



USAID FIRMS PROJECT

Rapid Appraisal of Livestock Markets In Balochistan

May, 2013

This publication was produced for review by the USAID. It was prepared by Shahzad Safdar for an assignment commissioned by Chemonics International under the USAID Firms Project.



USAID FIRMS PROJECT

RAPID APPRAISAL OF LIVESTOCK MARKETS IN BALOCHISTAN

DISCLAIMER

The author's views expressed in this publication do not necessarily reflect the views of the United States Agency for International Development, the United States Government or Chemonics International Inc.

Data Page

Contract Number: GBTI II Task Order No. EEM-4-07-07-00008-00

Contractor Name: Chemonics International, Inc.

Name of the Component: Business Enabling Environment (BEE)

USAID Technical Office: Office of the Economic Growth and Agriculture;
USAID Pakistan

Date of Report: May 25, 2013

Document Title: Rapid Appraisal of Livestock Markets in Balochistan

Author's Name: Shahzad Safdar

Editing: Azeem Ahmed Khan, DEC

SOW Title and Work Plan &Action ID: Work Plan Level 33600, Action #4862, SOW #1693

Project Area: Balochistan

Key Words: Appraisal, brokers, buyers, contractor, distortion, efficiency, feed, fodder, livestock, market information, market intelligence, pastoralists, ramps, slaughter house, suppliers, supply chain, traders, troughs, wholesale

Abstract:

Being a pastoral economy, Balochistan has yet to exploit its potential in the livestock sector. The small and landless livestock farmers live under miserable socio-economic conditions. Local farmers generally do not have familiarity with modern animal husbandry practices. There is no organized cattle farming activity, and the province suffers low productivity. The local farmers use unhygienic and polluted water for their animals. They lack proper healthcare coverage for their animals, poor marketing system and extension services. The small-scale farmers have no linkages with processors and marketers. They are also deficient in technical know-how to increase meat production.

Keeping in view the above facts it is important to see that once the livestock has been produced, how it is marketed and whether the current marketing system of live animals in Balochistan is efficient, ensuring optimum returns to the producers.

For the purpose, appraisal of livestock markets in Balochistan was conducted from March 2013 to May 2013. Information from suppliers, buyers and other stakeholders in and outside the markets was collected. Information so collected was analyzed and informs the contents of this report.

Acronyms

AIP	Annual Implementation Plan
BEE	Business Enabling Environment
COP	Chief of Party
COTR	Contracting Officer's Technical Representative
EG	Economic Growth
EMPL.	Employees
FT	Full-time
FTE	Full-time Equivalent
FY	Fiscal Year
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
IP	Implementing Partner
IR	Intermediate Result
IUA	Infrastructure Up gradation Agreement
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
N/A	Non-Applicable
PKR	Pakistan Rupees
PSD	Private Sector Development
RFP	Request for Proposal
SMEDA	Small and Medium Enterprises Development Authority
SO	Strategic Objective
SOW	Scope of Work
US	United States
USD	US Dollars
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
USG	United States Government
VCD	Value Chain Development

Table of Contents

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	VII
1.0 INTRODUCTION	1
2.0 COVERAGE AND METHODOLOGY	3
3.0 RESULTS	7
4.0 ANALYSIS	30
5.0 ANNEXURE	33
6.0 REFERENCES	39

Executive Summary

Livestock in Balochistan is raised as backup economic support to meet urgent cash needs and for meeting the household milk and meat requirements. Producers lack land and water for fodder cultivation for animals. Livestock is dependent upon grazing on rangelands. The Environmental Profile of Balochistan has defined the range as self-generating and self-maintaining vegetation used for livestock grazing. The rangelands not only serve as habitats for most of the wildlife, but small flocks are completely dependent on rangelands for their food. These rangelands are continuously depleting and if appropriate measures are not taken, will no longer remain available for grazing. Rangelands depletion is attributed to burgeoning population, persistent drought in recent years, over-grazing and deforestation. The deforestation and over-grazing have destroyed the flora and fauna besides depleting the vegetation cover of the rangelands. During winter, the farmers living in central Balochistan migrate with their flocks to lower lands in Sibi and Kachhi plains for grazing their flocks.

Being a pastoral economy, Balochistan is yet to exploit its potential in livestock sector. The small and landless livestock farmers live under miserable socio-economic conditions. Local farmers even have no idea or familiarity with modern animal husbandry practices. There is no organized cattle farming activity, and the province suffers low productivity. The local farmers use unhygienic and polluted water for their animals. They lack proper healthcare coverage for their animals, poor marketing system and extension services. The small-scale farmers have no linkages with processors and marketers. They are also deficient in technical know-how to increase meat production.

Keeping in view the above facts it is important to see that once the livestock has been produced, how it is marketed and whether the current marketing system of live animals in Balochistan is efficient, ensuring optimum returns to the producers.

For the purpose, appraisal of livestock markets in Balochistan was conducted from March, 2013 to May, 2013. Information from suppliers, buyers and other stakeholders in and outside the markets was collected. Information so collected was analyzed and an analysis of the situation is given as under:-

Livestock Markets

Livestock marketing is a very important aspect of animal rearing. Unfortunately there is no organized system of holding of livestock markets in Balochistan. In Balochistan livestock markets come under the purview of Balochistan Local Government Board (BLGB), which works under the Local Government Department. Almost all, except few, livestock markets are established and run by the private sector. Information regarding establishment and working of livestock markets in Balochistan, whether public or private, was not found to be collected and compiled at any central level. The information collected during appraisal reveals that there are about 42 livestock markets in Balochistan, most of which are privately organized and managed, which usually held at district head quarter level with some smaller markets, in few districts, held in nearby areas.

Livestock markets in Balochistan are mostly held in an open place, under open sky, without any organization, management, infrastructure and facilities like shelter for animals, water for humans and animals, ramps for loading and unloading of animals, boundary wall, feed, fodder and fodder troughs, weighing arrangements, sanitation and drainage and electricity. These markets are held mainly due to two reasons - one is availability and supply of livestock in its producing area and second is trade opportunities which are mainly because of geographical location of the market. There is no market intelligence/information service available due to which a level playing field is not available to all the stakeholders and it leads to exploitative behavior by those (mostly the traders) having more market information regarding prices, supply and demand situation because of frequent contact with other livestock markets. They can co-relate this information in a meaningful way, which help them in taking decisions regarding sale and purchase of animals and in demanding/offering prices.

Market days in an area are kept in a way that these do not clash with each other so that suppliers and buyers get maximum opportunity to buy and sell their animals. Some markets are held for small animals and some for large. In many markets small and large animals are traded at the same place. In some markets animals of different categories are traded in separate sections of the market but in most of the cases animals of all categories are mixed up which create problem for the buyers in finding out the desired animal which is also more time consuming.

Facilities of veterinary staff for disease checking/health certification are mostly not available in the markets which leads to the spread of animal diseases to other areas/provinces. It was revealed during appraisal that presence of veterinary staff in the markets is witnessed whenever there is a campaign against some disease and it is not a normal feature.

Another issue with respect to the marketing of livestock is the sale and purchase without having any description of the features of the animal under trade like its health status, pedigree, milking potential, weight, age, etc. It is on the spot decision and any misjudgment will result in the shape of loss on the part of buyer. Even in case of meat animals trading takes place on the basis of head count instead of live weight which, at least, provides some base for further negotiation. In this case also the producers, being less experienced, are at loss.

Deal in the market is finalized mostly through secret negotiation, auction was not found to be practiced in any market. Due to this the seller does not get the best price of its product or the buyer may pay more. Here again the experienced person remains in benefit. One may find traders buying and selling the same animal in the same market and getting reasonable margin in the process. It all happens due to poor marketing practices like selling the animals on the basis of head count instead of live weight, poor market information and through secret negotiation instead of auction.

Market charges, are not a big issue in Balochistan as most of the livestock markets in Balochistan, except few, are private in nature. These are just open places where trade takes place. If a state land is used for the purpose there are no market charges and if some private land is used, nominal charges are charged, mostly at loading/unloading points. Although there are some market charges charged in the livestock markets managed and contracted out by the relevant Local Government Department like one established at Eastern By-pass, Quetta contracted out by the Metropolitan Corporation, Quetta. Market charges in such market include entry charges, charges on transaction and other charges which are charged for using different facilities.

There is no system of collection and maintenance of record with respect to the animals reaching the markets, their health status, origin, ownership, animals traded, price, value of trade, destination and purpose of sale or purchase. This information is necessary to evaluate efficiency of markets, response of suppliers and buyers to any changes in the behavior of markets and to formulate any policy for the improvement of livestock marketing and livestock sector. Further, due to the absence of any record, traceability of the animal sold or purchased is not possible

Organizations of livestock producers, traders, contractors and animal welfare were not found to be established who could give suggestions for the improvement of livestock marketing.

Meat prices are fixed by the local government and no premium is associated with the quality of meat. It leads to slaughtering of unhealthy and old animals. Prevalence of brokers is common in the markets. They assist in the finalization of deal and get their pre-decided commission. Sometime they get the benefit of loose system of selling and buying in the market and get a reasonable margin in a deal.

Each part of the livestock is saleable which includes milk, mutton, beef, hides and skins, poultry, wool, farmyard manure and offal. But marketing of these products still needs improvement to ensure maximum returns to the livestock holders.

It has been concluded that under present circumstances the working of livestock markets in Balochistan do not fulfill the required efficiency criteria and also do not ensure optimum returns to the producers, the original owners of the product. Although the role of traders is important as they are integral part of the supply chain and also they provide a link between producers and consumers but actual issue is to remove the discrepancies and distortions in the present livestock marketing system, as pointed out in this report, so that a level playing field may become available to all the players and due returns are ensured to the producers. To achieve the objective livestock markets are the points to kick start the process through appropriate policy formulation and regulation.

Geographical Importance

Balochistan is situated at an important geographical location having its boundaries attached, on one side, with Punjab and Sind and on other side with Afghanistan and Iran. Due to this geographic location it is an ideal place for trade of livestock. There is an inward and outward flow of different types of livestock with Punjab and Sind. Markets established, particularly in border cities, have their own importance in this regard. Barkhan district is famous for sheep production and its trade takes place in Rakhni market from where it is supplied to Punjab, Afghanistan and Iran. Similarly Hub, Uthal and Bela areas are famous for goat production which is supplied to Karachi. Bela, Kharan, Noshki, Chaghai and Awaran areas are source of supply of camel to Iran which, as per reports, is further supplied to Gulf states. Balochistan is also an area used for transit trade from where cattle (cows and bulls) from Punjab and Sind, en-rout to Afghanistan, passes through. If proper attention is given to improve the markets and to facilitate the legal trade it may become a good source of foreign exchange earnings for the country as well as ensuring better returns to the producers

1.0 Introduction

Livestock sector occupies a unique position in the National Agenda of economic development. The sector provides net source of foreign earnings. Historically livestock has been dominated by small holders to meet their needs of milk, food security and cash income on daily basis. Moreover, livestock is considered a source of employment generation at rural level, helping to reduce income variability. It is central to the livelihood of the rural poor in the country and can play an important role in poverty alleviation and keep in uplifting the socio-economic condition of our rural masses. Livestock contributed approximately 55.4 percent to the agricultural value added and 11.9 percent to national GDP during 2012-13, against 55.3 percent and 11.9 percent during the same period last year. Gross value addition of the livestock sector at constant cost factor has increased from Rs.735 billion (2011-12) to Rs.756 billion (2012-13); showing an increase of 2.9 percent as compared to previous year.¹

The major livestock products in Balochistan include sheep, goats, cattle, camels, horses, donkeys, poultry and in some areas buffaloes. Sheep and goats are the most significant, because they are kept by all sorts of farmers and livestock traders. They can survive on the natural pastures of Balochistan, which are attributed by the dry land shrubs and small herbs that can only be benefited to small livestock of Balochistan.

In Balochistan hardly 2% of the entire area is under crop culture while the remaining 98% comprising of almost 35 million hectares of wastelands is fit for nothing but inadequate grazing for livestock through part of the year. It is estimated that only 15% of this rangeland is located in areas having more than 250 mm annual rain fall, which can support perennial grasses and shrubs.² Hence, barring some portions of Loralai and Zhob districts, rest of the land surface does not even support rearing of livestock throughout the year. Thus necessitating seasonal migration of nomadic and transhumance grazers, who move to lowlands in autumn and highlands in spring with a view to find feed for their livestock. In spite of the difficult conditions for livestock industry it occupies a pivotal place in the economy of Balochistan due to being the mainstay of more than 75% of the people inhabiting the countryside the relative absence of other means of subsistence.³

The increasing demand for livestock and its products due to high population growth rate, increase in per capita income, which has increased purchasing power of the people, a growing economy and a ever rising demand for live animals and products in neighboring countries, which is met through legal and illegal trade, has exerted significant pressure on the country's livestock resource base. Bright prospects of export of "Halal" meat to Middle Eastern countries have further enhanced the importance of the sector. Pakistan is expected to be preferred on account of cultural, religious and proximity basis. Moreover, great demand in Saudi Arabia on the eve of Hajj

¹ Economic Survey of Pakistan, 2012-13

² Meteorological Department, Government of Pakistan, Quetta, 2005

³ Current Livestock Marketing and its Future Prospects for the Economic Development of Balochistan–Pakistan, MUHAMMAD SHAFIQ1 AND MUHAMMAD AZAM KAKAR, *Department of Commerce, University of Balochistan Quetta, Pakistan, Livestock and Dairy Development Department Balochistan Quetta, Pakistan*

can also be met by imports from Pakistan which is also a potential source of foreign exchange earnings.

1.2 Purpose

Livestock marketing studies are important to provide necessary information, on the operations and efficiency of the livestock marketing system, required for effective planning and policy formulation in the livestock sector. The livestock markets are trading places where producers exchange their livestock products for cash to meet their other needs.

Keeping in view its importance and in order to get first hand information about economic behavior of different players in the markets, by observing market transactions and operations, a Livestock Rapid Market Appraisal of livestock markets in Balochistan was conducted.

1.3 Objectives of the Study

The overall objective of the study is to conduct a Rapid Market Appraisal of livestock markets in Balochistan, in order to establish a quantitative and qualitative basis for analyzing the impact of proposed interventions in the livestock sector. Mainly following areas have been covered in the appraisal:-

- a. Study of existing livestock markets in the province and quantify existing infrastructure, business processes, institutional arrangements, human resources, financial capacity, and other indicators found therein.
- b. Determination of economic losses caused in the livestock marketing sector due to lack of infrastructure, services and facilities
- c. Identification of upstream and downstream market channels for livestock markets operating in five selected districts of Balochistan
- d. Identification of various formal and informal stakeholders in the livestock sector and their position/influence in the market chain.
- e. Identification of existing deficiencies and distortions in current practices and determine whether they are conducive to enabling the fair, efficient, and growth-oriented functioning of livestock markets.
- f. Determination of time and cost to private sector and public sector based on current policies and practices.
- g. Identification of sources and amount of revenue over the past five years and determination of their utilization.
- h. Identification of needs and concerns of suppliers and buyers based on their perceptions and enlist their recommendations for the improvement of situation.

2.0 Coverage and Methodology

Rapid Market Appraisal is an approach considered to be an efficient way of collecting required information with limited resources and in a short span of time. This approach was applied for the collection of information regarding the working of livestock markets in Balochistan. The aspects covered during the appraisal include the way of holding and current status of functioning of these markets, existing infrastructure, business process, institutional arrangements, human resources, financial capacity, stakeholders involved and their influence, deficiencies and distortions in current practices, sources and amount of revenue and their utilization and needs and concerns of suppliers and buyers. The information, findings and analysis of the situation will further be used to draft a policy document for the improvement of livestock sector in Balochistan. Information from Livestock markets in Balochistan was collected to cover all the aspects as mentioned above. The livestock markets, for the purpose of obtaining required information, were selected keeping in view the geographical coverage, size and type of market, type of livestock being traded, importance of the area/market with respect to livestock rearing and trade. Importance of area/market with respect to export of livestock to the neighboring countries was also given due importance. Livestock markets visited include primary collection markets, secondary distribution markets and terminal markets. Information from suppliers, buyers, brokers, contractors, managers and other stakeholders inside and outside the markets was obtained through key questions. Key questions for general market information, suppliers to market and buyers in the market were prepared and shared with the project people and their feedback was incorporated to make the key questions more comprehensive. In total, information from livestock markets, functioning in five districts of Balochistan, was collected for the purpose of appraisal. In addition to this, thorough discussion with the relevant departments which include, Livestock and Dairy Development Department, Balochistan, Quetta, Local Government Department, Balochistan, Quetta, Metropolitan Corporation, Quetta and Balochistan Local Government Board (BLGB), Quetta, was held to get their view point on the matter.

Information from primary and secondary sources was collected to cover the following aspects during the appraisal:-

- 2.1 Status of existing livestock markets and their infrastructure, business process, institutional arrangements, human resource and financial capacity.
- 2.2 Economic losses caused in the livestock marketing sector due to lack of infrastructure, services and facilities.
- 2.3 Upstream and downstream market channels for livestock markets operating in five selected districts of Balochistan
- 2.4 Stakeholders in the livestock sector and their position/influence in the market chain.

- 2.5 Deficiencies and distortions in current practices and determination whether they are conducive to enabling the fair, efficient and growth oriented functioning of livestock markets.
- 2.6 Time and cost to private and public sectors based on current policies and practices.
- 2.7 Sources and amount of revenue over the past five years and their utilization.
- 2.8 Needs and concerns of suppliers, buyers and users based on their perceptions and their recommendations for the improvement of situation.
- 2.9 Livestock major products for marketing
- 2.10 Principal Findings

2.1.1 Visit of Livestock Markets

For the purpose of appraisal, five districts were selected with the consultation of Senior Policy Reform Consultant of the Project and Livestock & Dairy Development Department, Balochistan, keeping in view the geographical coverage, importance of area with respect to livestock rearing, trade and export. List of selected districts is given as under:-

- i. Quetta
- ii. Barkhan
- iii. Qila Saifullh
- iv. Pashin
- v. Lasbella

Information from selected markets, regarding record keeping, rate and display of market charges on entry/transaction, awareness about any law governing these markets, availability of different facilities such as shade, water for humans and animals, ramps for loading and unloading, availability of fodder, boundary wall, weighing scale, electricity, sanitation, presence of veterinary staff, way the transaction is held, presence of brokers and their role and charges, was collected. Views of contractors, on the issue, were also obtained.

2.2 Economic losses caused in the livestock marketing sector due to lack of infrastructure, services and facilities.

Livestock marketing sector in Balochistan lacks the required infrastructure, services and facilities necessary for efficient functioning of the sector and markets ensuring optimum returns to the producers and other actors in the supply chain, alleviating poverty and guaranteeing food security.

During the appraisal, factors responsible and type and extent of such economic losses were determined.

2.3 Upstream and downstream market channels for livestock markets operating in five selected districts of Balochistan

There are different upstream and downstream market channels through which livestock passes before reaching the market and from the market to its ultimate destination which may be a slaughter house, an export point or going back to the producer for rearing. These market channels were identified and have been described in the report.

2.4 Stakeholders in the livestock sector and their position/influence in the market chain.

Stakeholders in the livestock markets include suppliers (farmers/producers, livestock traders/beoparies), buyers (farmers/producers, livestock traders/beoparies, butchers, buying agents of processing/exporting industry, dairy farmers, consumers), contractors and brokers. Stakeholders outside the market include traders of different products of livestock like hides and skins, milk, wool, hair, offals, etc. and Government departments like Local Government and Livestock & Dairy Development Department. Views of all of these stakeholders, on the issue, were obtained and their position, in the market chain, was evaluated.

2.5 Deficiencies and distortions in current practices and their impact.

During the visits of livestock markets, deficiencies and distortions in the current practices and impact of current policies on their functioning was observed. Views of different stakeholders in this regard were also obtained.

2.6 Time and cost to private and public sectors based on current policies and practices.

Time and cost to private and public sector, because of the current policies and practices, was determined during the appraisal. Business process was evaluated by obtaining required information, through interviews, from the suppliers and buyers in the markets.

2.7 Sources and amount of revenue over the past five years and its utilization.

Livestock markets in Balochistan come under the purview of Balochistan Local Government Board (BLGB). BLGB was contacted to get the required information regarding sources and amount of revenue collected from livestock markets and its utilization.

2.8 Needs and concerns of suppliers and buyers.

There are different types of suppliers and buyers in the livestock markets. Information regarding current system of working of these markets, availability and deficiencies in required facilities, issues and concerns of suppliers and buyers, with respect to working of these markets, was collected through key questions. Their needs and recommendations for the improvement of the situation were also recorded.

2.9 Livestock major products for marketing

It is a fact that every part of the livestock is used for human benefit and nothing goes waste but the efficiency of utilization of livestock products is not yet up to the mark. Information regarding major livestock products and marketing of same was collected from various sources and issues in efficient utilization of these products were highlighted for improvement.

2.10 Principal findings

Principal findings, based on the appraisal and from the information gathered from other sources, have been given at the end of the report so that the same may made basis for policy formulation on livestock sector in Balochistan.

2.9 Study Period and Time Lines

The study commenced in April, 2013 and was completed in May, 2013.

2.10 Limitations

Limitations faced in the conduction of appraisal include access to different areas, language and security issues. Assistance of Livestock and Dairy Development Department, Balochistan was obtained, where required, to overcome these limitations and to collect the required information.

3.0 Results

Although the process of livestock marketing in Balochistan is almost similar to other provinces, and more closer to KPK because of few common things which include mountainous areas having vast rangelands providing grazing facility, but the establishment and control of livestock markets is different in a way that in other provinces almost all, except few, markets are public markets controlled and contracted out by the relevant Local Government Department while in Balochistan few markets are controlled by some Government agency while other markets are privately established and controlled. For the purpose of appraisal, information from livestock markets working in five districts was collected. Additional information, required, was also collected from different secondary sources. The information so collected was compiled and analyzed. Outcome of analyses has been interpreted in different parts of this section of the report.

Livestock Markets in Balochistan

As mentioned above, almost all, except few, livestock markets in Balochistan are established and run by the private sector. Livestock markets come under the purview of Balochistan Local Government Board (BLGB), which works under the Local Government Department, Balochistan. As per information provided by the BLGB, detail of information regarding establishment and working of livestock markets in Balochistan, whether public or private, is not collected and compiled at any central level. Further this information could also not be found from any secondary source. During the appraisal an effort was made to collect and compile the required information with the assistance of Livestock Department, Balochistan. The information so collected is given on the next page:-

Table 1: List of Livestock Markets in Various Districts of Balochistan

#	Name of Districts	District Markets
1	Awaran	i) Awaran
2	Bolan	i) Dhader
3	Jahl Magsi	i) Gandawa
4	Barkhan	i) Barkhan ii) Rakhni
5	Chagi	i) Dalbandin ii) Chaghi
6	Naseerabad	i) Dera Murad Jamali
7	Dera Bugtti	i) Dera Bugtti ii) Sui
8	Gwadar	i) Gawadar

#	Name of Districts	District Markets
9	Jaffarabad	i) Dera Allah Yar ii) Usta Mohammad
10	Killa Abdullah	i) Chaman
11	Killa Saifullah	i) Killa Saifullah
12	Khuzdar	i) Khuzdar ii) Wadh
13	Kharan	i) Kharan
14	Kalat	i.) Kalat
15	Turbat	i) Turbat ii) Mand
16	Kohlu	i) Kohlu .
17	Lasbela	i) Uthal ii) Bela iii) Hub
18	Loralai	i) Loralai ii) Mekhter
19	Musakhial	i) Musakhial ii) Drug
20	Mastung	i) Mastung
21	Panjgoor	i) Panjgoor
22	Pishin	i.) Pishin
23	Quetta	i) Khuchlak ii) Quetta Eastern Bypass iii) Alamo Chowk
24	Sibi	i) Sibi
25	Ziarat	i) Ziarat
26	Zhob	i) Zhob
27	Noshki	i) Nushki
28	Sherani	i) Sherani
29	Washak	i) Washak
30	Harnai	i) Harnai

Source: Livestock and Dairy Development Department, Balochistan, Quetta

During the appraisal following areas, with respect to working of livestock markets in Balochistan, have been covered:-

- 3.1 Status of existing livestock markets and their infrastructure, business process, institutional arrangements, human resource and financial capacity.
- 3.2 Economic losses caused in the livestock marketing sector due to lack of infrastructure, services and facilities.
- 3.3 Upstream and downstream market channels for livestock markets operating in five selected districts of Balochistan
- 3.4 Stakeholders in the livestock sector and their position/influence in the market chain.
- 3.5 Deficiencies and distortions in current practices and determination whether they are conducive to enabling the fair, efficient and growth oriented functioning of livestock markets.
- 3.6 Time and cost to private and public sectors based on current policies and practices.
- 3.7 Sources and amount of revenue over the past five years and their utilization.
- 3.8 Needs and concerns of suppliers, buyers and users based on their perceptions and their recommendations for the improvement of situation.
- 3.9 Livestock major products for marketing.
- 3.10 Principal Findings.

3.1 Status of existing livestock markets and their infrastructure, business process, institutional arrangements, human resource and financial capacity.

Livestock markets, working in five districts of Balochistan, from where the information, during the appraisal, was collected, are listed below:-

- i. Livestock Market, Quetta (Eastern Bye Pass).
- ii. Livestock Market, Samungli Road, Quetta.
- iii. Livestock Market, Kuchlak
- iv. Livestock Market, Barkhan
- v. Livestock Market, Rakhni
- vi. Livestock Market, Qila Saifullah
- vii. Livestock Market, Pashin.
- viii. Livestock Market, Hub.
- ix. Livestock Market, Bela, district Lasbella.

Types of Markets

Livestock markets in Balochistan can mainly be categorized in to three categories which include (i) Primary collection markets, (ii) Secondary distribution markets, (iii) Large Terminal markets. Characteristics of these categories of markets are given below:-

Table 2: Characteristics of Livestock Markets

Type of Market	Main Sellers	Main Buyers	Purpose of Purchase
Primary collection markets	Producers /traders	Other producers	For stock replacement or fattening
		Local butchers	Slaughtering for retail selling of meat
		Traders	For resale in larger markets
Secondary distribution markets	Producers /traders	Other producers/ farmers	For stock replacement or fattening
		Local butchers	Slaughtering
		Traders – local as well as from other provinces/buying agents	For resale in terminal markets & in the markets of other provinces/supply to processors, and exporters
Terminal markets	Traders	Local slaughter houses/butchers	Slaughter for local supply
		Traders/exporters	For supply to different buyers/export to neighboring countries (Iran, Afghanistan)
		Dairy farmers	For dairy farms

Source:- Study findings

Primary collection markets are held at sub-tehsil/town level or where the potential exists. Small numbers of animals are traded there. Some markets are held separately for small and large animals and in some cases both small and large animals are traded in the same market. Suppliers to these markets are farmers/producers and traders. Farmers mostly sell their livestock to meet their instant cash needs or due to non availability of feed, particularly during winters. They have little information about the prevailing prices in other areas/markets as a result they have low bargaining power. The traders who supply to these markets belong to the same area and are well known to the people. They purchase from the surrounding villages from the farmers. Contact is established through cell phone/personal contact. A price is offered by the trader to the farmer, keeping in view his margin, as he has a fair idea about the value of animal, being purchased, in the target market. After some negotiation deal is finalized. The farmer tries his best to get the maximum value. For this he does not finalize the deal in the first instance and contacts 2-3 traders. Deal is finalized with the trader who offers the best price. Producer, if does not feel satisfied with the price offered by the traders, sometimes, takes the animal to the nearest market, in an effort to get a better price. Buyers in these markets are other producers, local butchers and traders. Other producers purchase animals for stock replacement or for fattening for future sale to get additional income. Local butchers purchase for slaughtering for onward sale to the consumers. As there is no premium associated with good quality meat and sale price is fixed by the District Government, so the butchers do not buy good quality animals. Mostly they buy a mix of good and poor quality animals in which the ratio of poor quality animals (unhealthy, under age or old animals) is high. Traders buy from these markets for resale in the larger markets. They have the information about the prices of animals in larger markets so they are in a better position to strike a good deal.

Secondary distribution markets are larger markets, mostly held in the vicinity of big cities. Large numbers of small and large animals are traded there. Some markets are held separately for small and large animals and in some markets a mix of all kinds of animals are available for trade. Suppliers to these markets are producers, who come from surrounding areas, and traders who purchase animals direct from the producers in the villages or from smaller markets. Traders make their effort to get good price of their animal for which they also move from one market to other nearby markets. Although there are some costs associated with it but, being experienced in the field, they make cost and benefit calculations. Incidences of selling at loss were also reported by many.

As, all types and quality of animals are available in these markets, so variety of buyers visit these markets. Producers visit for stock replacement and fattening for sale on some special occasions such as Eid-ul-Azha. Local butchers purchase for slaughtering for sale to consumers. Traders purchase for resale in other big or terminal markets. Traders from other provinces also visit these markets. For example traders from Punjab and Sind visit such markets, for the purchase of small animals (sheep and goat).

Assessment of price is based on the visual observation. For slaughter animals (small and large) age, health and weight of the animal are main attributes. There are no weighing scales in the markets in the absence of which it is difficult to accurately estimate the weight of the animal. When

views of sellers and buyers were obtained on it they stated that this is the business and they can accurately judge the weight of the animal along with that they also stated that sometimes there is a misjudgment and they have to suffer a loss because of that. It highlights the necessity of use of weighing scales for the purpose for providing at least some base for negotiation. In the absence of that the farmers, as sellers as well as buyers, being less experienced are definitely at loss.

Terminal markets are held in some main large cities, mostly the provincial headquarters, where livestock from Punjab (mostly old age dry buffaloes) and from other intermediate markets/cities is brought for sale. These markets are mostly held separately for small and large animals. Suppliers to these markets are traders. One can hardly find any producer selling animals in these markets. Forces of supply and demand play their role in all the markets but in terminal markets their effect becomes visible soon as these markets are buying place for traders from other provinces, exporters and illegal traders. In case of increase in demand for animals in these markets, prices go up which trigger more supply to these markets and vice versa. Domestic demand increases gradually with the increase in income levels, population pressure and general price level and there is a good response time for that. So price also increases gradually. Other major factor which pushes the prices upward is the trade, legal or illegal, of good quality live animals to neighboring countries.

Buyers in these markets are local butchers who purchase animals for slaughtering for onward selling of meat to the consumers. Other buyers are traders, local as well as coming from other provinces. Local traders supply to different welfare organizations and exporters. Traders also supply the animals to people involved in smuggling of livestock to neighboring countries. Sometimes the traders from the country, where the livestock is smuggled, directly visit the target market to strike a deal. Traders, coming from other provinces, mostly from Punjab and Sind, purchase small animals (sheep and goat) for onward sale to the butchers, slaughter houses, departmental stores maintaining meat section and processing industry. Dairy farmers also purchase dairy animals for the replacement of their stocks.

Holding of markets: Livestock markets in Balochistan are mostly held on some open place without any infrastructure, organization and management. These markets held at different levels such as; local, sub-tehsil, tehsil and district. As mentioned above we can term these markets as primary collection markets, secondary distribution markets and large terminal markets. These markets are held on daily, twice a week, weekly, and sometimes on yearly basis. Some terminal markets, established in the vicinity of large cities work throughout the year. Basically there are two main reasons of establishment of a livestock market. One is availability and supply of livestock in its producing area and second is trade opportunities which are mainly because of geographical location of the market. Most of these markets are being held for a long time therefore both buyers and sellers are mostly well informed about these market days and dates. Market days are decided keeping in view the convenience of sellers and buyers. It was observed that market days, in an area, have been kept in a way that these do not clash with each other so that suppliers and buyers get maximum opportunity to buy and sell their animals. Daily based special markets are also organized about two weeks before the eve of Eid-ul-Azha, a Muslim festival. Some markets are held for small animals and some for large. In many markets small and large animals are traded

at the same place. In some markets animals of different categories are traded in separate sections of the market but in most of the cases animals of all categories are mixed up which create problem for the buyers in finding out the desired animal which is also more time consuming.

Health certification of animals, brought in the markets for sale and purchase, is important for two reasons. First, for a fair deal that the buyer is assured of the health status of the animal he is going to buy and second is to control the spread of diseases from one area to another. Unfortunately animals being traded in the markets are not certified with respect to their health status. It has become a major reason for the spread of diseases from one area/province to the other. Further, purchase of unhealthy animals from the markets by the butchers is also common which leads to sale of poor quality meat to the consumers. Presence of Livestock Department people in the markets was reported to be occasional.

Market and other charges: There are some charges which the sellers and buyers are to bear, when they take their produce to the market, for availing the facility of business opportunity in the market. These include entry charges, charges on transaction and other charges which they pay for using different facilities. The entry and transaction charges are mostly charged by the contractors, in case of public market contracted out by the relevant Local Government Department, or by the managers/organizers of a private market. As mentioned earlier that livestock markets in Balochistan, except few, are private in nature and are held in an unorganized and undisciplined manner. These are just open places where trade takes place. If a state land is used for the purpose there are no market charges and if some private land is used, nominal charges are charged, mostly at loading/unloading points, by the owner of the land or by the person managing the market. Livestock market Quetta, established at Eastern Bye Pass, is a public market. This market is established, controlled and contracted out by Metropolitan Corporation, Quetta. The land of the market is owned by a group of people who provide the facility of shade, water and fodder troughs and charge about Rs. 700-800/- per truck load of 18 animals and Rs. 50/- per animal in case of small transports carrying less animals. In addition to that ramps for loading/unloading of animals have also been established by private people who charge Rs. 500/- per truck load of 35 animals and Rs. 25/- per animal in case of transport carrying small number of animals. The market works for seven days a week. The contractor charges Rs. 30/- per large and Rs. 10/- per small animal for a two days stay in the market. After two days same charges are charged irrespective of sale or purchase of the animals.

Brokers: Wherever there is a sale and purchase of anything, brokers are found offering their services. Same is the case in livestock markets. Brokers facilitate the deal and get their commission. Producers, being less experienced and lacking up to date market information, mostly get their services. Sometimes brokers charge an agreed amount, and sometimes, if they find an opportunity, deceive both seller and buyer and get extra margin in addition to commission.

Efficiency: A general measure of efficiency of any economic activity is – fair deal, due return to the participant, time and cost of the process and satisfaction of all concerned. Unfortunately trade in livestock markets does not fulfill any of the above criteria. High numbers of middlemen leading to reduced margin for producers, long distance involved in trekking the animals to potential

markets, mortality en-route, selling and buying of meat animals on the basis of assessment rather than on weight basis, unorganized selling and buying and poor market information lead to higher marketing time and cost which results in inefficiency of these markets. The efficiency of the market as reflected by the time and cost of the business process and the extent to which price changes are transmitted through the marketing system strongly influences the operation of the markets.

Sale and purchase in livestock markets in Balochistan is mostly done on the basis of visual assessment of animals and through secret negotiation, auction of animals is not practiced. This mechanism does not guarantee a fair deal and the person with adequate information and good negotiation skill, which definitely is not a producer, maneuvers the situation in his favor.

Awareness regarding relevant Law: No one, including suppliers, buyers and contractors, responded positive about awareness of any law governing these markets.

Availability of veterinary services: As in livestock markets trade of live animals occurs and disease checking/health certification of the animals, being traded, is an important aspect of the trade but presence of Livestock Department was not visible in the markets.

Infrastructure/facilities: Livestock markets are mostly established on open places, without any infrastructure/facilities like shade, water for humans and animals, ramps for loading and unloading of livestock – incidents of injury of animals during loading/unloading were reported by many, availability of fodder, boundary wall, weighing scale, electricity, sanitation & drainage.

Institutional Arrangements: Due to private nature of livestock markets in Balochistan, lacking almost all basic facilities, one does not find any institutional arrangements in the markets.

Financial Capacity: Livestock markets in Balochistan are neglected areas and have failed to attract due attention from the relevant Government Departments. As almost all, except few, markets are private in nature, which are not contracted out by the relevant department so no revenue is generated from these markets. Resultantly financial capacity of these markets is poor. Any improvement in the markets needs Government attention for which resources from Government exchequer are required to be utilized to improve the situation and to provide necessary facilities in the markets.

Transportation to and from a market is an important aspect in the marketing of livestock as it link the producing areas with the areas of demand. It plays a role in the determination of final price. Mode of transportation and its cost depends on distance to target market and the type of livestock being transported. From the village or from a mountainous area to nearby local market, animals are mostly brought on foot. Mode of transportation ranges from auto rickshaw, bus, van to a trailer. Producers and local traders bring the livestock to the local market on auto rickshaw, small van, buses and mini trucks. Most common transport, used for transporting animals to the intermediate market, is the mini trucks, mazda and hilux. Mini trucks and large full size trucks are mostly used for carrying the animals to and from the terminal markets while mode of transport for interprovincial trade is large trucks and trailers. Sharing of transport is a common practice at all levels and it minimizes the transportation cost. Transportation of large animals (cattle and

buffaloes) from Punjab and Sind markets to Balochistan markets is most common for which trucks are used which carry about 8-10 animals. Similarly transportation of sheep and goat from Balochistan markets to Punjab and Sind markets is also very common for which mazda trucks are used. To carry maximum number of animals in one trip and to minimize transportation cost, these trucks are divided into two stories and the capacity increases to about 150 animals.

3.2 Economic losses caused in the livestock marketing sector due to lack of infrastructure, services and facilities.

Livestock marketing sector in Balochistan lacks the required infrastructure, services and facilities necessary for efficient functioning of the sector and markets, ensuring optimum returns to the producers and other actors in the supply chain, alleviating poverty and guaranteeing food security. A description of factors responsible and type of such economic losses is given as under:-

Although all types of live stock is produced in Balochistan but small ruminants are of prime importance as the rearing conditions support the production of small animals (sheep and goat), due to the availability of natural grazing places, which are kept by the small holders mainly to meet urgent cash needs and to fulfill their milk and food requirements. Unfortunately the current marketing system has failed to ensure due returns to the producers and they suffer from economic losses as described below:-

3.2.1 Producers receive 30-40 percent less value of their product by selling it at village level instead of taking to the market because of: -

- Poor information regarding price and demand situation in the market.
- Inadequate transport facilities.
- High transportation cost.
- Limited market access.
- Mortality/injury of animal en-route to the market.

3.2.2 Economic losses due to poor system of sale and purchase in the market as: -

- Sale and purchase takes place through secret negotiation, auction does not take place.
- Deal is finalized on the basis of assessment of the animal and without the provision of any information regarding the animal under trade. Weighing, even for meat animals, is not practiced.

3.2.3 Spread of diseases and high animal losses due to non availability veterinary services in the livestock markets.

3.2.4 Low carcass weight due to poor animal husbandry practices.

3.2.5 Losses during loading/unloading of large animals due to non availability of ramps.

3.2.6 Economic losses due to Illegal trade of live animals to the neighboring countries, without any record, which could have fetched resources had these been exported legally.

3.2.7 Non availability of slaughtering/processing facilities for value addition.

3.3 Upstream and downstream market channels for livestock markets operating in five selected districts of Balochistan

There are different upstream and downstream markets channels through which livestock pass before reaching the market and from the market to its ultimate destination which may be a slaughter house, an export point, a market in the other province for further trade or going back to the producer for rearing/stock replacement.

Stakeholders in the livestock sector and their position/influence in the market chain.

There are two main categories of stakeholders in livestock sector – one those found in livestock markets and others which are outside the livestock markets. Stakeholders inside the livestock markets include suppliers, buyers, brokers and contractors. Suppliers can further be divided into producers and traders and buyers can also be divided into farmers/producers, traders, butchers, buying agents, slaughter house owners, illegal traders, processors/exporters and consumers. Stakeholders outside the livestock markets include government departments like Livestock and Dairy Development and Local Government Department. Establishment, management and contracting out of livestock markets is the responsibility of Local Government Department while Livestock Department provides veterinary services in the markets. Stakeholders in livestock sector and their position, with respect to the livestock markets, has been evaluated and described below:-

Table 3: Stakeholders Analysis

Sr. No.	Stakeholder	Position/influence in the market chain		
		Information level	Bargaining skill	Position/Influence
1.	Producers	Low	Poor	Weak
2.	Village dealers	Average	Medium	Average
3.	Large traders	V. High	Excellent	V. Strong
4.	Contractors	High	-	Strong

Sr. No.	Stakeholder	Position/influence in the market chain		
		Information level	Bargaining skill	Position/Influence
5.	Brokers	High	Excellent	Average
6.	Butchers	High	V. Good	Strong
7.	Consumers	Nil	Poor	Weak
8.	Buying Agents	V. High	Excellent	V. Strong
9.	Government Departments	Not part of the market chain	Not part of the market chain	Not part of the market chain
10.	Illegal traders	Medium	Good	Strong

Source: Study findings

Producers: - Mainly there are two types of livestock producers in Balochistan. One are those who rear animals as secondary activity, along with their main farming activities, as a backup economic support and mostly to meet their urgent cash needs. Other are those who raise livestock (mostly sheep and goats) as a full time activity. They rely on grazing the animals on rangelands established on the mountains. They keep on moving from place to place depending on the weather conditions. During winters, when there is severe cold and snow on the mountains, they come down and as the conditions get favorable they again move to the mountains to avail the facility of grazing there.

The producers are not organized, widely dispersed and rarely coordinate with each other. On one side they are sellers while on the other side they are also buyers in the markets. Producers sell animals to meet their urgent needs as well as for the replacement of the stocks. Mostly they sell their livestock at the village level. Since they have little information about the market prices and demand and due to cash needs, they are not in a position to bargain effectively. Even if they visit the market for selling/buying, they face discriminating behavior and being less skilled in the evaluation of livestock, as compared to the traders, mostly fail to strike a good deal. As you move ahead in the supply chain, from primary collection markets to the terminal markets, the presence of producers start decreasing and you hardly find any producer, selling livestock, in the terminal markets. Apart from the above factors time and cost of taking the animals to the next level of market is also one major reason of selling the animals at village or collection market level. As taking animals to a distant market is an additional activity for the producers, so in that case they

are not left with any option except getting rid of the stock to avoid cost of taking back the animals, which reduces their bargaining power. Fear of injury or mortality enroot to the market is another factor inhabiting the producers from taking animal to distant markets.

Village dealers keep on moving in the surrounding villages and purchase livestock direct from the producers, and sell in the nearby local markets. They usually belong to the same area and have the information regarding availability of animals. Being linked with the markets, they have information about the market trends and also have fair idea about the overheads like transportation and feeding cost of animals, and their own transportation and food costs. Village dealers are a link between producers and market. Incidence of injury and mortality, en-route to market, were reported by many.

Large traders have strong forward and backward linkages. They have fare idea about what to buy, from where to buy and where to sell. They also have inter-Provincial linkages and get the benefit of two way trade. They buy livestock from producers and village dealers in small local markets and intermediate collection markets, transport it to terminal markets in the same province or take it to the major consumption centers in other provinces like Punjab and Sind. They are well informed about the current market prices and demand situation. As buyers they also work as buying agents for private slaughter houses, processors and exporters. Large traders are a link between terminal/large consumption markets and intermediate/small markets so the demand in large markets is reflected by the prices they offer to pay. These price signals are further transmitted downward. The large traders are also involved in trade of livestock with Afghanistan and Iran.

Brokers: Like other businesses, presence of brokers in livestock markets is also common. As the livestock markets are held on different days, they keep on moving from market to market. They remain present in the markets as a result they have good level of information regarding demand and prices of animals. Usually they themselves offer their services to the seller or buyer. They assist in the finalization of deal and get their charges, sometimes from the seller and sometimes from both sides.

Butchers are regular customers of livestock markets. They buy live animals from the market or from the producers and sell fresh meat to the consumers, at their retail outlets. They keep visiting different livestock markets to find out cheapest source of animals. They sell meat after 6-8 hours of slaughtering in traditional type slaughterhouses, which lack proper hygienic facilities. Capping of retail prices of meat by the District Administration leads them to sell poor quality meat in the market. Mostly the butchers sell a mix of different quality meat. Income returns to the butchers come from meat sales as well as from its by-products such as skin, head, trotters, stomach, lung and liver, etc.

Consumers buy non graded meat from butchers' shops where poor hygienic conditions exist. The Government regulates the price of meat but does not guarantee minimum meat quality standards and there is no premium associated with quality of meat under the law. This is one of the obstacles towards providing quality product to the consumers, who are ultimate payer of high meat prices. Reports of selling of meat coming from animals slaughtered outside the public

slaughter house were common and no effective mechanism, to check the situation, was found to be in place.

Processors/Exporters/Slaughter Houses mostly make their purchases through the buying agents. Detail of demand, which covers type of animal, its age, weight and price is conveyed to the agents and agreed who procure animals from the markets, mostly from producing areas for them. Their demand and prices affect the market.

Illegal traders: There is big demand for Pakistani meat and live animals in Afghanistan and Iran. This demand is met through legal and illegal trade. Livestock markets, established in border cities of Rakhni, in Barkhan district, and Chaman, are ideal places for such trade. In addition to this livestock from all major markets in Balochistan are purchased for the purpose. Presence of these traders in the markets raises the demand. Illegal trade of live animals mostly to Iran and Afghanistan pushes the prices upward.

Government Departments - Livestock and Local Government Department: Livestock markets in Balochistan come under the purview of Balochistan Local Government Board (BLGB), which works under the Local Government Department. When contacted to seek information regarding role of the Board with respect to establishment and working of the livestock markets, it was intimated that after devolution this subject has been handed over to the relevant local government department of the district and the BLGB has no active role in this regard. Livestock Department is supposed to provide veterinary services in the markets but their presence was not found to be visible during the appraisal and was reported to be restricted only when there is an issue of spread of any disease.

3.4 Deficiencies and distortions in current practices and their impact

Present system of establishment and working of livestock markets in Balochistan has been observed to be having many deficiencies and distortions which are explained below:-

Record keeping: As the livestock markets are held in an unorganized manner, no record of any type regarding number and type of animals arrived, sources of supply, animals traded, value of trade, purpose of purchase and destination of animals is maintained in the market. This is important information to be compiled for planning, policy formulation, working out changes in producers' response to any changes in the market and determining market efficiency. Further any record regarding number and type of livestock markets, established in Balochistan, was not found to be collected and compiled at some central level. Such information is important for any policy formulation on the subject.

Regulation: The livestock markets are supposed to work and regulated by the relevant Local Government Department but in Balochistan most the markets are established and are run under private set up. Effective regulatory role has not been found to be played by this department.

Brokers are present in almost every market. They play the role of intermediary in the finalization of a deal and get their charges which is usually an agreed amount. The need of brokers arises

because of non availability of information about the supply-demand situation and about the animal being traded like its age, weight, health status, pedigree and true milking potential. In the absence of this vital information it is difficult for the seller or buyer, particularly new one (mostly producers), to evaluate true worth of the animal being traded and because of this, the need of brokers arises. Sometimes the brokers keep both seller and buyer in dark. The seller on one side gets less return of his product while the buyer on the other side pay more, the difference amount goes into the pocket of middleman. It leads to less return to the producers and higher prices in the market. It all happens because of lack of information and finalization of deal on the basis of assessment instead of any realistic criteria.

Weighment: Trade in the market is carried out on the basis of personal judgment and there is no solid base to evaluate an animal. Particularly for animals sold or purchased for meat purpose, weight of the animal is important. In the markets there is no arrangement of weighing the animals. Unfortunately the sellers and buyers in the market did not show any interest in this idea that the actual live weight of the animal may provide a proper base for further negotiation. Actually there is a misconception in the market. Everyone thinks that he can accurately judge the weight of the animal and can exploit the situation in his favor. Actually at the end, the producers and new buyers, being less experienced, are at loss. Weighing of animals must be introduced in the markets. Traders were found to be particularly against the idea because this is the area where they can maneuver the situation in their favor.

Pricing mechanism and market information: Price of any product is very important in any business. It determines the profit for the seller and margin for a trader. Sale purchase in the livestock markets usually takes place through negotiation, secret or open. Demand supply situation and bargaining skill also plays an important role in reaching the final price. A person with more market information and better bargaining skill may strike a good deal. In this way the persons with less market information and poor bargaining skill, which are mostly producers, may not get the real value of his product. To avoid this distortion, provision of market information and maximum information about the animal, being traded, like its age, sex, weight, pedigree, true milking potential, health status, etc be provided to all concerned so that some basis may become available for further negotiation. Auctioning of animals instead of negotiation may be a good idea.

Control on meat prices: Meat prices at retail level are fixed by the District Administration which leads to slaughtering of unhealthy and old animals as no premium is associated with the good quality meat. It was observed that in spite capping the meat prices, good quality meat is available in the market but at a higher price in violation of the Government policy.

Milking potential: Animals purchased for milking purpose are tested for their milk potential. Sellers bringing such animals to the market don't milk them for last 24 or 36 hours and when tested for the purpose show good milk potential. Injections are also used to temporarily enhance milk yield. The buyer is deceived in this way. Moreover both the above mentioned practices, to show high milk potential, are also harmful for the health of the milking animal. These may be avoided and there should be a check on it.

Security and provision of bank counter: In livestock markets trade is carried out on net cash basis. So the buyers coming to the markets carry large amount of cash with them. Incidences of robbery were reported by many people and they also expressed their concern about non availability of security in and around the market premises. Provision of bank counter, at least in large markets, was demanded by many.

Sale of Stolen Animals: Incidence of sale of stolen animals is an issue in the livestock markets and due to non maintenance of record, solution of the problem becomes very difficult as traceability is not possible in the absence of required information.

3.5 Time and cost to private and public sectors based on current policies and practices and Business Process.

Balochistan is a mountainous area where livestock markets are held, in an unorganized manner, at some open place, owned by some private person, or some state land is used for the purpose. In case of private land, market charges are received by the owner of land, which usually are not very high. In some cases few people organize the market privately and they also collect market charges. Market charges are also collected by the contractor of a public market (like livestock market, Eastern Bye Pass, Quetta), such markets are very small in number in Balochistan. Transportation of animals, to and from the markets, cost of using the facilities in the markets, like loading/unloading, stay in the market, personal transport and food cost, are other items of cost which the suppliers and buyers have to bear. Payment of contract amount to the relevant Local Government Department, against collection of revenue from a public market, is also a cost item born by the private sector. As far as time to the private sector, under current policies and practices is concerned, it is worth mentioning here that due to unorganized nature of markets, non availability of transport facilities, particularly to the producers bringing their animals to local collection markets and long hours taken to reach the market, non availability of market information and time involved to complete the process of sale and purchase in the market, are the factors responsible for long time which the private sector has to give to complete the process. As the livestock markets in Balochistan, which are lacking in very basic facilities, is a neglected area for the Government, because no attention is paid and no resources are allocated for the improvement of same, so time and cost to the public sector in this regard, under current policies and practices, is almost negligible.

Business processes are typically defined as sets of activities that provide some form of value added to customers (Theuvsen, 1996)⁴. Concerning business processes in the livestock trading industry, the terms supplier (seller) and customer (buyer) first need to be further clarified. Depending on the particular business process, the respective positions of buyers and sellers can change. For example, in the marketing of livestock for productive uses, farmers can act as

⁴ Source: Business process analyses with *Visio*: An application in the cooperative livestock trading sector - Anja Voss, Ludwig Theuvsen

suppliers as well as customers, whereas, in the marketing of slaughter animals, farmers act as suppliers, while slaughterhouses act as customers.

In the business process of livestock marketing there are, as mentioned above, suppliers on the one side and buyers on the other. Suppliers include producers and traders while buyers include farmers, traders, butchers, buying agents, exporters and slaughter house owners. Business process can be evaluated according to various efficiency measures for instance, processing time, cost of doing business, error ratios, customer satisfaction, staff motivation, etc¹.

A further description of time and cost, in the business process, to the private sector is given here. Mostly the producers sell their livestock at village level on the basis of little information obtained from fellow villagers. In this way time and cost on their part is almost nil but they get less value of their product. Some producers take their animals to nearby small markets. Mode of transport ranges from auto rickshaw to bus or van, depending on the number and type of livestock and distance to market. Bus was observed to be the cheapest mode of transport. Sharing of transport was reported by many. It minimizes the transportation cost. In addition to that personal costs of travelling and food are also incurred by the producer. In the market, as there is no systematic way of trade, the livestock marketed by producers, may be sold early or it may take the whole day. In most of the cases full day is lost in the process.

Village dealers purchase animals from the producers in the surrounding areas and sell them in the nearby primary collection market or secondary distribution market. Purchase price of the animal is estimated keeping in view its price in the intended market and adding to it the transportation and feeding costs and their own food and transportation costs. Similarly large traders mostly make their purchases from secondary distribution markets and take the animals to the terminal or other larger markets in the areas of demand. Price is determined keeping in view the expected price in the target market and by adding to it overhead costs associated with transporting the animal to end market and self food and transportation costs. As the large traders are in frequent contact with the terminal markets, they have updated information about the market prices and requirement of buyers in the intended market and about type and quality of animals required.

The livestock being marketed is not of uniform type, size and quality. Price estimation in the markets is not based on any solid facts and there is no system of spread of market information so chances of loss are always there. Within the market the business process is almost same. In few markets different types of animals are traded separately otherwise in most of the markets all types of animals are mixed up which creates difficulty for sellers and buyers and more time is spent in selling and buying the required animals which also increases the cost to complete the process. Mostly the sellers and buyers were not found satisfied with the trading practices as these were not transparent and are not based on any solid criteria. Present business process based on current policies and practices does not fulfill any efficiency measures.

3.6 Sources and amount of revenue received from livestock markets over past five years and its utilization.

Livestock markets in Balochistan come under the purview of Balochistan Local Government Board (BLGB) and normally the source of revenue from livestock markets, as in other three provinces of Pakistan, is the amount received through awarding contract for the collection of revenue from public livestock markets. The contractor collects revenue from suppliers and buyers in the market, in the shape of entry and transaction charges.

On the basis of information, obtained from various sources during the appraisal, only one market could be identified as public livestock market, which is the market established at Eastern Bye Pass, Quetta, contracted out by the Metropolitan Corporation, Quetta against a sum of Rs. 1,25,00,000/- for the year 2012-13 (as reported by an official of relevant department of the corporation). Detail of utilization of this amount was not shared. Some other markets were also reported to be contracted out, as public markets, but any specific, reliable, information in this regard could not become available.

All other markets were reported to be private markets from where no revenue is received by the public sector.

3.7 Needs and concerns of suppliers and buyers.

Suppliers and buyers are main stakeholders in livestock markets. It was important to get their views regarding working of the markets and to record their needs and concerns. During the appraisal almost all types of suppliers and buyers were contacted and their views were recorded which are described below:-

Provision of facilities in the markets: Livestock markets are devoid of any kind of basic facilities like shade, water for humans and animals, ramps for loading and unloading, fodder and fodder troughs, sanitation and drainage, weighing arrangements and veterinary services. Suppliers and buyers expressed their concern about non availability of these facilities and emphasized for the provision of same.

Security: Suppliers and buyers expressed their concern over the current security situation in and around the market premises. During the appraisal many people demanded proper security arrangements on the day of market as there is cash handling in large amounts and this is in the knowledge of every person that people coming to and going from the market must be having cash with them. Incidences of cash snatching and robbery were reported by many people. Establishment of a bank counter on the day of market, at least in large markets, was also demanded by many.

Disease checking and health certification: Spread of animal diseases through the trade of diseased live animals is an area of concern highlighted by many suppliers and buyers in the markets. They further pointed out that in case of any animal falling sick or in case of injury there is no arrangement of its treatment in the market. To overcome the situation establishment of a counter of veterinary staff in the markets was proposed by many.

Provision of market information: Awareness regarding up to date reliable market information is necessary for the sale and purchase of livestock. Traders are in continuous contact with the markets so their information level is usually much higher than the producers who sell their animals at village level or in the local collection market and their frequency of visits to market is very low so they remain less informed regarding the prices and supply demand situation. Further the market information of suppliers and buyers is limited to their area of work and is based on personal contacts. The introduction of cellular phone has facilitated them in collecting information from different markets but this is an individual based effort and no formal system of provision of market information exists presently. This issue was raised by many during the appraisal.

Fixation of meat prices: Maximum limit of meat prices is fixed by the District Administration. With the passage of time prices of live animals are increasing due to inflation and many other factors. Although the meat pieces are revised from time to time but an effort is usually made to keep the meat prices at minimum level to facilitate the consumers. Supply of good quality meat at the fixed price is very difficult which leads to slaughtering of un-healthy and diseased animals. Buyers of animals, particularly the butchers, expressed their concern on it and demanded a premium associated with good quality meat.

3.8 Livestock major products for marketing and value chain associated with these products:

Every part of livestock is used to satisfy human needs and desires. Following are the major products of livestock⁵:

Milk is an important product of livestock, which accomplish the need of people. Now there are significant number of cattle, buffaloes and sheep and goat that are kept for dairy purpose. There is no surplus milk posing any marketing problem to the producers in most of the towns and cities. Fresh liquid milk produced in few peri-urban dairy units in different towns finds immediate market, rather supply is less than the demand especially in summers. In milk marketing, dodhies and milkmen are the only dominant intermediary. A number of adulterations and contaminations are reported in the milk supplied by dodhies. The competitive milk marketing in the pasteurized and Ultra Heat Treated (UHT) forms is at highly limited scale and UHT milk prices are almost double than the loose fresh milk supplied by dodhies. There is some seasonality in the production of milk. In winter, milk supply increases, because of calving pattern of buffaloes and cows leading to decrease in milk prices in rural areas. However, middlemen harvest this benefit and urban consumers rarely get the due benefit. The district and city government fixes the milk price on the recommendations of price committee but the quality of milk supplied at the fixed price is not ensured. The price is fixed as the maximum retail price but it serves as the minimum retail price and the consumers, although being aware of the milk prices, have to pay price much higher than the official price, most of the time, to get good quality milk.

⁵ Shafiq, M. and Kakar, M. A. 2006. Current Livestock Marketing and its Future Prospects for the Economic Development of Balochistan – Pakistan. International Journal of Agriculture and Biology, 1560-8530/2006/08-6-885-895.

Mutton provides the protein to the human body; therefore it is considered as an integral part of human need. Mutton is obtained from sheep and goat. Development of the mutton industry is constrained by the largely traditional meat marketing system, which provides no incentive for the production of good quality meat. This is evident in the lack of facilities in live animal markets, the old-fashioned slaughter facilities and retail price structure. Abattoirs are seriously lacking basic sanitation facilities like light, adequate water supply, space for slaughtering and animal keeping, meat refrigeration and disposal of offal. Due to non-grading sale system, the butchers are getting more profit to buy female culled animal for slaughtering. Although pre-and post mortem examination exists yet illegal slaughtering is taking place. The control price at end product is one of the negative factors on quality. Because of poor quality control, the mutton of old and diseased animals is sold in the markets in generalⁱⁱⁱ (Iqbal *et al.*, 2000). The existing quality control system of livestock is poor. The fix pricing system produces poor quality of mutton. The butchers are interested in carcass weight, no meat grading system is prevailing and so the butchers always prefer to buy female culled animals than young healthy animals. Improvement in the existing quality control system is inevitable, as it does not suit to producers and consumers as producers are not fetching the desired price of a healthy animal and simultaneously the consumers are getting poor quality meat of unhealthy animals at the fixed retail price.

Beef can be obtained from cattle, buffaloes and camel but cattle are the main source of beef production to the meat markets. Major part of total population is marketed to slaughtered houses, which is not enough to meet the demand of the dwellings. The supply can meet the demand but due to massive smuggling of large animals to Afghanistan and Iran, there is always shortage of all sort of meat. As now, realizing the potential and returns associated with the cattle farming for beef purpose, people have started adopting it on commercial bases.

Hides and Skins. When animal is slaughtered, its hides and skins are used to generate income. Hides are obtained from large ruminants; such as cattle, buffaloes and camels, while skins are collected from the small ruminants; like sheep and goat. These hides and skins are used for different propose of human needs. At first step skins and hides are purchased by the local traders in small towns/cities and weekly collection is taken to the wholesale market mostly in some big city. At wholesale market lots are made according to the type, size and quality of skins or hides where these are sold to the wholesaler. The wholesales onward supply these skins or hides to different tanneries. Often poor quality of hides and skins is the most important constraint affecting the marketing of hides and skins. Poor quality is due to poor flaying techniques, improper preservation and warble fly or tick damage. In this scenario, the butchers need some good and modern training in flaying and salting of hides and skins before going for marketing to leather tanning and manufacturing industry. The hides and skins provide basic input for a progressive export-oriented leather tanning and manufacturing industry. Due to poor production and marketing system, Pakistan is facing substantial lossⁱⁱⁱ (Qureshi, 2002). The older butchers teach young butchers about flaying and meat cutting in the abattoirs and meat shops.

Wool. Sheep are the source of wool production, used for further consumption. Wool production is 1.5% of the total value of the livestock^{iv}. Wool production can be increased if scientific methods are used and it is managed properly. Again the lack of incentive for the producer to improve the

quality of the marketed wool is not so much a reflection of price but of the value of wool produced, in comparison to the value of the animals for meat. Further constraints result from poor shearing techniques, lack of sorting and marking of wool^v. Wool is an important by-product of sheep farming activity and basic input for warm cloth and carpet industry. A number of household products are also indigenously manufactured from using sheep wool thread. There are two sources of wool one is fleece wool and other is slip/clip wool. Wool shearing is performed twice a year i.e. once in spring or March-April and then in autumn or August/September. As sheep is found in all provinces of Pakistan, therefore wool marketing is spread throughout the country. However, wool and hair marketing activities are relatively more concentrated in the areas specialized in sheep and goat farming. There are only a few major wool-trading centers in the entire country. Multan wool market is largest wool market of Pakistan followed by Jhang, Mianwali, Bahwalnagar, Quetta and Sahiwal. D.G. Khan wool market is also developing gradually as a big wool market of Pakistan^{vi}. The producer sells fleece wool to the collector or wool merchants in the nearest urban center. A wholesale trader then transports and resells the wool at the large wool markets, usually to a commission agent working on behalf of a processor or exporter. Export oriented wool is handled through the grading centers at Karachi, Multan and Lahore and is sorted, washed/scoured, baled and graded according to the grades defined by Wool Test House, Karachi. Slip wool is normally purchased by processors directly from the skin tanneries and most is exported^{vii}. The price of wool is paid to the producers on weight basis. The white colored, clean wool fetches relatively higher price as compared to dirty and pale colored one. Similarly the mixed wool is also receiving low price. However, the reflection of incentive for quality wool production in wool price is very little compared to the amount of efforts needed to produce good quality wool^{viii}.

Hair. Goat provides the hair, which is used, for domestic consumption. Proper strategy is required to increase the production of hair of goats having constructive demand in the domestic and in the nearby countries.

Farmyard manure. As it is said earlier that nothing is the waste of livestock, manure is also utilized and is a sold item. Whether it is poultry waste or waste of any animal, it is used as fertilizer for agriculture land. Part of manure produced remains un-utilized or is dried for fuel purpose. It can also be used for odder production for livestock.

Offal. Animals' offal is also a sale item, which is not only eaten but also utilized in making the string of sports goods.

3.9 Principal Findings

On the basis of appraisal some principal findings have been made which are given as under:-

1. Livestock in Balochistan comprises of sheep, goats, cattle, camels, horses, donkeys, poultry and in some areas buffaloes. Sheep and goats are the most significant in Balochistan as these are reared on rangelands which serve as major food source so are kept by all sorts of farmers and livestock traders.
2. Balochistan Local Government Board (BLGB), having its Head Office at Quetta, deals with the livestock markets in the province.

3. As per information obtained from BLGB there is no central system of collection and compilation of information regarding holding of livestock markets in the province.
4. In Quetta district there is only one livestock market, to which we can call a public market, established under Government control which is livestock market Eastern bye-pass, Quetta and controlled by Metropolitan Corporation, Quetta. Contract of this market has been awarded to a private contractor.
5. As per report of BLGB there might be some other public markets in the province but these markets come under the domain of relevant Local Government institution and this information is normally not compiled at any central level.
6. Apart from this majority of the markets in the province are established under private set up.
7. These livestock markets are organized at different levels such as; local, sub-tehsil, tehsil and district on daily, weekly, fortnightly, monthly and sometimes yearly bases. These markets are traditional; therefore both buyers and sellers are mostly well informed about these market days or dates, as these have remained un-changed since ages.
8. In general, both small and large ruminants are traded in the same market, however in some places, the trade of small and large animals takes place in separate markets.
9. Trade of live stock starts at village level. A trader, usually belonging to the same area, moves around in the nearby villages and buys livestock from the producers and take the purchased animals to the local market, to which we can call a Primary Collection Market, for onward sale to the traders visiting the market from other cities.
10. These traders take the animals to the next larger market, a Secondary Distribution Market, for onward sale to the buyers from other areas who take the animals to the Terminal Markets.
11. Information level of producers with respect to supply and demand situation, export/illegal trade and market prices, is very low as compared to the trader.
12. Even if the producers have some awareness regarding better prices in next level of market, they usually prefer to sell in the local market or at village level due to the difficulty in availability and high cost of transport.
13. Livestock markets are generally open places devoid of any facility like shade, shelter, water for humans and animals, boundary wall, ramps for loading/unloading of animals.
14. Deal in the market is finalized on the basis of assessment of animal and weighing is not practiced in case of meat animals. Trader, with a better assessment skill, usually succeeds to finalize the deal in his favor.
15. Being situated in the vicinity of Afghanistan and Iran there is lot of demand of livestock from Balochistan.

16. Having a porous border with Afghanistan and Iran there is inward and outward flow of animals.
17. Chaman, Rakhni and Noshki, being border cities, are the main trading places with Afghanistan and Iran.
18. Livestock major products include milk, mutton, beef, hides and skins, poultry, wool and farm yard manure. In addition to this blood and offals are also collected and used for different purposes if available in sufficient quantity.
19. In the markets deal is finalized through negotiation, auction is not practiced. Demand supply situation and bargaining and assessment skill also plays its role in reaching the final price of the animal and traders, being experienced, have an edge over the producers in this regard.
20. Stakeholders in livestock markets have no awareness regarding any law governing establishment and working of these markets.
21. No animal welfare association/organization or of market managers, traders or producers was reported to be established for consultation for any future market development.
22. Incidence of injury/mortality en-route to market was reported to be common.
23. Usual margin of traders between purchase and sale price was found to be between 30 to 50 percent.
24. Majority of suppliers and buyers in the markets were of the view that Government should manage the markets.
25. Collection of market charges, wherever collected, is made either on entry or on loading/unloading places.
26. There is no source of prior information regarding market trends i.e., increase or decrease in demand which strongly affect the market prices. Situation becomes clear only on reaching the market.
27. Producers take their animals to market usually on foot which sometimes takes a day to reach the market.
28. Producers receive 30-40% higher price if sold in the market instead of selling at village level.
29. Suitability of transport for transporting the animals, with respect to cost, depends on the destination, distance, type of livestock to be transported and purpose – whether trade or otherwise.
30. Most common reason of sale of livestock by the producers was found to be instant cash needs and sometimes non availability of feed.

31. Geographically Balochistan is situated in a central place having its borders with Punjab, Sind, Afghanistan and Iran. Due to this geographic location it is an ideal place for trade of livestock. There is an inflow and outflow of different types of animals.
32. The markets established in border cities have their own importance with respect to the trade of a specific type of livestock.
33. Barkhan district is famous for sheep production and its trade takes place in Rakhni market from where it is supplied to Punjab, Afghanistan and Iran. Similarly Hub, Uthal and Bela areas are famous for goat production which is supplied to Karachi.
34. Bela, Kharan, Noshki, Chaghai and Awaran areas are source of supply of camel to Iran which, as per reports, is further supplied to Gulf states.
35. Balochistan is also an area used for transit trade from where cattle (cows and bulls) from Punjab and Sind, en-route to Afghanistan, passes through. Buffaloes from Punjab and Sind are also supplied to Balochistan for slaughtering.

4.0 Analysis

Livestock in Balochistan is raised as backup economic support to meet urgent cash needs and for meeting the household milk and meat requirements. Producers lack land and water for fodder cultivation for animals. Livestock is dependent upon grazing on rangelands. The Environmental Profile of Balochistan has defined the range as self-generating and self-maintaining vegetation used for livestock grazing. The rangelands not only serve as habitats for most of the wildlife, but small flocks are completely dependent on rangelands for their food. These rangelands are continuously depleting and if appropriate measures are not taken, will no longer remain available for grazing. Rangelands depletion is attributed to burgeoning population, persistent drought in recent years, over-grazing and deforestation. The deforestation and over-grazing have destroyed the flora and fauna besides depleting the vegetation cover of the rangelands. During winter, the farmers living in central Balochistan migrate with their flocks to lower lands in Sibi and Kachhi plains for grazing their flocks.

Being a pastoral economy, Balochistan is yet to exploit its potential in livestock sector. The small and landless livestock farmers live under miserable socio-economic conditions. Local farmers even have no idea or familiarity with modern animal husbandry practices. There is no organized cattle farming activity, and the province suffers low productivity. The local farmers use unhygienic and polluted water for their animals. They lack proper healthcare coverage for their animals, poor marketing system and extension services. The small-scale farmers have no linkages with processors and marketers. They are also deficient in technical know-how to increase meat production.

Keeping in view the above facts it is important to see that once the livestock has been produced, how it is marketed and whether the current marketing system of live animals in Balochistan is efficient, ensuring optimum returns to the producers.

For the purpose, appraisal of livestock markets in Balochistan was conducted from March, 2013 to May, 2013. Information from suppliers, buyers and other stakeholders in and outside the markets was collected. Information so collected was analyzed and an analysis of the situation is given as under:-

Livestock Markets

Livestock marketing is a very important aspect of animal rearing. Unfortunately there is no organized system of holding of livestock markets in Balochistan. In Balochistan livestock markets come under the purview of Balochistan Local Government Board (BLGB), which works under the Local Government Department. Almost all, except few, livestock markets are established and run by the private sector. Information regarding establishment and working of livestock markets in Balochistan, whether public or private, was not found to be collected and compiled at any central level. The information collected during appraisal reveals that there are about 42 livestock markets in Balochistan, most of which are privately organized and managed, which usually held at district head quarter level with some smaller markets, in few districts, held in nearby areas.

Livestock markets in Balochistan are mostly held in an open place, under open sky, without any organization, management, infrastructure and facilities like shelter for animals, water for humans and animals, ramps for loading and unloading of animals, boundary walls, feed, fodder and fodder troughs, weighing arrangements, sanitation and drainage and electricity. These markets are held mainly due to two reasons - one is availability and supply of livestock in its producing area and second is trade opportunities which are mainly because of geographical location of the market. There is no market intelligence/information service available due to which a level playing field is not available to all the stakeholders and it leads to exploitative behavior by those (mostly the traders) having more market information regarding prices, supply and demand situation because of frequent contact with other livestock markets. They can co-relate this information in a meaningful way, which help them in taking decisions regarding sale and purchase of animals and in demanding/offering prices.

Market days in an area are kept in a way that these do not clash with each other so that suppliers and buyers get maximum opportunity to buy and sell their animals. Some markets are held for small animals and some for large. In many markets small and large animals are traded at the same place. In some markets animals of different categories are traded in separate sections of the market but in most of the cases animals of all categories are mixed up which create problem for the buyers in finding out the desired animal which is also more time consuming.

Facility of veterinary staff for disease checking/health certification is mostly not available in the markets which lead to spread of animal diseases to other areas/provinces. It was revealed during appraisal that presence of veterinary staff in the markets is witnessed whenever there is a campaign against some disease and it is not a normal feature.

Another issue with respect to the marketing of livestock is the sale and purchase without having any description of the features of the animal under trade like its health status, pedigree, milking potential, weight, age, etc. It is on the spot decision and any misjudgment will result in the shape of loss on the part of buyer. Even in case of meat animals trading takes place on the basis of head count instead of live weight which, at least, provides some base for further negotiation. In this case also the producers, being less experienced, are at loss.

Deal in the market is finalized mostly through secret negotiation, auction was not found to be practiced in any market. Due to this the seller does not get the best price of its product or the buyer may pay more. Here again the experienced person remains in benefit. One may find traders buying and selling the same animal in the same market and getting reasonable margin in the process. It all happens due to poor marketing practices like selling the animals on the basis of head count instead of live weight, poor market information and through secret negotiation instead of auction.

Market charges, are not a big issue in Balochistan as most of the livestock markets in Balochistan, except few, are private in nature. These are just open places where trade takes place. If a state land is used for the purpose there are no market charges and if some private land is used, nominal charges are charged, mostly at loading/unloading points. Although there are some market charges charged in the livestock markets managed and contracted out by the relevant Local Government Department like one established at Eastern By-pass, Quetta contracted out by the Metropolitan Corporation, Quetta. Market charges in such market include entry charges, charges on transaction and other charges which are charged for using different facilities.

There is no system of collection and maintenance of record with respect to the animals reaching the markets, their health status, origin, ownership, animals traded, price, value of trade, destination and purpose of sale or purchase. This information is necessary to evaluate efficiency of markets, response of suppliers and buyers to any changes in the behavior of markets and to formulate any policy for the improvement of livestock marketing and livestock sector. Further, due to the absence of any record, traceability of the animal sold or purchased is not possible

Organizations of livestock producers, traders, contractors and animal welfare were not found to be established who could give suggestions for the improvement of livestock marketing.

Meat prices are fixed by the local government and no premium is associated with the quality of meat. It leads to slaughtering of unhealthy and old animals. Prevalence of brokers is common in the markets. They assist in the finalization of deal and get their pre-decided commission. Sometime they get the benefit of loose system of selling and buying in the market and get a reasonable margin in a deal.

Each part of the livestock is saleable which includes milk, mutton, beef, hides and skins, poultry, wool, farmyard manure and offal. But marketing of these products still needs improvement to ensure maximum returns to the livestock holders.

It has been concluded that under present circumstances the working of livestock markets in Balochistan do not fulfill the required efficiency criteria and also do not ensure optimum returns to the producers, the original owners of the product. Although the role of traders is important as they are integral part of the supply chain and also they provide a link between producers and consumers but actual issue is to remove the discrepancies and distortions in the present livestock marketing system, as pointed out in this report, so that a level playing field may become available to all the players and due returns are ensured to the producers. To achieve the objective livestock markets are the points to kick start the process through appropriate policy formulation and regulation.

Geographical Importance

Balochistan is situated at an important geographical location having its boundaries attached, on one side, with Punjab and Sindh and on other side with Afghanistan and Iran. Due to this geographic location it is an ideal place for trade of livestock. There is an inward and outward flow of different types of livestock with Punjab and Sindh. Markets established, particularly in border cities, have their own importance in this regard. Barkhan district is famous for sheep production and its trade takes place in Rakhni market from where it is supplied to Punjab, Afghanistan and Iran. Similarly Hub, Uthal and Bela areas are famous for goat production which is supplied to Karachi. Bela, Kharan, Noshki, Chaghai and Awaran areas are source of supply of camel to Iran which, as per reports, is further supplied to Gulf states. Balochistan is also an area used for transit trade from where cattle (cows and bulls) from Punjab and Sind, en-route to Afghanistan, passes through. If proper attention is given to improve the markets and to facilitate the legal trade it may become a good source of foreign exchange earnings for the country as well as ensuring better returns to the producers.

5.0 ANNEXURE

5.1 – Key Questions

5.1.1 - Information from Suppliers to Livestock Market

1. Market - name & address _____ Date of Visit _____
2. Name of supplier _____
3. Address _____ Contact No. _____
4. Category of Supplier (a). Producer/Farmer (b). Trader (c). Other _____
5. Type of livestock being marketed:-

Sr. No.	Type	Reserve Price	Age	Weight
1.	_____	_____	_____	_____
2.	_____	_____	_____	_____
3.	_____	_____	_____	_____
4.	_____	_____	_____	_____

6. Reason of sale (i) Instant cash need (ii) Trade (iii) Non availability of feed
7. Origin/ distance /time to reach market _____
8. Mode/cost of transport _____
9. Cheapest mode of transport _____
10. Views about collective transportation _____
11. Incidence of injury, mortality, theft during transportation _____
12. How the value of livestock is estimated _____
13. Previous price information of the livestock _____ If yes – Source _____, Is it helpful in striking a good deal _____
14. Knowledge of market trends – rise in demand and price w. r. to (i) Export (ii) any other reason (specify) _____
15. % age difference in price of similar type of livestock, between Eid-ul-Azha and other days _____

16. Mode of deciding/finalizing the deal (i) Open (ii) Secret
17. If seller is (i) Producer – difference in price between selling to trader at village level or in a market __%, (ii) Trader – whether purchased from producer at village level or from other trader and difference between purchase and sale price
18. Facilities available in the market: (a) Shade (b) Ramps for loading/unloading (c) Water (d) Fodder (e) Fodder troughs (f) Weighing (g) Sanitation/drainage (h) Boundary wall (i) Disease checking_____
19. Facilities required in addition to above_____
20. Charges to be paid on transaction (a) Amount/rate_____ (b) Paid to whom_____ Receipt obtained Y/N (d) Awareness about permissible charges - Y/N
21. Behavior of contractor/its agent_____
22. Awareness about any law governing the market – if yes, views about it_____
23. Awareness about rights and liabilities of contractor_____
24. Are you satisfied with the system? Y/N, If not what improvements are proposed
 - a. _____
 - b. _____
 - c. _____
25. Market should be held daily/weekly/fortnightly/monthly
26. Opinion about access to market and its organization_____
27. Are there any illegal livestock markets without Govt. control/management. If yes what %age _____
28. Is there any illegal trade of livestock –if yes, (i) To what extent (Nos.)_____ (ii) Destination market (s)_____ (iii) Mechanism _____
29. Market information availability Y/N, if yes (i) Source_____ (ii) Type_____
30. Existence of any (formal) associations, for future market development, of:-
 - (i) Market managers Y/N (ii) Traders Y/N (iii) Producers Y/N
31. Animal welfare issues in the market and existence of animal welfare association

32. Current supply and demand situation for livestock in Balochistan – meeting local demand from:- (i) Local supply_____% (ii) Other provinces/markets
_____%

33. Whether annual demand for livestock in Balochistan is – (i) Increasing _____%
(ii) Decreasing _____% (iii) Reasons _____

5.1.2 - Information from Buyers in the Livestock Market

1. Market – Name & address _____ Date of Visit _____
2. Name of buyer _____
3. Address _____ Contact No. _____
4. Category of buyer: Farmer/Trader/Butcher/Buying Agent/Consumer/Processor/any other
5. Detail of livestock purchased:-

	Sr. No. Weight	Type	Purchase Price	Age
1.	_____	_____	_____	_____
2.	_____	_____	_____	_____
3.	_____	_____	_____	_____
4.	_____	_____	_____	_____

6. Purpose of purchase – (a). For Rearing (b) Trading (c) Consumption (d). For onward sale to _____ (d) For processing/slaughtering (e) Other _____
7. If for trade then target market (s) _____
8. Usual expected margin between purchase & sale price _____%
9. Other sources of purchase _____
10. Percent of total purchase (a) From Market _____ (b). From other sources _____
11. Mode/cost of transport _____
12. Cheapest mode of transport _____
13. Views about collective transportation _____
14. Incidence of injury, mortality, theft during transportation _____
15. Facilities available in the market: (a) Shade (b) Ramps for loading/unloading (c) Water (d) Fodder (e) Fodder troughs (f) Weighing (g) Sanitation/drainage (h) Boundary wall (i) Disease checking _____

16. Charges to be paid (a) On transaction (b) On entry (c) On exit (d) Rate/amount _____ (e) Paid to whom _____ (f) Receipt obtained Y/N (g) Awareness about permissible charges Y/N
17. Behavior of contractor/its agent _____ Services provided _____
18. Awareness about rights and liabilities of contractor _____
19. Awareness about any law governing the market – if yes, views about it: _____
20. Are you satisfied with the system - Y/N What improvements are proposed?
- a. _____
- b. _____
- c. _____
21. Market should be held daily/weekly/fortnightly/monthly?
22. Opinion about access to market and its organization _____
23. Are there any illegal livestock markets without Govt. control/management. If yes what %age _____
24. Is there any illegal trade of livestock –if yes, (i) To what extent (Nos.) _____ (ii) Destination market (s) _____ (iii) Mechanism _____
25. Availability of market information Y/N, If yes (i) Source _____ (ii) Type _____
26. Details of any (formal) associations, for future market development, of:-
- (i) Market managers Y/N, (ii) Traders Y/N (iii) Producers Y/N
27. Animal welfare issues in the market and existence of animal welfare association _____
28. Current supply and demand situation for livestock in Balochistan – meeting local demand from:- (i) Local supply _____% (ii) Other provinces/markets _____%
29. Whether annual demand for livestock in Balochistan is – (i) Increasing _____% (ii) Decreasing _____% (iii) Reasons _____
30. Recovery from the livestock losses due to floods in 2010 _____%.

5.1.3 - General Information Regarding Livestock Market

(One questionnaire to be filled from one market)

Date _____

1. Location/address _____

2. Area _____

3. Name _____ of
contractor _____

4. Value/period of contract for 2012-13 _____

5. Contract awarding authority _____

6. Law under which market is functioning _____

7. Facilities available _____

(1) Weighing – Y/N, Loading/unloading ramp – Y/N, Water – for humans – Y/N, For animals – Y/N, Fodder/feed – Y/N, Its prices as compared to market prices _____

Fodder Troughs Y/N, Shade – Y/N, Health certification/disease treatment – Y/N,

Boundary wall – Y/N

8. Schedule of charges displayed – Y/N

9. Mode of collection of charges (a) From sellers _____ (b) From buyers _____

10. Transport availability _____

11. Animal welfare issues observed in the market _____

12. The role of any government officers in:-

a. Market management or function _____

b. Veterinary inspection or treatment _____

c. Data collection _____

d. Other market support or regulatory activities _____

13. Timings and day of market _____

14. Can individual animals be identified after purchase? _____

15. In the whole transport-market-transport process what are possible time periods when
animals do not have feed and water
access? _____

16. What % of which markets consist of very young buffalo/cattle calves? _____

6.0 REFERENCES

1. Anjum, M. S., 1995. "Survey Report on Wool Marketing in Pakistan". Coordinated Research Project for the Development of Sheep and Wool, PAK/88/032, FAO, Pakistan
2. Byerlee, D., and M. Iqbal (1987) Recent Trends and Variability in Prices of Selected Crops and Livestock Products in Pakistan. *Pakistan Journal of Agricultural Social Sciences* 1: 2.
3. Chambers, R, (1980), *Rural Development: putting the Last First*, Harlow, England.
4. Cox, R. and S. Thomas, 1969. A look at channel management'. In: McDonald, P.R. (ed.), *Marketing Involvement in Society and the Economy*, 50: 687–701.
5. Dahlin, Anders (1998) Genetic Studies on Sahiwal Cattle in Pakistan. Doctoral Thesis, ACTA Universitatis Agriculturae Sueciae. Agraria 99. Swedish University of Agricultural Sciences. Uppsala.
6. Delgado, C., M. Rosegrant, H. Steinfeld and S. Ehui, 1999. "Livestock to 2020: The Next Food Revolution". International Food Policy Research Institute, FAO, ILRI, Food Agriculture and the Environment Division Paper 28.
7. Draft Punjab Livestock Market Rules, 2010 Schinzel, H. U. (1982), Demand Supply and Marketing of Livestock Products: A case study of a selected area in Punjab. Report No. 9. Lahore: Pak-German Technical Cooperation, Livestock Production, Extension and Artificial Insemination Service.
8. FAO, 1987. "Pakistan Livestock Sector Study", Vol. 1 and 2. FAO/Asian Development Bank Cooperative Programme. Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations-Rome
9. FAO, 2003. "Action Plan for Livestock Marketing Systems in Pakistan". TCP/PAK/0168: Livestock Action Plan. ASI, NARC Islamabad
10. Government of Pakistan, 1994. *Economic Survey, 1993 - 94*. Government of Pakistan, Finance division, Economic Advisors Wing, Islamabad.
11. Government of Pakistan, 2002. *Economic Survey*. Finance Division, Economic Adviser's Wing, Islamabad.
12. Government of Pakistan, 2003. "Milk Production, Processing and Marketing in Pakistan". Ministry of Food, Agriculture and Livestock (Livestock Wing), Government of Pakistan
13. Government of Pakistan, 2006. *Pakistan Livestock Census 2006*, Agricultural Census Organization, Statistical Division, Ministry of Economic Affairs and Statistics, Islamabad
14. Government of Pakistan, 2010. *Economic Survey, 2009-10*, Finance division, Economic Advisors Wing, Islamabad.
15. Hammer, M. (1990): Reengineering Work: Don't Automate, Obliterate. In: Harvard Business Review, November-December, pp. 104-112.
16. Iqbal, M., U. Farooq, A. Bashir, N.A. Khan and S.Z. Malik, 2000. "A Baseline Survey of Development of Livestock Sector in Cholistan". Pakistan-German Technical Cooperation.

Commissioned by Deutsche Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit (GTZ), GmbH and GTZ, P.N. 91.

17. Khalid, M. and A. Rodriguez, 1991. *Marketing and Processing of Small Ruminants in Highland Balochistan*. MART/AZR Project. Arid Zone Research Institute, Brewery Road, Quetta, Pakistan.
18. Mehmood, K., 1990. "Marketing of Small Ruminants and Meat in Highland Balochistan", in the Annual Report of the Highland Regional Program of the MART/AZR, project Pakistan AZRI – ICARDA.
19. Mustafa, U., K. Mehmood, S.I. Ali, N.A. Shah and M. Afzal, 1995, "Marketing of Small Ruminants in Highland Balochistan". Progressive Farming, 5 (2), Pakistan Agricultural Research Council, Islamabad.
20. NMC (National Management Consultant), 1997. "Migratory Livestock and the Marketing System in Balochistan". NMC (Private Limited). M.T. Khan Road Karachi Pakistan.
21. Pirzadeh, T. and U. Islam, 1981. *Consumption Patterns of Milk and Meat in Lahore*. Results of a Consumer Survey. Livestock Production and Marketing Survey Punjab. Report No.11. Directorate of Livestock Production Extension and Artificial Insemination Service, Punjab, (LPE/AI), Lahore and GTZ, Eschborn.
22. Punjab Economic Report 2005 and Punjab Economic Report 2007.
23. Qureshi, A.H., 2002. Markets and Marketing. In: Bashir, M. (ed.), *Diagnostic Survey Report of Northern Areas Development Project*. Agriculture of Northern Areas, Technology Transfer Institute (PARC) Gilgit.
24. Rodriguez, A., I. Ali, M. Afzal and N.A. Shah, 1992. *Marketing of Goat and Sheepskins in highland Balochistan*. Mart/AZR Project Arid Zone Research Institute, Quetta.
25. Shafiq, M. and Kakar, M. A. 2006. Current Livestock Marketing and its Future Prospects for the Economic Development of Balochistan – Pakistan. International Journal of Agriculture and Biology, 1560-8530/2006/08-6-885-895.
26. Sharif, M., W. Malik, N. I. Hashmi and U. Farooq. (2003) "Action Plan For Livestock Marketing Systems in Pakistan", Joint study by Social Sciences Institute NARC and FAO Office Islamabad, Pakistan.
27. Theuvsen, L. (1996): Business Reengineering. Möglichkeiten und Grenzen einer prozessorientierten Organisationsgestaltung. In: Zeitschrift für betriebswirtschaftliche Forschung, Vol. 48, pp. 65-82.
28. Wagenaar, J.P., F. Muhammad, S. Hassan, A. Rebaz and A. Wahab, 1997. *Final Report on Migratory Livestock and the Marketing System in Balochistan*. National Management Consultants (Pvt.) Ltd.

END NOTES

- ⁱ Theuvsen, L. (1996): Business Reengineering. Möglichkeiten und Grenzen einer prozessorientierten Organisationsgestaltung. In: Zeitschrift für betriebswirtschaftliche Forschung, Vol. 48, pp. 65-82.
- ⁱⁱ Iqbal, M., U. Farooq, A. Bashir, N.A. Khan and S.Z. Malik, 2000. "A *Baseline Survey of Development of Livestock Sector in Cholistan*". Pakistan-German Technical Cooperation. Commissioned by Deutsche Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit (GTZ), GmbH and GTZ, P.N. 91.
- ⁱⁱⁱ Qureshi, A.H., 2002. Markets and Marketing. In: Bashir, M. (ed.), *Diagnostic Survey Report of Northern Areas Development Project*. Agriculture of Northern Areas, Technology Transfer Institute (PARC) Gilgit.
- ^{iv} Wagenaar, J.P., F. Muhammad, S. Hassan, A. Rebaz and A. Wahab, 1997. *Final Report on Migratory Livestock and the Marketing System in Balochistan*. National Management Consultants (Pvt.) Ltd.
- ^v Cox, R. and S. Thomas, 1969. A look at channel management'. In: McDonald, P.R. (ed.), *Marketing Involvement in Society and the Economy*, 50: 687–701.
- ^{vi} Anjum, M. S., 1995. "Survey Report on Wool Marketing in Pakistan". Coordinated Research Project for the Development of Sheep and Wool, PAK/88/032, FAO, Pakistan
- ^{vii} FAO, 1987. "Pakistan Livestock Sector Study", Vol. 1 and 2. FAO/Asian Development Bank Cooperative Programme. Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations-Rome