

PROJECT APPRAISAL REPORT (PAR)

5/20174 - 11

PAGE 1

1. PROJECT NO. 512-669-995-174.4	2. PAR FOR PERIOD: Apr. 10, 1975 Mar. 30, 1976	3. COUNTRY BRAZIL	4. PAR SERIAL NO. 75-1
--	---	-----------------------------	----------------------------------

5. PROJECT TITLE
**Food-For-Work/Ministry of Agriculture (MinAg)
Transfer Authorization Nos. 3687 and 5689**

6. PROJECT DURATION: Began FY 73 Ends FY 76	7. DATE LATEST PROP	8. DATE LATEST PIP	9. DATE PRIOR PAR May 21, 1975
---	---------------------	--------------------	--

10. U.S. FUNDING	a. Cumulative Obligation Thru Prior FY: \$960,000	b. Current FY Estimated Budget: \$300,000	c. Estimated Budget to completion After Current FY: \$ NA
------------------	--	--	--

11. KEY ACTION AGENTS (Contractor, Participating Agency or Voluntary Agency)

a. NAME	b. CONTRACT, PASA OR VOL. AG. NO.
1. USAID/HMFD	
2. The Ministry of Agriculture represented by its entities:	NA
a. SUNAB/APD (National Superintendency of Supply/Food for Development)	NA
b. COBAL (The Brazilian Food Company)	NA
3. State of Rio Grande do Norte (RN)	NA

I. NEW ACTIONS PROPOSED AND REQUESTED AS A RESULT OF THIS EVALUATION

A. ACTION (X)			B. LIST OF ACTIONS	C. PROPOSED ACTION COMPLETION DATE
USAID	AID/W	HOST		
			<u>This is a Terminal PAR</u>	
		X	State to send final report to USAID	April, 1976
		X	Although action not related to this project per se, the attaining of project purpose (see pg. 4) depends on action already initiated by SUNAB/APD to acquire GOB funds for continuing projects using the Food-for-Work principle in States of Rio Grande do Norte and Ceara, without external assistance. In Rio Grande do Norte, <u>acude</u> * construction will be continued. In Ceara, the project will concentrate on construction of <u>acudes</u> and will also be applied to construction of farm-to-market roads.	May/June, 1976
			* Earthen dammed, rain water reservoirs	

D. REPLANNING REQUIRES
 REVISED OR NEW: PROP PIP PRO AG PIO/T PIO/C PIO/P

E. DATE OF MISSION REVIEW

PROJECT MANAGER: TYPED NAME, SIGNED INITIALS AND DATE

MISSION DIRECTOR: TYPED NAME, SIGNED INITIALS AND DATE

Robert R. Standley

William F. Galabert

3/19/76

AID 1020-25 (10-70)	PROJECT NO.	PAR FOR PERIOD:	COUNTRY	PAR SERIAL NO.
PAGE 2 PAR	512-669-995-174.4	TO April 10, 1975 March 30, 1976	BRAZIL	76-1

II. PERFORMANCE OF KEY INPUTS AND ACTION AGENTS

A. INPUT OR ACTION AGENT CONTRACTOR, PARTICIPATING AGENCY OR VOLUNTARY AGENCY	B. PERFORMANCE AGAINST PLAN							C. IMPORTANCE FOR ACHIEVING PROJECT PURPOSE (X)					
	UNSATISFACTORY		SATISFACTORY			OUT-STANDING		LOW		MEDIUM		HIGH	
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	1	2	3	4	5	
1. USAID/FFPD							X						X
2.													
3.													

Comment on key factors determining rating

Inputs: 1. PL 480 Title II Commodities - Quantities, types of commodities, and timeliness of arrival. These factors graded by State of RN as 7.
 2. Technical assistance in program planning, implementation, and evaluation, judged 6 by RN owing to availability of only one USAID technician with fewer field visits, as opposed to 2 techs previously available and more field visits.

PAR worksheet items used in evaluation also included:

Understanding of Common Objectives, Participation in Strategy & Planning, Coordination in Implementation, Contribution to Project Team, Contribution of Title II Foods, Participation in Chronogram, and Planning & Administration.

4. PARTICIPANT TRAINING	NA	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	1	2	3	4	5
-------------------------	-----------	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---	---

Comment on key factors determining rating

5. COMMODITIES	PL 480 Title II and Brazilian Foods	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	1	2	3	4	5
						X+							X

Comment on key factors determining rating

Judged by State, USAID and SUNAB/APD on timelines of arrival and quality and adequacy of foods. Both Title II and Brazilian foods, contributed on 50/50 and simultaneous bases, were judged together.

6. COOPERATING COUNTRY	a. PERSONNEL	1. State of RN	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	1	2	3	4	5
	b. OTHER	2. SUNAB/APD						X-						X
		3. MinAg(COBAL)						X	X-					X

Comment on key factors determining rating (which provided Brazilian Food)

- State judged by USAID and SUNAB/APD on: a. Number of agudes constructed, Workers and dependents receiving food, Specialized group capable of administering program, Storage and internal transfer of foods, Engineering assistance and inspection of agudes, Financial support and monitorship of projects, Administration and records, and Proper utilization of food commodities.
- SUNAB/APD judged by USAID and State on: Specialized group capable of administering program, and Support in logistics and care of foods, planning, and implementation. Within these factors SUNAB/APD was graded also on: Competency and continuity of leadership, Technical Capacity, Acceptance of and participation in purposes of the project, Disposition of Technical Assistants to work on sites in rural area.
- COBAL, of MinAg, judged by USAID, State, and SUNAB/APD on: Brazilian Foods - Adequacy and timeliness of delivery, understanding of objectives of project, and participation in the chronogram.

7. OTHER DONORS	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	1	2	3	4	5
				X								X

(See Next Page for Comments on Other Donors)

A/D 1020-25(10-70)	PROJECT NO.	PAR FOR PERIOD:	COUNTRY	PAR SERIAL NO.
PAGE 3 PAR	512-660-995-174.4	4/10/75-3/30/76	BRAZIL	76-1

11. 7. Continued: Comment on key factors determining rating of Other Donors

Ministry of Labor contributed Cr\$2,833,000 during life of project for payment of wages to laborers. This provided wages for 885,312 mandays.

III. KEY OUTPUT INDICATORS AND TARGETS

A. QUANTITATIVE INDICATORS FOR MAJOR OUTPUTS	From "add-on" Log Frame dated 4/30/75, attached	TARGETS (Percentage/Rate/Amount)					END OF PROJECT
		CUMULATIVE PRIOR FY	CURRENT FY		FY ____	FY ____	
			TO DATE	TO END			
1. Construction of <u>Acudes</u> a. Completed b. In construction	PLANNED	a. 370 b. 460	a. 600	a. 695			a. 695
	ACTUAL PERFORMANCE	a. 370	a. 514 b. 282				
	REPLANNED						a. 695 b. 161
2. Work provided: a. Number workers employed b. Mandays of work	PLANNED	a. 27,000 b. 276,000	a. 30,000 b. 3,000,000	a. 34,325 b. 3,400,000			a. 34,325 b. 3,400,000
	ACTUAL PERFORMANCE	as planned	as planned				
	REPLANNED						
3. Workers and dependents receiving supplemental food.	PLANNED	115,000	150,000	171,625			171,625
	ACTUAL PERFORMANCE	as planned	as planned				
	REPLANNED						
* 4. Specialized group capable of administering program - 16 administrators in MinAg and State, trained and efficiently implementating program.	PLANNED	group of 16					GROUP of 30
	ACTUAL PERFORMANCE	GROUP of 30					
	REPLANNED						
B. QUALITATIVE INDICATORS FOR MAJOR OUTPUTS	COMMENT: This factor cannot be judged quantitatively yet.						
1. Improvement of life for 3,200 families cultivating new arable land created by <u>acudes</u> .	The first acudes constructed by this program, however, are beginning to produce both fish and agricultural crops. An estimate of families benefitted is 500 to 700. (3 to 5 years are required for the agricultural value of an acude to become significant. Crops are planted below the earthen						
2.	COMMENT: dam which moistens the land by slow seepage.)						
3.	COMMENT: * A4. Break down of Group 30: State of RE (within Sect. of Ag) Administrators - 7; Engineers - 7; Inspection & Logistics - 12 SUNAB/APD (MinAg) - 3 (one is food care and storage specialist) COIAL (MinAg's Food buying agency) - 1						

AID 1020-25 (10-70)	PROJECT NO.	PAR FOR PERIOD:	COUNTRY	PAR SERIAL NO.
PAGE 4 PAR	512-669-995-174.4	4/10/75 - 3/30/76	BRAZIL	76-1

IV. PROJECT PURPOSE

A. 1. Statement of purpose as currently envisaged.
 (From Logical Framework, B-1 Purpose, attached) 2. Same as in ~~BOOK~~ Log Frame YES NO

Establish a GOB controlled and supported supplemental feeding program for rural workers and their families while carrying out agricultural development projects in dry areas of Northeast.

B. 1. Conditions which will exist when above purpose is achieved. (From Log Frame, B-2, E.P.O. Status)	2. Evidence to date of progress toward these conditions.
1. Ongoing program has full GOB operational support. 2. A trained and experienced body within MinAg to administer program, and operational expertise within State Sect. of Agriculture of RNorte. 3. Purchase and use of Brazilian food for program. 4. Viability of Food-For-Work concept has been demonstrated.	1. GOB has contributed 50 percent of food necessary for this phase of the project. The MinAg's SUMAB/APD has progressively taken on more and more project related activities, as well as responsibility for continuation of project by GOB without external assistance. (See below) 2. Leadership on GOB level for project continuation, post PL 480 Title II participation, has been assumed by SUMAB/APD within MinAg. (See States administrative group on page 3) 3. SUMAB/APD has a proposal now (Mar. 1976) in MinAg, with informal notice of its approval, which requests Cr\$94,000,000 (approx. \$9.8 million) for purchase of Brazilian foods to continue project in Rio Grande do Norte and implement similar project in Ceara. 4. State has 282 <u>acudes</u> now in construction, 550 with construction to be resumed, 1,295 surveyed and designed by Secretariat of Agriculture engineers, and requests for more than 2,000 additional <u>acudes</u> . This is a total of more than 4,000 <u>acudes</u> having SUMAB/APD approval for program continuation. This clearly proves viability of concept. SUMAB/APD is planning to expand the program into Ceara during CY 1976 (with only Brazilian resources).

V. PROGRAMMING GOAL

A. Statement of Programming Goal (From Log Frame, A-1)

Improve agricultural and nutritional conditions in Brazil's Northeast.

B. Will the achievement of the project purpose make a significant contribution to the programming goal, given the magnitude of the national problem? Cite evidence.

This project provides only a small contribution to the goal. Its value lies in the fact that other larger programs which fit within the programmed goals are being carried on by the GOB, and that this project benefits people who cannot be reached by the large programs. While the Food-for-Work project has served as a demonstration or pilot project, it clearly shows benefits to the state, e.g. acudes assist in protecting the state against drought and retaining rural people on the land during times of drought. It also offers a viable, although limited, solution to the socio/economic problem of periodic lack of work for agricultural laborers and the consequent malnutrition of large numbers of people.

PROJECT DESIGN SUMMARY
LOGICAL FRAMEWORK

¹²
Project Title and N#: Food-for-Work Program (MinAg/RGN)

From: June FY 75 to: May, FY 76

Transfer Authorization: N# 5689

Total US Funding: \$370,000

Date Prepared: April 30, 1975

Narrative Summary	Verifiable Indicators	Important Assumptions
<p>(A-1) <u>Goal</u></p> <p>Improve agricultural and nutritional conditions in Brazil's Northeast.</p>	<p>(A-2) <u>Measures</u></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Additional land available for year-round cultivation. 2. Açudes protect NE agricultural areas from droughts. 3. Permanent & temporary employment more readily available in project areas. 4. Rural workers and families protected from malnutrition during dry season. 	<p>(A-3)</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Other development programs also will benefit the rural areas and contribute to the sector goal. 2. Continuation of GOB efforts to increase agricultural productivity in the NE.
<p>(B-1) <u>Purpose</u></p> <p>Establish a GOB controlled and supported supplemental feeding program for rural workers and their families while carrying out agricultural development projects in dry areas of Northeast.</p>	<p>(B-2) <u>E.O.P. Status</u></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Ongoing program has full GOB operational support. 2. A trained and experienced body within MinAg to administer program, and operational expertise within State Sect. Ag. of RGN. 3. Purchase and use of Brazilian food for program. 4. Viability of Food-for-Work concept has been demonstrated. 	<p>(B-3)</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Continuing need for supplemental feeding programs in depressed areas. 2. Availability of sufficient food from Brazilian agricultural resources for continuation of such a program. 3. The GOB will accept responsibility to continue to provide work and food for the seasonally unemployed rural workers in the NE.
<p>(C-1) <u>Outputs</u></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Man days of work 2. Men Employed 3. Açudes Constructed 4. Labors and Families Receive Supplemental Feeding. 5. New Arable Land Produced. 6. Improved living by cultivation of new arable land created by açudes. 7. Specialized group capable of managing program. 	<p>(C-2) <u>Magnitude</u></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. 1,125,000 2. 6,825 3. 195 4. 34,125 5. 780 hectares 6. 1,560 Families 7. 16 administrators, in MinAg and State, trained on-job and efficiently implementing program. 	<p>(C-3)</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Better diet can improve worker productivity. 2. Title II commodities and FFP personnel will continue to be available through life of project.
<p>(D-1) <u>Inputs</u></p> <p><u>USG</u></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. PL 480 Title II Commodities 2. Technical assistance in program planning, implementation, and evaluation. <p><u>GOB</u></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Brazilian Foods 2. Financial support 3. Administrative Support 4. Planning, implementation, logistical support. <p><u>STATE</u></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Storage, care, and internal transportation of food. 2. Engineering planning and inspection for açude construction. 3. Financial assistance through bank loans for açude construction. 4. Administration, inspection, and records. 	<p>(D-2) <u>Imp. Target</u></p> <p><u>USG</u></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. 1,125 MT-575 bulgor, 450 CSB 2. One US Direct Hire, part-time <p><u>GOB</u></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. 1,125 MT-Rice, cornmeal, vegoil. 2. Estimated Cr\$1,000,000. 3. 3 persons in MinAg (COBAL) 4. 3 persons in SURAB/APD <p><u>STATE</u></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. 19 persons 2. Engineers' Records in SecAg of açudes planned and constructed. 3. Records of loans for this purpose. 4. 10 persons. 	<p>(D-3)</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Availability of Brazilian personnel, finances, and food for continuation of program. 2. Availability of Title II commodities and FFP personnel through life of project.