



**USAID**  
FROM THE AMERICAN PEOPLE



# USAID ENERGY POLICY PROGRAM

## POST-TRAINING EVALUATION BEST PRACTICES IN COMMERCIAL OPERATIONS FOR NTDCL PARTICIPANT TRAINING PROGRAM

MARCH 22 – APRIL 3, 2015

May 2015

*This program is made possible by the support of the American people through the United States Agency for International Development (USAID)*

# USAID ENERGY POLICY PROGRAM

## POST-TRAINING EVALUATION

### BEST PRACTICES IN COMMERCIAL OPERATIONS FOR NTDCL PARTICIPANT TRAINING PROGRAM

MARCH 22 – APRIL 3, 2015

Contract No: AID-EPP-I-00-03-00004

Order No: AID-391-TO-12-00002

©USAID Energy Policy Program  
House 4, Street 88, Sector G-6/3  
Ataturk Avenue, Islamabad, Pakistan  
Tel: +92 (51) 835 7072, Fax: +92 (51) 835 7071

#### DISCLAIMER

The contents of this document are the sole responsibility of Advanced Engineering Associates International, Inc. (AEAI) and do not necessarily reflect the views of USAID or the United States Government.



**USAID**  
FROM THE AMERICAN PEOPLE

## Best Practices in Commercial Operations for National Transmission and Despatch Company Limited (NTDCL)

### Participant Training Program

Training dates: March 22<sup>nd</sup> – April 3<sup>rd</sup>, 2015

### Post-Training Evaluation Report

Conducted on: May 12, 2015

In this activity, the Energy Policy Program (EPP) successfully delivered the final of the three executive exchange training courses in Best Practices in Commercial Operations for National Transmission and Despatch Company Limited (NTDCL) from March 22<sup>nd</sup> – April 3<sup>rd</sup>, 2015 in Minneapolis, Indianapolis and Detroit. A total of 9 participants (two females and seven males) from the key departments of Design, Metering, Human Resource, Administration and Central Power Purchase Authority (CPPA) participated in the training sessions.

Best practices in Commercial Operations for NTDCL course was designed to Improve capacity in Pakistan power sector's electricity grid through exposure to best practices in business process improvement, financial management, utility commercial management practices; while establishing professional relationships for NTDCL to draw upon after the conclusion of the program.

**Number of Participants trained:** 09 participants (Two females and seven males)

At the end of the training course, post-training evaluations were conducted from all nine participants. They were given a seven questions post-training evaluation form to explain their valuable experience. Following are the statistics and quotes of the participants' responses.

Please tick in appropriate box: *5 outstanding, 4 very good, 3 satisfactory, 2 needs improvement, 1 did not meet expectations*

| I. Program Rating                          | <i>Did not meet expectations</i> | <i>Needs improvement</i> | <i>Satisfactory</i> | <i>Very good</i> | <i>Outstanding</i> |
|--|----------------------------------|--------------------------|---------------------|------------------|--------------------|
| Relevance to your organization's work area | 0                                | 1                        | 4                   | 3                | 1                  |
| Structure of the program                   | 0                                | 1                        | 2                   | 6                | 0                  |
| Topics covered in the program              | 0                                | 1                        | 3                   | 4                | 1                  |
| Quality of class room interactions         | 0                                | 0                        | 0                   | 7                | 2                  |
| Quality of training and reading materials  | 0                                | 0                        | 4                   | 5                | 0                  |
| Appropriateness of reading materials       | 0                                | 1                        | 7                   | 1                | 0                  |
| Quality of Speakers/Trainers               | 0                                | 0                        | 0                   | 9                | 0                  |
| <b>II. Program Content and Trainers</b>    |                                  |                          |                     |                  |                    |

|                               |   |   |   |   |   |
|-------------------------------|---|---|---|---|---|
| Training Content & Relevance  | 0 | 1 | 4 | 4 | 0 |
| Trainer/Speaker Effectiveness | 0 | 0 | 0 | 9 | 0 |

According to the rounded responses of all participants from the above stated table:

1. 11% of the participants rated it outstanding, 33% of the participants rated “Relevance to your organization’s work area” as very good; whereas, 44% rated it as satisfactory and 11% felt the need of improvement.
2. 67% of the participants found “Structure of the program” very good, while 22% participants rated it as satisfactory and 11% of the participants felt need of improvement.
3. 44% participants found the category “Topics covered in the program” very good, 11% of them found it outstanding, 33% rated it as satisfactory and 11% felt the need of improvement.
4. 22% found “Quality of class room interactions” outstanding, 78% found it to be very good.
5. 56% of the participants felt “Quality of training and reading materials” was very good, while 44% found it satisfactory.
6. 78% participants rated “Appropriateness of reading materials” as satisfactory, 11% rated it as very good, while 11% felt the need of improvement.
7. 100% of the participants rated “Quality of Speakers/Trainers” as very good.
8. 44% participants rated the “Training Content & Relevance” as very good, 44% rated it as satisfactory and 11% felt the need of improvement.
9. 100% of the participants found “Trainer/Speaker Effectiveness” very good.

**Please share any other observations or comments regarding the trainer/training program/logistics:**

Participants were asked to share their observations and comments regarding the trainer, training and logistics. When asked; almost all the participants found the training very beneficial for them while mentioning:

*“On the whole, this was an amazing knowledge sharing experience. None hesitated to show their working style/documents to us. Helping culture of the companies inspired us. However, time was short and it should be enhanced in understanding their operations”*

*“Number of days in training was less”*

*“Very good capacity building and vision broadening”*

*“The training sessions were flexible and customized to the need of the participants, which helped in achieving learning objectives”*

*“Need to enhance the weightage of finance and ERP related trainings”*

*“Trainers were very helpful and cooperative”*

*“It was really informative and efficient”*

*“New technologies should be included in the training”*

**Before you received this training, how would you describe your knowledge of commercial operations and maintenance system procedures?**

Keeping in view all the responses it showed that before this training most of the participants had very limited knowledge and all of them have significantly developed knowledge after the training, as they quoted:

*"I did not have much knowledge about commercial operations; however, with this training I have developed some basic knowledge"*

*"This training has helped me enhance my knowledge about commercial operations and maintenance systems"*

*"Before receiving this training, I have fairly satisfactory knowledge about commercial operations and maintenance systems"*

*"Being an HR professional, we didn't have knowledge of commercial operations and maintenance systems and procedures"*

**What specific skills did you gain as a result of your exposure to the best practices in business process improvement, financial management & utility commercial management practices during your training?**

Participants were asked to address the specific skills that they have gained during this training; and they wrote:

*"Better attitude to work, level of motivation enhanced and development of managerial skills in HR"*

*"Our organization needs to use optical fibers for communication of meters"*

*"We learned a lot about project management, culture of utilities and solar technology"*

*"Technical knowledge of systems was developed in comparison to USA vs. Pakistan"*

*"Learned about document development w.r.t procurement, integration of renewable tactics, and transmission line operations"*

*"With regards to improvement in the financial management, I learned about the efficient budgeting processes, tariff rate calculations and project cost recovery"*

*"I came to know about the need of an ERP system for controlling, managing, financing and faster decision making"*

*"I learned about performance evaluation and the best concept of pay for performance"*

**How will your organization benefit from this training in both the short term and long term?**

The training strategy was based on organizational improvements so that the staff and the organization can achieve their set targets, objectives and both personal and corporate goals. Participants were asked to express how their organization will be benefited from Commercial Operations training in both short and long term, they shared:

*"We should do all operations efficiently and accurately. Most important of all in time"*

*"We will share our learning with the top management and will try to implement change with their help"*

*"I shall keep in mind and will keep appraising my seniors about the knowledge gained from this training"*

*"In short-term I can manage my load of work by using practices learned from this visit. In long-term, we can go for a better financial management and accounting system; which is currently under process"*

*“In short-term, I will focus on improvement in practices at the individual level. In long-term, I will focus on decision making in the power sector”*

*“My organization will benefit from the training in both technical and administration point of view”*

*“Sharing experiences and bench marking utility performance against different parameters”*

*“I will arrange an open session and deliver handouts pertaining to the subject training. Being a public and government owned company, implementation may be difficult”*

### **What was missing from the Training?**

Participants shared their respective views and stated:

*“From HR perspective, the training was altogether different, yet upon request, training for us was molded and a session was arranged with the HR personnel of visited companies”*

*“The training duration needs to be extended for a better understanding and learning experience”*

*“There should be more use of relatable case studies regarding certain bottlenecks and how they can overcome them”*

*“Smart grid introductions and visits should be arranged”*

*“HVDC systems training should be given”*

*“Detailed financial training as compared to technical”*

*“Training was of a very short duration”*

### **Do you have any suggestions for how we could improve future best practice exchange visit training programs?**

All the participants have different views about how to improve future Commercial Operations trainings, most of the participants have complained about the short time duration they suggested that the time period for such technical training should be increased, as they mentioned:

*“EPP should arrange visit/presentations for such technologies which are novel and beneficial for our grid system”*

*“The duration of the training should be extended to one month”*

*“NTDCL’s top management should be sent on similar trainings as they are involved in decision making”*

*“The problems in NTDC can be forwarded to trainers prior to training so that they can prepare relevant material/session accordingly”*

*“EPP is requested to arrange such training programs for HR, Finance, IT and Audit exclusively”*

[www.ep-ep.com.pk](http://www.ep-ep.com.pk)  
[info@ep-ep.com.pk](mailto:info@ep-ep.com.pk)