PD-AAB-333-G1 526003 — (6)

AID 1020-28 (10-70) REPORT U-448

PAGE 1

PROJECT APPRAISAL REPORT (PAR)

6p.

1. PROJECT NO.	2. PAR FOR PERIOD:	3. COUNTRY	4. PAR SERIAL NO.
526-15-110-050.3	1 Dec. 72 TO 30 April 73	PARAGUAY	74-11

5. PROJECT TITLE

LIVESTOCK DEVELOPMENT

6. PROJECT DURATION: Began FY 1968 Ends FY 1977	7. DATE LATEST PROP	8. DATE LATEST PIP	9. DATE PRIOR PAR
	4/22/74	4/15/70	12/29/72

10. U.S. FUNDING	a. Cumulative Obligation Thru Prior FY: $ 1,685,000	b. Current FY Estimated Budget: $ 423,000	c. Estimated Budget to completion After Current FY: $ 1,227,000

11. KEY ACTION AGENTS (Contractor, Participating Agency or Voluntary Agency)

a. NAME	b. CONTRACT, PASA OR VOL. AG. NO.
New Mexico State University	AID/la-620

I. NEW ACTIONS PROPOSED AND REQUESTED AS A RESULT OF THIS EVALUATION

A. ACTION (X) USAID	AID/W	HOST	B. LIST OF ACTIONS	C. PROPOSED ACTION COMPLETION DATE
X		X	1. Continue to press the Ministry of Agriculture (MAG) for adequate counterpart to our project.	Continuing
X		X	2. Future Proags should stipulate that each year in January MAG will inform the Mission officially the amount invested by line item in the previous year and the amount approved by line item by the Congress for the budget year.	Continuing
X		X	3. Should PRONEGA's actual funding for CY 1974 be less than planned, make an analysis to establish project priorities and to determine new targets for CY 1974.	30 June 1974
X		X	4. Complete a study to determine the number of Faculty of Agronomy and Veterinary Sciences (FAV) graduates employed in the private sector and employer satisfaction with their performance.	30 June 1974
X		X	5. NMSU should prepare a detailed work plan for the Livestock Extension activities indicating plans for demonstration visits, and plans for regular contacts with cooperator ranches.	30 June 1974
X		X	6. Discuss with MAG the need for having the Livestock Advisory Council adopt-by-laws and initiate a more active role.	30 June 1974
X		X	7. With the assistance of summer interns from the FAV, make a sample survey of cooperator ranches to obtain information relative to project progress, including information on the influence of these ranches on nearby ranches, i.e. the multiplier effect.	31 Dec. 1974
X		X	8. PRONEGA should maintain current records on accomplishments in cooperator ranches by updating the data obtained through the survey.	31 Dec. 1974

D. REPLANNING REQUIRED (REVISED OR NEW) ☐ PROP ☒ PIP ☐ PRO AG ☐ PIO/T ☐ PIO/C ☐ PRIO/P

E. DATE OF MISSION REVIEW 3 May 1974

PROJECT MANAGER: TYPED NAME, SIGNED INITIALS AND DATE	MISSION DIRECTOR: TYPED NAME, SIGNED INITIALS AND DATE
[illegible] 5/2/74	Oliver H. Stone 5/2/74

AID 1020-28 (10-70) PAGE 2 PAR	PROJECT NO. 526-15-110-050.3	PAR FOR PERIOD: TO 30 April 1974	COUNTRY PARAGUAY	PAR SERIAL NO. 74-11

II. PERFORMANCE OF KEY INPUTS AND ACTION AGENTS

A. INPUT OR ACTION AGENT / CONTRACTOR, PARTICIPATING AGENCY OR VOLUNTARY AGENCY	B. PERFORMANCE AGAINST PLAN: UNSATISFACTORY 1	2	SATISFACTORY 3	4	5	OUTSTANDING 6	7	C. IMPORTANCE FOR ACHIEVING PROJECT PURPOSE (X): LOW 1	2	MEDIUM 3	4	HIGH 5
1. New Mexico State University				X								X
2.												
3.												

Comment on key factors determining rating

The performance of the NMSU contract team is rated as satisfactory. They have been persistent in their efforts to adhere to the contract work schedule and to project targets under the difficult conditions caused by inadequate GOP funding of the project. Responsiveness to A.I.D. direction and the relationships maintained with Paraguayan project technicians and other divisions of the Ministry of Agriculture were outstanding.

However, there has been inadequate attention given to the collection of data for project evaluation and to obtaining information on the past and present funding of PRONIEGA by the GOP.

	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	1	2	3	4	5
4. PARTICIPANT TRAINING						X						X

Comment on key factors determining rating

The training program is progressing satisfactorily. The Spanish language M.S. training program at NMSU permits the project to select candidates on the basis of their professional ability rather than their English language ability. A total of twenty participants have completed training and all are working for the project in the areas for which they were trained.

	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	1	2	3	4	5
5. COMMODITIES					X							X

Comment on key factors determining rating

Commodities purchased during the period of this PAR included only minor laboratory and miscellaneous items for the FAV and PRONIEGA. They were found to be appropriate to project needs and were adequately used.

		1	2	3	4	5	6	7	1	2	3	4	5
6. COOPERATING COUNTRY	a. PERSONNEL					X							X
	b. OTHER			X									X

Comment on key factors determining rating The above Paraguayan personnel rating is based on their more than satisfactory performance while knowing that full PL 480 Title I funding would not be available for CY 1973 and none would be available for CY 1974. The lower "Other" rating is because the GOP has not yet provided the necessary funds to cover PRONIEGA's CY 1974 operating budget requirements, which is delaying the implementation of new research projects and interfering with the extension work. However, MAG has presented supplementary budgets to the Ministry of Finance to cover the deficit caused by the lack of PL 480 funds.

Other negative aspects have been inadequate funding of the MAG's Agricultural Extension Service (SEAG) which is delaying the training of the SEAG agents working for PRONIEGA, and a lack of statistical data to evaluate adequately the project's progress.

GOP financial support to FAV has increased during 1974 which helps to assure continuation of the new curriculum, and the work is progressing satisfactorily.

	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	1	2	3	4	5
7. OTHER DONORS					X							X

(See Next Page for Comments on Other Donors)

AID 1020-25(10-70) PAGE 3 PAR	PROJECT NO. 526-15-110-050.3	PAR FOR PERIOD. To: 30 April 1974	COUNTRY PARAGUAY	PAR SERIAL NO. 74-11

II. 7. Continued: Comment on key factors determining rating of Other Donors

IDB : Under the MAG's Proyecto Integrado de Desarrollo Agropecuario (PIDAP) funded by the IDB, PRONIEGA is receiving funds to finance physical facilities for livestock research. This contribution to project funding was sufficient to provide machinery, equipment and construction needed for the research program

IBRD: Long term credit for ranchers funded by the IBRD ($12.8 million between 1968 and 1973) is adequate and is facilitating the adoption of improved livestock practices However, coordination between the IBRD loan project and PRONIEGA should be improved. Efforts should be made to reactivate the Livestock Advisory Council, through which coordination of activities could to be achieved.

III. KEY OUTPUT INDICATORS AND TARGETS

A. QUANTITATIVE INDICATORS FOR MAJOR OUTPUTS		Targets (Percentage Rate Amount)					
		CUMULATIVE PRIOR CY	CURRENT CY TO DATE	CY 74 TO END	CY 75	CY 76	END OF PROJECT
FAV and PRONIEGA personnel, and National Agricultural and Livestock Extension Service (SEAG) agents trained (Cumulative)	PLANNED	22		25	33	39	48
	ACTUAL PERFORMANCE	20	0				
	REPLANNED						
Research studies that meet MMSU quality standards. Initiated/completed. (Cumulative)	PLANNED	23/6		37/10	44/19	48/22	53/27
	ACTUAL PERFORMANCE	23/6	0/0				
	REPLANNED						
Number of cooperator ranches (Cumulative)	PLANNED	25		30	35	40	55
	ACTUAL PERFORMANCE	25	0				
	REPLANNED						
No. of Country Extension Agents/Extension Agents and PRONIEGA subject matter specialists adequately trained and assisting farmers. (Cumulative)	PLANNED	2/32		4/32	6/34	8/35	12/36
	ACTUAL PERFORMANCE	2/32	0/0				
	REPLANNED						

B. QUALITATIVE INDICATORS FOR MAJOR OUTPUTS

1.

2. COMMENT

3. COMMENT

AID 1020-28(10-70) PAGE 3 PAR (a)	PROJECT NO. 526-15-110-050.3	PAR FOR PERIOD: To: 30 April 1974	COUNTRY PARAGUAY	PAR SERIAL NO. 74-11

II. 7. Continued: Comment on key factors determining rating of Other Donors

III. KEY OUTPUT INDICATORS AND TARGETS

A. QUANTITATIVE INDICATORS FOR MAJOR OUTPUTS		TARGETS (Percentage/Rate/Amount)					
		CUMULATIVE PRIOR CY	CURRENT CY 74 TO DATE	CURRENT CY 74 TO END	CY 75	CY 76	END OF PROJECT
Field demonstration/short courses for ranchers and ranch foremen. (Cummulative)	PLANNED	4/2		10/5	16/8	24/11	42/17
	ACTUAL PERFORMANCE	4/2	0/0				
	REPLANNED						
Publication and distribution of research/extension bulletins and leaflets. (Cummulative)	PLANNED	3/8		6/18	11/30	18/42	26/66
	ACTUAL PERFORMANCE	3/3	0/2				
	REPLANNED						
Number of PAV graduates employed in the private sector.	PLANNED	58		33	36	40	50
	ACTUAL PERFORMANCE	*	*				
	REPLANNED						
	PLANNED						
	ACTUAL PERFORMANCE						
	REPLANNED						

B. QUALITATIVE INDICATORS FOR MAJOR OUTPUTS

1.

COMMENT

* No information was available during this evaluation. (See Action No. 3).

2.

COMMENT

3.

COMMENT:

AID 1020-25 (10-70)	PROJECT NO.	PAR FOR PERIOD:	COUNTRY	PAR SERIAL NO.
PAGE 4 PAR	526-15-110-050.3	To: 30 April 1974	PARAGUAY	74-11

IV. PROJECT PURPOSE

A. 1. Statement of purpose as currently envisaged. 2. Same as in PROP? ☒ YES ☐ NO

To develop within the Ministry of Agriculture a National Program of Livestock Research and Extension (PRONIEGA) and to develop within the National University's Faculty of Agronomy and Veterinary Sciences (FAV) an institutional capacity that will provide well trained manpower for the livestock and other agricultural sub sectors.

B. 1. Conditions which will exist when above purpose is achieved.	2. Evidence to date of progress toward these conditions.
1. PRONIEGA has demonstrated the capability to perform effectively without external technical or financial assistance a. Capability to continue carrying out research projects. b. Capability to continue effectively rancher extension services.	1. The project has been able to develop within PRONIEGA a cadre of adequately trained technicians who are showing a high degree of competence in performing livestock research studies under the supervision of the NMSU technicians. A weak area has been the extension work, but the increased emphasis now placed by the NMSU advisors on extension should contribute to solving this problem. The main difficulty has been the inadequate funding of PRONIEGA by the GOP.
2. A substantial improvement in the livestock situation as a direct consequence of completed research projects and extension activities. a. Calving percentage increased from 45 to 60%.	2. Because of financial difficulties, PRONIEGA has been unable to maintain records on information relative to certain project accomplishments as recommended in the last PAR. Therefore, data for measuring progress in livestock production was incomplete. In order to determine direct project influence on cooperator ranches and indirect influence of these

V. PROGRAMMING GOAL

A. Statement of Programming Goal

To increase the foreign exchange earnings of Paraguay by increasing the export of beef and related products, while meeting domestic needs for same.

Sub-Goal
To increase livestock production in Paraguay.

B. Will the achievement of the project purpose make a significant contribution to the programming goal, given the magnitude of the national problem? Cite evidence.

Goal: The total number of cattle slaughtered for export and foreign exchange earnings for the last three years was as follows:

	Head	$000
1971	217,470	20,167
1972	301,754 1/	31,591
1973	220,483	43,858

Sub-Goal: According to the annual surveys performed by the MAG, Paraguay's total cattle population during the last three years has been as follows:

1971	4,458,900	Head
1972	4,548,200	"
1973	4,875,900	"

1/ 1972 is not a representative year because domestic consumption decreased 29% from 1971, resulting from price increases and export represented 44% of total production.

AID 1020-25 (10-70) PAGE 4 PAR (a)	PROJECT NO. 526-15-110-050.3	PAR FOR PERIOD: To: 30 April 1974	COUNTRY PARAGUAY	PAR SERIAL NO. 74-11

IV. PROJECT PURPOSE

A. 1. Statement of purpose as currently envisaged. 2. Same as in PROP? ☐ YES ☐ NO

B. 1. Conditions which will exist when above purpose is achieved.	2. Evidence to date of progress toward these conditions.
b. Decrease in the age (4-5 to 3-4 years) and increase in the weight (370 to 400 kgs) of animals at slaughter. c. Mortality rate decreased from 6 to 3 percent. d. Dressing percentage increased from 50 to 55 percent, e. Lifetime productivity increased from 3 to 4.5 calves.	ranches on nearby ranches, the MMSU will conduct a survey starting in December 1974 (Action No. 6). PROMIEGA will be required to update the information obtained through the survey on a continuous basis (Action No. 7).
3. PAV graduates accepted for appropriate positions within the livestock sector and performing well. 100 students graduating between CY 1973-78 employed in the livestock sector.	3. A MSU advisor is making a study to determine the number and performance of the PAV graduates within the livestock sector. The final results of the study were not available for this PAR.

V. PROGRAMMING GOAL

A. Statement of Programming Goal

B. Will the achievement of the project purpose make a significant contribution to the programming goal, given the magnitude of the national problem? Cite evidence.

PROMIEGA is the only organization in Paraguay that carries out livestock research and that disseminates among ranchers specific information on results. However, due to the lack of sufficient data on project accomplishments, no accurate estimation can be made now on the extent to which PROMIEGA has actually contributed to the increase in livestock production in Paraguay.