister-in-charge	8/74	6 m	MCH/FP	Meharry	Assistant Matron
Diseko	I	Charge Nurse	8/74	6 m	MCH/FP	Meharry	Studying at University in Botswana
Mabena	OX					Meharry	Nursing in Rakops
Pupe	I	Chief Nursing Officer	9/77	2 yrs	MA Nursing Admin. MEd	University of Clumbia	Same
Maoco	OX					Meharry	Nursing in Francistown
Magokwe	QX					Meharry	Nursing in Francistown
Thipe	QX					Meharry	Nursing in Shoshong
Ramalepa	I	Sister	1/74	4 m	MCH/FP	Meharry	Sister in Maternity Ward
Mogale	Q	Staff Nurse	1/74	6 m	MCH/FP	Meharry	Senior Sister in Palapye
Mosweu	QX					Meharry	Nursing in Selebi Phikwe
Morewane	I	Charge Nurse	2/75 10/77	5 m 5 wks	MCH/FP Adolescent Fertility Workshop	Meharry Chicago	Sister in Gaborone
Busang	I	Sister-in-charge	5/76	3 m	MCH/FP/Admin	Chicago	Same
Moremi	Q	Staff Nurse	5/76	3 m	MCH/FP/Admin	Chicago	In charge of all District clinics around Maun

OTHER

Mothibatsela	O	[illegible] Mining Engineer	8/76	2 yrs	M.Mining Engineering	Pennsylvania St. University	Same [illegible]
Charumbira	CX	In charge Labour Unit, Central Statsi Office			Statistics	Bureau of Censuses	Studying in Munich
Mfosi	I	Personnel Officer	9/78	3 m	Training and Man-power Devel.	Utah State University	Same in Gaborone Town Council

BEST AVAILABLE COPY

KEY

I Participant was interviewed by researcher

O Participant returned questionnaire

OX Participant failed to return questionnaire

CX Researcher unable to contact participant