

## **AIDSTAR-Two Project Trip Report – CAR Oct. 26 – Nov. 26, 2012**

---

Printed April 2013

5 key words:

HIV

TB

Most At Risk Populations

Men Who Have Sex With Men

Central Asia

This report was made possible through support provided by the US Agency for International Development, under the terms of Contract Number GHH-1-00-07-00068-01. The opinions expressed herein are those of the author(s) and do not necessarily reflect the views of the US Agency for International Development.

---

AIDSTAR-Two  
Management Sciences for Health  
4301 N. Fairfax Drive  
Arlington, VA 22203  
Telephone: (703) 524-6575  
[www.msh.org](http://www.msh.org)

## 1. Scope of Work:

Destination and Client(s)/ Partner(s)	Kazakhstan and Central Asian Republics. USAID CAR regional Office. PSI Central Asia. Dialogue Project Consortium
Traveler(s) Name, Role	Elden  Chamberlain, Consultant & Team Leader Dialogue Project Mid term Evaluation
Date of travel on Trip	26 Oct – 26 Nov 2012
Purpose of trip	Conduct Mid term Evaluation of Dialogue Project
Objectives/Activities/ Deliverables	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <b>In Briefing:</b> Introduction of the evaluation team and review of materials. Team presentation of proposed evaluation approach, including description of methodology, plan for data collection (including questionnaires that will be used), and overall evaluation schedule.</li> <li>2. <b>First Draft Evaluation Report:</b> Content should cover all the main evaluation questions and include major findings, conclusions, evidence-based recommendations and relevant annexes.</li> <li>3. <b>Oral Presentation:</b> Power Point presentation (including handouts). The oral presentation should, at minimum, cover the major findings, conclusions, and lessons learnt.</li> <li>4. <b>Final Draft Evaluation Report:</b> A complete report presented in the agreed-upon format and incorporating comments from USAID and other stakeholders. This will be submitted to USAID prior to the departure of the evaluation team leader.</li> <li>5. <b>Final Report:</b> The team leader will submit a final report within one week of receiving comments from USAID and other stakeholders</li> </ol>
Background/Context, if appropriate.	<p>The USAID Dialogue on HIV and TB Project is a five-year, United States Agency for International Development (USAID) funded program aimed at reducing the spread of the HIV and tuberculosis (TB) epidemics in Central Asia through improving health behaviors among most-at-risk populations (MARPs), namely People Who Inject Drugs (PWID), Sex Workers (SWs), Men who have sex with men (MSM), People living with HIV/AIDS (PLWHA), Prisoners and Migrants. USAID Dialogue on HIV and TB Project is implemented by a consortium of partners led by Population Services International (PSI) and includes Project HOPE, AIDS Foundation East-West (AFEW), and the Kazakh Union of people living with HIV/AIDS in the Republic of Kazakhstan.</p> <p>AIDSTAR-Two was asked by USAID to conduct a midterm assessment of the Dialogue project. This evaluation came at the midpoint of the Dialogue Project, and as such provided an opportunity to use evaluation findings to guide implementation of the second half of the project. The overriding purpose of this evaluation was to obtain independent appraisal on project performance in order to determine whether or not and to what extent project approaches and activities have been successful and to use this information to make any necessary adjustments. To this end, the evaluation assessed the project's</p>

	<p>approach and methodology to achieve project objectives; reviewed and validated project-reported accomplishments as per outputs established in the Cooperative Agreement and related monitoring plans with USAID/CAR; assessed the effectiveness and impact of technical assistance, training, and grant activities; and made evidence-based recommendations for improving implementation of the Dialogue Project and future USAID/CAR programming on HIV prevention. The results of this evaluation will also assist the Mission to determine whether additional areas of focus or a shift in strategic approach or implementation would increase the impact of the project.</p>
--	---

**2. Major Trip Accomplishments:** Should include the major programmatic goals realized, relevant metrics, and stories of impact from the trip.

All deliverables achieved.

Evaluation Methodology Developed
Final evaluation report developed and submitted to MSH for editing/publishing
Presentation of findings made to USAID
Presentation of findings made to PSI

**3. Next steps:** Key actions to continue and/or complete work from trip.

Description of task	Responsible staff	Due date
Final report to be edited and made print ready	Elizabeth Walsh & Elden Chamberlain	Completed

**4. Contacts:** List key individuals contacted during your trip, including the contacts' organization, all contact information, and brief notes on interactions with the person.

Name	Contact info	Home organization	Notes
See attached schedule of evaluation			

**5. Description of Relevant Documents / Addendums:** Give the document's file name, a brief description of the relevant document's value to other staff, as well as the document's location in eRooms or the MSH network. Examples could include finalized products and/or formal presentations, TraiNet Participant List, Participant Contact sheet, and Meeting/Workshop Participant Evaluation form are examples of relevant documents.

File name	Description of file	Location of file
Evaluation Report		attached
Evaluation Methodology		attached

Findings PPT for USAID and PSI		attached
Schedule of evaluation		attached
Meetings held		attached

[..\..\..\..\..\Desktop\MSH Travel\Elden Chamberlain\Dialogue mid term evaluation\\_Final\\_11\\_29\\_2012.pdf](#)

[..\..\..\..\..\Desktop\MSH Travel\Elden Chamberlain\Dialogue Project Evaluation Methodology\\_31\\_Oct\\_2012.pdf](#)

**MID-TERM EVALUATION OF THE DIALOGUE PROJECT**

**Evaluation Team:**

Team Leader/Senior Evaluation Specialist: Elden Chamberlain;  
 HIV/AIDS Technical Advisor: Alisher Latypov;  
 Capacity Building Technical Advisor: Karen Johnson Lassner;  
 Evaluation Specialist: Katerina Maksymenko.

**USAID/CAR/HEO Team:**

Head of HEO: Leslie Perry;  
 Regional HIV Advisor: Khorlan Izmailova;  
 Project Management Specialist/HE/Tajikistan: Dilorom Kosimova;  
 Health Project Management Specialist/Kyrgyzstan: Nazgul Chokmorova;  
 Regional Strategic Information Advisor: Arman Dairov.

Location	Date	Time	Activity/Meeting
Kazakhstan	Sunday, October 28 <sup>th</sup>		Evaluation Team arrives in Almaty
	Monday, October 29 <sup>th</sup>	9:00 - 13:00	<b>Evaluation Team <u>internal</u> meeting</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Revision of draft instruments;</li> <li>• Revision of protocol.</li> </ul>
		13:00-14:00	<b>Lunch</b>
		14:00-18:30	<b>Evaluation Team <u>internal</u> meeting</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Revision of schedule;</li> <li>• Discussion of documents.</li> </ul>
	Tuesday, October 30 <sup>th</sup>	08:30-13:00	<b>Evaluation Team <u>internal</u> meeting:</b> continue working on items of October, 29 <sup>th</sup>
		13:00-14:00	<b>Lunch</b>
		14:00-16:00	<b>Evaluation Team <u>internal</u> meeting:</b> continue working on items of October, 29 <sup>th</sup>
		15:00–17:00	<b>USAID Almaty Office (In-Briefing)</b>  Khorlan Izmailova, Regional HIV Advisor Arman Dairov, Regional Strategic Information Advisor
	Wednesday, October 31 <sup>st</sup>	9:00-11:00	GF PIU. Batyrbek Asembekov, GF PIU Manager
		1130 – 1300	Almaty AIDS Centre.
		1300 - 1400	<b>Lunch</b>
		1430-1730	NGO "Adali" MSM program
	Thursday, November 1 <sup>st</sup>		<b>Site visit to Temirtau</b> (via Astana).  Temiratau AIDS Centre. MDT Team in conjunction with NGO "Shapagat" PLHIV program  Abay - NGO "Kredo" Prisoners Program  Karanganda – NGO "Umid" PWID Program

	Friday 2nd, November 3 <sup>rd</sup>	1400-1830	<b>Dialogue Project Senior Management Team</b> Leila Koushenova, Regional Program Director Elmira Imamabakieva, Technical Deputy of Regional Program Shana Aufenkamp, Regional Program Advisor AFEW representative Project HOPE representative Kazakh Association of People Living with HIV representative

**Tajikistan (Elden Chamberlain and Alisher Latypov and Khorlan Izmailova( Thur-Fri))**

<b>Date</b>	<b>Time</b>	<b>Activity/Meeting</b>	<b>Location</b>
<b>Sunday, November 4<sup>th</sup></b>		Flight to Dushanbe	
<b>Monday, November 5<sup>th</sup></b>	9:00 – 10:00	GF PIU (UNDP)	UNDP Office
	10:30-12:00	NGO "Mavorid" Sex Worker Program	
	1230–15:00	NGO " Vita " Prisoners Program	
	1530 - 1630	Republican AIDS Centre	
<b>Tuesday, November 6<sup>th</sup> (Local Holiday)</b>		Drive to Kulob	
<b>Wednesday, November 7<sup>th</sup></b>	0900 - 2000	NGO "Anis" PWID Program PLHIV Program SW Program MSM Program Migrants Program	Kulob
<b>Thursday, November 8<sup>th</sup></b>	0700-1030 1200-1400 1430 – 1700	Drive to Dushanbe NGO "Spin Plus" PLHIV / PWID Programs NGO "Legal Support" MSM Program	Dushanbe
<b>Friday, November 9<sup>th</sup></b>	0900 – 1200	Dialogue Consortium PSI AFEW Project Hope International Office for Migration	Dushanbe
	1600 - 1830	USAID Country office Dilorom Kosimova, Health Project Management Specialist	
<b>Sunday, November 11<sup>th</sup></b>	1100 - 1430	Fly to Almaty	

**Kyrgyzstan (Karen Johnson Lassner and Kateryna Maksymenko of Evaluation Team and Arman Dairov)**

<b>Date</b>	<b>Time</b>	<b>Activity/Meeting</b>	<b>Location</b>
<b>Sunday, November 4<sup>th</sup></b>		Leaving to Bishkek	
<b>Monday, November 5<sup>th</sup></b>	8:30 – 9:30	<b>USAID Country office</b> Lawrence Held, Deputy Director	USAID Country office, Bishkek
	10:00-12:00	<b>GF PIU</b> TB Coordinator HIV Coordinator	UNDP, Bishkek
	12:00–13:30	<b>Lunch</b>	
	13:30–16:00	<b>Republican AIDS Center</b> Ymutkan Jusupovna Chokmorova, Director	Republican AIDS Center, Bishkek
	16:00-17:00	<b>Dialogue Project Office</b> Djamila Alisheva, Country manager	PSI, Bishkek
	16:30-17:30 20:00-21:00	<b>PSI</b> Outreach workers of the MSM component, MSM component coordinator	PSI, Bishkek
<b>Tuesday, November 6<sup>th</sup></b>	9:00 – 12:00	<b>NGO "Rans Plus", prisoners</b> Ibragim Lebuzzov, Director Outreach workers, trainer	Chui Oblast
	13:00 – 15:00	<b>NGO "Pravo na zhizn", PWID</b> Aibar Sultangaziev, Director Outreach workers, social worker Clients, volunteers	
	16:00-18:00	<b>NGO "Antistigma", PLHIV</b> Maria Vladimirovna, Director STI Doctor/Social worker Outreach workers Clients	
<b>Wednesday, November 7<sup>th</sup> (Local Holiday)</b>	10:00-12:00	<b>NGO "Podruga", SW</b> Nadezhda, Director	Bishkek
<b>Thursday, November 8<sup>th</sup></b>		Leaving to Osh from Bishkek	
	10:00 -12:00	<b>NGO "Plus Center", PWID</b> Ravshan, Director Outreach coordinator Outreach workers Clients	Osh
	14:00 – 15:00	<b>NGO "Podruga", SW</b> Outreach workers Pimp, client	Karasu
	16:00 – 17:00	<b>Osh AIDS Center</b> Director	Osh
		Leaving to Bishkek from Osh	
<b>Friday, November 9<sup>th</sup></b>	13:00 – 16:00	<b>Dialog Project Country Management Team</b> PSI Kyrgyzstan representatives AFEW representative Project HOPE representative	Bishkek

<b>Saturday, November 10<sup>th</sup></b>		Leaving to Almaty from Bishkek.	
---	--	---------------------------------	--

**Almaty, Kazakhstan**

<b>Almaty</b>	Sunday, November 11 <sup>th</sup> – Thursday, November 15 <sup>th</sup>		<b>Evaluation Team analyzes and discuss findings and works on Draft Report</b>
Friday, November 16 <sup>th</sup>	15:00		<b>USAID/HEO – “out brief”</b>
Saturday, November 17 <sup>th</sup> – Tuesday, November 20 <sup>th</sup>			Team Leader and one member of Evaluation Team work on comments made during USAID/HEO “out brief”. Finalizing Evaluation Report
Friday, November 23 <sup>th</sup>			In country mission ends Draft Report submitted to USAID CAR & AIDSTAR-Two for Comments
Friday November 30 <sup>th</sup>			Report Completed and submitted to MSH editing dept
Friday December 7 <sup>th</sup>			Final report submitted to USAID CAR

## Annex VII

### List of Meetings and Participants

Date	Location	Group	Organization	Participants	Number of participants
<b>KAZAKHSTAN</b>					
Oct 30th, 2012	KZ, Almaty	Donor	USAID	Khorlan Izmailova, Regional HIV Advisor; Arman Dairov, Regional Strategic Information Advisor	2
Oct 31st, 2012	KZ, Almaty	Stakeholders	Republican AIDS Center	Batyrbek Asembekov, GF PIU Manager	1
	KZ, Almaty	PLHIV	City AIDS Center	HCP&Management: Dr. Gulzhakhan Akhmetova, MDT Coordinator	1
				Outreach workers	3
Oct 31st, 2012	KZ, Almaty	MSM	NGO 'Adali'	Management: Vitaly Vinogradov, Outreach Coordinator, Sergej, Director	2
				Outreach workers	3
Nov 1st, 2012	KZ, Temirtau	PLHIV	NGO 'Shapagat'	Management: Zoya Ruzhnikova, Outreach Coordinator	1
				Outreach workers	3
				HCPs: HIV specialist and Nurse	2
				Clients	5
Nov 1st, 2012	KZ, Karaganda	PWID	NGO 'Umit'	Management: Project coordinator, Outreach coordinator	2
				Outreach workers, Social worker	4
				Clients	3
Nov 1st, 2012	KZ, Karaganda	Prisoners	NGO 'Kredo'	Management: Project Coordinator	1
				Outreach workers	3

				Clients	2
Nov 2nd, 2012	KZ, Almaty	Project Consortium	PSI CAR, AFEW, Project HOPE, Kazakhstan Union of PLWH	Nurali Amanzholov, Altinay Rsaldinova, Irina Yuzkaeva, Leila Koushenova, Mira Sauranbayeva, Shanna Aufenkamp, Elmira Imambakieva, Irada Nurasheva, Marat Bakpayev	9
<b>KYRGYZSTAN</b>					
Nov 5th, 2012	KG, Bishkek	Donor	USAID	Lawrence Held, Deputy Director	1
Nov 5th, 2012	KG, Bishkek	Stakeholders	UNDP, GF PIU	Management: Oksana Shubina, HIV Grant Coordinator; Irina Schelokova, TB Grant Coordinator	2
Nov 5th, 2012	KG, Bishkek	Stakeholders	Republican AIDS Center	HCPs& Management: Ymutkan Jusupovna Chokmorova, Director; Epidemiologist	2
Nov 5th, 2012	KG, Bishkek	MSM	PSI	Management: Outreach coordinator	1
				Outreach workers	3
Nov 6th, 2012	KG, Chui oblast	Prisoners	NGO 'Rans Plus'	Management: Outreach coordinator	1
				Outreach workers , Trainer	4
Nov 6th, 2012	KG, Chui oblast	PWID	NGO 'Pravo na zhizn'	Management: Aibar Sultangaziev, Director	1
				Outreach workers, Social worker	5
				Clients	7
Nov 6th, 2012	KG, Chui oblast	PLHIV	NGO 'Antistigma'	Management: Maria Vladimirovna, Outreach coordinator	1
				HCPs: Diljarom, STI Specialist	1
				Outreach workers	2
				Clients	2
Nov 7th, 2012	KG, Bishkek	SW	NGO 'Podruga'	Management: Project coordinator	1
Nov 8th, 2012	KG, Karasu			Outreach workers	2
				Clients	1
Nov 8th, 2012	KG, Osh	PWID	NGO 'Plus Center'	Management: Ravshan, Diretor; Elmira, Outreach coordinator	2
				Outreach workers	2
				Clients	

Nov 8th, 2012	KG, Osh	Stakeholders	Osh AIDS Center	HCPs & Management: Elmira Baltabaeva, Head doctor	1
Nov 9th, 2012	KG, Bishkek	Project Consortium	PSI CAR, AFEW, Project HOPE	Djamila Alisheva, Aisha, Mahabat, Ulan, Dina, Nurdin Almirekov	6
<b>TAJKISTAN</b>					
Nov 5th, 2012	Dushanbe, TAJ	Stakeholders	UNDP, GFATM PIU	Ulugbek Aminov, HIV project manager	1
Nov 5th, 2012	Dushanbe, TAJ	SW	NGO Marvorid	Mahmud Madjidov, Director, and a group of staff, outreach and social workers and clients	10
Nov 5th, 2012	Dushanbe, TAJ	Prison inmates	NGO Vita	Olga Muravlyova, Head of the organization, and three other staff members	4
Nov 5th, 2012	Dushanbe, TAJ	Stakeholders	Republican AIDS Centre	Alidjon Soliev, M&E Specialist	1
Nov 6-7th, 2012	Kulyab, TAJ	PWID, MSM, SW, Migrants	NGO Anis	Idimo Kholmurodova, Director; Rustam Bozorov, Project Coordinator; Bekmurodova Iqbolbi, Drop-in Center Coordinator; 6 clients of drop-in center; outreach workers; social workers; Project Beneficiaries (PWID, MSM, SWs, Migrants)	40
Nov 8th, 2012	Dushanbe, TAJ	PWID	NGO SPIN Plus	Alisher, and other staff members, including social workers, outreach workers, database specialist, drop-in center clients, MDT members	15
Nov 8th, 2012	Dushanbe, TAJ	MSM	NGO Legal Support	Aziza Pirova, Director, and other staff members, including project coordinator and outreach workers	4
Nov 9th, 2012	Dushanbe, TAJ	Consortium partners	PSI, AFEW, Project Hope, International Office for Migration	Shodiya, Dilshod, Djamilya, Mahina	4

Nov 9th, 2012	Dushanbe, TAJ	Donor	USAID	Dilorom Kosimova, Health Specialist; Khorlan Izmailova, Regional HIV Advisor; Britt, Gender Specialist	3
Total:					177