



USAID
FROM THE AMERICAN PEOPLE



REPORT



2ND CONSULTATIVE INTERCHANGE

USAID'S TEACHER EDUCATION PROJECT (Pre-STEP)

January 4-5, 2012

Serena Hotel, Islamabad

This program is made possible by the support of the American people through the United States Agency for International Development (USAID)

USAID TEACHER EDUCATION PROJECT

REPORT ON 2nd NATIONAL CONSULTATIVE INTERCHANGE

PROGRAM TITLE:	USAID's TEACHER EDUCATION PROJECT (Pre-STEP)
SPONSORING USAID OFFICE:	USAID/PAKISTAN
COOPERATIVE AGREEMENT NUMBER:	AID-391-A-11-00001
GRANTEE:	EDUCATION DEVELOPMENT CENTER, INC. (EDC)
DATE OF SUBMISSION:	FEBRUARY 20, 2012

The authors' views expressed in this document do not necessarily reflect the views of the United States Agency for International Development or the United States Government.

ACRONYMS

ADE	Associate Degree in Education
AIOU	Allama Iqbal Open University
AJK	Azad Jammu and Kashmir
BBSYDP	Benazir Bhutto Shaheed Youth Development Program
B.Ed.	Bachelors in Education
BOC	Bureau of Curriculum
BPS	Basic Pay Scale
BZU	Bahauddin Zakariya University
CADD	Capital Administration and Development Division
CGPA	Cumulative Grade Point Average
CIDA	Canadian International Development Agency
CIP	College Improvement Plan
CPD	Continuous Professional Development
CRISP	Centre for Rehabilitation and Infrastructure Program
CT	Certificate of Teaching
DCRD	Directorate of Curriculum and Research Development
DCTE	Directorate of Curriculum and Teacher Education
DOE	Department of Education
EDC	Education Development Centre, Inc
EMIS	Education Management Information System
EST	Elementary School Teacher
FDE	Federal Directorate of Education
FJWU	Fatima Jinnah Women University
GB	Gilgit-Baltistan
GCET	Government College for Elementary Teachers
HEC	Higher Education Commission
KIU	Karakorum International University
KPK	Khyber Pakhtunkhwa
LOP	Life of Project
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MT	Master Trainer
NACTE	National Accreditation Council for Teacher Education
NCRC	National Curriculum Review Committee
NPST	National Professional Standards for Teachers
PC	Planning Commission
PITE	Provincial Institute of Teacher Education
PMP	Performance Monitoring Plan
Pre-STEP	Pre-Service Teacher Education Program
PSC	Provincial Steering Committee
PTC	Primary Teaching Certificate
REAC	Research Evaluation and Advisory Committee

RITE	Regional Institute of Teacher Education
RSU	Reform Support Unit
SALU	Shah Abdul Latif University
SBKWU	Sardar Bahadur Khan Women's University
SOP	Standard Operating Procedures
STEDA	Sindh Teacher Education Development Authority
TED	Teacher Education Development
TC-CU	Teachers College – Columbia University
UAJK	University of Azad Jammu & Kashmir
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
UOB	University of Balochistan
UOK	University of Karachi
UOS	University of Sindh

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACRONYMS	3
INTRODUCTION & OVERVIEW	6
PROVINCIAL DISCUSSION GROUPS	8
AZAD JAMMU & KASHMIR (AJK)	8
BALUCHISTAN	10
GILGIT BALTISTAN (GB)	11
KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA (KPK) AND FATA	13
PUNJAB	14
SINDH	16
RESOLVING COMMON CHALLENGES AND ISSUES	19
RECOMMENDED CHANGES TO PRE-STEP LOP WORK PLAN	21
ANNEXURES	23

INTRODUCTION & OVERVIEW

The USAID-funded Teacher Education Project (Pre-STEP) has been working closely with the Higher Education Commission, Provincial Departments of Education, fifteen partner Universities and seventy five Government Colleges of Education in the country to improve the quality of basic education through preparing and hiring better qualified teachers. In line with the National Education Policy 2009, HEC and provincial governments have taken the bold decision to reform pre-service teacher education. Central to the reform is the introduction of the four-year B.Ed. (Hons.) Elementary degree and the two-year Associate Degree in Education (ADE). Since the decision was made to introduce the new programs, significant progress has been made and as of January 2012, approximately 45 colleges and 12 universities are offering the B.Ed (Hons.) and ADE.

The two-day National Interchange provided an update on the accomplishments of the project and focused on the strategies and policy initiatives needed to institutionalize the reforms of teacher education over the remaining life of the project and beyond. It also provided an opportunity to refine the work plan collaboratively with our partners.

The Interchange was attended by more than 80 senior officials of provincial departments of education (DOE) and their teacher education apex bodies, representatives of the Higher Education Commission, Vice-Chancellors and Deans of partner universities, federal Secretary - Capital Administration and Development Division (CADD), and provincial Secretaries of Education (Annexure II). All participants attending the Interchange were provided copies of the LOP Work Plan and matrices and performance monitoring plan (PMP).

In December 2011, prior to the Interchange, the LOP Work Plan was shared with the provincial Steering and Advisory Committees for detailed review, discussion and feedback. The purpose of these consultations was to ensure that the LOP meets the provincial strategic priorities for implementing teacher education reforms.

The agenda (Annexure I) on the opening day of the Interchange was highlighted by a number of presentations. The Chief of Party Dr. Mahmood ul Hasan Butt reported on of the significant achievements during the first three years of Pre-STEP and the tasks ahead during the remaining life of the project. Dr. Samina Qadir, Vice-Chancellor at Fatima Jinnah Women University shared her views about USAID's Teacher Education Project and the support it has provided her University to implement the new four-year degree program. Ms. Salma Nazar - a USAID-sponsored student enrolled in the doctoral program at the Center for International Education, University of Massachusetts - shared her reflections on the opportunities provided to her through a USAID-funded scholarship to further develop knowledge and research skills.

A short video was also shared documenting the teaching/learning skills of students currently enrolled in the Associate Degree in Education (ADE) program. In the video, student teachers discussed the role of teachers and the importance of the student-centered teaching skills they are learning to use in their classrooms.



Dr. Mahmood Butt, Chief of Party - Pre-STEP addressing the participants of 2nd Consultative Interchange

Ms. Jo Lessor-Oltheten, Director of the Office of Education at USAID, addressed the Interchange and lauded the achievements of the project so far. Ms. Lessor assured continued support from USAID for programs to improve the quality of basic education in Pakistan.

The second day of the interchange began with an introduction and overview of the agenda by Dr Butt, the project Chief of Party and opening remarks by Mr. Tariq Khan, Education Advisor at USAID. The Director Curriculum, Ms Rana Hussain and the Advisor Policy, Dr Fayyaz Ahmed, then presented a brief overview of the Life of Project work plan to set the stage for discussions that followed.

Working In provincial and area groups, participants discussed the work plan. While a set of questions was shared with each group to prompt discussion, groups were encouraged to discuss the aspects of the plan that interested them most, and to consider their role in its implementation. Each group was invited to generate and present their recommendations for the work plan and for institutionalizing and strengthening the teacher education reform efforts in their province.

After lunch, questions were invited on the presentations and then Dr. Mary Lackie, Senior Technical Director Pre-STEP, presented a quick synthesis of the presentations and identified common themes. Dr Lackie explained that the presentations would be reviewed in more detail to ensure that recommendations are included in the work plan.

In the next session, participants were invited to join one of four concurrent discussion groups. Each group was asked to discuss one of the following issues and to make recommendations to plenary (and to Pre-STEP) for action.

- Assessment in the ADE and B.Ed. (Hons.) Elementary,
- Affiliation of colleges with the universities,
- Consolidation and harmonization of pre-service teacher education programs,
- Bridging courses for upgrading professional knowledge and skills of practicing teachers.

Dr. Sohail Naqvi, the Executive Director at the Higher Education Commission closed the Interchange, by expressing his appreciation for the work being done by USAID through the project to improve the quality of basic education in Pakistan.

PROVINCIAL DISCUSSION GROUPS

As one of the key purposes of the Interchange, this session was planned to let the provinces/regions discuss and share their views of Pre-STEP's LOP work plan. Each group was given a set of guiding questions designed to enable them to share their progress and ideas for better implementation of Pre-STEP activities. The groups also produced a set of policy recommendations for the life of project and beyond.

AZAD JAMMU & KASHMIR (AJK)

ACHIEVEMENTS

STATE LEVEL:

- Teacher Education Strategy 2018 has been formally approved by the Provincial Steering Committee (PSC) and was signed by the Secretary of Education (Schools);
- State government has formally notified that the ADE program is to be implemented in six Government College for Elementary Teachers (GCETs) this year and the remaining GCETs in 2013;
- The Additional Secretary Education reported that the Service Rules have been amended and are in the final stage of approval;
- The ADE program was successfully launched in six GCETs in AJK;
- Two of the six GCETs were granted affiliation by University of AJK (UAJK), the remaining four will be granted affiliation before January 10, 2012;
- Six-members (three from UAJK and three from the Directorate of Curriculum Research and Development (DCRD)) of the Joint Quality Assurance Committee were appointed to regularly monitor the implementation of ADE in the GCETs;
- Selection and placement of qualified faculty members in GCETs has started and seventy percent of the colleges have disciplined specialist faculty members. The faculty in Science, Math, and Information Technology are still in short supply.



Provincial Group Discussions

INSTITUTION LEVEL:

- Practicum schools of six GCETs were notified by the Education Department for ADE student-teachers to get hands on experience in teaching at elementary schools;
- Faculty of the Institute of Education at UAJK is being appointed and a new batch of students was admitted with normal tuition fees instead of higher-level self-financed fees;
- A research proposal entitled "The role of collaborating teachers in facilitating prospective teachers for their first teaching experiences: A multi-case study of teaching practicum" has been developed by a team

of research scholars at the Institute of Education in UAJK and submitted to Research Evaluation and Advisory Council (REAC);

- Forty four faculty members from UAJK and GCETs participated in active learning techniques and curriculum development seminars;
- Orientation for implementing Semester system has been provided to UAJK and GCETs staff.

ROLE OF AREA GOVERNMENT AND DIRECTORATE OF CURRICULUM RESEARCH AND DEVELOPMENT

- Introduction of the new teacher education program in all GCETs was initiated and the phasing out of the old Primary Teaching Certificate (PTC)/Certificate of Teaching (CT) diploma and 1-year B.Ed. program has begun;
- Formal notification of the amendment in service rules providing better pay package to attract quality students to become teachers is in the final stages of approval;
- Appointment of qualified faculty in GCETs and retaining them to ensure successful implementation of the new HEC-approved scheme of studies for ADE;
- Staff for quality assurance and monitoring is being appointed;
- Provide financial support for upgrading professional qualifications of in-service teachers to participate in professional development programs;
- Provide budgeted resources for infrastructure improvement of GCETs;
- Collaborative review of curriculum, schedule of course offerings, and assessment with the UAJK;
- Develop policy guidelines for continuous professional development of teachers in the region.

ROLE OF UNIVERSITY OF AZAD JAMMU & KASHMIR

- Develop collaborative affiliation policies and procedures with the GCETs;
- Develop uniform assessment and examination schedule for all GCETs consistent with UAJK schedule;
- Approval of curriculum (as per HEC guidelines) to be uniformly offered in all the GCETs;
- Share scholarly resources including faculty, and materials with affiliated GCETs
- Provide capacity building opportunities through short and long courses for GCET instructors;
- Share research findings with GCETs and involving their faculty in action research projects;
- Phasing out 1-year B.Ed.degree;
- Control private sector B.Ed. program through strict adherence to affiliation criteria;
- Offer bridging courses and other opportunities for professional development for practicing teachers during the summer and through flexible scheduling at regional study centers.

BEYOND PRE-STEP

- To review the teacher education curriculum continuously there should be a separate section at DCRD collaborating with GCETs and UAJK;
- A separate teacher education cadre should be established to staff teacher education institutions;
- An Education Management Information System (EMIS) database setup needs to be regularly budgeted to have reliable and accurate data including projections for teacher needs;

- Government commitment to allocate additional budget resources for providing financial incentives to attract students to new teacher education programs, hire and retain graduates of ADE and B.Ed. (Hons.) and rehabilitate infrastructure of teacher education institutions;
- Establish an independent teacher licensing, certification and recruitment board to ensure hiring of better qualified teachers.

COORDINATION AND IMPLEMENTATION OF TEACHER EDUCATION REFORMS

- Appoint a high-level standing committee consisting of Secretary of Education, Registrar of UAJK, Director Finance of UAJK, Director Public Instruction (DPI) and Secretary Finance & Services who will meet regularly to ensure implementation of teacher education reform.

CHALLENGES

- The paucity of qualified teacher educators that are needed to fully staff all GCETs;
- The need for sufficient financial resources for scholarships, higher salaries and pay packages, and in-service continuous development programs needs to be addressed in 2012 to continue to sustain teacher education reform beyond 2013;

SUGGESTIONS TO STRENGTHEN THE TEACHER EDUCATION PROGRAM

- Establish a separate teacher education cadre;
- High-level coordination committee should meet regularly as a standing committee to develop Planning Commission (PC-1) for generating development funds and proposals for enhanced recurring budget requests;
- Development of a comprehensive outreach and public awareness campaign to attract better qualified candidates to the teaching profession;
- Effective monitoring and accreditation of both public and private sector teacher education institutions to ensure compliance with national professional standards;

BALUCHISTAN

ACHIEVEMENTS

- Eight Colleges of Education have started ADE courses from 2012 increasing the enrolment to approximately 400 additional students;
- Six new colleges are being established to offer the ADE program in other districts beginning next year;
- Two universities, University of Balochistan (UOB) and Sardar Bahadur Khan Women's University (SBKWU) have already started B. Ed. (Hons.) classes;
- SBKWU has completed its strategic plan for education department for year 2018 with the support of USAID's teacher education program, and is the first university in the country to have completed its strategic plan;
- Government of Balochistan (GOB) has allocated /created 200 new posts for employing ADE degree holders. This will encourage new teacher trainees to enroll in the ADE program;

- Service rules for junior elementary school teacher (JEST) at pay scale 15 have been drafted and are close to final approval;
- One hundred and fifty scholarships of Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA) Project have been reserved for female trainees teachers of ADE in the province in addition to 100 merit/need based scholarships provided by USAID;
- Two teams of four Master Trainers (MT) each of apex institutions have been nominated, trained, and are working closely with Pre-STEP Professional Development Teams in GCETs;

ROLE OF PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENT

- Develop a provincial strategic plan to redesign teacher recruitment policies to meet the demand of teachers in the province;
- Plan acquiring increased financial resources for staffing and infrastructure for establishing 6 new colleges of education;
- Teacher education task force has to design policies for continuous professional development of practicing teachers in collaboration with the universities offering teacher education programs;

CHALLENGES

- Candidates for admission to ADE program need preparation in the functional use of the English language since the medium of instruction for a majority of ADE/B.Ed. (Hons.) courses is English. The institutions offering teacher education programs are to design proficiency courses in English before the initial start of the program of studies;
- Teacher education institutions in Balochistan have been on an annual term system. They need orientation to successful implementation of semester system in course offerings and assessment. There is a dire need of bridging courses and other avenues of professional development for the currently practicing teachers;
- Given the anticipated increase in enrolment of teacher education institutions funds for scholarships need to be increased for both pre-service and in-service activities.

GILGIT BALTISTAN (GB)

ACHIEVEMENTS

- Introduced the ADE program in three colleges of education in Gilgit Baltistan and the B.Ed. (Hons.) is being offered in the Karakoram International University (KIU). Total student enrollment in the GCETs is 117 and 40 students are enrolled in the KIU;
- Female enrollment is high as compared to male students;
- Thirty one faculty members of GCETs and KIU have participated in ADE/B.Ed. (Hons.) curriculum, pedagogy, assessment, research, and practicum workshops;
- Service and recruitment policy was approved by the Department of Education by including ADE as a new qualification. ADE graduates will be assigned to Basic Pay Scale (BPS) 14 - previously it was BPS 9;
- Teacher Education Strategy 2018 was drafted and will be shared with stakeholders at the national-level on January 11-13, 2012 in Karachi;

- Pre-STEP arranged an accreditation workshop at KIU campus where 40 plus faculty of teacher education institutions were invited to learn about NACTE accreditation standards and process of accreditation. National Professional Standards for Teachers (NPST) were also shared with the participants;
- Department requests Pre-STEP for providing 1) accreditation fee or waive off the fee, and 2) technical support in developing system and process for accreditation;
- To meet the growing demand of teacher educators in the province, M.Phil program has been started at KIU with an enrollment of 63 students.

LESSONS LEARNED

- Gilgit Baltistan is the first province where service rules have been approved by the Department of Education. The implementation problems identified in a series of meetings have been rectified;
- Advocacy efforts made for launching the ADE and the admissions campaign have had a positive impact on increasing enrollment in both degree programs.

ROLE OF GB GOVERNMENT

- The PTC/CT degrees have been abolished in GCETs and the PTC was eliminated from the service rules;
- Teacher Education Strategy 2018 will be implemented through the establishment of an apex body for teacher education which will be responsible for providing professional development opportunities and ensuring quality;
- The government is working on the development of a distinct teacher education cadre;
- Beginning next year, the Department of Education is planning to start the B.Ed. (Hons.) at GCETs for which it needs technical support from Pre-STEP to train faculty and provide required teaching and learning materials through an additional materials grants for these colleges.

ROLE OF APEX BODY

- A grant of Rs. 61 million has been approved for the creation of enabling environment to improve the physical facilities, increase staffing, and purchase of equipments. This budget will help sustain Pre-STEP supported initiatives;
- A concept clearance paper was finalized for establishment of an apex body named Directorate of Curriculum and Teacher Education (DCTE).

ROLE OF UNIVERSITY

- A uniform assessment policy needs to be developed and implemented in all the GCETs in collaboration with KIU;
- KIU granted affiliation for three GCETs and the next step is for the affiliation policy guidelines to be collaboratively developed with KIU and the Department of Education.

BEYOND PRE-STEP

- An apex body, identified as the Directorate of Curriculum and Teacher Education (DCTE), needs to be developed, staffed, and provided with a budget to monitor the implementation of new degree programs.

The apex body will collaborate with KIU and GCETs to develop well coordinated policies for student assessment and curriculum refinement.

CHALLENGES

- Teaching of English as a subject and its use as medium of instruction is a challenge in the province because of the low-level of English proficiency in basic education. KIU has designed a zero credit course in functional English for ADE students with good results. This program needs to be offered by all GCETs offering ADE program;
- Procedures need to be developed for formative assessment of students by college faculty and its importance in the overall assessment scheme needs to be clarified for uniform implementation in all teacher education institutions;

KHYBER PAKHTUNKHWA (KPK) AND FATA

ACHIEVEMENTS AND EXPERIENCES

- Thirteen regional institutes of teacher education (RITEs) are currently offering ADE;
- All RITEs have been affiliated with a regional University;
- Six additional colleges (RITE: Peshawar, Malakand, Mardan, Dargai, Draosh, Charsadda) will start ADE in 2012;
- Three universities in the province are offering B.Ed. (Hons.) program;
- One hundred merit and needs based scholarships were awarded to the first cohort of ADE students and 30 scholarships were awarded to student enrolled in B.Ed. (Hons.) at two universities. With the increased ADE enrolment in more RITEs and B.Ed. (Hons.) enrolment in more universities, additional scholarships are needed.

CHALLENGES

- Capacity building:
 - Scheduling of training workshops for a variety of professional development trainings need to be structured so as not to disrupt the ongoing teaching activities;
 - Trainings workshops need to be offered on campuses of RITEs rather than at central locations to promote inter-institutional coordination along with professional development;
 - DCTE and PITE need to coordinate participation in subject matter-based training workshops;
- Frequent changes in Curriculum without using appropriate channels:
 - Changes in curriculum have created problems with the assessment of students;
 - The curriculum of B.Ed. (Hons.) and ADE should be reviewed and approved by the National Curriculum Review Committee (NCRC) of HEC and circulated to all provinces;
 - Any revision in courses should be routed through Universities Board of Studies, Academic council to the affiliated colleges for implementation;
 - Printed material of course syllabi and course guides need to be provided to universities and colleges in a timely manner.

- Semester-based assessment:
 - A uniform semester-based system of grading and assessment is needed throughout the province and written rules for ADE assessment are needed;
 - There is a need for a consultative meeting with all universities in KP to have a similar assessment system in the province. Pre-STEP can organize meeting/ seminar/ workshop for developing such a system of grading for ADE.

- Content issues:
 - Teaching of English as a subject and its use as medium of instruction is a challenge in the province because of the low-level of English proficiency in basic education. A zero credit course in functional English for ADE students is needed for all RITEs;
 - In Islamiat course Quranic verses need to be written in Arabic. The medium of instruction in Islamiat needs clarification. Can students be given an option of language of instruction and examination?

- Role of 1-year B.Ed.:
 - Universities in KP offering B.Ed. (Hons.) need to review how to phase out of 1-year B.Ed. degree.

- Role of Universities:
 - Material and equipment grants to universities offering B.Ed. (Hons.) program need to be increased and provided in a phased program beginning second quarter fiscal year (FY) 2012;
 - RITEs offering the ADE program need USAID grants for infrastructure improvement, furniture, and instructional materials. It is recommended that procurement of these materials be done on an expedited basis;
 - Universities need to develop a system of bridging courses for upgrading the professional qualifications of practicing teachers and get them approved by their academic statutory bodies. Given the large pool of under-qualified teachers employed in KP, a program for in-service professional development is urgently needed;

- Phasing out PTC/CT:
 - Phasing out of PTC/CT degree will be carried out over a 3-year period during which an increased number of ADE graduates will be available to meet teacher needs in the province. Such phasing-out will be coordinated with all distance education universities offering these programs.

PUNJAB

ACHIEVEMENTS

Punjab University (PU):

- The new degree program was offered as a pilot degree in 2010;
- The second cohort of students has been admitted during 2011;
- Current enrollment in 4-year B.Ed. is at approximately one hundred students;
- The new degree program requires a change in teachers' pedagogy.

University of Education (UOE):

- The new degree program was offered as a pilot degree in one campus in 2010;
- Three additional campuses have offered the 4-year B.Ed. in 2011;
- Absence of notification on service rules is affecting the admissions;
- The faculty had to reshuffle the scheme of studies to incorporate content courses;

Fatima Jinnah Women University (FJWU):

- The new degree program was offered as a pilot degree in 2010;
- The second cohort of students has been admitted during 2011;
- The new degree requires teaching on an active learning basis;
- No college of education is currently affiliated with FJWU;

Allama Iqbal Open University (AIOU):

- AIOU has taken a lead in preparing instructional resources for the new degrees;
- AIOU faculty members have been participating in curriculum design workshops, and capacity building programs with Pre-STEP;
- The new degree programs have been granted approval from university statutory bodies;
- AIOU plans to work further on content development, course outlines, write up of courses, production of material, etc.

ROLE OF UNIVERSITIES

- Need to play a proactive role to get notification of recruitment rules by Government of Punjab;
- The academic career progression after B.Ed. (Hons.) needs to be clarified;
- More clarity on duration of the ADE for Punjab;
- AIOU will offer 4-year B.Ed. (Hons.)



Provincial Group Discussions

BEYOND PRE-STEP

- Universities are currently implementing the 4-year BS program in other disciplines, with B.Ed. being a professional degree more capacity building and content material was essential hence Pre-STEP gave a timely impetus and support in this regard;
- More work is required in reviewing and aligning the curricula with National Professional Standards for Teachers (NPST);
- The number of teacher educators qualified to teach ADE and B.Ed. (Hons.) programs needs to be increased in the province;
- Semester system is not being implemented across colleges and universities;
- HEC guidelines of formative and summative evaluation by 40/60 ratio needs to be followed.

SUGGESTIONS TO STRENGTHEN THE TEACHER EDUCATION PROGRAM

- More consultative interchange sessions are needed among colleges, education departments and universities for developing uniform academic and assessment policies;
- More inter-provincial sharing of policies and procedures related to teacher education reforms is required. Punjab and Sindh have started moving in this direction and needs to be expanded to other provinces so that uniform teacher education policies can be developed on a national basis;
- Professional development activities should be carried out during non-teaching sessions to minimize disturbance;
- Acknowledge university faculty who are participating in course design and review included in the HEC-approved scheme of studies;
- Admissions to B.Ed. 4-year may be provided through other entry points like conventional 2-year BA/BSc., and other BS programs.

SINDH

ACHIEVEMENTS

Sindh has taken the following concerted steps to promote provincial ownership of pre-service teacher education reform:

- Development of a Teacher Education Development (TED) Policy to improve the quality of teacher education in Sindh;
- Establishment of an apex oversight body for Teacher Education called Sindh Teacher Education Development Authority (STEDA);
- Phased out PTC, CT and diploma in education and replaced them with ADE;
- Rationalized number of teacher education institutions based on available facilities and needs and providing resources through regular budget supplemented by donor agencies;
- Developed draft service rules to recruit ADE and B.Ed. (Hons.) graduates in BPS-16 and BPS-17 respectively;
- Identification of number of posts as junior elementary and elementary school teachers in budget by the districts is in process;
- Development of quality assurance units at three levels including internal college level, third party from Provincial Institute of Teacher Education (PITE), and affiliating university;
- Roll-out of ADE in 12 colleges from January 2012;
- Capacity building of college staff
 - ADE Offering Colleges
 - CPD for Managers (SESM)



Provincial Group Discussions

- CPD for Teachers
- Scholarships by:
 - One hundred merit and needs based scholarships by USAID’s Teacher Education Project,
 - Benazir Bhutto Shaheed Youth Development Program (BBSYDP) for ADE approved by 500 scholarships per batch (500 – 2012-13, 500 – 2013-14),
 - CIDA scholarships directed to support ADE candidates.
- Universities:
 - Faculty participation in curriculum development, and collaborative affiliation policies,
 - Need grants for materials and equipment,
 - Offering B.Ed. (Hons.) Elementary at University of Sindh (UOS) in 2011, and starting B.Ed. in University of Karachi (UOK) in 2012, and Shah Abdul Latif University (SALU) in 2013.

LESSONS LEARNED

- Coordination between Department of Education (DOE) and Universities needs to be promoted;
- University concerns:
 - The ADE roll out has been announced while affiliation was in process,
 - Introduction of 4-year B.Ed. course needs to phase out 1-year B.Ed. It needs additional human resources for effective implementation, equipment and material grants are needed urgently,
 - QA mechanism needs to be made systematic and output oriented,
 - Universities’ need more coordination with STEDA implementation team.

ROLE OF THE PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENT

Government of Sindh (GOS):

Policy - Approval & Implementation of TED Policy;
 Financial - Budget allocation for sustaining;
 Technical - Develop capacity at provincial, apex and college level;
 HR - Allocate appropriate staff (teaching).

STEDA:

Policy - Policy formulation and overseeing of implementation;
 Financial - Recommends the DOE for rationalized financial support to the colleges;
 Technical -Designing of standards for teacher education programs;
 HR - Right person at the right place policy.

Universities:

Policy - Controlling & Regulatory authority for ADE/B.Ed. (Hons.)

- Exam conducting body
- Curriculum
- Admission policy
- Eligibility & enrolment
- Eligibility & recruitment of faculty

- Academic quality monitoring

Technical - Conduct refresher courses, workshops, invite guest speakers, and encourage resource sharing;
HR - Main provider of teacher educators.

BEYOND PRE-STEP

- Implementation of approved teacher education policy through enhanced recurring budget;
- Government of Sindh has taken ownership of the reforms in initial teacher education by working proactively. Plans are in the design phase that will sustain reforms accomplished under Pre-STEP.

COORDINATION AND IMPLEMENTATION OF TEACHER EDUCATION REFORMS

- STEDA will be coordinating reforms in teacher education through its broad-based Board of Governors (BOG) which has good representation of all teacher education stakeholders.

CHALLENGES

- Quick notification is required for the service rules for new graduates;
- Clarification is needed on the specific roles of PITE and Bureau of Curriculum (BOC);
- A coordination mechanism between the Education Department and universities needs to be developed.

SUGGESTIONS TO STRENGTHEN THE TEACHER EDUCATION PROGRAM

- Provincial teams working on the development of same courses need better coordination with each other;
- Continuous professional development needs to be provided for faculty in colleges of education in order to become better teacher educators;
- A teacher certification and licensing regime needs to be developed to ensure recruitment and retention of qualified teachers.

RESOLVING COMMON CHALLENGES AND ISSUES

During this session, the participants were invited to join one of the four concurrent discussion groups. Each group discussed one of the following issues and gave specific recommendations that are reproduced below as action points.

ISSUE 1: AFFILIATION OF COLLEGES WITH UNIVERSITIES

- The replacement of annual system with the semester system to fulfill the objectives of the new degrees;
- Maintaining and monitoring quality in GCETs according to prescribed criteria by affiliating university
- Access to required documentation for GCETs to qualify for affiliation;
- What would be the affiliation mechanism for private institutes interested in starting ADE?
- The affiliation fee for GCETs is currently not in the budget;
- Collaborative coordination between universities and GCETs needs to be strengthened for the purpose of sharing resources.

RECOMMENDATIONS

- Revise budgets to include funds for the affiliation fee;
- Schedule regular meetings among college and university administrators to resolve issues;
- Affiliation to be granted under the territorial jurisdiction of universities;
- Affiliation should be given only to those institutions that fulfill the criteria;
- Pre-STEP is requested to conduct a study to design the affiliation process in detail for implementation of the new degree programs;
- Universities should affiliate only those private institutions which offer only teacher education programs.



Dr. Rehana Masrur, Dean - AIOU, engaged in discussion

ISSUE 2: ASSESSMENT IN THE ADE/B.ED. (HONS.) DEGREE PROGRAMS

- Transition from the annual to the semester system requires a uniform grading and assessment process;
- Development of the process and instruments of grading the practicum experience;
- Training of cooperating teachers to ensure credible quality of practicum;
- Collaborative designing of examination papers by the college and university faculty needed to cover both theory and practice elements of the program.

RECOMMENDATIONS

- Standards of assessment may be developed with Pre-STEP technical support for dissemination to the universities and colleges;
- Regional seminars to finalize guidelines of assessment for wider dissemination to all stakeholders may be facilitated by Pre-STEP;
- Training to implement uniform policy for calculation of Cumulative Grade Point Average (CGPA) needs to be conducted;
- Assessment issues should be a part of the strategic planning activities being carried out at provincial and institutional levels.

ISSUE 3: CONSOLIDATION AND HARMONIZATION OF TEACHER EDUCATION PROGRAMS

- Different entry points and how people can complete the new degrees needs to be discussed;
- Determine how to provide credits for teaching experience needs to be determined for enabling practicing teachers to complete ADE requirements;
- A study is needed to critically evaluate PTC/CT, and diploma in education curricula to determine any gaps that need to be met.

RECOMMENDATIONS

- Develop a system to evaluate and align credits, courses (how many and content), and duration of teaching experience;
- Identify three groups: in-service, pre-service, and old degree holders but not employed who may be interested in completing the new degree programs;
- Pre-STEP rationalization study report has many points to be adopted for a smooth transition from old to new degree programs;
- Develop standard operating procedures (SOPs) for the consolidation of teacher education programs, and disseminate to all stakeholders.



Mr. Abdul Majeed Bhurt, Director - BOC Sindh, presenting the results of a group discussion

ISSUE 4: UPGRADING PROGRAM FOR PRACTICING TEACHERS AND THE LINK BETWEEN INITIAL TEACHER EDUCATION AND CONTINUOUS PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT - BRIDGING COURSES

The following questions were explored by the participants:

- How should equivalency be determined?
- What arrangements/plans will provinces need to make to put in place upgrading programs?
- Who will offer upgrading programs - Universities? Colleges? Or both?
- Is there a role for 'traditional' in-service/Continuous Professional Development (CPD) providers?

RECOMMENDATIONS

ROLE OF PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENT:

- Collect data about numbers, etc. of under-qualified teachers from available education census data and statistics;
- Develop cost estimates for providing in-service opportunities including scholarships, tuition to universities, and other financial incentives to encourage practicing teachers to professionally upgrade their qualifications.

ROLE OF HIGHER EDUCATION COMMISSION:

- Facilitate provincial governments and universities to develop equivalence of the newly approved degree programs, processes, and rules;
- Plan a national conference to discuss issues of bridging courses and offer them at six interested partner universities.

ROLE OF UNIVERSITIES:

- Identify universities that will develop and pilot upgrading programs;
- Determine what courses to offer and guidelines for how the equivalency program would be put in place;
- Determine the capacity of PTC and CT diploma holders through a critical evaluation of the course of study completed and a competency test.

RECOMMENDED CHANGES TO PRE-STEP LOP WORK PLAN

As a result of the feedback from the interchange participants, USAID's Teacher Education Project has identified a number of activities in the work plan that will be reviewed in detail and changes/modifications made that are in line with provincial expectations. The activities that will be reviewed are detailed below:

ACTIVITY 1.1.3: ASSIST COLLEGES, UNIVERSITIES AND PROVINCIAL GOVERNMENTS TO IMPROVE THE PROCESS AND OUTCOMES OF AFFILIATION

Participants highlighted the urgent need for strengthening linkages between teachers colleges with their regional universities. USAID Teacher Education Project will continue to support development of collaborative affiliation system with the universities and colleges of education. Participants suggested that the project involve the provincial departments of education officials in the affiliation process; the suggestion will be reviewed and the work plan revised if required.

ACTIVITY 1.2.1: EXPLORE SYSTEMS AND PREPARE PLANS FOR TEACHER CERTIFICATION AND LICENSING

Sindh has indicated its strong interest in developing a teacher certification and licensing system to ensure hiring and retention of qualified teachers. USAID's Teacher Education Project will include Sindh as one of the provinces

where efforts will be focused and the results will be shared through inter-provincial interchanges. The work plan will be revised in support of this recommendation.

ACTIVITY 1.2.2: REVISE RECRUITMENT RULES AND PAY AND GRADE SCALES FOR ELEMENTARY TEACHERS

The notification of revised recruitment rules was highlighted by all the provinces as being close to finalization. It was suggested that these actions be completed before the first group of ADE students graduate in 2012 and the USAID's Teacher Education Project work closely with the provinces to try and achieve this goal. The work plan will be revised to accommodate this suggestion where possible.

ACTIVITY 2.2.3: IMPROVE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE PRACTICUM COMPONENT OF THE ADE/B.ED. PROGRAMS BY SUPPORTING UNIVERSITIES AND COLLEGES TO EXPAND LINKAGES WITH PRACTICUM SCHOOL

Participants recommended that training be provided to cooperative teachers and development of a well-defined system of placement, monitoring and assessment of student teachers during their practice teaching and internships. This activity will be reviewed and the work plan will be revised accordingly.

ACTIVITY 2.2.4: PROVIDE EQUIPMENT AND SUPPLIES GRANTS TO PROVINCIAL INSTITUTIONS, UNIVERSITIES AND COLLEGES IN SUPPORT OF THE NEW DEGREE PROGRAMS

The participants recommended that the amount of the grants be increased and a phased plan to expedite their use be developed. The USAID's Teacher Education Project will review this recommendation and if feasible, the work plan will be revised accordingly.

ACTIVITY 3.1.1: PROVIDE SCHOLARSHIPS TO 1490 STUDENT TEACHERS ENROLLED IN THE B.ED. AND ADE PROGRAMS

The work plan currently includes 100 merit and need based scholarships to each province for ADE students and 15 scholarships to each university offering B.Ed. (Hons.) program. With more than 40 colleges offering the ADE program, the participants recommended an increase in the number of such grants in each province. USAID's Teacher Education Project will review this request and determine if it is possible to increase the number of scholarships and revise the work plan accordingly. Additionally, it was suggested that it might be possible to "leverage" additional resources for scholarships by working closely with other donors like Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA). In Sindh and KPK provinces, CIDA has started to provide scholarship funds for the ADE degree that were previously allocated for the Diploma in Education.

ACTIVITY 3.2.1: PREPARE PROVINCIAL PLANS FOR UPGRADING TEACHER QUALIFICATIONS

Discussion focused on the need to work on the details of professional development plans for practicing teachers through a variety of in-service programs including working with the universities to develop needed bridging courses based on a critical analysis of the PTC, CT and diploma courses completed by the serving teachers. Where applicable the work plan will be modified.



2nd National Consultative Interchange

January 4-5, 2012 – Serena Hotel, Islamabad

Day 1 (January 4, 2012)

Time	Activity
6:30 - 7:00 PM	<i>Registration</i>
7:00 – 7:05 PM	<i>Invocation</i>
7:05 - 7:20 PM	<i>Welcome Remarks by Dr. Mahmood ul Hasan Butt, Chief of Party - Pre-STEP Program</i>
7:20 – 7:30 PM	<i>Reflection from Pre-STEP Partner Institution Faculty</i>
7:30 – 7:40 PM	<i>ADE Student's comments (Video Clip)</i>
7:40 – 7:55 PM	<i>Remarks by Vice Chancellor of Fatima Jinnah Women's University, Dr. Samina Qadir</i>
7:55 – 8:10 PM	<i>Remarks by Director - Education Office USAID/Pakistan, Ms. Jo Lesser Oltheten</i>
8:10 onwards	Dinner

Day 2 (January 5, 2012)

Time	Activity	Preview
9:00 - 9:30 AM	<i>Introduction to the Interchange</i>	Pre-STEP COP to share the purpose of the day and an overview of progress to date.
9:30 - 9:45 AM	<i>Overview of the Life of Project Work Plan</i>	Pre-STEP Senior Technical Directors present LoP work plan overview
9:45 - 11:00 PM	<i>Provincial Discussion Groups</i>	Pre-STEP Provincial Directors lead break-out sessions to discuss the work plan ideas in their province.
Tea Break		



11:30 - 1:30 PM	Report out from Provincial Discussions	Group spokesperson reports out and summarizes discussion points
Lunch Break (one hour)		
2:15 – 2:35 PM	Question and Answer	Provincial Discussions
2:35 – 2:40 PM	Synthesis	Common Themes
2:40 - 3:30 PM	Resolving Common Challenges and Issues	Four concurrent discussion groups on the following topics: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Affiliation (Discussion Facilitator: Higher Education Commission Representative) 2. Assessment (Discussion Facilitator: Provincial Government Representative) 3. Consolidation and Harmonization of Teacher Education Programs (Discussion Facilitator: Provincial Government Representative) 4. Bridging Courses
Working Tea		
3:30 - 4:00 PM	Plenary Discussion	Report out from discussion group leader and Q&A
4:00 - 4:15 PM	Monitoring and Evaluation	Highlights of Monitoring and Evaluation
4:15 – 4:30 PM	Communications	Highlights of Communication Strategy
4:30 – 4:45 PM	Dr. Sohail Naqvi, Executive Director, HEC	Closing Remarks
4:45 - 5:00 PM	USAID Representative	Closing Remarks

ANNEX II: LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

2nd Consultative Interchange - January 4-5, 2012			
Sr.	Organization/ Institute	Participant Name	Designation
Islamabad			
1	Allama Iqbal Open University	Dr. Javed Iqbal	Chairman, Department of Distance Non-Formal Education
2	Allama Iqbal Open University	Dr. Nazir Sangi	Vice Chancellor
3	Allama Iqbal Open University	Prof. Dr. Rehana Masrur	Dean, Faculty of Education
4	Allama Iqbal Open University	Mr. Muhammad Ajmal	Assistant Professor - Education
5	CIDA/CPBEP	Ms. Huma Mirza	Senior Technical Advisor, Teacher Education
6	DFID	Ms Nilofer Javed	Senior Education Specialist
7	EDC	Cathryn	/Consultant
8	Education Sector	Dr. Syed Hadi	Sect Education
9	Education Sector	Muhammad Nasir	Director Education
10	Education Sector	Raja Muhammad Qadeer Khan	Director Education
11	GIZ, Education Project Office	Ms. Ayesha Fazal	Director Education
12	Higher Education Commission	Dr. S. Sohail H. Naqvi	Executive Director
13	Higher Education Commission	Dr. Muhammad Latif	Director General
14	Higher Education Commission	Mr. Muhammad Javed Khan	Adviser, Academics Department
15	Higher Education Commission	Fida Hussain	Director General, Quality Assurance
16	Higher Education Commission	Malik Arshad Mahmood	Director Curriculum
17	Higher Education Commission	Dr. Tahir Ali Shah	Deputy Director Curriculum
18	Inter Provincial Coordination	Mr. Mulazim Hussain Mujahid	Deputy Educational Adviser
19	Inter Provincial Coordination	Mr. Shahzad Iqbal	Senior Joint Secretary
20	Policy & Planning Wing, MoE	Mr. T.M. Qureshi	Joint Educational Adviser
Sindh			
21	Bureau of Curriculum & Extension Wing, Govt. of Sindh.	Mr. Abdul Majeed Bhurt	Director
22	Government of Sindh	Mr. Riaz Ahmed Memon	Special Secretary Education
23	PITE	Mr. Ata Muhammad Dito	Director/Member of Task Force
24	Reforms Support Unit (RSU)	Mr. Parvez Seehar	Chief Program Manager (CPM),
25	Reforms Support Unit (RSU), Education Department, Government of Sindh	Ms. Raisa Adil	Deputy Program Manager (TED)
26	Reforms Support Unit (RSU), Education Department, Government of Sindh	Mr. Abdul Khaliq Shaikh	Deputy Program Manager (EMR) & Policy Coordinator
27	Reforms Support Unit (RSU), Education Department, Government of Sindh	Mr. Sagheer Shaikh	Consultant/Member of Task Force
28	Reforms Support Unit (RSU), Education Department, Government of Sindh	Zahid Jatoi	Monitoring Officer
29	RSU/STEDA	Muhamad Saghir Shaikh	Coord (TED)
30	Shah Abdul Latif University Khairpur	Prof. Dr. Nilofar Shaikh	Vice Chancellor
31	Shah Abdul Latif University Khairpur	Prof. Dr. Syed Ahmed Hussain Shah	Professor Department of International Relations
32	University of Karachi	Dr. Shakeel ur Rehman Farooqui	Assistant Professor, Department of Genetics
33	University of Karachi	Dr. Zafar Iqbal	Dean, Faculty of Arts
34	University of Sindh	Ms Parveen Shah	Pro Vice Chancellor
35	University of Sindh	Prof. Dr. Parveen Munshi	Dean, Faculty of Education

Balochistan			
36	Bureau of Curriculum & Extension Wing, Govt. of Sindh.	Mr. Ehsan Ahmed	Director of Education
37	Government of Balochistan	Mr. Zulfiqar Jatoi	Deputy Secretary, PPIU and Member of Task Force for Strategic Planning of Teacher Education
38	Government of Balochistan	Mr. Rashid Razaq	Additional Secretary, Education Department
39	PITE	Ms Samina Naz	Senior Subject Specialist
40	Sardar Bahadur Khan Women's University	Prof. Sultana Baloch	Vice Chancellor
41	University of Balochistan	Prof. Dr. Abdul Nabi	Vice Chancellor
Gilgit-Baltistan			
42	Directorate of Education	Mr. Raja Muhammad Nasir	Director of Education
43	Directorate of Education	Mr. Muhammad Abideen	Director Planning
44	Karakorum International University	Prof. Dr. Shafiq Jullandhry	Dean Social Sciences and Humanities
45	Karakorum International University	Prof. Najma Najam	Vice Chancellor
Muzaffarabad-AJK			
46	Department of Education	Mr. Muhammad Sadiq Dar	Secretary Education - Schools
47	Department of Education	Ms. Night Mubasher	Director General, Directorate of Curriculum Research and Development
48	Department of Education, AJK	Raja Akhlaq Hussain Khan	Additional Secretary Schools
49	Kashmir Education Assessment Centre	Mr. Khawaja Javed Iqbal	Senior Subject Specialist
50	Kashmir Education Assessment Centre	Prof. Raja Muhammad Qadeer Khan	Senior Subject Specialist
51	Teacher Foundation	Ms. Jamshed Naqvi	Managing Director
52	University of Azad Jammu Kashmir	Prof. Dr. Habib-ur-Rehman	Vice Chancellor
53	University of Azad Jammu Kashmir	Dr. Abdul Majeed Niazi	Head of Education
KPK/FATA			
54	Directorate of Curriculum and Teacher Education, Abbotabad, KPK	Mr. Atta ullah Khan	Director
55	Elementary & Secondary Education Department, Government of Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa	Farid Qureshi	Special Secretary E&SE
56	Elementary & Secondary Education Department, Government of Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa	Ms. Sarwat Jahan	Directress School E&SE
57	Elementary & Secondary Education Department, Government of Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa	Mr. Mushtaq Jadoon	Secretary Elementary & School Education
58	FATA Secretariat	Mr. Shaheen Shah	Deputy Director Education
59	Gomal University	Prof. Dr. Umer Ali Khan	Associate Professor - Education
60	Gomal University	Prof. Dr. Mansoor Akbar Kundi	Vice Chancellor
61	University of Hazara	Dr. Saeed Anwar Khan	Dean, Faculty of Arts
62	University of Hazara	Prof. Dr. Syed Sakhawat Shah	Vice Chancellor
63	University of Peshawar	Dr. Arbab Khan Afridi	Director, IER
Punjab			
64	Fatima Jinnah Women University	Prof. Dr. Samina Amin Qadir	Vice Chancellor
65	Fatima Jinnah Women University	Dr. Mussarat Anwar Shaikh	Chairperson Education Dept. & Controller Exams
66	University of Education	Dr. Muhammad Khalid Mahmood	Director - Division of Education
67	University of Education	Tasaduq Hussain Khokhar	Principal, Lower Mall Campus
68	University of Punjab	Prof. Dr. Mumtaz Akhtar	Director, Institute of Education & Research
USAID/Pakistan			
69	USAID	Ms. Jo Lesser Oltheten	Director, Education Office
70	USAID	Mr. Muhammad Tariq Khan	Education Advisor / AOTR
Pre-STEP			
71	Pre-STEP	Dr. Mahmood-ul-Hassan Butt	Chief of Party
72	Pre-STEP	Mr. Tom Chesney	Deputy Chief of Party
73	Pre-STEP	Dr. Mary Lackie	Sr. Technical Director - Policy
74	Pre-STEP	Ms. Helen Kamal	Sr. Technical Director - Professional Development
75	Pre-STEP	Dr. Fayyaz Ahmed	Advisor - Education Policy
76	University	Prof. Gita Khamsi	Consultant

77	Pre-STEP	Mr. Makbul Shah	Consultant - Communications
78	Pre-STEP	Mr. Hassan Zulfiqar	Manager - Documentation and Reporting
79	Pre-STEP	Mr. Arsal Latif	Coordinator - Knowledge Management
80	Pre-STEP	Ms. Zubia Zubair	Manager - Communication & Outreach
81	Pre-STEP	Mr. Khalid Mahmood	Director - Strategic Planning
82	Pre-STEP	Mr. Nooruddin Shah	Specialist-Education Policy & Systems
83	Pre-STEP	Mr. Anjum Pervaiz	Provincial Director - Sindh
84	Pre-STEP	Dr. Amjad Saqib	Provincial Director - Punjab
85	Pre-STEP	Mr. Kamran Lone	Provincial Director - FATA-KPK
86	Pre-STEP	Mr. Farooq Akbar	Provincial Director - Balochistan
87	Pre-STEP	Mr. Muhammad Bashir	Coordinator - AJK-GB
88	Pre-STEP	Ms. Ayesha Razzaque	Research Coordinator
89	Pre-STEP	Ms Sarwat Alam	Director - Learning Systems and Pedagogy
90	Pre-STEP	Ms Rana Hussain	Director - Cucciculum Development
91	Pre-STEP	Ms Shahida Maheen	Director - Professional Development
92	Pre-STEP	Ms Lubna Nazli	Manager - Executive Office
93	Pre-STEP	Mr. Tahir Mubeen	Manager - Operations and Logistics
94	Pre-STEP	Ms. Fozia Tariq	Receptionist/Front Desk Officer
95	Pre-STEP	Mr. Ramin Nabilzadeh	Assistant - Program
96	Pre-STEP	Mr. Zakir Abbas	Assistant - Program
97	Pre-STEP	Mr. Adnan Muzaffar	IT Officer
98	Pre-STEP	Mr. Rohina Nazli	Consultant